

# AMS Program & Abstracts

WASHINGTON, D.C., OCTOBER 27-30 2005

**AMS** AMERICAN  
MUSICOLOGICAL  
SOCIETY

# Contents

## *Thursday afternoon, 27 October*

- 26 The American Style: Two Separate Paths
- 27 Between Classic and Romantic: Analysis and Interpretation
- 30 Chant and Chorale in the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Centuries
- 34 Medieval and Renaissance Topics
- 38 Seventeenth- and Eighteenth-century Opera
- 41 Twentieth-Century Topics

## *Thursday evening, 27 October*

- 45 (Mis)Appropriations of History: Constructions of “The English Musical Renaissance”
- 46 Reconstructing Nations, Re-imagining Communities: Music and Post-Socialist Transition

## *Friday morning, 28 October*

- 48 Chant as an Expression of Identity
- 52 Music in American Cultures
- 56 Music and Painting
- 59 Performance, Politics, and the Problem of “Italian Style” in Old Regime France
- 63 Revisions, Sketches, and the Work Concept
- 67 Romantic Reception and Historiography

## *Friday afternoon, 28 October*

- 71 The New York Victorian Consort
- 71 Collaboration and Authorship in Popular Music
- 74 Medieval Theory
- 78 Music and Society in Modern France
- 81 Music, Theater, and Women in the Eighteenth Century
- 85 Representing Politics and Religion in the Seventeenth Century
- 88 Twentieth-Century Sketches

## *Friday evening, 28 October*

- 93 Culture at the Crossroads: Interactions Between European and American Music From the Gilded Age to the Jazz Age
- 94 AMS Hispanic Music Interest Group: Current Research on Mexican Music by Mexican Scholars: Carrillo, Revueltas and the “Black” Villancico

## *Saturday Morning, 29 October*

- 95 Church and Theater in Mozart’s Vienna
- 98 Cultural Politics in the Twentieth Century

- 102 Jazz topics
- 105 Music, Culture, and Politics in Vienna: Dvořák to Mahler
- 109 New Light on the “Caput” Masses
- 112 Rachmaninoff and Ravel
- 114 Technologies of the Diva
- 115 Wagner’s Parsifal

*Saturday afternoon, 29 October*

- 118 An Italian Composer in Eighteenth-Century China: The Sonatas and Letters of Teodorico Pedrini
- 118 art songs of latin america
- 119 American Musics
- 123 Fifteenth-Century Topics
- 126 Haydn Topics
- 130 National Identities
- 133 Nineteenth-Century Opera
- 137 Russian Modernism

*Saturday evening, 29 October*

- 142 The Cold War and Changing Ideologies of New Music
- 143 Current Copyright Issues in Scholarly Editions of Music
- 144 A Sense of Place: Music and Regional Environments, Musicology, and Ecocriticism

*Sunday Morning, 30 October*

- 145 Authors and Authority in the Renaissance
- 150 Convention, Gender, and Memory in the Music of Brahms
- 154 Music and Politics in the Twentieth Century
- 157 Orlando di Lasso
- 159 Performance and/as History
- 162 Popular Music
- 166 Troubadour and Trouvère Chansons
- 171 Index of Participants

# *Abstracts*

Thursday afternoon, 27 October

THE AMERICAN STYLE: TWO SEPARATE PATHS

Alan Mandel, piano

Piano Sonata No. 3 in C major Allegro con brio	Alexander Reinagle (1756–1809)
<i>Ballad</i> , Op. 6	Amy Marcy Cheney Beach (1867–1944)
Sonata No. 4 (Keltic Sonata), Opus 59 With great power and dignity With naive tenderness Very swift and fierce	Edward MacDowell (1860–1908)
<i>Cosmic Voyage and DevilDance</i>	Alan Mandel (1935–)
Study No. 18	Charles Ives (1874–1954)
Sonata No. 2 Moderato—Allegro	Elie Siegmeister (1909–1991)
<i>The Banjo</i> , Op. 15	Louis Moreau Gottschalk (1829–1869)

There have always been two distinct conceptions of American musical style. Virgil Thomson believed that “Americans [write] music in every known style . . . the way to write American music is very simple. All you have to do is be an American and then write any kind of music you wish.” Conversely, Elie Siegmeister recognized in American music “blues, jazz, and folk elements . . . a musical vernacular, vitality, rhythmic drive, melodic freshness, and an ‘open air’ sound.” The music chosen for this concert represents these two conceptions.

Alexander Reinagle was a close friend, by correspondence, of C.P.E. Bach; he also corresponded with Haydn. His sonata resembles their music both stylistically and formally. Amy Beach’s music is distinguished by a natural melodic gift and an eclectic style, which contains rich textures, chromaticism, complex harmonies, frequent and startling modulations, intensity, and restlessness. Her early *Ballad* exhibits all of these characteristics. MacDowell’s music is fully Romantic in the tradition of Grieg, Raff, and Liszt. Rhapsodic, dramatic, lyrical, and often programmatic, it rejects narrow nationalism in favor of broad lineage. The “Keltic” sonata favors rich melodic lines, adventurous harmonies, and impressive climaxes.

Alan Mandel’s *Cosmic Voyage and DevilDance* is a phantasmagoric work that employs the piano’s percussive resources and lyrical qualities. In this work, jazz and ragtime idioms coexist with a mystical, very late romanticism and contemporary techniques. Ives’s Study No. 18, which Alan Mandel found among Ives’s papers at Yale, utilizes familiar Ivesian quotation techniques. Beginning with a trumpet-like section, it accelerates through a “marching band” song, into a rhythmic, dissonant rendition of “Hello, Ma Baby!” The tunes build in a wildly enthusiastic, surrealistic fashion.

Among Siegmeister’s varied oeuvre, Sonata No. 2 is especially effective, because of its enormous breadth of contrast within a ten-minute, one-movement work, its succinct sonata allegro form, its ingenious development of a four-note motif, and its explosive yet controlled emotional content. In Gottschalk’s *The Banjo*, instantly repeated piano figures suggest sounds of that

instrument. The composer often placed this work last on his concert programs. Syncopated rhythms recall those of minstrel tunes, and the coda quotes Stephen Foster's "Camptown Races."

**BETWEEN CLASSIC AND ROMANTIC:  
ANALYSIS AND INTERPRETATION  
James Webster, Cornell University, Chair**

**THEMATIC MARKERS IN THE LATE MUSIC OF MOZART**

Amy Holbrook  
Arizona State University

When applied to the music of Haydn, the term "monothematicism" refers to his practice of initiating the secondary key area of a sonata-form exposition with a transposition of the main theme into that key. The term is in many cases a misnomer, because the second group commonly will continue on to a variety of new ideas after the start of the key area has been marked by the reappearance of the main theme. Although Mozart contributed only a handful of examples of the "monothematic" exposition à la Haydn (a prominent example is the first movement of the "Prague" Symphony, K. 504), his use of transposed versions of the opening motive of a work at the start of the second group as well as in other parts of the form—transitions, retransitions, episodes, closing, development, secondary development, coda—is varied and extensive, particularly in the instrumental music of his last five years.

The earliest work displaying such economy of thematic material is the Rondo in D Major for piano, K. 485, an odd little piece in sonata form, despite the title, in which versions of the opening theme appear throughout in a total of six different keys. Dated January 10, 1786, K. 485 is an extreme and abrupt departure from Mozart's polythematicism, the wealth of melodic ideas for which he is noted, in favor of recurrences of the main theme or its head motive, transposed and manipulated so as to mark key areas, sectional divisions, and formal function or treated developmentally as a thread of continuity through modulating or tonally adventurous passages. After K. 485, this unifying device becomes a distinctive feature, perhaps even a style trait, of the instrumental works and movements in sonata form, rondo form, and their variants.

Although any general description of the music of Mozart's last five years will point out its increased thematic unity, this paper identifies specifically all of the works that use the thematic marker significantly, some to the point of true monothematicism, and categorizes these sonata-form and rondo movements based on the location and function of recurrences of the head motive. Examination of thematic markers in a few music examples leads to speculation about the origins of Mozart's tendency in a substantial number of the late works to distribute head motives throughout sectional forms that had previously relied on thematic contrasts. Although the Rondo in D Major offers some clues, another odd keyboard work, a thirty-eight-measure Gigue, K. 574, shows in miniature how Mozart could incorporate elements of fugue into a sectional binary form. A conclusion of this study is that thematic markers can be compared to fugue subjects, and that they and the infusion of contrapuntal writing and learned fugal procedures into the late works are only symptoms of a much larger structural conception through which Mozart creates his own amalgamation of fugue with the formal conventions and thematic types of the Classical style.

PARAMETERS OF CYCLIC INTEGRATION IN THE  
INSTRUMENTAL MUSIC OF THE CLASSICAL ERA:  
MOZART'S STRING QUARTET IN A MAJOR, K. 464

Bryan Proksch

University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill

Cyclic integration through related thematic material is a widely accepted premise for a number of works from the Renaissance, Baroque and nineteenth century, but its use in the music of Haydn and Mozart remains contested. Scholars point to related themes in Beethoven's juvenilia, but dispute seemingly similar connections in Haydn and Mozart despite the chronological overlap. This reluctance stems partially from an absence of discussion in contemporary theoretical treatises, which address "unity" only vaguely within individual movements, and partially from a lack of overt thematic connections in Haydn and Mozart's works.

The question of cyclic integration in the music of Haydn and Mozart is further complicated by the ideology of organicism. In the early nineteenth century, writers such as E.T.A. Hoffmann extended the scope of music analysis from individual movements to whole works using organicism as an aesthetic principle. In the 1820s, A.B. Marx set up Beethoven as the founder of a new musical epoch where the aesthetics of organic unity played a central role. His arguments convinced generations of scholars that Beethoven invented cyclic integration. By equating cyclic integration with organic unity and by singling out Beethoven as its innovator, Marx precluded Haydn and Mozart's works from being thought of as cyclic. Hence the only studies of systematic connections among the movements of Haydn's works, by James Webster and Ethan Haimo, include lengthy defenses of their premises and limit themselves to either "special" works using unconventional compositional procedures (including run-on movements, programmatic elements, "monotonicity," etc.) or "disruptive," unconventional, musical elements (including tonal problems, problematic pitches, etc.).

I will disentangle cyclic integration from organicism by redefining the parameters of cyclic integration in eighteenth-century compositions. While organicism seeks to explain how each moment of a composition grows out of a germinal motivic cell, cyclic integration seeks relationships among movements without reference to growth or limitations to thematic material. The strict nineteenth-century organic approach has blinded us to the wide variety of affinities of musical material shared among Haydn and Mozart's movements. I will examine Mozart's String Quartet in A Major, K. 464 as an example of a strongly cyclically integrated work due to the considerable number of shared elements among its movements, such as the inclusion of certain contrapuntal techniques, idiosyncratic phrase structures, atypical articulations, unusual harmonic motion, particular use of specific unstable chromatic pitches, and distinctive patterns of dynamics, in addition to thematic connections. Cyclic integration is a fluid matrix of parameters that may or may not be present in every movement of a work. By approaching the works of Mozart and Haydn in this way, our parameters for cyclic integration will not be determined by nineteenth-century standards.

ASPECTS OF ROMANTICISM IN SCHUBERT'S EARLY SONATA FORMS

Brian Black

University of Lethbridge

Schubert's earliest attempts at writing sonata forms are found in a series of string quartets he composed between the ages of thirteen and seventeen. Superficially these movements recall

the music of Haydn, Mozart and Beethoven in similar motives and even outright quotations; yet structurally they are marked by perplexing anomalies, which most commentators have treated as the mistakes of a student learning the basics of the form. Such anomalies, though, hold a deeper significance—they reveal idiosyncratic elements of Schubert's style that represent a shift away from Viennese classicism of the late eighteenth-century towards developments in music characteristic of early romanticism.

This stylistic shift is evident in certain fundamental features of the sonata-form movements as well as specific developments in the composer's handling of the form during the period under discussion (c. 1810–1814). In the first place, Schubert's themes do not exhibit the motivic diversity of most classical themes, but are often restricted to one basic idea. Secondly, the same uniformity also marks the overall structure of the very first sonata forms (those written between 1810 and 1812). This is due to an unchanging focus on one rhythmic/melodic figure through literal repetitions of the main theme's basic idea across the whole movement, extending even into the subordinate theme, which is so derivative of the main theme's material that it lacks a separate identity.

Carl Dahlhaus has argued that such "monothematicism" in the early sonata forms indicates that Schubert was working under a late eighteenth-century formal aesthetic, which accepted a second theme only as a subordinate, rather than an opposing, idea. The present paper contends, however, that the monothematic, almost monomotivic, character of these sonata forms is more typical of new stylistic currents exemplified by the early romantic character piece, which exhibits the same homogeneous thematic construction and pervasive concentration on a limited set of motives.

In the period from 1812 to 1814, Schubert gradually develops a form that accommodates two contrasting thematic regions, each dominated by a different rhythmic / melodic figure. The resulting thematic relationship—a complementary one between two distinct, equally intense entities—also marks the contrast between the larger A and B sections of a tripartite character piece, such as Schubert's *Impromptu in E-flat Major*, opus 90, no. 2. Furthermore, the often sudden tonal juxtaposition between the keys of these two sections is similar in effect to the unusual modulatory schemes Schubert devises to prepare the second thematic / tonal region of his expositions.

This paper will demonstrate that many of the most unusual aspects of the early sonata-form movements arise from Schubert's struggle to reconcile the new tendencies in his writing with the dictates of an older, established form. The discussion will draw on comparisons with the works of Schubert's predecessors, such as Haydn and Mozart, and his contemporaries (specifically Vorišek, Field and Schumann), and will follow the developments in Schubert's handling of the form up to the breakthrough of the *String Quartet in B-flat Major*, D. 112, from the fall of 1814.

## THE MOONLIGHT CONVENTION IN THE EARLY NINETEENTH CENTURY

Sarah Clemmens  
Yale University

The moon, with its periodic disappearance and variable light, gained a special relevance in the romantic era; as Jean Paul stated, ". . . der Mondschein [ist] zugleich romantisches Bild und Beispiel." Several German ballad compositions of the 1790s and 1800s, particularly ones

on Ossianic texts, include moonlight episodes with special musical treatment. For example, “Colma’s Lament” from the Ossianic *Songs of Selma* contains a section of text in which the moon emerges from behind a cloud to illuminate the heath; in four concordant settings by Zumsteeg, Reichardt, Zelter, and Schubert, the section is treated with remarkable similarity. Although Schubert’s setting is clearly modeled on Reichardt’s, there is no particular reason to assume imitation or influence among the others. Rather, this seems to be a case of convention.

This paper examines instances of the proposed “moonlight” convention in the hopes of clarifying a musical *topos*, in the sense developed by Leonard G. Ratner and continued by Allanbrook, Levy, and others. The “moonlight” convention involves a 12/8 or other compound meter with an arpeggiated accompaniment, and is somewhat related to the 6/8 barcarolle. Elements of the instrumental pastoral convention may also be present (slow harmonic rhythm, parallel thirds or sixths), but often the keys are not simple “pastoral” ones and tend more often to the minor mode. Bellini’s “Casta Diva”—Norma’s plea to the chaste moon goddess—exhibits the central “moonlight” elements. The convention is easy to find in the madrigalisms of the pre-Schubertian through-composed ballad; some lieder involve it as well. Zelter’s setting of Goethe’s *An den Mond* employs the convention; both of Schubert’s concordant settings eschew it, but his 1815 setting of Höltz’s *An den Mond* D. 193 is a perfect example of “moonlight.” The *Langsam* 12/8 opening in F minor strongly recalls Beethoven’s “Moonlight” Sonata op. 27 no. 2 in its arpeggiated right hand over longer notes in the left hand. Schubert’s introductory piano progression also aurally evokes particular measures of Beethoven’s work in a very marked way; even the register is nearly precisely duplicated.

Again, the question is not one of influence; it is likely that Schubert knew Beethoven’s 1802 work and not likely that he was imitating it. Rather, the moonlight convention influenced both Schubert’s setting and the sonata’s nickname of *Mondschein-Sonate*. In a well-known anecdote, Lenz attributes the “Moonlight” sobriquet to Rellstab’s invention and dates its earliest usage to about 1835. Lenz also relates that the Viennese referred to op. 27 no. 2 as the “Arbor Sonata” (*Lauben-Sonate*). Although Rellstab could have known Schubert’s similar-sounding address to the moon D. 193 (published 1826), that was probably not a factor. It is more probable that the similarity of the sonata’s first movement to the frequently-used moonlight or barcarolle idiom reminded Rellstab of his moonlit boat trip and inspired the name; perhaps the convention also helped to legitimize Rellstab’s title and advanced its currency over the Viennese “Arbor.” This convention, combined with Beethoven lore and criticism, might actually refresh our perspective on this overfamiliar piece.

## CHANT AND CHORALE IN THE EIGHTEENTH AND NINETEENTH CENTURIES

Leo Treitler, Graduate Center, CUNY, Chair

## ANDRÉS MARCOS BURRIEL AND LITURGICAL SCIENCE AS CULTURAL NATIONALISM IN EIGHTEENTH-CENTURY SPAIN

Susan Boynton  
Columbia University

In 1749, the Jesuit Andrés Marcos Burriel was appointed to direct the royal commission on the archives of Spain, through which the government sought to obtain documents sup-

porting royal claims to jurisdiction over ecclesiastical property in preparation for negotiations with Rome regarding control over benefices. However, Burriel's conception of his mandate soon expanded to include all the domains encompassed by a broad humanist vision, as seen in his "Apuntamientos de algunas ideas para fomentar las letras," an all-encompassing proposal for the cultural renewal of Spain through research by a committee composed entirely of Jesuit scholars. Burriel hoped that the endeavors described in this text would help recreate the flourishing intellectual climate under the Catholic monarchs in the sixteenth century. At the center of this ambitious project of cultural nationalism was the medieval chant and liturgy of the Iberian peninsula; Burriel saw this legacy as an important part of Spain's prestige at home and abroad.

Burriel began in the archive and library of Toledo Cathedral, where he worked from late 1750 to early 1756 with the initial of writing a new ecclesiastical history of Spain. After an initial survey of the archival documents, Burriel and his assistants analyzed, copied, and transcribed medieval liturgical books, along with manuscripts of the Bible, patristics, and canon law. Burriel's papers from these years, now preserved in the Biblioteca Nacional in Madrid, manifest a wide-ranging interest in and an unusual knowledge of the ritual and theological traditions of medieval Spain. Drawing upon his unpublished papers, as well as his published correspondence and other writings, this paper will demonstrate the importance of the liturgy in Burriel's distinctive vision of Spanish culture.

Burriel worked closely with original sources to an extent that was mostly unprecedented before the twentieth century. He noted discrepancies between the Mozarabic liturgical manuscripts of Toledo copied before the liturgical reform of 1080 and the sixteenth-century editions that purported to codify the surviving oral tradition. To improve upon these editions, Burriel planned to publish new editions of the Mozarabic liturgical books for parish and scholarly use. His analysis, comparison, and collation of late-medieval Spanish diocesan uses anticipated comparative methods that entered common use only several generations later. Comparing and compiling notes from liturgical books from all over Spain, Burriel traced the history of proper chants for certain feasts of particular significance in Toledo. He paid close attention to the appearance as well as to the contents of medieval chant manuscripts, having many neumes reproduced by a calligrapher in facsimiles that remain invaluable to musicologists. Unfortunately, most of Burriel's plans never came to fruition. The Concordat of 1753 between Rome and Spain removed the urgent need for evidence that had motivated the mission to Toledo; in 1754–55 Burriel lost his support at court, and in 1756 he was dismissed from the Royal Commission on the Archives. Because the Toledo project was terminated prematurely, Burriel's liturgical scholarship is largely unknown today, but it provides an important example of cultural politics and scholarly innovation during the Spanish Enlightenment.

"SINGING FROM THE HEART": MEMORIZATION AND  
IMPROVISATION IN AN EIGHTEENTH-CENTURY UTOPIAN  
COMMUNITY

Sarah Eyerly  
University of California, Davis

Little is known about the practice of group improvisation in the literate cultures of eighteenth-century Europe. The difficulties of studying a practice that existed outside the realm of written notation are compounded by the lack of evidence that such practices were

important in eighteenth-century European society. However, newly discovered documents from the Archives of the Moravian Church in Herrnhut, Germany, allow us to examine for the first time a written record of a vibrant tradition of group improvisation involving chorale melodies and their four-part harmonization that existed within the religious communities of the Moravian church.

Moravian communities were experimental, utopian communes where music played a crucial role in the maintenance of social and religious order. Music was central to daily life, and community members sang together throughout the day—in worship, work, and conversation. Moravians described themselves as “living in song.” An individual’s ability to improvise new songs was highly prized as “giving voice to the divine.” The most important demonstration of improvisational abilities occurred in the daily *Singstunden* [singing hours]. Individual hymn-verses and phrases of chorale melodies from a memorized repertory of several thousand pre-existing hymns were extemporaneously combined by a community member, and repeated by the other participants, to create a “hymn-sermon” which elaborated upon a particular scriptural passage. If no suitable verses could be drawn from the memorized repertory, then the community member would improvise a new hymn. This practice was referred to as “singing from the heart,” and was seen as outward evidence of a person’s commitment to the community.

Study of the *Singstunde* tradition provides new insights into the relation of improvisation to the art of memory. The memorization of the large hymn repertory necessary to participate in the *Singstunden* and the wide-scale ability of community members to improvise new hymns were integrally linked. Improvisation was possible because community members had accumulated a mental storehouse of verbal and musical examples, which they could utilize in creating new hymns. They practiced daily the creation of new hymn texts, through the repeated use of specific literary patterns: versification, particular poetic meters, and formulas and themes, accompanied by specific words and phrases. Musically, the number of chorale tunes was limited to around twenty “favorites.” In addition, congregants assembled personal manuscript books of hymn verses and chorale tunes to assist in the creation of new *Singstunden*. These books, described as “memory texts,” functioned essentially like medieval tonaries: they were not used in performance, but instead to assist in the memorization of the information contained in them.

Study of the *Singstunde* tradition illuminates the role of improvisation in an eighteenth-century literate culture and, therefore, the effects of literacy on improvisational techniques. Moravians cultivated a style of improvisation that was only possible in a literate context through the use of a memorized library of compositional techniques. Thus, each community member acquired the facility to visually and aurally demonstrate their faith by spontaneously recombining material from their memorial archive, or by employing learned compositional strategies that allowed “the heart to sing.”

MELISMAS, MELODIC INCIPITS, AND MEISTERSINGERS:  
REEXAMINING SONG TRANSMISSION  
IN THE ANABAPTIST *AUSBUND*

Beth Aracena  
Eastern Mennonite University

When Joseph Yoder published his transcriptions of Amish congregational hymns in 1942, a handful of subsequent articles by different authors extolled the Amish songs as evidence of

a living four-hundred-year-old oral tradition. The hymns derive from the German *Ausbund*, the oldest known hymnbook of the Anabaptists, whose 1564 printing dates just decades after Martin Luther championed reform of the church. As with many early Protestant hymnbooks, the *Ausbund* does not transmit musical notation; rather, a textual incipit or title indicates the melody. Scholars have devoted considerable attention towards identifying these original tunes, and comparisons of German folk songs with the corpus of hymns sung by twentieth-century Amish have given rise to claims of ancestry that inform both Reformation history and contemporary song transmission.

This paper examines that scholarship identifying melodic prototypes for Amish performances of *Ausbund* hymns in order to test the substantiation of an enduring centuries-old oral tradition. A comparison of the tuneful, syllabic songs conserved in sixteenth-century prints with highly melismatic, ametrical, chant-like Amish hymns poses an interesting consideration in the historical transmission of these melodies. How did the Amish repertory develop into songs so different from their “original” sources?

In his seminal article of 1945, George Pullen Jackson argued that the “strange music” of the Amish evolved from inaccuracies associated with the dynamics of group singing and oral tradition. His findings have been accepted wholly among scholars of Anabaptist hymnology. A re-examination of Jackson’s methodology, however, demonstrates that his research efforts were skewed by an artificial system of distilling “ur-melodies” and by limiting his study to Yoder’s transcriptions to formulate his connections. Since Yoder, several other authors have produced important collections for understanding Amish hymns. Specifically, transcriptions of Pennsylvania Amish by Katie Stoltzfoos, Indiana Amish by Olen F. Yoder, and Ohio Amish by Noah Hershberger and Ben Troyer, Jr. provide a significant augmentation of sources for which to compare Amish hymn tunes. These new resources, bolstered by extant recordings of Amish worship held in the Library of Congress and in private historical libraries, beckon reconsideration of the original song connections.

Focusing on modern conceptions of folk song transmission, previous scholars have overlooked elements of the Meistersinger tradition as a significant influence on the performance of *Ausbund* hymn tunes. The melismatic melodies sung by the Amish embody a tradition of vocal embellishment guided by regulated formulas and poetic design. In this light, the melodic designations preserved in the *Ausbund* represent a style of poetic-musical declamation rather than the adoption of a strictly conceived melody. By reexamining the *Ausbund* corpus within the historical contexts of Meistersinger culture, musicologists gain new insights into the composition of Protestant repertories in Germany and colonial America. Such conceptualizations of melodies as formulas intertwined with poetic design, in turn, inform ontological considerations of contrafacta.

## MENDELSSOHN AS AMERICAN HYMNODIST

Peter Mercer-Taylor  
University of Minnesota

William H. Cummings’ pairing of a melody from the late Felix Mendelssohn’s “Gutenberg” *Festgesang* with Charles Wesley’s text “Hark! the Herald Angels Sing” has, over the last century-and-a-half, secured a firm position for Mendelssohn in the varied and ever-shifting landscape of English-language hymnody. Outside of this tune, however, Mendelssohn’s name persists in this sphere chiefly through occasional appearances of adaptations of his *Song*

*without Words* op. 30 no. 3, and through his own arrangements of a handful of standard Lutheran chorales (e.g., MUNICH and NUN DANKET). The picture looked very different at the end of the nineteenth century, by which time editors, arrangers, and publishers of hymns had mined Mendelssohn's melodic oeuvre with particular enthusiasm and resourcefulness. Indeed, the appearance of dozens of his tunes in American hymnals across a range of denominations through the late nineteenth- and early twentieth centuries—this study examines over thirty such adaptations—comprised a critical facet of Mendelssohn's public reception in this country in terms not only of the sheer breadth of his music's dissemination but of the values with which it tended to be imbued. For all the scholarly energy that has been expended on the uses to which Mendelssohn put Protestant congregational song, very little has gone into the question of the uses to which Protestant congregational song put Mendelssohn, despite the likelihood, *prima facie*, that public hearings of these hymns outnumbered all other public performances of Mendelssohn's work in the United States through the last quarter of the nineteenth century.

Mendelssohn's presence in American collections of sacred song dates from the generation of Lowell Mason, the path-breaking editor, hymn composer, and music educator who included Mendelssohn's part-song "*Auf ihrem Grab*" (op. 41 no. 4), retexted, among the dozens of works by European composers in the 1843 second edition of his *Carmina Sacra: Boston Collection of Church Music*. In the century that followed, melodies from six *Songs without Words*, five numbers from *Elijah*, four songs for mixed chorus, and a range of other vocal and instrumental works would find their way into American hymnals. The appearance of around a dozen of these—among them melodies from the "Scottish" Symphony's first movement, the *Song without Words* op. 38 no.6, the second movement of the Cello Sonata no. 2, and *Elijah's* aria "If with all your heart"—in at least a handful of hymnals suggests that they enjoyed considerable popularity before disappearing from the repertoire, as most had by the middle of the twentieth century.

## MEDIEVAL AND RENAISSANCE TOPICS

Anne Stone, Queens College, CUNY, Chair

### "THE WHOLE DUTY OF MAN": LITURGICAL CHANT AS POLITICAL THEORY IN THE CORONATION OF RICHARD THE LIONHEARTED

David Schiller

University of Georgia

In the first, second, and fourth recensions of the medieval English coronation ritual, the antiphon *Unxerunt Salomonem* was sung immediately after the anointing of the king. "In *Unxerunt*," according to Andrew Hughes, "we are reminded of an antiphon from the season when Christ is ascending his heavenly throne, and of the baptism of Christ the King," just as the monarch takes his throne and, like Solomon, is sanctified with holy oil.

However, in the third recension of the coronation ritual, which was in use from the latter half of the twelfth century through the thirteenth century, and thus for Richard's coronation in 1189, *Unxerunt* is conspicuously absent. Of the seven extant manuscripts of the third recension, four provide no chant to be sung during or after the anointing of the king, while three others specify the chant that is my focus here: the responsory *Deum time*. Its text is the

penultimate verse of Ecclesiastes: "Fear God, and keep his commandments, since this is the whole duty of man." Like *Unxerunt*, *Deum time* is thus associated with Solomon, the traditional author of Ecclesiastes, but it reminds us of Solomon's obedience to God's law, not his anointing.

Though a rarity in the English Coronation ritual, *Deum time* appears in a wide variety of contexts, in Vespers as well as Matins liturgies, in the Divine Office. To date, some two dozen Office manuscripts in which it appears have been indexed in the CANTUS on-line database. *Deum time* is associated with Trinity in a plurality of these manuscripts, with the August readings from the Wisdom books in others, and also with Lent in the Worcester Antiphony, and with Transfiguration in the Karlsruh Antiphony. The readings for which it serves as a responsory deal variously with Samuel's prophetic authority over Israel's kings, and with the fear of God as the beginning of wisdom and fundamental principle of human governance.

The reason that *Deum time* temporarily replaces *Unxerunt* in the Coronation ritual, I argue, has to do with the transition from Christ-centered to Law-centered conceptions of kingship, that extraordinary evolution in political thought that Ernst Kantorowicz documented in *The King's Two Bodies*. *Deum time* resonates with John of Salisbury's admonition in the *Policratus*: "Attend to the law which is imposed upon princes by the Greatest King who is an object of fear all over the earth . . ." John's proof-text for this admonition is Deuteronomy 17:19: "[The king] shall read therein all the days of his life, that he may learn to fear the Lord his God, and to keep all His words and ceremonies which are prescribed by the law." As John of Salisbury observes, "Each word of this text is thunder in the ears of the prince if he is wise." The same can be said of the chant *Deum time*.

## HEARING TEXT AND MUSIC IN A MEDIEVAL MOTET

Suzannah Clark

Merton College, University of Oxford

In a series of recent articles, Christopher Page concedes that, even with prior knowledge of the texts of medieval polytextual motets, the words are largely unintelligible to third-party listeners in performance. For support, he cites Jacques de Liège's famous complaint in *Speculum musicae* that contemporaries often found it impossible even to discern which language was being sung. Assuming the meaning to be nevertheless relevant, Page proposes that singers probably introduced their audience to the words either by paraphrasing them or singing each line in turn before their "tutti" rendition. According to Page, listeners must delight in knowing rather than following the plot and in hearing the sonorous rather than the semantic quality of the words.

This paper will argue that the meaning of motet texts was meant to be grasped in performance. Indeed, in straining to hear the words, Page has overlooked the role of the music. I shall focus on the motet *Jolient/Quant voi la florete/Je sui jolietel/APTATUR*, preserved in three and four voices in mss *Bamberg* and *Montpellier* respectively, in order to demonstrate the variety of ways in which the music served to bring out the meaning of the words in performance. I shall use variants between sources as part of my testimony: the recomposition evident in the four-voice expansion suggests that the poet-composer was attempting to assist in the communication of the words to offset the thicker texture. For instance, the crux of the motet's meaning is located in two sudden short phrases, in which a nun, torn between faith and (earthly) love, sings of both simultaneously in the duplum and triplum. The added

quadruplum (a monk) draws attention to this moment by matching her peculiar phrase structure and creating a dissonance. Moreover, her music in the second phrase is recomposed in *Montpellier* to generate an immediate echo that contrasts “enamouré” with “en religion.” These juxtapositions are replicated throughout the motet. If both characters are in two minds at once—about whether to keep their vows or follow their love—the music charts every turn of their quandary: at the end of the motet, she sings simultaneous snippets of music that are citations from a clausula and a trouvère chanson; in the middle, she sings a song whose music is modeled on a trouvère melody (she no longer wishes to sing compline); he lapses into Latin, to music echoing his vernacular leanings just heard; he rounds off his part with a musical quotation from another trouvère chanson packed with clichés of carnal lust.

But perhaps the most convincing clue that the words are meant to be understood in performance can be found if we enter into the spirit of one of the trouvère chansons borrowed in this motet: the chanson from which our nun fashions her own song is about a nun who sings about wanting to be rescued. She duly is. It seems hard to imagine that our nun and monk would risk singing in a motet if their pleas for rescue stood no chance of being heard.

#### WHAT IS A REFRAIN?: MUSICAL QUOTATION IN THIRTEENTH-CENTURY FRANCE

Jennifer Saltzstein  
University of Pennsylvania

Wandering between different genres and discourses, the refrain is emblematic of the intertextuality and generic fluidity that characterize thirteenth-century music and poetry. Yet, beyond the simplest description of the refrain as a short, one- to two-line phrase that repeats in a number of musical and poetic contexts, the genre defies easy definition. Throughout the refrain’s scholarly history, the question of whether refrains are complete or are a fragment of a longer song has remained central. Though compelling arguments have been made on both sides, the idea that the short refrains originated as a structurally recurring element in a *rondelet* and were subsequently quoted in other contexts has taken particularly strong hold in the scholarly imagination of the genre. Nico H. van den Boogaard’s *Rondeaux et refrains* is generally accepted as the most complete catalogue of refrains, however many of the refrains it contains are “unica,” lacking concordance. This seeming contradiction has led to claims that either intrageneric quotation is not a central feature of the refrain, or that Boogaard’s catalogue contains a substantial number of misidentifications.

Reexamining Boogaard’s catalogue reveals that the work actually itemizes a variety of different practices of quotation in medieval music and narrative. This paper will demonstrate how variegated these practices were by comparing a number of refrains that operate very differently within the contexts in which they appear. Rather than attempting to adopt a strictly controlled definition of the refrain, I will argue that the term has been used as a catch-all to describe very different kinds of musical and textual quotation. Many refrains operate in the manner described above, but I will focus on refrains that have escaped notice because they fit less comfortably our perceived notion of what a refrain is. For example, *Mes fins cuers n’est mie a moi, ainz l’a qui bien l’aime*, is one of a number of refrains that are quoted across the motets of the Montpellier Codex. These refrains have no extant concordances in contemporary repertoires of monophonic song or narrative, and they differ in important ways from the refrains that have received the most scholarly attention. Examining this and other such refrains will

provide a new perspective on thirteenth-century musical repertoires and open out our understanding of the refrain.

## THE EVOLUTION OF IMITATION IN THE LATE FIFTEENTH CENTURY

Julie Cumming  
McGill University

The most striking changes in musical style during the late fifteenth century are the development of pervasive imitation and the introduction of homorhythm. In order to understand these changes I worked with Peter Schubert and a group of graduate students to analyze the motets in the first five Petrucci motet prints (1502–1508). In the process we developed a system of classification for the different textures and approaches to imitation found in the repertory. The system allows us to describe in detail for the first time the emergence of the compositional techniques that dominated sixteenth-century music.

The first five Petrucci motet prints (174 motets with 355 *partes*) contain a comprehensive anthology of motet types and styles composed between 1470 and 1505. Much of the music is by composers who came to fame in the 1490s (Josquin, Gaspar, Obrecht, Brumel, and Compère), but some is by mid-fifteenth-century composers such as Regis, Ockeghem, and Tinctoris.

Our classification system focuses on presentation types: ways of opening a section of a piece and presenting motivic material. Typical presentation types from the mid-fifteenth century are non-imitative texture and free imitation for two voices, especially superius and tenor (as in the chanson). Typical of the sixteenth century, but already present in the Petrucci motets, are three imitative presentation types, each of which includes a repeated two-voice combination: periodic entries, paired imitative duos, and paired non-imitative duos. In a periodic entry, three or more voices enter with the same tune after the same time interval, as at the opening of Josquin's *Ave Maria*. In paired imitative duos four voices enter with the same tune, but there is a longer time interval between the second and third entries, resulting in a repeated imitative duo. In paired non-imitative duos two voices enter together with different tunes; their music is repeated by another pair of voices. Josquin uses these three presentation types more than any other composer in the collection, revealing him as a leader in embracing the new techniques.

Some Petrucci motets also include transitional presentation types that seem to be groping their way toward the sixteenth-century types. Accompanied free imitation (a pair of duos in which only one voice is repeated in the second duo) resembles the paired non-imitative duo. Free imitation for four voices approaches periodic entries and paired imitative duos. A brand new non-imitative presentation type also makes its appearance: four-voice homorhythm, unknown in the mid-fifteenth-century motet. This texture is found especially in pieces by composers who worked in Milan, such as Gaspar, Compère, and Josquin.

Analysis of the Petrucci motets allows us to trace the emergence of pervasive imitation and the adoption of homorhythm in the last decades of the fifteenth century. The general tendency is movement from a style that stressed irregularity and variety, achieved through non-imitative textures and free imitation, toward a style that stressed periodicity and the repetition of contrapuntal combinations. This new aesthetic had a fundamental impact on the music that followed.

SEVENTEENTH- AND EIGHTEENTH-CENTURY OPERA  
Mauro Calcagno, Harvard University, Chair

DAFNE, THEOLOGY, AND THE BEGINNINGS OF GERMAN OPERA

Anthony Alms  
Graduate Center, CUNY

Considered by many the first opera in German, *Dafne* (Torgau, 1627; music, now lost, by Heinrich Schütz; text, adapted from Rinuccini's libretto, by Martin Opitz) provides a unique opportunity to examine a fledgling German music drama in relation to both its Italian forerunner and to the ancient model. Of particular interest is the means by which the "spiritual" content of the myth, i.e., its outline of the relationship between humanity and divinity, was "translated" into the context of Protestant Saxony, via Catholic Florence.

Numerous "moralized Ovids" from the Middle Ages and Renaissance had already interpreted the Daphne myth in Christian terms. Rinuccini's libretto, though not intended as a Christian allegory, accords, to an extent, with these interpretations in their portrayal of Apollo as Christ pursuing the stubborn human soul (Daphne).

Opitz's adaptation, though, portrays Apollo not as God becoming mortal in order to save humanity, but as a divine being becoming human-like through a desire for self-determination. Underlying Apollo's passionate pursuit is an adherence to human will, with which Apollo is ultimately incapable of attaining his goal (Daphne). This portrayal embodies Opitz's conception of poetry as moral instruction, and resonates with his reputation as a "learned teacher of the Protestant faith": the picture of a being of divine origin confined to mortal powers ("fallen man") that cannot access (divine) love reflects Luther's pronouncements against the Catholic doctrine granting human will a degree of efficacy regarding spirit.

Thus German opera begins with a striking conceptual difference, one based on a uniquely German point of view. This paper asserts that the key elements constituting this conceptual difference are theological in nature. The paper elucidates these elements in Opitz's libretto—and, to the extent possible, in surviving descriptions of Schütz's score—and offers them as a framework for interpreting similarly "spiritual" themes in later works by German composers, including the "salvation" through reasoned action outlined in Mozart's *Die Zauberflöte*.

TWO *ELIOGABALOS*: A SIGN OF A CHANGE IN  
AESTHETICS OF DRAMA IN VENETIAN OPERA?

Hendrik Schulze  
University of Salzburg

The case of Francesco Cavalli's last extant opera *Eliogabalo* remains a mysterious one. As Mauro Calcagno has recently shown, there is a strong case to be made that it was for political reasons that it never got staged during Cavalli's lifetime, being replaced by a totally new version composed by Giovanni Antonio Boretti and performed in 1668. But even if political reasons are at the core of the decision to discard Cavalli's version, the question remains to be answered: why was a new composer put in charge of the music while the librettist (Aurelio Aureli) remained the same?

This paper proposes that the answer can be found examining issues of style and aesthetics of drama. Indeed it seems that in addition to political concerns the new version of Boretti also

answered to stylistic and dramaturgical concerns. In fact, it can be read as a clear statement for a new aesthetics in opera that came to bear in the late 1660s which put more emphasis on reflection and less emphasis on action. For this, the position and the significance of arias are crucial.

As an examination of the arias in Cavalli's version reveals, even the arias that are seemingly reflecting all have a function in the action as well—either they are overheard and someone gains information from them, or there is a direct response, or they are necessary to give to the audience crucial information of the state of emotion of the character singing the aria. By the late 1660s, this could be termed a conservative approach.

In contrast, the arias in Boretti's version adhere to a considerably newer aesthetic concept. His reflective arias seem to form a second layer to the drama quite independent from the physical action, an action of ideas and passions that is much more allegorical in its content. The emergence of this newer aesthetic can be seen in operas like Nicolò Beregan's and Antonio Cesti's *Tito* (1666), where the main character probably for the first time in opera history is able to sing an aria about his secret emotions while several other characters are present onstage, who nevertheless do not appear to be aware either of his singing or of his emotions. Since it does not make sense to interrupt a person's actions for this kind of reflection, the aria has to be moved to the end of the scene when the character in question has to leave the stage anyway, hence the emergence of the exit aria as the main type of closed form.

A composer like Cavalli, who throughout his career as composer of operas seems to have been most interested in character development and depiction of physical action, could not be at ease with such aesthetics. Therefore it only seems logical that the task of composing the music for Aureli's radically altered libretto was given to a younger composer.

## OPERA FOR A DOOMED PRINCESS AND A BEWITCHED KING: PRIVATE AND PUBLIC, OPERAS AND PATRONS, IN 1680s NAPLES

Louise Stein  
University of Michigan

This paper presents new case studies in the patronage, adaptation, performance, and reception of opera in late seventeenth-century Naples. Opera is here considered primarily from the standpoint of performance and production. I am particularly interested in explaining how the developing systems of production accommodated patrons' preferences, how personal taste shaped the politics of public production, and, on the other hand, how politics influenced intimate, private performances.

My first case focuses on two operas for a private occasion in private houses that were produced to satisfy public political agendas. A noblewoman, Lavinia Ludovisi, was the focus of international intrigue leading to her marriage to the duke of Atri (Naples 1682). Her marriage was of grave importance to her families and the Spanish crown, because her ability to bear children would assure the Ludovisi succession (the Ludovisi were Spanish grantees). I recount the intrigues that led to Lavinia's betrothal (through letters of diplomats, cardinals, and family members) and discuss her wedding celebrations and the opera productions. The first opera, a recent Venetian opera (*L'Ulisse in Feaccia*), was produced at the d'Atri palace in Naples. It was paid for and produced by an unlikely female patron, the duke's mother. Thanks to the extant payments from her checkbook, we can now learn something about how such a private, non-professional patron put on an opera. The second opera was performed in Spanish in the

Castello Nuovo and paid for by Lavinia's brother, prince of Piombino. This was *Celos aun del aire matan*, the Spanish opera commissioned and first performed Madrid, 1661 to commemorate the marriage of María Teresa of Spain to Louis XIV. Although scholars (Bianconi, Fabris, Stein) have previously noted that this Spanish opera was performed in Naples, my paper presents new thoughts and documents to explain, for the first time, why it was performed for a private wedding.

My second case study brings to light new information about the public productions of two operas in Naples—Alessandro Scarlatti's early *La Psiche, ovvero Amore innamorato* (Naples, 1683) and *Il Fetonte* (1685)—for highly political occasions, and the extent to which they were shaped by the personal taste and very private proclivities of the patron (the marquis del Carpio, viceroy to 1687). Carpio not only financed the operas (in part with public funds) but produced them; his taste and erotic politics shaped crucial aspects of performance and composition. My work with extant pieces from these operas and with records concerning their production, and my extensive research about their patron, shed new light on the subject of opera production in Naples just before 1700. This was a crucial time and place in the development of both operatic conventions and early modern systems of production. The marquis del Carpio turns out to be a very significant patron; his activity gives us a glimpse of how musicians and singers worked within and around administrative structures in Naples in the 1680s, and how private and public interests intersected in opera production.

## REPRESENTATIONS OF AMERICAN SLAVERY IN EIGHTEENTH-CENTURY OPERA BUFFA

Pierpaolo Polzonetti

University of North Carolina, Greensboro

At the time of the American Revolution, thanks to the reformist positions of Queen Maria Carolina Habsburg, the Kingdom of Naples was among the first European countries to embrace the rising nation. As a consequence, North American subjects became fashionable in Neapolitan opera buffa for about two decades, from Piccinni's *I napoletani in America* (1768) to Paisiello's *Le gare generose* (1786). Although the feelings of enlightened Neapolitans towards Revolutionary America were generally positive, the persistence of slavery was seen as highly problematic. The contemporary theatrical culture, primarily opera buffa, documents the changing European perception of American slavery during these two crucial decades. The political, artistic, and social links connecting the Kingdom of Naples and Austria determined a continuous exchange of ideas and works between the two countries, revealing related but dissimilar attitudes towards this burning issue. A few theatrical works also offer an eighteenth-century European perception of slavery in America surprisingly different from the more ethnically concerned perspectives of the last two centuries.

This paper examines three interrelated works within the Neapolitan and Viennese milieu presenting slavery as the central aspect of the dramatic conflict: the Neapolitan play *Pulcinella da Quacquero* (1770), the libretto *Amiti e Ontario* (1772), written by Ranieri de' Calzabigi and set by Giuseppe Scarlatti for the Austrian Princess of Auersberg, and the Neapolitan adaptation of the latter, *Le gare generose* (The Contests in Generosity) by Giuseppe Palomba and Paisiello (1786), immediately revised and performed in Vienna.

*Pulcinella da Quacquero* presents an English aristocrat who enslaves the children of an American Quaker. The latter preaches against the vices of the old world, manages to free his

daughter and allows her to wed Pulcinella. This commedia-dell'arte character—a symbol of Naples—finally decides to emigrate to Philadelphia, where there is hope for freedom and prosperity. In this context, slavery is presented as a perversion of European ancien régime, which the Americans are fighting against. Calzabigi's *Amiti e Ontario* more realistically portrays the internal conflict of a Pennsylvanian Quaker (Mr. Dull), who believes in equality and yet exploits black and Native American slaves. The act of mercy, through which Mr. Dull frees his slaves, represents the dramatic focal point of this opera. The same can be observed in *Le gare generose*, which replaces the Native American slaves with Italian slaves. In Paisiello's opera, the act of mercy is "extorted" from Mr. Dull by the Italian slave-girl Gelinda by means of a manipulative buffo aria alternating sentimental and comic sections. In the Viennese version of *Le gare*, this piece is replaced by a more serious rondò aria characterized by an unmistakable sincerity of expression and by a power of persuasion that were lacking in the original number. When after this moving piece Mr. Dull declares his intention to free his slaves, the audience does not laugh at him, but applauds his generosity and the accomplishment of his ideal of equality.

## TWENTIETH-CENTURY TOPICS

Elizabeth Bergman Crist, University of Texas, Austin, Chair

### FLEISHER AND THE ULTRAMODERN "ART OF NOISE": HOW THE PERCUSSION ORCHESTRA FOUND ITS WAY INTO THE EDWIN A. FLEISHER COLLECTION OF ORCHESTRAL MUSIC

Christopher Shultis  
University of New Mexico

According to the Free Library of Philadelphia, where the collection is housed, "The Edwin A. Fleisher Collection of Orchestral Music is the world's largest lending library of orchestral performance material." Ask any conductor with an interest in orchestral music: the Fleisher Collection is an indispensable resource.

The Fleisher Collection's fame centers upon the above. However, it is also important to note the Collection's activities while part of the WPA Music Copying project. The New Grove entry on Edwin A. Fleisher draws attention to the 2,000 manuscripts of American composers copied by hand through this program as well as to the 650 Latin American orchestral works collected in the 1940s by Nicolas Slonimsky.

Less known however, and the subject of this paper, is the role the Fleisher Collection played in the history of experimental American music, in particular regarding the early beginnings of what was then called the "percussion orchestra." It is becoming better known that John Cage was an early proponent of this ensemble and was himself the first "professional" percussion orchestra conductor. Cage was most engaged in this activity, as composer, performer and conductor, at about the same time the Fleisher Collection was part of the WPA project, that being from 1934—Cage writes his first percussion composition, *Quartet*, in 1935—until 1943, when Cage composes *Amores*. Cage's avid collecting and commissioning during this period made him the single largest source of percussion orchestra scores in the world. Where did those scores end up? In the Edwin A. Fleisher Collection. How did they get there? With the assistance of Arthur Cohn. Now perhaps best known for his work at Carl Fischer and as

the author of *The Literature of Chamber Music*, it was Cohn who, as Director of the Fleisher Collection from 1934 until 1952, got Fleisher interested in collecting American music. And it was a letter from Cage to Arthur Cohn on March 12, 1940 that announced the shipping of an initial eighteen percussion orchestra scores that would later be hand copied, score and parts, and thus made available for performance.

This paper will tell that story, beginning with the composer Johanna Beyer who initially contacted Cage about the project. It will end with short excerpts from some of the most important and least known works found in the collection, including music by Beyer, who wrote several pieces for Cage's ensemble that are in the collection, and William Russell, a composer whom Cage continued to champion throughout his long life.

There is extensive correspondence associated with the WPA project that is housed in the Fleisher Collection. And these materials will serve as primary sources in the telling of this little known history, a history that will draw connections between some of the most important experimental figures in twentieth-century music and the person who put them in the Fleisher Collection: Arthur Cohn.

### “SERIOUS IMMOBILITIES”: MUSINGS ON SATIE’S *VEXATIONS*

Steven Whiting  
University of Michigan

Setting his sights on “the origins of the avant garde in France,” Roger Shattuck stated that “The twentieth century could not wait for a round number; it was born, yelling, in 1885.” For music, though, the twentieth century was born more quietly, eight years later, with a piece reflecting the private agony of a mystically-inclined cabaret pianist on the Butte Montmartre. Erik Satie’s *Vexations* (1893) is avant-garde not just because of its harmonic audacity, not just because of the highly idiosyncratic logic of its composition (uncovered recently by Robert Orledge), but also, and perhaps most of all, because of its enigmatic performance note, which brings the piece within the realm of trance music, minimalism, and conceptual art.

John Cage’s realization of 9–10 September 1963 set the pattern for marathon “performances” of *Vexations* that have but questionable basis in Satie’s autograph. Such attempts misread Satie’s suggestive note as an instruction and arbitrarily define the unit of 840-fold repetition, which the manuscript leaves open to widely divergent readings. Not only are the ambiguities of Satie’s score ignored, the possibility that such ambiguities may be essential to the artistic conception is not even entertained.

Characteristically for Satie, *Vexations* suggests multiple, not entirely reconcilable significances. Its “thème de la basse” brings to mind the “basso del tema” of the “Prometheus” Variations and may be counted among Satie’s more arcane jabs at Beethoven (by comparison with his broad burlesque of the last twenty-three bars of the Eighth Symphony in *de Podophthalma*). And the sonorous sameness of its chordal structure evokes some of the extreme verbal games cultivated by cabaret poets with whom Satie consorted during his years of Montmartre bohemianism. In the end, though, the decisive aesthetic factor would seem to be the “unperformability” of *Vexations*. More than any other of Satie’s works, *Vexations* resists realization in sound. Virtually any performance risks distorting intentions that are elliptically presented and ultimately unknowable.

THE INFLUENCE OF GUSTON, POLLACK AND ROTHKO UPON THE  
LATE MUSIC OF MORTON FELDMAN

Edward Jurkowski  
University of Lethbridge

During the 1960s, Morton Feldman abandoned the elements of indeterminacy that had characterized his scores since the early 1950s and instead began a remarkable compositional journey in which he relied on his intuition and acute sense of orchestration to create works of ferocious difficulty in which every note and rhythm was notated to formidable precision. Concomitantly, Feldman's compositions also became increasingly greater in duration—although given Feldman's life-long predilection for painting, it is perhaps more appropriate to speak of his works in terms of space rather than duration.

While it has been frequently acknowledged that Feldman's passion towards Turkish rugs played a vital role in how these expansive compositions from his last decade are structured, in this paper I argue that their design may be more profitably explained by studying the composer's deeper appreciation of the large canvases of such painters as Philip Guston, Jackson Pollock, and Mark Rothko. For instance, uncovering Feldman's relationship with these New York-based painters proves valuable to not only comprehend his frequent use of the term "scale" to describe the form and length of these expanded musical compositions (an obviously problematic expression, given its association to portray the visual instead of the temporal art of music), but also the rationale behind his conscious attempt to disorient memory in his late works, an attribute that directs to what is, in my opinion, Feldman's crowning compositional achievement—namely, an innovative means to experience musical time.

BIRTWISTLE'S ORPHEUS:  
MYTH, MODERNISM, AND THE PERSISTENCE OF MEMORY

Jonathan Cross  
University of Oxford

Orpheus and the English composer Harrison Birtwistle (b. 1934) are long-standing partners. *Nenia: The Death of Orpheus*, a "dramatic scene" (1970), was his first explicit presentation of the myth, though earlier works had been concerned with related stories. *On the Sheer Threshold of the Night* (1980) is a madrigal that dramatizes Boethius's account of the central moment in the Orpheus story, while the recent twenty-six *Orpheus Elegies* (2002–4)—settings of Rilke—show that re-telling the Orpheus story is still a live and vital concern for the composer.

This paper will focus on the ways in which multiple ideas of Orpheus are represented in the monumental work that dominated much of Birtwistle's compositional life during the 1970s and 1980s: his "lyric tragedy" *The Mask of Orpheus*, which received its première at English National Opera, London, in 1986. Birtwistle and his librettist Peter Zinovieff present many versions of the Orpheus myth during the course of the opera. A simple, linear narrative is neither desired nor achieved; the work is concerned less with story per se than with the ways that stories can be told and retold. The story here keeps returning symbolically to Orpheus's physical *dismembering*, even while Orpheus's actions are concerned with *remembering* (attempting to recapture his lost lover through memory). So, too, the music. Despite the modernist "urge to fragmentation" clearly evident throughout, there is a deep resistance to this powerful cen-

trifugal force, a yearning for the opposite, for a line, for a narrative, for Ariadne's thread of melody—which attempts to hold things together, even in the certain knowledge that the attempt will always fail (just as Orpheus continues to yearn for Euridyce, even in the certain knowledge that he will never be reunited with her). Though Orpheus's head was severed from his body, it still continued to sing.

*The Mask of Orpheus* raises many fascinating interpretive issues. While sketch study and analysis can help in investigating some of these (examples of both will be given), a wider frame of reference is also required, because the work asks bigger questions concerning the very nature of modernism. Through ancient myth, Birtwistle confronts us with the constructed nature of the representation of identity. Orpheus remains masked throughout, his "true" identity never being fully revealed. Orpheus adopts different subject positions by changing his mask. And we, as observers, are invited to do the same. Birtwistle is saying something extremely important about how our identities are constructed, negotiated and represented. At the end of the work, words vanish, only memory persists (there is no new musical material at all), and identity seems ultimately unsustainable. This is both a source of the work's fragile melancholy and a symptom of its late modernity.

*Thursday evening, 27 October*

**(MIS)APPROPRIATIONS OF HISTORY: CONSTRUCTIONS OF “THE  
ENGLISH MUSICAL RENAISSANCE”**

**Deborah Heckert, Stony Brook University, and  
Charles Edward McGuire, Oberlin College Conservatory of Music, Moderators  
Byron Adams, University of California, Riverside  
Jenny Doctor, University of York  
James Brooks Kuykendall, Calvin College  
Leanne Langley, Goldsmiths College, London  
Jennifer Oates, Queens College, CUNY  
Eric Saylor, Drake University**

The reconceptualization of the movement traditionally termed the “English Musical Renaissance” (EMR) is one of the most crucial issues today in British music studies of the late nineteenth and twentieth centuries. The term is a linchpin in the chronological histories of J. A. Fuller-Maitland, Percy Scholes, Frank Howes, and Peter Pirie (though all describe a slightly different period for this “renaissance”), and has been used more recently as the locus for deconstructive criticism by Meirion Hughes and Robert Stradling. At root, all these writers are concerned with a composer-centered history, seeking to aggregate national progress on the back of a group of exemplary male composers including Stanford, Parry, Mackenzie, Elgar, Holst, Vaughan Williams, and Britten. They further describe a national English music history in terms of a nineteenth-century German model, celebrating “hero-genius” composers of primarily symphonic repertory.

As studies of music in Britain continue to grow in depth and sophistication, the monumental acceptance of long-held ideologies clustered around the EMR must be scrutinized and reevaluated. If the field is to move towards greater understanding of the function and meaning of music and musical practices in Britain, the authority of this ideology must be challenged by reexamining its basic tenets. Our panel aims to explore the logic behind the creation of this construction, the deeper ideological implications of its inclusionary and exclusionary devices, and the consequences of its enduring impact on the reception of British art music.

This panel traces the EMR’s historical trajectory, noting what has been lost through the application of the “hero-genius” narrative juggernaut, and suggests new lines of inquiry to create a broader and indeed more nuanced understanding of British musical culture. Each participant will present a position statement on one facet of the EMR. Adams will detail the ways in which both “traditional” and “revisionist” historians have constructed narratives of the EMR, illustrating the shared assumptions of these seemingly disparate authors by focusing on how they consistently marginalize the contributions of women and homosexuals to British musical life. Doctor will interrogate cyclical processes in which sound media solidify choices of genre, composer and piece through amplification and repetition, with reissues and newly “discovered” works reaffirming choices for future generations, while rejections invariably deny opportunities to those outside the narrow EMR scope. Kuykendall and Saylor will examine how the establishment of the EMR canon worked to assign composers “elite” or “ostracized” status, contrasting Arthur Sullivan, who lost his early centrality to the movement when he became “merely popular,” with Vaughan Williams, who moved from a political radical to the

“grand old man” of the movement by the vagaries of reception. Oates will reveal the disenfranchised Scottish compositional voices the nationalistic moniker “English” leaves in its wake. Finally, Langley will propose abandoning altogether the composer-history narrative, suggesting instead that education, professionalization, and the paradigm shift towards orchestral music were more fundamental, more important markers of a wider musical transformation across Britain. Further discussion between the moderators, panelists and audience members will follow the presentations.

## **RECONSTRUCTING NATIONS, RE-IMAGINING COMMUNITIES: MUSIC AND POST-SOCIALIST TRANSITION**

**Susan Thomas, University of Georgia, Moderator**

**Michael Beckerman, New York University**

**Kevin Karnes, Emory University**

**Katarina Markovic-Stokes, New England Conservatory of Music**

**Karen Peters, University of Wisconsin-Madison**

With the collapse of the Soviet empire in the period from 1989 to 1991, all who lived within the socialist world have been compelled to redefine their places within communities both local and global. In the former Soviet bloc, six decades of ambivalence towards the phenomena of nation and nationalism have left behind a legacy of personal and societal insecurity and instability. In turn, those states that have subsequently resisted democratization now must renegotiate their relationships with an increasingly globalized world. From the Baltic, where the dissolution of Soviet authority is widely known as the “Singing Revolution,” to the Balkans, where nationalist upheavals have been accompanied by folksong revivals and the refashioning of epic narratives, to Cuba, where popular song has been a voice for utopian socialist ideals as well as a prominent force in the emerging dialogue with capitalism, music has provided a medium through which diverse peoples have sought to reposition themselves and their communities within the post-socialist reality.

This forum will explore the ways in which the performance, reception, composition, and study of music has contributed to the shaping of events and ideas within socialist and post-socialist societies in both recent history and the present day. An interdisciplinary roundtable of scholars will consider this situation from a variety of geographic and cultural perspectives, each sharing observations from his or her ongoing research before opening up the floor for discussion. Michael Beckerman will address the cultural and political implications of the (re)emergence of Roma and other previously marginalized musics and music histories in the former Czechoslovakia. Katarina Markovic-Stokes and Karen Peters will share their research and experiences regarding the divergent and competing ways in which synthetic and deliberately multi-national forms of musical expression have been cultivated in the Balkans. Kevin Karnes will consider attempts made by Latvian composers and scholars to recover musical languages and historical narratives silenced by a half-century of cultural Sovietization. Finally, Susan Thomas will examine how these same political circumstances have affected the “geography” of Cuban music, effectively deterritorializing Cuban music making.

The breadth of the panel participants’ research interests and methodological approaches will allow for a rich and multi-faceted examination of music and its role in societies that, while very different in their geographies, languages, religions, and local histories, were all shaped

in essential ways by the twentieth century's socialist experiment. Of intrinsic importance to the researcher and central to this discussion are the many investigative problems particular to undertaking musicological and ethnomusicological research in transitional societies. We hope that the discussion initiated by this panel will provide all of those who participate and attend with new perspectives from which to approach these complex and pressing issues.

*Friday morning, 28 October*

## **CHANT AS AN EXPRESSION OF IDENTITY**

**Thomas Forrest Kelly, Harvard University, Chair**

The “repertory” that we call “Western chant” existed in times of rivalry and competition within the Church (some early abbots and bishops even had armies), when it might take weeks or even months to travel from one abbey to another. Consequently, local compositions, of mass and office propers as well as of the better-known “additions” (tropes, sequences, liturgical drama), constituted a significant portion of it. These local chants often served functions not limited to the liturgy: like altarpieces, many chants expressed the devotional agendas of composers, commissioners or communities and became symbols of their identity.

This session explores how medieval identities were expressed by the chant. The reputation of Metz, a city visited seventeen times by Charlemagne, rests on chroniclers’ reports of the purity of its chant transmitted from Rome and the perfection of its singing. (Here traces of this chant are presented for the first time.) At the ancient abbey of St. Jean of Réôme, which faced dominance by Cluny in the tenth century, an extensive proper office for its patron saint was composed and presented in a beautifully-decorated codex. In Benevento, two unique masses for the Transfiguration captured local aesthetic attitudes and expressed influences from Byzantium and northern Europe. And at the Carmelite convent in Krakow, which was founded by Queen Jadwiga in the fourteenth century, the brothers sang unique offices of the Visitation and Our Lady of Snows, articulations not only of their devotion to the Virgin, their patron saint, but also of their allegiance to the spiritual and political programs of the Pope and founding Queen. These case studies illustrate how identities were represented in choices of music and text, in their redaction into manuscripts and in performance. They also confirm that some compositions were created expressly to maintain identity.

For too long, emphasis on a monolithic “chant repertory” subdivided by liturgico-musical categorizations has diverted interest from individual compositions and repertoires of local *unica*, which may now be recognized as more than just functional music—as works created for a range of purposes and produced through individual artistic action. The purpose of this session is to encourage a new view of Western chant, one which accords better with medieval agendas as they can be determined.

## **THE MEANING OF METZ: THE ROLE OF MESSINE CHANT IN THE PROPAGATION OF CULTURAL IDENTITY**

Lori Kruckenberg  
University of Oregon

Historians have long been acquainted with the enormous political, ecclesiastical, and intellectual contributions of Metz to developments in eighth-, ninth-, and tenth-century music, yet musicologists have been hampered in their investigation of Messine chant because of the scattered and meager evidence. To be sure, several contemporary stories and statements (including those by John the Deacon, Notker Balbulus, Ekkehard IV, and Adhemar of Chabannes) declare the significance and priority of Metz’s chant, but relatively little Messine music from before 1200 survives, and thus the partisan accounts can be neither refuted nor

corroborated. This paper suggests some new ways for scholars to sort through and reconcile the Messine musical legacy insisted upon by various medieval chroniclers.

While previous scholarship has dealt with the broader cultural agendas of these narratives (particularly Roman vs. Frankish perspectives), this study will address more localized and time-specific agendas of the individual narratives. I will propose, for instance, that the pride of place accorded Metz and its chant *c. 800* was an attempt to counter more established Merovingian centers like Reims or Paris. Thus, the fabled attempts by Carolingians to assert influence through the dissemination of a single chant repertory was perhaps less about linking the Frankish north to Rome, and more about a Carolingian need to erase its parvenu status and expunge the lingering threats and emerging challenges of Frankish rivals past and present. From the ninth century on, the Messine moniker was repeatedly co-opted and used to establish the local and institutional authority of other chant traditions. The various medieval applications of “Messine,” then, deserve greater scrutiny with regard to their chroniclers’ motivations.

This paper also recommends a means towards a recovery of some of the early Messine chant tradition, whose dispersion was aided by the political ambitions of Lothar I in the mid-ninth century and again by the “Lotharingian cultural axis” (via Gorzian and Brognian monastic reforms) in the tenth. First, a group of ninth-century Messine tropes will be identified. Based on their patterns of transmission, I will argue that these chants were initially disseminated between 843 and 870, years marked by dynastic division and an evaporating ideal of Carolingian unity, and that their spread represents an attempt by the Lotharingian Kingdom to claim political dominance through cultural identity. The Duchy of Lotharingia re-emerges as a cultural force in the tenth century as sponsor of two monastic reform movements and patron of a second transmission of Messine chant beyond its boundaries. Finally, possible “Messine” features of these chants will be offered, providing a new perspective on and counterpoint to current discussions on Gregorian and non-Gregorian chant, and a link between music of the Carolingian and post-Carolingian periods.

## THE OFFICE OF ST. JEAN DE RÉÔME: ITS NOTATION, MUSIC AND MESSAGE

Barbara Hagg  
University of Maryland, College Park

The Abbey of St. Jean of Réôme, once home to the writer on music, Aurelian, is one of the oldest monasteries in Burgundy. Its patron saint, Jean, godfather to Clovis, the first king of the Franks, is the subject of a beautifully decorated manuscript from the tenth century that was written at the abbey: Semur-en-Auxois, MS 1. The manuscript includes a unique neumed office for the feast of St. Jean and its octave, lessons for the week, and documents about the history of the abbey. Only one other slightly later manuscript, very likely from Cluny, also contains the office of St. Jean, and with neumes.

The notation and music of this office, which has never been cited anywhere, is of the greatest interest. The tenth-century Burgundian neumes comprise a wide range of simple and special symbols that are comparable to the descriptions in Aurelian’s treatise, early neumes from Autun and the Dijon tonary in Montpellier, confirming that Burgundy must figure in any investigation into the origins of the better-known notational types of St. Gall and Laon. Although the office for St. Jean cannot be transcribed, the responsory verses are partially or

fully-neumed, depending on the amount of newly-composed music, and permit the identification of some of their tones. The melodic features of the office chant align it with at least one other office from the region, that for St. Germain of Auxerre.

The history of the abbey of Réôme suggests why the Semur manuscript and its elaborate decorations were necessary. The abbey of Réôme, property of the Crown for most of the ninth century, reverted to the bishop of Langres in 885 and was led by Maiolus, abbot of Cluny and then William of Dijon (or Volpiano) in the tenth century. Having thrived under abbots close to the court, where Clovis was mythologized, the abbey was now threatened by subjection to others with different devotional agendas, notably Cluny. The preparation of an elegant book with an extensive liturgy for St. Jean, patron saint, was a way of ensuring his place in the devotions of his abbey. When the office was written into the Cluniac if not Cluny manuscript, it was abbreviated and edited. No later medieval sources of the office survive.

Reasons for the composition of many medieval offices are known, thanks to the research of Andrew Hughes, David Hiley, and others. Offices created following translations or elevations or relics are as numerous as are those resulting from commissions. In this case, however, the office of St. Jean of Réôme not only praised the life of the patron saint, but also served to defend the distinguished history and ritual of the abbey. Like the falsified documents appended to the office and vita in the Semur manuscript, the music for St. Jean protected the identity of the abbey.

## EASTERN HERITAGE AND THE EMERGENCE OF A WESTERN AESTHETIC: THE FEAST OF THE TRANSFIGURATION OF THE LORD IN BENEVENTAN MANUSCRIPTS

Luisa Nardini

Italian Academy for Advanced Studies in America

The evangelical event of the Transfiguration—the culminating point of Christ’s public life—is a key theme in the entire Christian tradition. Its emphasis on Jesus’s double nature was discussed and analyzed in the exegetical writings of many theologians (such as Origen, St. Cyrille of Jerusalem, and St. Jerome, among others). The celebration of this event was introduced in the liturgical calendar of the Byzantine Church as early as the fourth century. Yet in the medieval West, the first evidence of complete Mass formularies only appears in the eleventh century in some Spanish and Beneventan liturgical books.

The strong political and cultural connections between Byzantium and Benevento after the sixth century may have determined the astonishing richness displayed by Beneventan manuscripts for this feast, wherein we find an Office, a processional song, a benediction, as well as three different Mass formularies embellished with Tropes, Sequences, and Prosulas. The Mass formularies include an international, post-Gregorian composition (*Benedicta sit*) and two local masses: “*Sanctus Deus*” (I-Bv 39 and I-Bv 40) and “*Ecce nubes*” (I-Bv 39).

Through the detailed analysis of these two local Masses my paper aims to highlight their different aesthetic attitudes. With its reliance on Trinitarian themes and the Old Testament, the Mass “*Sanctus Deus*” has a more archaic flavor, an impression supported by melodic structures. The choice of an undeniably Byzantine text for the introit and the remnants of archaic Byzantine modality in the alleluia are not only due to a probable earlier date of composition; rather they should be considered as further signs of the Eastern influence which was also prevalent in the artistic production of the time in southern Italy.

The Mass “*Ecce nubes*” reveals a more “modern” attitude, in which the imitation of the language and structure of Gregorian melodies demonstrates that its composer was able to master fully the style of the chant imported from the North. The relatively more “modern” taste shown by the musical setting of “*Ecce nubes*” is also evident in its texts. Based mainly on Matthew’s Gospel, they are not only clearly centered on the figure of Christ (rather than contemplatively praising the Trinity as in the Byzantine-like texts of the other Mass), but also bear more vivid narrative elements. I argue that these thematic and formal changes in the structure of the second Mass are analogous to some aspects of the artistic and literary production of the time. Medievalists have often considered the emergence of history as an academic discipline in ecclesiastical schools and the creation of large-scale pictorial cycles in churches across Europe, particularly in southern Italy, as marking the appearance of narrative art as a distinctive feature of late medieval western culture.

The two masses for the Transfiguration—balanced between the archaic reminiscences evident in the contemplative nature of “*Sanctus Deus*” and the aesthetic renovation expressed by the narrative vein of “*Ecce nubes*”—reveal unexpected insights into the complexity of the cultural context of southern Italy at the end of the eleventh century.

## HONORING THE HOME: TWO LATE MEDIEVAL OFFICES IN KRAKOW

James Boyce  
Fordham University

In 1397 a group of Carmelites came from Prague to found a new convent in Krakow at the request of Queen Jadwiga and with the approval of Pope Boniface IX. Their presence in Krakow furthered the spiritual and political aims of Queen Jadwiga, who sought to strengthen religious ties with Bohemia and especially to promote Marian devotion, both of which she accomplished by bringing Carmelites from Prague to Krakow.

Krakow, Carmelite Monastery, Codex 1, one of three antiphonals that the Carmelites made in Prague and brought with them to Krakow, contains proper offices for the recently promulgated Marian feasts of Our Lady of the Snows and the Visitation, both of which had been accepted into the Carmelite liturgy by the General Chapter of Frankfurt in 1393. The feast of Our Lady of the Snows was extended beyond the city of Rome in the fourteenth century and was endorsed by John of Jenstein, archbishop of Prague, who wrote some chants for its celebration. It was especially important to the founding Carmelites from Prague, since their convent there was dedicated to the Virgin Mary under this title. A lengthy dedicatory inscription in a different Krakow manuscript, now in the Ossilinski Library in Wroclaw, indicates that several convent officials, including the prior and the cantor, had unusually long terms of office, suggesting a high level of liturgical sophistication and stability in the founding convent.

The proper rhymed office for Our Lady of the Snows in Krakow, Carmelite Monastery, ms. 1 is unique among Western liturgies and otherwise unknown among the Carmelites. The Visitation office was promulgated by Boniface IX for the purpose of ending the Western schism, a vision in which Queen Jadwiga ardently shared. The Carmelites dedicated their new convent in Krakow to Mary under the title of her Visitation, thereby allying themselves with the religious and political aims of both Pope and Queen. Thus in celebrating these two feasts the Krakow Carmelites honored both the house of their origin and their new home, and reaffirmed their commitment to the Virgin Mary, as well as their own participation in

the spiritual and political aims of both Pope and Queen. Even though ms. 1 was revised in the eighteenth century, and a number of its offices were substantially changed in the process, the office of Our Lady of the Snows was left intact, while the decorated initials of the original Visitation chants are clearly perceptible, despite the later revisions made to the original work.

My paper will compare Krakow, ms. 1 with a Carmelite manuscript from Mainz, Germany, in order to reconstruct the original Visitation office, and will then describe the liturgical and musical details of each of these two important feasts before delving into the larger political and spiritual questions that these offices pose.

## MUSIC IN AMERICAN CULTURES

**Karen Ahlquist, George Washington University, Chair**

### THE BOHEMIAN GIRL AND THE VIRGINIAN GIRL: CROSSOVER OR CUSTOM?

Renee Lapp Norris  
Lebanon Valley College

In the United States during the nineteenth century (particularly its middle third), it was not unusual for an actor-singer to perform in apparently diverse entertainments such as minstrel shows, opera, and vocal concerts. Maximilian Zorer immigrated to the United States with the Moravian Singers, which performed vocal concerts in New York. Possessing an extraordinary falsetto, Zorer later became well known as a female impersonator in blackfaced parodies of operatic sopranos. Nelson Kneass performed as the Captain of the Guard in Anne and Edward Seguin's lavish premiere of Michael Balfe's opera *The Bohemian Girl*, and Kneass also arranged and performed in some of the most well-known blackfaced parodies of European operas. Joseph H. Kavanaugh performed in all the operatic productions of Joseph and Mary Anne Paton Wood during their tours of the United States during the 1830s. He later composed "The Virginia Rose Bud," an exceptionally popular blackface opera parody song, and performed with Sanford's Minstrels.

Performers such as those listed above were able to move between the minstrel show, opera, and concert in part because the music of these venues, while including some marked stylistic differences, still worked within the larger aesthetic of Western music. That is to say that the music of the minstrel show was much more European than African, and that many popular songs were similar stylistically to European, particularly Italian, operatic arias.

Musicological thought during much of the twentieth century tended to ignore or consider unlikely these sorts of "crossovers," because art music (e.g. opera and concert) and popular music (minstrelsy) were considered separate forms with different audiences and intentions. An important point made by the paper is that this divide was not so clearly drawn during the nineteenth century; operas, concerts, and minstrel shows were all commercial entertainments and therefore relied on popular acceptance for their success. In addition to the careers of the performers listed above, evidence to support this claim includes press reports demonstrating that a broad range of persons of diverse economic means attended these various forms of entertainment and publishers' willingness to intermingle art and popular music in commodities such as sheet music.

The careers of Zorer, Kneass, and Kavanaugh, taken in hand with evidence from the nineteenth-century press, demonstrate several important points: 1) it was not unusual for the same person to perform as operatic characters, blackfaced minstrel show characters, and in concert; 2) opera, minstrelsy, and concert music were all commercialized and each helped to define the musical mainstream; 3) the music of these genres was somewhat similar, in that it grew from common European practice; and 4) opera, concerts, and minstrel shows shared audiences as well as performers. These points lead to the indisputable conclusion that we cannot apply a twentieth-century paradigm to the whole of nineteenth-century performance in the United States. Accepted aesthetic boundaries cannot be preserved and at the same time adequately reflect the actual experiences of musical performers and consumers.

### “INTELLECTUAL INTEREST” AND THE MODERNISM(S) OF THE OTHERS

Catherine Parsons Smith  
University of Nevada, Reno

It been difficult to develop analytical models and practices that bring the music of certain “others” fully into discussions of American musical modernism in the period 1920–1940. I propose here that we may have set our sights too narrowly to be entirely successful, and to suggest some ways to move this process forward.

Writing to William Grant Still following the premiere of Still’s second symphony in 1937, Alain Locke, author of *The New Negro* (1925) and *The Negro and his Music* (1936), remarked, “It is so strange that nowhere among Negro musicians do you find any really intellectual interest in new works and experimenting.” (Still-Arvey Papers, 12/20/1927) There is also very little such “really intellectual interest” among white women writers on music in this period. Women are commonly found among music critics reporting concerts in the daily papers, and a few were prominent as editors, but they are relatively rare among writers in the periodicals with longer lead times (*Aeolian Review*, *Modern Music*, or *Musical Quarterly*, etc.) to which we turn for more considered aesthetic interpretation and analysis, i.e., for the “intellectual interest” that Locke could not find among black musicians. Thus it seems that both white women and African American males and females are curiously underrepresented in the critical, “intellectual” writing that has defined modernism in the concert music of this period.

My approach here is to return to the framework on which I drew when I first argued in 1988 that anti-feminism was an essential element in the aesthetic of musical modernism. In *No Man’s Land: The Place of the Woman Writer in the Twentieth Century* (volume 1, 1988), critics Sandra Gilbert and Susan Gubar offered three basic arguments to make their case relative to writers: the use of “sexual linguistics,” a “female affiliation complex,” and the outspoken “masculinist” statements of male modernist authors. My study “‘A Distinguishing Virility’: On Feminism and Modernism in American Music,” read in 1988 to the Sydney Chapter, Musicological Society of Australia, and again in 1989 at the meeting of the American Musicological Society in Austin (published in Cook and Tsou, 1994), demonstrated the applicability of those arguments to musical modernism. Numerous studies since then on the complex interactions of race, ethnicity, and gender in our musical culture(s) have lent a new richness to our discipline; they provide impetus for this paper, which expands on the earlier one.

I focus here on selected writings from the modernist period by white women and African American musicians and composers. My goal is to tease out markers from the seeming non-

interest of these others in the so-called “intellectual” that will allow us to identify more fully how they expressed their involvement with the new. The exercise should lead toward a broader interpretation of American musical modernism, one that will identify and then more richly contextualize their contributions.

CONFRONTING THE STEREOTYPES,  
CONFOUNDING CULTURAL HIERARCHY:  
AN UNEXPLORED WEB OF AMERICAN MUSICAL LIFE, 1876–1880

Katherine K. Preston  
College of William and Mary

American cultural life during the second half of the nineteenth century was both incredibly complex and astonishingly interconnected. Musicians, actors, and dancers—independently and in troupes—moved from city to town, from venue to venue, sometimes from genre to genre with an alacrity that would astonish most performers and audiences in our modern era of “niche” marketing. This remarkable and almost completely forgotten level of fluidity among nineteenth-century performers belies our twenty-first-century assumptions about the modernity of a mobile community; it likewise contradicts the convenient and facile stereotypes we so readily project onto earlier historical periods.

In this paper I will focus on one small group of musicians active in New York—and very much elsewhere—during the period from 1876 to 1880. These musicians were members of the Boston Ideal Opera Company, an itinerant troupe that was formed in the late 1870s and that would eventually become one of the most popular, acclaimed, and longest-lived English opera companies active in the United States during the last third of the century. The opera troupe itself—with its decidedly heterogeneous audiences and its mixed repertory (of old-fashioned English operas, new-fangled operettas and operas bouffes, and translated new and old continental operas)—stubbornly resists any attempts to position it retroactively within a clear-cut late-century cultural hierarchy. The extra-company activities of the musician/actors themselves, however, are even more revealing of the fluidity characteristic of a career on the American musical stage during this period; these activities are the focus of this paper.

My work is based on information from an extraordinary collection of almost three hundred and fifty letters written by the Boston Ideals musicians to their manager, Miss Effie Ober of Boston and Maine; the letters (individually catalogued) are in the Harvard Theatre Collection. A close examination of this small group of performers, including information about their earlier careers as well as their varied and diverse activities during the 1879–80 season, confounds many of our unconscious and ingrained stereotypes about nineteenth-century music and musicians, especially those working on the musical stage. The examination also reveals a great deal about the rich, complex, and interconnected web that was characteristic of the American musical and theatrical world during the period.

“REAL AMERICANS MEAN MUCH MORE”:  
RACE, ETHNICITY, AND AUTHENTICITY IN *LA FANCIULLA DEL WEST*  
AND *THE GIRL OF THE GOLDEN WEST*

Linda Fairtile  
University of Richmond

The prospectors, camp followers, and outlaws who populate *La fanciulla del West* constitute the most ethnically diverse cast of characters in all of Puccini's operas. Like its dramatic source, David Belasco's *The Girl of the Golden West*, Puccini's *Fanciulla* explores the transience of identity, as people of sundry backgrounds reinvent themselves amidst the tumult of the California gold rush. In both works, nonetheless, a rigid hierarchy of race and ethnicity governs behavior and social interaction, privileging newcomers of European descent—Puccini's idea of “real Americans”—over stereotyped Mexicans and Native Americans. Only Ramerrez, a Mexican bandit, succeeds in circumventing this code: educated and refined, he poses as “Johnson from Sacramento” and wins the heart of Minnie, the tough-but-tender saloon keeper.

My paper contrasts the racial and ethnic representations in these two related stage works. While *The Girl* reflects Belasco's own experience with the social conventions that enabled nineteenth-century Californians of varied backgrounds to share the same geographical space, *Fanciulla* exposes its creators' meager knowledge of the United States and its inhabitants. Aware that racial and ethnic distinctions would add American flavor to their Italian opera, Puccini and his librettists nonetheless overlooked significant culturally determined behavior in Belasco's play. During rehearsals for *Fanciulla*'s world premiere at the Metropolitan Opera, Belasco corrected one of its most egregious violations of the West's racial code, the participation of a Native American in the attempted lynching of a white man, but considerable discrepancies between play and opera remain.

The character of Ramerrez exemplifies the gulf between Belasco's and Puccini's understanding of racial and ethnic protocol, both in the American West and on the New York stage. By endowing his Mexican protagonist with the unconventional attribute of eloquence, Belasco legitimizes Ramerrez as a romantic partner for Minnie. In the opera, Ramerrez escapes the confines of a stereotyped Mexican identity through musical means, but his association with a characteristically African-American rhythmic pattern has the unintended effect of moving him further down the social ladder. Puccini shared Dvořák's assessment of African Americans and Native Americans as key contributors to the musical character of the United States, but by identifying a Mexican with a cakewalk and assigning a Zuni Indian melody to a black-face minstrel, *Fanciulla*'s musical appropriations blur all non-Anglos into a generic other. Such imprecise Americanisms earned Puccini harsh criticism, most notably from the Indianist composer Arthur Farwell.

While Farwell, Allan Atlas, and others have traced this opera's musical borrowings, my paper is the first to examine how these muddled appropriations, together with verbal and visual miscues, undermine Puccini's portrayal of the diverse population of nineteenth-century California. *La fanciulla del West* stands out among exotic operas because a significant portion of its audience possesses insider knowledge of the culture that it attempts to depict. My paper concludes by proposing that Americans' heightened sensitivity to questions of authenticity in this work can enhance the investigation of racial and ethnic representation in other operas as well.

## MUSIC AND PAINTING

H. Colin Slim, University of California, Irvine, Chair

## THE FAMILY CONCERT: A FRESH LOOK AT A FAMILIAR PORTRAIT

Katherine Wallace

Houston, Texas

Lorenzo Costa's famous painting, *The Concert*, has been subjected to much conjecture concerning its setting and the identity of its three musicians. The painting, now in the National Gallery of London, has accumulated various interpretations, from a depiction of well-known musicians performing at the court of Ferrara or Mantua, to an allegory of familial harmony, to a self portrait of the artist himself (for various commentaries on this painting see Gentili, Barcham and Whiteley 2000, Fenlon 1997, Johnson 2001, H. M. Brown 1987, Ramsden 1983, Negro 2001). For musicologists, it has been convenient to see the Costa painting as a portrayal of professional musicians at one of the better known musically-inclined courts of Ferrara or Mantua, but a closer investigation of the history of this painting and its artist reveals that it likely has a very different geographical and social setting. The Costa *Concert* can in fact be identified as a portrait of three members of the ruling Bentivoglio family of Bologna engaged in courtly music making. This thesis is corroborated by new evidence concerning Lorenzo Costa's biography and career which situate the probable date and place of composition during Costa's Bolognese period. The identity of the singers and lute player are further illuminated by comparing *The Concert* with other portraits of the Bentivoglio family members, as well as by an investigation of the role of music within the Bentivogli court.

Viewing Costa's musical portrait from this new perspective allows us to affirm the significance of family music-making in noble and upper middle class Italian families in the early modern period. It is highly revealing of practices of aristocratic music-making in general, and of the performance of the lute song in particular. In addition, this perspective is notably supportive of Bologna's place as a cultural centre in northern Italy at the turn of the sixteenth century, when current music scholarship seems to ignore Bologna in favor of Ferrara, Mantua, Milan and Venice, at least until the founding of the famed *Accademia Filarmonica di Bologna* in 1666. The association of *The Concert* with the Bentivoglio family draws attention to a musical tradition established well before the seventeenth century, and redefines the role of music in projecting an image of courtly nobility and refinement—an image which was particularly sought after by Ginevra Sforza, wife of Giovanni II who ruled as first citizen of Bologna from 1463 until the commune's ultimate demise and return to direct Papal control in 1506. Ginevra was highly active in her children's courtly and musical education and in creating a court which used music and art to raise the reputation of this Patrician family equal to that of the noble Estensi and Gonzagas.

## MUSIC AND FANTASY IN EARLY MODERN ENGLAND

Amanda Eubanks Winkler

Syracuse University

Sixteenth- and seventeenth-century medical and philosophical discourses dwelt on the nature of fantasy. At the same time, playwrights featured "Fancy" in musical entertainments and composers explored the musical genre variously known as "fantasia," "fancy," or "fantasy."

Thomas Morley describes the ill-defined and fluid genre's appeal in *A Plaine and Easie Introduction to Practicall Musicke* (1597):

"The most principall and chieftest kind of musicke which is made without a dittie is the fantasy, that is, when a musician taketh a point at his pleasure, and wresteth and turneth it as he list, making either much or little of it as shall seeme best in his own conceit. In this may more art be showne then in any other musicke, because the composer is tide to nothing but that he may adde, diminish, and alter at his pleasure."

According to Morley, the fantasy allows the musician's imagination to run free. He is not constrained by narrow generic boundaries; instead, he may do what he "list." But it is precisely the idea of imaginative freedom lauded by Morley in his well-known description of the musical fantasy that caused the related concepts of "fantasy," "fantasia," "fancy," and the "imagination" to be both celebrated and mistrusted in early modern England.

Early modern medical and philosophical discourses elucidate the tension between fantasy's positive and negative qualities. The fantasy was thought to retain and consider impressions from the external senses and was also able to conceive circumstances, situations, and images that did not exist in the external world. In this role, fantasy was a tremendously powerful creative force. But fantasy could also be destructive. Since the reason only understood the external world as mediated by fantasy, fantasy could deceive reason. Those suffering from disorders of the mind, such as melancholy, were particularly susceptible to fantasy run amok.

Some fantasias, like Dowland's *Forlorn Hope Fancy*, play with the relationship between creativity and irrationality, exploring the fecundity of the unfettered imagination through freedom of form, while also considering the dangers of fantasy through the incorporation of musical gestures associated with melancholy. In masques and musical plays from the period, fantasy is cast as feminine (and thus irrational) or ambiguous in gender. The allegorical character Fancy is portrayed as a hermaphrodite in Shirley's *Triumph of the Peace* (1634) and as a capricious usurping queen in Strode's *The Floating Island* (1636), where an erratic song by Henry Lawes, featuring dissonant cross-relations and a descending bass line, accompanies her coronation.

Although Linda Austern, Gregory Butler, and Graham Strahle have considered the connection between early modern ideas about fantasy and musical genres, this paper is the first to explore fantasy within a broad multi-disciplinary context. Analyzing Dowland's and William Lawes's instrumental music, medical and philosophical texts (Burton, Wright, Tuwitt), "fancy dress" paintings by van Dyck, costume designs by Inigo Jones, and musical plays and masques from the period that feature the character Fancy, I demonstrate how the dialectic between fantasy's generative and destructive qualities informed seventeenth-century musical production.

### C. P. E. BACH'S MUSICAL PORTRAITS AND THE POETRY OF THE MOMENT

Annette Richards  
Cornell University

The musical portrait is a contested genre. It represents both too obvious an imitation of the extra-musical, mere *musikalische Malerei*, while simultaneously its depiction of its subject necessarily hovers between the individual and the general, the specific character and the universal characteristic, rarely approaching the unique likeness of a painted image. C.P.E. Bach's own essays in the genre of musical portraiture (Berlin 1754–58) depict not only generalized

characters (in the manner of French character pieces) but also particular individuals among Bach's circle of friends; they were anthologized and widely disseminated during his lifetime, yet some years later Bach himself expressed an ambivalent attitude towards these celebrated experiments.

While the social context for these pieces has been studied by Darrell Berg, what remains to be explored is both their important relation to visual culture at the Berlin court of Frederick the Great, whose collecting of French portraiture and genre painting amounted to an obsession, and the extraordinary currency of the musical portrait (especially as visual object) in the later life of Bach—himself an avid collector who fostered the artistic ambitions of his talented son, and left a breathtaking collection of nearly three hundred painted and engraved portraits of musicians and other cultural figures at his death.

One of the crucial aspects of contemporary French genre painting and portraiture was the idea of the distillation of a moment: small intimate paintings such as Chardin's "petits sujets" or "petits tableaux" offered a private glimpse of life momentarily suspended. Bach would have seen works by Chardin and Watteau, among many others, in the palaces of Frederick the Great; drawing on contemporary art theory as well as the lively critical discourse in Paris and Berlin, this paper shows how, like their visual analogues, Bach's character pieces of the 1750s, designated by Bach himself as "Petites Pièces," represent early explorations of the idea of frozen time. In some sense transcending the painting as they play out character in time, these pieces simultaneously crystallize the visual into a series of musical moments, pointing forward to Bach's later exploration of this idea in works such as the "Abschied" Rondo H. 300, or the C major Fantasia H. 291, whose extraordinary endings freeze the player's final gesture and fill the visual space of performance with dying sound or even silence, like a bubble that can never quite burst.

It seems appropriate that Bach's final act as a collector was the creation of his own self-portrait—the F-sharp Minor Fantasy, H. 300. This work returns the discussion to Bach's famous (and hitherto unstudied) portrait collection, and shows how Bach's earlier intimate musical portrayals give way in his collection of musical (and non-musical) portraits to a grander vision of character. The portrait collection—a history of music and other arts pieced together, mosaic-like, from hundreds of individual faces—amounts to nothing less than the physiognomy of European, and especially German, culture. Here, the frozen moment is expanded to an equally timeless eternity of artistic achievement.

## PORTRAIT OF A GENRE: BRAHMS'S "SONG BOUQUETS" AND THE GRAPHIC CYCLES OF MAX KLINGER

Inge van Rij

Victoria University of Wellington

When Brahms received Max Klinger's graphic cycle entitled *Brahms-Fantasies* he wrote to the artist: "I must conclude that all Art is the same and speaks an equivalent language." Occasional attempts have been made to account for Brahms's attraction to this work and Klinger's art generally, and it has often been observed that Klinger was drawn to musical themes in his art, even giving his graphic cycles their own opus numbers. But one significant area of equivalence between music and Klinger's art has so far been overlooked: the relationship of Klinger's graphic cycles to Brahms's song collections.

In the first part of the *Brahms-Fantasies* Klinger has selected and combined five of Brahms's songs from four different opus groupings, ordering them and illustrating them in such a way as to suggest a loose framework of an ill-fated love affair. In doing this Klinger was enacting precisely the same process that Brahms undertook in his lieder collections, where the composer typically groups poems from different lyric sources, adds his own musical interpretation, and combines these in effective groupings. As if to strengthen this analogy, Brahms returned the compliment Klinger paid him in dedicating to him the *Brahms-Fantasies* by dedicating to Klinger his own *Four Serious Songs* op. 121.

The *Four Serious Songs* are actually unusual in Brahms's song collections, not only because of their Biblical texts, but also because the four songs have since their conception been treated as a single unit. Most of Brahms's other song collections consist of songs that were conceived independently and arranged only at the time of publication. Very few of them outline a narrative in the manner often expected of song cycles, and instances of explicit musical interconnections between the songs are rare. However, Brahms once complained to a friend that no one ever performed his opus collections of songs in the groups in which he had arranged them—groups that he likened to bouquets that singers would pluck apart. Even today, at a time when the relaxing of the organicist imperative has led to investigations of different forms of compatibility and coherence in a range of “multi-pieces,” both performers and musicologists continue frequently to pluck apart Brahms's bouquets, and my book on Brahms's song collections (Cambridge University Press, 2006) will be the first extensive study of the implications of Brahms's complaint.

Even before he was given the *Brahms-Fantasies*, Brahms admired Klinger's graphic cycles, two of which he owned. An examination of selected graphic cycles suggests reasons for this admiration. With their complex relationship to narrative, the subtlety of interrelationships between individual numbers which are dependent on the “Witz” of the recipient, their self-reflexivity and autobiographical allusions, Klinger's graphic cycles provide a visual analogue for the song collections of the composer he so greatly admired, helping us to understand both the nature of the “song bouquet” and the significance of Brahms's comment that the artist spoke “an equivalent language.”

## PERFORMANCE, POLITICS, AND THE PROBLEM OF “ITALIAN STYLE” IN OLD REGIME FRANCE

Georgia Cowart, Case Western Reserve University, Chair

The presence of Italian elements in French musical life was a perennial source of both conflict and artistic transformation during the Old Regime. From the earthy dramas of slapstick comedians to the virtuosic exploits of *seria* singers—either witnessed firsthand in France or known by reputation—Italian musicians alternately posed a threat or provided inspiration for their absolutist neighbors. While critics often opposed the standard features attributed to “Italian” and “French” musical styles in sharp polar dichotomies, the two frequently merged in practice with rich results: on a concrete level, the fusion of French and Italian idioms produced new genres and generic hybrids, while on a more abstract plane, debates over “Italian” music shaped fundamental conceptions of performance, the musical work, and the aesthetic status of music. Most importantly, Italian music served as a foil for how the French conceived of their own music throughout several generations of political and aesthetic metamorphoses.

This panel's objective is to generate new perspectives on "Italian style" in French music by exploring intersections between musical, dramatic, and political dimensions of vocal performance. In addition to expanding upon recent research into French opera, we juxtapose opera with the closely related, but often neglected, genre of the cantata. Insight into specific performance contexts comes from new documentary research on operatic sources concerning the *Académie Royale de Musique* in Paris including scores, libretti, and dramatic staging, as well as new information on court patronage at Versailles and a revised interpretation of the origins of the *cantate française*. We also address the role of a proliferating musical journalism in disseminating debates over Italian music during the *Querelle des Bouffons* of the 1750s, as opera loosened its ties from traditional patrons and came ever more strongly under the scrutiny of literary critics within a growing public sphere. Throughout these transitions, Italian music proved a malleable symbol of "otherness" with respect to French tradition—often representing some form of resistance to the seat of absolutism—while simultaneously finding a place at the core of political and aesthetic dilemmas native to France and critical to French national identity.

Finally, the panel addresses issues of performativity critical for changing conceptions of the musical work and the work of the musical performer during this period. One panelist traces a lineage of acting practice beginning with Italian troupes at the early Parisian Fair Theatres and lasting into the late eighteenth century, as seen in various stagings of Rousseau's *Le Devin du village*; traces of the comic tradition perceptible even in late revivals of *Le Devin* suggest the fluid boundary between performance and work characteristic of popular drama. On a philosophical level, another panelist argues that opera—especially insofar as it was perceived to be "Italian"—provoked an early reaction against the blurring of performer and piece that it was presumed to represent. We can thus locate in French musical criticism of this period fundamental conceptions of the musical work more often attributed to the nineteenth century.

## THE POLITICS OF PATRONAGE AT VERSAILLES AND THE BIRTH OF THE *CANTATE FRANÇOISE*

Don Fader

University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill

Although it has often been observed that Louis XIV's role in musical patronage was partly taken over in the late 1680s by his younger relatives who fostered new musical forms, the musical implications of this development have yet to be fully explored. This is particularly the case for research on the French Baroque cantata, where David Tunley and Manuel Couvreur have presented competing claims not only about the composer but also the patron responsible for its development. Tunley's discussion of the birth of the *cantate* follows the conventional wisdom that it had been developed by Jean-Baptiste Morin, a musician in the service of one of the most infamous patrons of Italian music, Philippe II d'Orléans. Following a biographical sketch of Jean-Baptiste Rousseau (inventor of the *cantate* as a literary genre), Couvreur asserts that Rousseau's employer, Hilaire Rouillé du Coudray, asked the poet to compose French texts in imitation of Italian cantatas, and it was Nicolas Bernier rather than Morin who was the first to set Rousseau's verse to music.

A broader view of court patronage reveals that *cantate* composition in its first phase was not so much the product of a single inventor or patron, but rather stemmed from the interaction of its principal adherents in a complex hierarchy of patronage maintained by Louis XIV's son, the Grand Dauphin. Dedications of publications, press reports, letters and court

journals indicate that the figures involved in the creation of the *cantate* were all clients of two of the Dauphin's courtiers: Orléans (patron to Morin and Nicolas Bernier) and Adrien-Maurice de Noailles (patron to Bernier, Rouillé du Coudray, and Rousseau). Orléans and Noailles introduced works by Bernier and Rousseau at Versailles in 1700, presumably prior to the new genre's development, and continued to further their careers for a number of years afterward. Interest in the *cantate* among these nobles formed part of an artistic response to political tensions in the royal court where the Dauphin's group adopted the sponsorship of Italian music and comedy in opposition to conservative royal taste. Thus the development of the *cantate* served the interests of, and was encouraged by a number of diverse patrons at different levels in the political hierarchy of the royal court. An understanding of the artistic implications of courtly politics thus provides both a clearer picture of the stimulus for the creation of the cantata, and an important corrective to the view of musical culture at Versailles as dominated by the *Roi soleil*.

## ITALIAN MUSIC AND THE DILEMMA OF LIBERTY IN THE *QUERELLE DES BOUFFONS*

Catherine Cole

Cleveland State University

Sparked by performances of Italian comic opera at the elite *Académie Royale de Musique*, the *Querelle des Bouffons* of the 1750s lured Parisians into a pamphlet war of unprecedented dimensions pitting Italian against French music. The *Querelle* is recognized as an aesthetic watershed, particularly for the "progressive" contributions of *encyclopédiste* Italophiles including Jean-Jacques Rousseau and Melchior Grimm, who advocated a new ideal of "natural" music closely related to rising conceptions of individual liberty symbolized by Italian music. At stake was not the identity of Italy but that of the French monarchy, torn between traditional conceptions of social order and calls for greater expressive freedoms—a rift that in the early 1750s centered intensively on opera as an emblem of absolutism. Despite extensive recent literature on related debates between Rameau and Rousseau over music and language, the political stakes of the *Querelle* have yet to be fully articulated; moreover, because the conservatives are often disdained as inferior literary figures, their strategies for defending and redefining national identity have been largely overlooked. Yet the Francophiles provide critical perspective on the stakes of musical "liberty" during a period in which political liberty was far from being universally accepted as desirable, and this paper therefore juxtaposes arguments from defenders of monarchical opera including Travenol, Castel, Caux de Cappeval, and an anonymous "Patriot" with familiar essays by D'Alembert, Grimm, and Rousseau.

Radicals and conservatives in fact concur on many key points. They agree that French opera mirrors a centralized monarchy by subordinating all elements of its spectacle—including subservient, "rule-abiding" French music—to a totality governed by the libretto. Both camps find that Italian musicians, by contrast, elevate individual expression over dramatic coherence and harmonic convention alike: infringing "laws" of dissonance resolution and disregarding the libretto's meaning for the sake of pure musical effect, Italian music breaks free from linguistic and dramatic constraints. For the *encyclopédistes*—simultaneously struggling for literary freedom from the royal censor—Italian music evokes resistance to tyranny, while for monarchists its perceived anarchy symbolically overturns the "natural" hierarchies of their stage and, by extension, society. Buffoonists bemoan French composers' affection for their theatrical "shackles," while monarchists privilege the operatic whole over its elements.

Reevaluating the conservative defense of French operatic tradition yields new insight into the political connotations of well-known distinctions between French and Italian idioms, elucidating why this dispute over opera was so important not only for musical aesthetics, but for the formation of a new public sphere dedicated to individual expression both within musical composition, and in journalistic writing about opera. More broadly, it also indicates a significant connection between the growth of individual expression and the emerging ideal of “independent” music itself, with the autonomy of music from language and precise signification a meaningful parallel for the liberation of individuals from the perceived constraints of absolutism.

ITALIAN THEATRE AND THE “BAS COMIQUE”:  
NEW SOURCES FOR *LE DEVIN DU VILLAGE*

Jacqueline Waeber  
Trinity College, Dublin

Jean-Jacques Rousseau’s *Le Devin du village* (first staged at Fontainebleau in 1752 and in Paris at the Académie Royale de Musique in 1753) figures among the most popular works of ancien régime France, yet in current scholarship it is still frequently misinterpreted, if not completely overlooked. Its generic ambiguity has vexed commentators since the eighteenth century, when Marmontel in 1759 called it a “modèle de pastorale”—hence viewing it as stylistically French—whereas it had been frequently labeled an “intermède imité des Italiens” since 1753. My recent discovery of the original recitatives written for the 1752 performances has shown, in fact, that “italianisms” in the musical score of *Le Devin* are rather superficial and essentially confined to the recitative parts.

However, the strongest influence of Italian style upon *Le Devin*—as yet generally unrecognized—lies in its use of pantomime through specific “jeux de scène” and the tribute that this pays to the practice of the “bas comique” proper to Italian acting, as exemplified by the Parisian Fair stages and the Comédie-Italienne in contrast to the “haut comique” proper to the Académie Royale de Musique (ARM) and the Comédie-Française. This point will be demonstrated using new documentary evidence, notably the first version of the libretto as given in the autograph manuscript and other musical sources.

Although Rousseau toned down these elements for the version of *Le Devin* performed from 1752 onwards, its Italian theatrical roots were strong enough to remain perceptible in the way the work was staged throughout the later eighteenth century. It is precisely the generic ambiguity proper to *Le Devin* that led the ARM to cast and stage it as part of a category of works invoking the “bas comique” at various levels. This paper compares stagings of *Le Devin* with several other works using a similar idiom, some of which were coupled with Rousseau’s intermède from 1753 onwards. These include Camppra’s *Les Fêtes vénitiennes* (first staged in 1710 and revived in 1740); Mouret’s *Les Amours de Ragonde* (first staged at Sceaux in 1714 and revived at the ARM in 1742); and Rameau’s *Platée* (first staged at Versailles in 1745 and at the ARM in 1749). Examining the intertwined histories of these pieces sheds new light on the pivotal role of *Le Devin* as a watershed in the “italianization” of the French lyric stage, and allows us to reevaluate the influence of Italian comedy at the ARM. Source materials concerning stage settings, costumes, acting, and ballet casts related to *Le Devin* and its “predecessors” from the 1740s will show that in escaping from its author’s own hands, *Le Devin* became more Italian than Rousseau ever wanted it to be.

OPERA, PERFORMATIVITY, AND “ITALIAN STYLE” IN  
EIGHTEENTH-CENTURY FRANCE

Downing Thomas  
University of Iowa

In *The Quest for Voice*, Lydia Goehr identifies a change that took place around 1800, radically altering our conception of performance from a “fluid and continuous relation between compositional and performance activities” to a rigid distinction between them. Out of this rift, Goehr argues, came two modes of performance: on the one hand, a *Werktreue* mode in which performance is considered a vehicle, not an end; and on the other a mode that centers on the virtuoso, on the performance event as creative act. Scrutinizing the context in which opera was written and performed in ancien régime France, however, it is clear that efforts to differentiate work and performance were already in full swing by the mid-seventeenth century. It is equally clear that compositional practices together with performance practices, from very early on in the French context, reveal the relationship between work and performance to be a highly unstable one, despite theorists’ admonitions to create absolute distinctions between them.

An examination of dramatic theory and criticism and of selected operatic scenes (which were often the object of such criticism) will sound out the question of boundaries between work and performance. In his *Pratique du théâtre*, first published in 1657 and reissued for many decades, the influential abbé d’Aubignac insisted on the strict separation between what he referred to as the “truth” of the work (the historical or mythological persons and events being represented) and performance (dance, music, costumes, machines, singers, and so on). Other commentators (Rapin, Saint-Evremond, and others) continued and expanded upon this attitude of suspicion towards performance. Far from being an epistemological shift specific to the nineteenth century (as Goehr, following Foucault, would have it), the distinction between work and performance was a primary feature shaping opera criticism during the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. Once French opera had become an established, if not always accepted, feature of the cultural landscape, the blurring of work and performance came to be more specifically identified as Italian. This occurred most strikingly during the mid-eighteenth century pamphlet exchange known as the *Querelle des Bouffons*. As an examination of scenes from Rameau’s *Platée* will reveal—marking, in a sense, a century’s worth of practice and criticism—operatic practice in some of its earliest manifestations in France thrived on the very problems that critics saw in it.

**REVISIONS, SKETCHES, AND THE WORK CONCEPT**  
Nicholas Marston, Cambridge University, Chair

CANONIZATION OR CLASSICIZATION?:  
REVISIONS MADE BY CLEMENTI TO HIS OWN WORKS, 1781–1826

Erin Helyard  
McGill University

This paper explores emerging notions of canonization in the 1800s and the new cultural transitioning from the mid eighteenth-century attitude of music as “event” to the early

nineteenth-century ideal of music as “work” through a study of the revisions made by Muzio Clementi to his own works. From 1781 to 1826, Clementi set about revising and modernizing a significant portion of piano works that he composed primarily in the 1770s and 1780s. A large number of the revisions owe their existence to Breitkopf & Härtel’s monumental *Œuvres Complètes* project (begun in 1804 and abandoned for a variety of reasons in 1817), which chose to initiate a “complete edition” of Clementi after two attempted editions of Haydn (1798) and Mozart (1800).

Clementi’s revisions have been previously discussed in relation to the fluid and changing notational procedures of the late eighteenth century as well as broader implications of performance practice, but this paper identifies a new self-promoting attitude surrounding Clementi’s industrious revisions that is linked to the novel idea of a “complete edition.” The notion of attempting a “complete edition” of one composer’s entire musical output was first instigated by the artist, scientist and economist Gottfried Christoph Härtel (1763–1827). He founded the influential *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung* in 1798, whose pages over the next two decades would help foster an aura of fame around Clementi—the “venerable master” soon becomes synonymous with his self-created epithet: “Father of the Pianoforte.” Simultaneously, Clementi sets out to complete “New and Improved” (for so they were termed on their title-pages) editions of the influential Opus 2 sonatas as well as his many other popular sonatas, determined to keep his oeuvre in the public eye with a series of prodigious re-issues and revisions.

Many of the revised works make use of the extended keys and new pedal effects of pianos that Clementi and others were producing and in many cases the addition of a wealth of new articulation, dynamic and expressive markings contribute to the visual look of a “modern” score designed for the cursory look of the consumer leafing through a score, even if the essential musical vocabulary dates from twenty years previously. The *Œuvres Complètes* project spurs Clementi to re-compose and alter substantial sections of mainly developmental material. This paper reviews, refines and contextualizes Charles Rosen’s notion of “classicization” as well as expands David Grayson’s work on differing levels of “authenticity” in early nineteenth-century embellished versions of Mozart’s piano concerti. For Clementi, the act of revision seems to serve as a potent adjunct to the newly emerging idea of a “canon” of musical works: complete, “correct,” sanctioned and “improved” by the composer himself.

#### APRÈS UNE LECTURE DE LISZT: VIRTUOSITY AND WERKTRUUE IN THE “DANTE” SONATA

David Trippett  
Harvard University

Franz Liszt was a pianist and a composer, an *exécutant* as well as creative artist. His keyboard works present an unfamiliar symbiosis of instrumental practice and work ideology, and thus belong exclusively to neither compositional nor performance music histories. If Liszt is a pianist, then he is also a composer, hence he becomes a hybrid: composer-pianist. Within this *ex post facto* separation, however, there is no possibility of fusing the differentiated parts into one “Liszt.” His compositional and performing abilities necessarily remain distinct in our historical understanding.

This paper will examine the staggered compositional history of Liszt’s sonata *Après une Lecture de Dante*—*Fantasia quasi Sonata* in the light of this schism. As a work borne expressly

of an improvisational practice, the “Dante” sonata exhibits paradoxical traits which bind it simultaneously to both performance and compositional traditions. Through a study of Carl Czerny’s influence on Liszt, and the improvisational practices for which Liszt was famed at the keyboard, I take a medium-sensitive approach to the “Dante” sonata, accounting for the extensive revisions and episodic music which seems to evade precise analytical scrutiny.

The “Dante” sonata was notated and revised by Liszt over nineteen years (1839–c. 1858), in at least four manuscripts, using three copyists, and four titles. He performed it three times in various stages of revision before Schott’s eventual publication in 1858. This process bridged two distinct periods of his life: the *Glanzzzeit* of immensely successful European concert tours (1839–1847); and the predominantly compositional span as *Kapellmeister* in Weimar (1848–1858). As such, the piece and its attendant revisions document an apparent change in Liszt’s identity from performer to composer, reflecting a consequent shift from a performance-orientated to a work-orientated culture. I will consider the nature and status of the “Dante” sonata in relation to its pre-history, drawing principally on the practice of improvisation, the ecology of a virtuoso pianism in the 1830s and 1840s, and the emerging status of the work-concept in the mid-nineteenth century.

After studying and transcribing the excised material from the four extant manuscripts of the “Dante” sonata held in Weimar, I have reconstructed the genesis of that work and charted its compositional history and generic evolution. First, I consider the historicisation of Liszt’s dual identities (performer / composer) and the significance this has for an abstract conception of his works. Second, I contend that the art for which Liszt achieved his earliest acclaim—improvisation—formed an intrinsic part of his compositional process. Here, I will argue that the “Dante” sonata is the static embodiment of thousands of hours of improvisation captured in a “logical” form, and as such, signifies an apparent collision of performance- and composition-based categories. Finally, a comparative presentation of selected revisions, alternatives, and variants, from the “Dante” sonata illustrates the extent to which self-borrowing and the interchangeability of texts raise questions about our modern work-concept, the notion of a musical text, and the functions of performance within a text.

#### DECENTERING THE SINGLE WORK: FRANZ LISZT’S *LA LUGUBRE GONDOLA*

Simon Obert  
University of Basel

To a greater extent than practically any other composer in the nineteenth century, Franz Liszt created music by means of transcription and arrangement. He did this with his own music as well as with the music of many other composers, as is well known. The pieces entitled *La lugubre gondola* (1882–1885) can be seen as characteristic examples of Liszt’s reworking his own music. Thanks to Rossanna Dalmonte’s recent discovery of a new version of a piece, there are no longer two, but three piano pieces; and if one also takes into account the chamber version (for violin or cello and piano), the *La lugubre gondola* group consists of four numbers.

The new constellation of pieces raises new questions. The paper proposes a new interpretation of the work as a whole and of the relationships between the four individual versions. I shall examine the types of revisions used, the implications of the new chronology, and show how the work sheds light on Liszt’s historical position. First, the pieces illuminate Liszt’s working method by exemplifying a broad variety of transcription techniques: the transcription as

a revision of an earlier piece, as an adaption for other instruments, and as a new composition. Second, the revised chronology calls for a new narrative about the compositional process. The piece hitherto regarded as the first must now be viewed as the latest; the recently discovered manuscript represents the new first version. Between these two are the previous (and current) number 2, followed by the chamber version. Finally, the pieces that make up *La lugubre gondola* shed new light on Liszt's historical position at the end of the nineteenth century. Recomposing a piece repeatedly—without any external motivation—indicates a modern conception of the musical work: the emphatic notion of the unified single work disintegrates into a series of pieces, no one of which is the only authoritative text. In fact, *La lugubre gondola* can be interpreted as a potentially open work: over the course of the four pieces, they become increasingly open in terms of form and tonality. Moreover, a series is always potentially open-ended by virtue of its capability for limitless continuation. In this respect, each new transcription is less a modification of a preceding piece than it is a fundamental alteration of the constellation as a whole. The pieces of *La lugubre gondola*, then, represent stages in a process that takes the place of the emphatic single work, and the “work” manifests itself between these stages. By examining the relationships between the pieces, the work's process-oriented, open-ended nature, as well as the different work concepts involved in its composition, can be made apparent.

JOHANNES BRAHMS, GUSTAV NOTTEBOHM, AND  
BEETHOVEN'S “HAMMERKLAVIER” SONATA

Marie Rivers Rule

University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign

Evidence of Brahms's engagement with Beethoven's “Hammerklavier” Sonata spans his entire career. In addition to his many performances of the piece, Brahms made notable allusions to the work in his op. 1 Piano Sonata in C Major and his op. 98 Fourth Symphony in E Minor. Brahms's appreciation of the “Hammerklavier” Sonata was taken to a deeper level through his awareness of Beethoven's creative process as facilitated through his scholar friend Gustav Nottebohm. When Brahms moved to Vienna in 1862, he developed a close friendship with Nottebohm. They discussed matters of composition and musicology, but also played music and drank beer together. Brahms was a close friend of Nottebohm's for the last twenty years of his life. Nottebohm shared ideas with Brahms concerning his studies of Beethoven's manuscript sources, and they edited some works together.

Beethoven's “Hammerklavier” Sonata was one of the works that Nottebohm wrote about in his many articles concerning Beethoven's manuscript sources. Sketches for the “Hammerklavier” Sonata are contained in two of Beethoven's sketchbooks from 1818, A 45 and A 44, the missing Boldrini Sketchbook of 1817, and many loose pages. Upon Nottebohm's death, Brahms was given the A 45 manuscript. It stayed in his private collection until his death in 1897 when it entered the Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde in Vienna as part of the Brahms Nachlass.

Brahms's ownership of this manuscript is significant because it contains arguably the clearest example of a structural chain of falling thirds in the sketch materials for the “Hammerklavier” Sonata. Brahms surely would have discussed the passage with Nottebohm. From examination of Nottebohm's transcription, the “Hammerklavier” Sonata, and Brahms's Fourth Symphony, it appears very likely that through the study of Beethoven's creative process, Brahms borrowed

the chain of falling thirds idea as a compositional device from Beethoven. Support for this conclusion is found in Brahms's similar employment of the falling thirds idea in works from his later period, and particularly the Fourth Symphony. What is involved is not simply a motivic chain of thirds, but a more complex process akin to what Schoenberg described as "developing variation." Although Schoenberg did not use this term in relation to Beethoven's music, I argue that the way Beethoven uses the chain of falling thirds in the "Hammerklavier" Sonata is highly distinctive, and that "developing variation" could also be applied to Beethoven in this case.

Because of Brahms's close study of Beethoven's manuscript sources with Nottebohm and the similarities in both composers' use of the falling thirds chain, it appears that Beethoven's "Hammerklavier" Sonata helped inspire Brahms's intensive use of this compositional device in his late career.

## ROMANTIC RECEPTION AND HISTORIOGRAPHY

Jessie Ann Owens, Brandeis University, Chair

### *SINGENDE SEELE OR UNSINGBAR?:*

### JOHANN FORKEL ON THE MUSIC OF OCKEGHEM

Lawrence Bernstein  
University of Pennsylvania

In his pathbreaking *History of Music*, Wilhelm Ambros waxed rhapsodically about the expressive content of an Ockeghem chanson. He characterized the famous triple canon "Prenez sur moy" as a work in which the composer breathed a "singing soul" into the music. This avowedly Romantic reading contrasts sharply with an earlier account of the same work by Johann Forkel, who found it is so devoid of musical impulses as to be "unsingable." How two German historians, writing only seventy years apart, could harbor such utterly contradictory perceptions of the same music is the principal burden of the present paper.

Two reasons have been advanced to explain Forkel's pejorative view. His transcription misconstrues the canon, badly mutilating the harmonic fabric of the piece. And, like other cultural historians at Göttingen, he inherited an historiographical outlook so doggedly progressive that it led him to attribute the flaws he discerned in late medieval music to the primitive evolutionary stage he believed it had not yet outgrown.

Actually, though his transcription of "Prenez sur moy" is inaccurate, Forkel corrected it in the body of his text. And though Progressivism is a truly important factor in Forkel's hostility toward some early music, he was not always that antipathetic toward it. Sometimes, his views on fifteenth-century music are those of a relativist; sometimes they offer outright approval. The vexing inconsistency of Forkel's approaches to early music reflects his reactions to turbulent historiographical changes that occurred while he was working on the *Allgemeine Geschichte*. As a Bach scholar, for example, Forkel saw the music of his own day as having receded from the summit it attained in the music of Bach, a view that must have made a substantial dent in his progressive historical outlook. And the inventory of Forkel's library includes many titles by philosophers who championed a relativist historical outlook, the knowledge of which helped Forkel to treat the music of the ancient world affirmatively.

Given this tractability in historiographical outlook and the fact that Forkel was the first in two hundred years to have solved the canon in "Prenez sur moy," it seems surprising that

he came down so hard on the piece. It seems stranger still because Forkel knew the extent of Ockeghem's renown better than any of his predecessors. Moreover, Ockeghem was known in eighteenth-century Germany as the "Bach of his day," a representation the authorship of which Forkel suppressed, although he must have known it.

Progressivism might be enlisted to explain Forkel's antipathy to "Prenez sur moy." More likely, however, he took his cue from a sixteenth-century theorist he favored greatly. That writer's strongly deprecatory attitude toward Ockeghem arose from his having used the composer as a negative icon in his own struggle to eradicate from music pedagogy the old Boethian numerical order. From what we know of Forkel's curricular involvements at Göttingen, it seems likely that he would have empathized with this theorist's views as those of a kindred spirit.

## WHO IS THE FATHER?: CHANGING PERCEPTIONS OF TALLIS AND BYRD IN LATE NINETEENTH-CENTURY ENGLAND

Suzanne Cole

University of Melbourne

From the joint publication of the *Cantiones sacrae* of 1575, the first fruits of their Elizabethan monopoly on music printing, Tallis and Byrd have frequently been regarded as a team—a kind of "dynamic duo" of English church music. This joint identity is given physical form in the well-known portrait of the two composers, prepared for Nicola Haym's abortive history of music in the early eighteenth century.

The extensive prefatory material of the *Cantiones* casts Tallis and Byrd jointly as the parents of English music, but at various points in the subsequent four centuries, the title "Father" of English (church) music has been bestowed upon the two composers individually. During the mid to late nineteenth century, Tallis's right to the title was undisputed—it is enshrined as fact at the beginning of the W.H. Husk's entry on Tallis in the first edition of Grove's *Dictionary* (1889)—and was largely based upon the popularity of his English service music, particularly the Litany and Preces and Responses. The end of the nineteenth century, however, saw the beginning of a reevaluation of the respective merits of the two composers, and a renewed interest in the music of Byrd. Writing in 1899, Richard Runciman Terry argued that one of the advantages of a more comprehensive study of Tallis's Latin polyphony would be the "dissipation of the absurd yet generally accepted notion" that Tallis was the greater of the two.

This paper will examine the reception of these two composers, both jointly and individually, paying particular attention to the change in attitudes that occurred around the turn of the twentieth century. I will distinguish different spheres of reception, differentiating between academic or antiquarian interests and the repertoires of the public liturgies of the Anglican church and also the Roman Catholic church, which, towards the end of the nineteenth century, came to play an increasingly important role in English musical life. I will, in the process, challenge the general musicological tendency to privilege academic publications and concert performances over liturgical performances. Thus, the absence of any works by Tallis from the list of publications of Musical Antiquarian Society, despite Rimbault's infamous 1841 edition of Byrd's Mass for five voices, is contrasted with the forty-plus editions of Tallis's Litany and/or Responses published throughout the nineteenth century, at a time when Byrd's Responses were still essentially unknown and unsung.

Finally, I will assess the contribution of beliefs about religious affiliations of the two composers to the reception of their music, and the role of Roman Catholic converts such W.S.

Rockstro and Terry and Catholic institutions such as Westminster Cathedral and the Brompton Oratory in the performance and promotion of Byrd's music. This will serve to locate the activities of scholars such as W. Barclay Squire in a broader cultural context, and will highlight the complex interrelationships between the academic study of sacred music and the liturgical and ideological requirements of the churches.

### “MOZART’S” TWELFTH MASS: CASE CLOSED?

Mark Everist

University of Southampton

For the world of Mozart scholarship, the composer's so-called “Twelfth Mass” is a closed case. Despite its great popularity in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, so the argument goes, the work is clearly not by Mozart, but probably by Wenzel Müller; it is therefore consigned to K. Anh. 232 / C1.04. With the exception of its presence in recent studies of Novello's publishing house (who was responsible for its first publication in 1819, and who assigned its number), the work has sunk without trace from the field, deprived of a critical edition, professional modern recording or a place in the history of music.

But for the nineteenth and much of the twentieth centuries, Mozart's “Twelfth Mass” was—together with the Requiem—his most popular sacred work, and for the composer's biographer Edward Holmes it could rival *Don Giovanni* and *Die Zauberflöte* in nineteenth-century musical affections. Holmes dedicated an entire article to the work, which was subsequently published as an introduction to Novello's vocal score from the 1850s onwards. The “Twelfth Mass” and Holmes's commentary together were important vehicles of effect in Mozart reception throughout the Anglophone world.

The “Twelfth Mass” came to assume a talismanic quality, and was made to stand almost as a synecdoche for Mozart himself. It finds an important place in Joyce's *Ulysses* and in the writings of Jack London. The work was also embedded in a wide range of cultural events on both sides of the Atlantic, frequently used for the celebration of changes to the environment or cultural framework of the inhabitants of the USA and Great Britain. It was at the center of events as different in time and place as the celebrations of the completion of the transcontinental line of the Central Pacific Railroad in May 1869 and of the 2004 opening of the airport in the channel island of Guernsey. Indelibly inscribed in the repertory of amateur and church choirs, the “Twelfth Mass,” still most frequently attributed to Mozart, continues erroneously and paradoxically to contribute to the composer's status.

The importance, then, of the “Twelfth Mass” lies less in questions of attribution, but more in its significance for the growth of Mozart's stature in the Anglophone world. It is a striking paradox that one of the most important Mozartian vehicles of effect was not even his creation, and that many of the discourses that surround the composer were triggered by a composition by another. The consequences of, for example, Holmes's detailed commentary on the “Twelfth Mass” pose a set of important questions for the study of Mozart reception and historiography. The case of Mozart's “Twelfth Mass” remains open.

REDEEMING THE REQUIEM: EDWARD TAYLOR AND THE  
“NATURALISATION” OF MOZART’S LAST WORK  
IN NINETEENTH-CENTURY ENGLAND

Rachel Cowgill  
University of Leeds

The Roman Catholic origins, liturgical function, and doctrinal context of Mozart’s Requiem were all factors that problematized its reception in protestant England. For over a decade after its first English performance (at John Ashley’s Covent Garden Oratorios in 1801) the Requiem failed to find a foothold. During the 1810s it was championed by the likes of George Smart and Thomas Adams; but anti-catholic sentiment and the lack of an established institution for non-liturgical performance of musical settings of the Roman Catholic mass continued to obstruct its dissemination. Various strategies were adopted to render the Requiem more palatable to protestant, patrician audiences, including instrumental (thus textless) performance, the “selection” of movements deemed most neutral in terms of doctrine, and the interpolation of spoken texts endorsed by the Established Church.

It was during the 1830s, however, when the protestant character of the Established Church was perceived to be increasingly under threat from the Oxford Movement, the Gothic Revival, and the growing confidence of newly emancipated English Catholics, that the most systematic attempt was made to “naturalise” Mozart’s Requiem. Edward Taylor produced an adaptation for the 1836 Norwich Festival, translating and revising the text in order to convey an unequivocally Anglican vision of the future life. A new narrative was imposed on the work, music from other Mozart works and by other composers was inserted between the movements, and the whole was renamed “Redemption.” Effectively, therefore, Taylor was transforming the Requiem into a post-Handelian oratorio, and his actions provoked heated debate in the musical and general press.

As this paper will show, *Redemption* raises a number of intriguing and complex issues for investigation: How did emerging ideas of textual fidelity fare in relation to this by now notoriously incomplete score? To what extent did the “creeping catholicism” of the 1830s in English culture affect notions of what was appropriate for performance as oratorio—the genre that expressed most strongly the core values of British Protestantism? How did this response to Mozart’s Requiem reflect increasingly Romantic constructions of the composer’s genius and death, and a growing, proto-Victorian obsession with mortality and the afterlife?

*Friday afternoon, 28 October*

## **THE NEW YORK VICTORIAN CONSORT**

**Julia Grella O'Connell, mezzo-soprano**

**Allan Atlas, English concertina**

**Francesco Izzo, piano**

Based at The Graduate Center of The City University of New York, the New York Victorian Consort came together in Spring 2003 in order to promote certain repertoires of Victorian (with a little stretching) England that otherwise go unheard.

In the course of recreating what could have been a representative (if completely hypothetical) evening of music in a Victorian salon, the Consort features music for the English concertina (played on period instruments), which enjoyed a tremendous vogue among fashionable amateurs, especially since, at mid-century, it was one of the few instruments of which women could avail themselves; art songs and ballades, particularly by women composers; songs by now-forgotten Italian composers who resided in London (thus Gaetano Braga and Angelo Mascheroni will figure on our program); and an occasional "traditional air" (with arrangements by the group's "resident arranger," Benjamin Bierman).

Using the format of a lecture-recital, the Consort aims both to educate and to entertain.

## **COLLABORATION AND AUTHORSHIP IN POPULAR MUSIC**

**Jeffrey Magee, Indiana University, Chair**

**"MUSIC BY JEROME KERN"—OR BY ROBERT RUSSELL BENNETT?  
WHAT THE MANUSCRIPTS AND OTHER EVIDENCE TELL US**

Stephen Banfield  
University of Bristol

The craft of a popular songwriter occasions curiosity for a number of reasons, chiefly to do with notions of literacy and inspiration. For how much of the composition was he or she actually responsible? Biopics inevitably show the raw, impulsive idea being worked upon by collaborators, from lyricists and musical mentors up to the corporate forces of music director, orchestrator and producer in the theatre or film studio. Interested parties are aware that Broadway composers did not and do not orchestrate their own works. Questions of authorship and precedence condition aesthetic responses, as well they should. It is right, then, that the compositional process in Kern, the earliest canonic Broadway master trained more in the business than the art of music, should be accountable.

While there is little if any evidence for material being published under Kern's name without his approval or sight, and plenty that he exercised maximum control and could be very particular with musical details, it remains uncertain exactly what Kern wrote out himself and what was done under instruction by his copyist or his orchestrator, with or without the free hand to act as arranger. The question will probably remain open for a long while yet, but selective study of the manuscripts is leading towards tentative conclusions. In this paper three of Kern's associates will be considered: his long-term assistant Charles Miller, who worked with Kern at his publisher, T. B. Harms, from 1915 or earlier and remained associated with him

in California in the 1940s; the orchestrator of the earlier Kern shows, Frank Saddler, model for Jim Hessler in *Till the Clouds Roll By*; and, most important, Robert Russell Bennett, the Nadia Boulanger pupil whose attitude to Kern remained ambiguous throughout an association that lasted over twenty years and resulted in full scores for almost all his later musicals for stage and screen.

Early holograph piano/vocal scores survive in Kern's hand, and that for *Oh, I Say!* (1913) will be examined. It was probably later in his career, when he had become "the Great God Kern," that he had the confidence to let an arranger act as amanuensis and realize his sketches, and it is this process that must be most carefully scrutinized, using Kern's sketches, the fair copies of Bennett and others, and Bennett's testimony as witness. The genesis of the songs "Sitting pretty," "Why do I love you?" and "Ol' man River" will be considered, using the above evidence and, in the last case, variant imprints and early recordings. Finally, Kern's authority over continuity in the Act I finale of *Sitting Pretty* will be demonstrated.

### "THE WORLD'S LONGEST SYMPHONY": ISSUES OF COLLABORATION AND THEMATIC TRANSFORMATION IN RICHARD RODGERS AND ROBERT RUSSELL BENNETT'S *VICTORY AT SEA*

George Ferencz

University of Wisconsin-Whitewater

NBC television's pioneering documentary *Victory at Sea* (VAS) first aired in 1952–53, its twenty-six half-hour episodes focusing on the U.S. Navy's activities around the globe during the Second World War. The underscoring was credited to Richard Rodgers (music) and Robert Russell Bennett (arranger, conducting the NBC Symphony). VAS's fully symphonic score constituted a production value unmatched in today's network-, cable- or public-television documentaries.

Bennett prepared suites of VAS excerpts for RCA that have, on LP and CD, been strong sellers for decades. Bennett's VAS "Symphonic Scenario" medley opened the May 2004 dedication of the National World War II Memorial, a reminder that the VAS score serves as many Americans' principal musical commemoration of the war.

VAS scholarship to date has been undertaken primarily by communication and popular culture researchers. No detailed examination of the Rodgers-Bennett music has been done. Studies of Rodgers's career, and even his autobiography *Musical Stages*, divulge few details about his contribution or the nature of the Rodgers-Bennett partnership.

Materials examined include Bennett's inked holograph scores for the series (3,920 pages), Rodgers's holograph materials, and the published VAS "Symphonic Scenario" medleys prepared by Bennett for orchestra, concert band, and piano. Among interviewees were VAS assistant producer Donald B. Hyatt and Bennett's aide at NBC, George Zevitas. Audio and video materials examined include the commercial VHS/DVD releases of the twenty-six VAS episodes as well as archival LP recordings, privately pressed by RCA in the 1950s, of the complete underscoring, minus the narration.

Rodgers contributed twelve short compositions—"themes" descriptive of locales or action onscreen. These amounted to less than thirty minutes of music, no more than he had typically written for any of his stage musicals. Three themes were written for the initial episode, recorded March 1952. Rodgers composed all but one of his themes for the first half of the twenty-six-episode series, his involvement nearly ending even before the series' broadcast debut on 26 October. Bennett reports that "we just barely finished writing and recording the

twenty-sixth show in time for it to go on the air (3 May 1953),” whereas Rodgers had long since turned his attention to the musical comedy *Me and Juliet*, which opened out-of-town on 20 April.

Because of its eleven-hour aggregate length, Victory at Sea’s orchestral soundtrack was long included with pieces by Mahler and Havergal Brian in the *Guinness Book of World Records* “world’s longest symphony” entry. The score is comprised of: (1) Rodgers’s themes, in straightforward orchestral transcription by Bennett; (2) Rodgers’s thematic material manipulated by Bennett, including motivic development, thematic transformation, reharmonization, and added counterpoint; and (3) portions that are wholly Bennett’s creation, ranging from brief interludes to the underscoring for entire half-hour episodes. Examples from all three categories will be presented.

## DRAMATIC INTEGRITY IN THE MUSICAL COMEDIES OF GEORGE GERSHWIN

Howard Pollack  
University of Houston

Although commentators often regard the prewar American musical comedy as so much window dressing for star performers and hit songs, especially as compared to those so-called “integrated” musical plays that followed in the wake of *Oklahoma!*, this attitude fails to come to grips with the prewar musical comedy as a viable theatrical genre in its own right. As the drama critic Harold Clurman wrote in 1962, “Whatever fine distinctions are made between the musicals after the great Rodgers and Hammerstein hit and those of Irving Berlin, Jerome Kern, George Gershwin, Cole Porter and Vincent Youmans, as well as those of Rodgers himself (in collaboration with Larry Hart) in the twenties and thirties, it is certain that the work of those early days was of the same nature as, and of equal (if not superior) value to, that of our more “integrated” musicals today.”

This paper on the Gershwin musicals aims to support Clurman’s contention by considering them as “integrated” works of art that, while highly formulaic in many respects, and somewhat distinctive from traditional comic opera in their emphasis on physical humor and dance, still honor the requirements of the narrative lyric stage—that is, to tell a story with the aid of music. My argument draws upon a study of correspondence, sketches, scores, scripts, published music, and reviews regarding Gershwin’s nineteen book musicals for Broadway and his three book musicals for Hollywood.

This overview will summarize information regarding: 1) Gershwin’s dramatic intentions and those of his collaborators; 2) the backgrounds of his librettists; 3) the use of literary and dramatic sources; 4) the expectations and reactions of critics; 5) revivals; and 6) the form and content of the works themselves. As an illustration, I will discuss Gershwin’s 1925 musical, *Tell Me More*, and how its score helps illuminate its dramatic structure and themes.

## THE DIVINELY DECADENT LIVES OF *CABARET*

James Leve  
Northern Arizona University

Fred Ebb’s death last year marked the end of Kander and Ebb, the longest composer-lyricist collaboration in musical theater history. When John Kander and Fred Ebb met in the

sixties, the Broadway musical was beginning a precipitous decline in popularity. The Rodgers and Hammerstein model, which had reigned since 1943, was incapable of responding to the disillusionment created by the Cold War, and rock was replacing Broadway music as the primary popular idiom. With *Cabaret*, Kander and Ebb infused much needed new energy into the musical theater genre and established the concept musical as a viable alternative for the traditional book musical as exemplified by *Oklahoma!* *Cabaret* transformed the musical into a more commentative, self-reflective, and ironic genre, thereby allowing it to resonate with modern audiences.

Kander and Ebb's demo recording of *Cabaret*, which contains many songs that were eventually cut from the show, reveals that they and Harold Prince began writing a conventional book musical. Early on, however, Prince came up with the idea of featuring an emcee. In response, Kander and Ebb wrote a series of evocative numbers that they called "The Berlin Songs," which included "Willkommen" and "Two Ladies." Kander based the music of these songs not on Kurt Weill, as is generally believed, but on the same authentic 1920s cabaret music, such as that composed by Friedrich Holländer, that influenced Weill. The writers had intended *The Berlin Songs* to be performed as a single unit in the cabaret. But when the writers and Prince decided to disperse the songs over the course of the entire story, thereby moving the musical in and out of the metaphorical space they called "limbo," the concept musical was fully born. Kander and Ebb continued to exploit the concept musical format for *Zorba*, *Chicago*, *Kiss of the Spider Woman*, and the as yet unproduced *Skin of Our Teeth* and *The Minstrel Show*.

An examination of Bob Fosse's film version and Sam Mendes's Broadway revival of *Cabaret* highlights the adaptability of the concept musical in general and *Cabaret* in particular. Fosse further exploited the metaphorical nature of the original 1966 *Cabaret* by expunging the non-diegetic book songs. The film's male protagonist is left with no song to sing, and thereby functions more like Christopher Isherwood's point-of-view character from *The Berlin Stories*, who participates in the action but also observes it with the so-called objectivity of a camera. Mendes's 1998 revival goes even further by locating the entire musical in the cabaret. Mendes purposefully exaggerated the decadent entertainment and camp strategies associated with Nazi culture in order to foreground the musical's political message.

The research for this paper relies on primary resources, including musical sketches in Kander's and Ebb's personal papers. Numerous interviews with Kander and Ebb, as well as materials in the Harold Prince Papers at the New York Public Library of the Performing Arts, shed light on the development of *Cabaret*.

## MEDIEVAL THEORY

Jan Herlinger, Louisiana State University, Chair

### CORRER 336, PART 4: A NEW ITALIAN SOURCE FOR LATE MEDIEVAL MUSIC THEORY

Linda Cummins  
University of Alabama

Manuscript Correr 336 of the Biblioteca del Museo Correr, Venice, was first described in print in Volume 6 of RISM's *The Theory of Music* (2003). The composite manuscript contains two treatises on hermetic philosophy, a handwritten copy of Gaffurio's *Practica musicae* dated

1502, and an Italian miscellany of late medieval music theory. The miscellany, copied into two gatherings of eight bifolia each comprising ff. 425–456 of the composite, assembles texts dealing with fundamentals of music, hexachords, mutations, coniunctae, and modal theory, without a single attribution. This paper offers an analysis of the miscellany's contents and a sketch of its significance, based on study of the manuscript in Venice and subsequent work with digital photographs made by the presenter, some of which will be shown.

RISM signals a connection between the first item in the collection (ff. 425r–434r) and the Berkeley Theory Manuscript: “cfr. *Ellsworth, Manuscript*, p. 84 *et passim*”—“p. 84” referencing the famous discussion of mode in “motets, ballades, and the like.” But the item actually presents a new source for the Berkeley Treatise, Book 1.2–9 (pp. 48–108 in Ellsworth's 1984 edition), whose readings often accord with those of the Catania manuscript and are occasionally preferable to those of the Berkeley manuscript itself. With the other sources, it is an important witness to the dissemination not only of the doctrine of mode in polyphonic and secular works but to that of *coniunctae* (hexachords built on notes other than C, F, and G), a doctrine that figured prominently in the development of *musica ficta* theory.

The miscellany offers as well (ff. 434r–444r) a sixth source for *Divina auxiliante gratia*, a digest of Marchetto's *Lucidarium* (1317/18), the seminal modal treatise of medieval Italy (Wiering, *The Language of the Modes*, 2001); as this digest frequently “stands in” for the longer *Lucidarium* in Italian fifteenth-century compilations, it is one of the most important witnesses to Marchetto's continuing influence during the second century after the composition of his treatise (Herlinger, “Marchetto's Influence,” 1990). The redactor of this idiosyncratic version of *Divina*, however, gave it no comprehensive caption, retaining its incipit but replacing its opening reference to Marchetto with a simple “etc.” (thus rendering its doctrine anonymous) and marking its end only by turning to a new topic—with words I have identified as coming from Martianus Cappella. He also abstracted phrases from *Divina*'s preface, placing them in a work nearer the end of the manuscript, where they serve to define the character of the entire collection (words from *Divina* in italics): “Eager to treat of the foundations of chant, I compiled this brief work, *first for my own edification, second for the profit of pupils*, not in my own words but in those of others—as if plucking flowers out of a meadow.”

## CONTRARY TO THE LAWS OF NATURE: THE JUDGMENT OF MUSIC AS “NATURAL” AND “UNNATURAL” IN MEDIEVAL MUSIC THEORY

Anne Johnson  
Graduate Center, CUNY

Our ability to understand historical texts about music rests largely on our understanding of the terms used in those texts. While this may seem obvious with regard to technical musical vocabulary, it is just as true for certain more general words that bear a rich extra-musical connotation. *Natura*, Latin for “nature,” is one such term.

Writers of Late Antiquity and the Middle Ages had a tendency to rely on accepted authority to explain and justify phenomena of music, rather than to develop new, individualized answers to old questions. Often this authority is some kind of presupposed order of existence, or divine law, commonly referred to as “nature.” Nature—conceived as either an external or an internal force—is seen to influence how music is formed and judged. The adjective “natural” is also applied judgmentally to music, as are adverbial phrases meaning “according to nature”

and “contrary to nature.” To trace the history of these usages is to consider the strictly musical tradition as well as influences from writings on philosophy and religion.

Early in Western music history one finds instances where criticism against “unnatural” music is severe, even tinged with morality. Music that does not follow the laws of nature is described as “perverted” and “corrupt.” Such apparent outrage is as common among earlier Greek writers as it is in the works of medieval Christian writers. Specific references to Christianity using *natura* in Latin musical writings tend to be statements of credo, however, and employ gentler language even when passing judgment about music. Music described as natural is also considered divine; not only does it follow God’s law, but it is sent by God. Thus, in some sources, natural music is distinct from, and superior to, man-made music.

According to many writers, nature itself fashioned the rules for the way music works. These rules are an outgrowth of the laws of physics and mathematics, and so cannot be questioned or changed. Disobeying the rules of natural music leads to musical disorder. In their struggle to keep music theory up to date with developments in musical practice, some authors level judgment against the unnaturalness of new music or musical habits. On the other hand, some claim that the new musical system under consideration is more natural than the old, authoritative one.

This paper cites examples of the term *natura* (and its Greek predecessor, *physis*) from primary sources dating from the fourth century BCE through the fourteenth century CE.

## BONE IN THE HEART: METAPHORIC MANIPULATION OF BODY PARTS IN THIRTEENTH- AND FOURTEENTH-CENTURY FRENCH AND ITALIAN MUSIC THEORY TREATISES

Luminita Florea  
Berkeley, California

In the early 1960s Edward Lowinsky drew a very intriguing analogy between the state of sixteenth-century anatomy represented in the works of Andreas Vesalius, and the state of contemporary musical composition and theory represented in the works of Josquin and Isaac, among composers, and Lampadius, among theorists. Essentially, Lowinsky observed that “both anatomists and musical analysts . . . were motivated by a new understanding of the body—human or musical—as a completely integrated, unified entity.”

It appears that, unlike medical historians, music historians undertook no further exploration of the interweaving of anatomy and music theory in the pre-Vesalian period. Yet the use of anatomic terminology in medieval music theory treatises was neither casual nor cosmetic; rather, it was a deliberate and coherent choice by those who wrote to explain music theory concepts.

This paper discloses the manner in which, some two hundred and fifty to three hundred years before Vesalius and the musicians named by Lowinsky, music theorists referred in their works to internal organs, systems, and fluids, both human and animal, and arranged them hierarchically according to function and level of performance. The organs were then used as verbal *similes* to make matters musical more easily understood. Concepts and terminology were borrowed from texts of anatomy, surgery, dissection, treatment, and medication used at the medical schools in Paris, Bologna, and Padua. Anatomic drawings (called *figure incisionis*) developed in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries to illustrate medical tracts were known as well to music theorists of the time.

From the anatomic imagery chosen by music theorists it is clear that Johannes Grocheio was a proponent of Galenic theories as the latest being taught at Paris, while Marchetto of Padua attempted to reconcile Galen and Aristotle, just like his concitizen, Pietro d'Abano, did in his *Conciliator differentiarum philosophorum et medicorum*. Perseus and Petrus discoursed on the brain, the skull, the heart, and the arterial system while describing the structure of the hexachord; Grocheio dwelled on the respective functions of the heart, liver, and brain when prescribing composition rules for motets and organa; and Marchetto went to extreme interpretive lengths when describing the structure of the heart to explain the role of *proprietas* in mensural notation. More importantly, through Marchetto's comparative approach one rediscovers concepts of animal and human anatomy that were common knowledge since classical antiquity, yet have been lost to the study of human anatomy since dispelled as "myths" by Vesalius in the sixteenth century. A striking example is the belief in the presence of a bone—*os cordis*—not only in the heart of large animals (a fact known to modern zoology), but also in the human heart (a fact known to Albert the Great and all the intervening generations up to Vesalius).

In addition to the written and spoken word, the paper will include slides and web-based images of pertinent anatomical drawings (and the interpretation of these) found in medical tracts that were familiar to music theorists.

#### ANONYMOUS IV AS AN INFORMANT ON THE CRAFT OF WRITING MUSIC

John Haines

University of Toronto

The treatise by the late thirteenth-century English writer known only as Anonymous IV is rightly famous as an unparalleled report on the performance and nomenclature of organa in Paris. But Anonymous IV also deserves recognition for another role, that of an informant on the craft of writing music. In his treatise he breaks centuries of silence on the mechanical aspects of his trade. In particular, the English anonymous writer provides us with three important insights into the development of square notation, the most dramatic musical calligraphic change in his day. Anonymous IV first points to music scribes as largely responsible for this development. Singing the praises of a century's worth of famous music writers and their teachers, he credits these craftsmen with a wide range of accomplishments, including the adoption of the square note whose importance was later stressed by Parisian liberal arts scholars. Secondly, the English anonymous hints at the combined importance of English and French writing centers in effecting a gradual shift from neume to square. Indeed, Anonymous IV suggests that the *nota quadrata* was far from universal in his day, the last quarter of the thirteenth century, but that it was associated with what he calls the "good notators." Finally, and more tentatively, he may be seen as implying that the rise of the square note in music owed to broader trends in areas related to music such as geometry. Anonymous IV's concern for the craft of music writing, unique among medieval music theorists, sheds important light on the fundamental questions of why and where neumatic notation was abandoned in favor of a shape more suited to "the books of the moderns."

**MUSIC AND SOCIETY IN MODERN FRANCE**  
**Hugh Macdonald, Washington University in St. Louis, Chair**

THE LAW OF UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCES:  
 THEATRE DEREGULATION AND OPERA IN PARIS  
 AND THE FRENCH REGIONS, 1864–1880

Katharine Ellis  
 Royal Holloway, University of London

In January 1864 Napoléon III signed legislation intended to answer the pleas of a large constituency of musicians: to abandon theatrical anti-competition policies that fixed generic norms and seemed to restrict the opportunities for young composers to have their works performed. Seven months later the legislation came into effect: from July the government released all theatres (except the national ones) from the contracts that prescribed their allotted genres, and allowed new theatre companies to present whatever they wished, without regard to the creation of a distinct, generic, “space” which they, and they alone, would be allowed to fill. Market forces and entrepreneurship were to preside; critics looked forward to a repeat of the glory days of deregulation in the early 1790s, when competition between Parisian opera companies produced unprecedented levels of operatic activity in the capital.

In 1860s Paris the results of theatre deregulation were rather different, and the hoped-for expansion of activity in opera and opéra-comique did not materialize. New operatic ventures failed, and quickly. Increasingly, commentators were seen beating their breasts: they had argued passionately for deregulation; now they regretted such short-sighted enthusiasm. Yet if the situation in Paris appeared depressing, that in the provinces was worse. As Parisian commentators belatedly complained, the government had left regional opera at the mercy of municipal generosity and an “uneducated” paying public that preferred “entertainment” to “art.” They found the result chastening: instead of a rigorously organized system of local subsidies, with hierarchies, local centers and established tour schedules (a version of the non-competition rules at work in Paris), they saw complete destabilization and a Darwinian struggle between operetta and café-concert on the one hand and opera of various kinds on the other.

This paper is a case study of the perils of the one-size-fits-all legislation so characteristic of France’s centralized bureaucracy since the days of Louis XIV, illustrating how and why it affected the country’s regional operatic tradition. Drawing on archive and press documents, it builds on recent work on the institutional history of opera, expanding it beyond Paris to take account of the very different situation in *la France profonde*. In so doing, it alerts us once more to the power of accidental externalities in the shaping of musical life, to the importance of taking account of regional variation in the “national” stories we derive from Parisian history, and the perennial fragility of opera as an economically viable art form.

POÈTE MAUDIT: SCHUMANN’S MUSIC IN *FIN-DE-SIÈCLE* FRANCE

Jess Tyre  
 SUNY, Potsdam

Late-nineteenth- and early-twentieth-century French criticisms of Robert Schumann’s instrumental music are characterized by two interrelated themes: Schumann’s impaired

psychological condition and the perception of a flawed compositional technique. Both of these are commonly associated with Schumann scholarship in general, but their reverberations within the musical culture of *fin-de-siècle* France have received little attention to date.

Using primary journalistic sources of the period (*La Revue et Gazette Musicale de Paris*, *Le Ménestrel*, *Le Courrier Musical*, *Le Temps*, etc.) this paper considers Schumann's reception in Third-Republic France before 1914, and demonstrates how critics linked the composer's approach to form, expression, and orchestration to his documented psychological decline.

French critics assessed Schumann's health and its bearing on his music in a number of different ways. Some saw madness as the culprit behind sabotaged compositions, "heavy," "somber" works, "distorted" in form and content, and poorly orchestrated. Others reversed this view, and blamed Schumann's creative, but problematic artistic sensibilities for his deterioration. Still others saw not mental illness, but simply an extremely introverted personality that chose art over conventional reality in a search for life's greatest meanings.

Such claims troubled experts concerned with the development of post-Beethovenian symphonic music and the influx of German Romanticism in the French concert hall. They in no way harmed the composer's popularity with the French public, however, during an era in which the Décadents, Symbolists, and Impressionists drew attention to the vagaries of the human condition and the psychological life of the individual. Indeed, Schumann's sufferings enhanced his image as a representative *poète maudit*, a doomed, solitary Byronic figure who cursed his fate, yet fought to the end to express himself through music.

## FORGING FRENCH IDENTITY: THE POLITICAL SIGNIFICANCE OF *LA MUSIQUE ANCIENNE ET MODERNE*

Jann Pasler

University of California, San Diego

Scholars have begun to research the presence of "early music" in late nineteenth-century France. However, they have missed something significant: in many cases, old masterpieces were performed alongside contemporary music, sometimes premieres. In this paper, I argue not only that the juxtaposition of *la musique ancienne et moderne* on the same concerts was meaningful and significant, but also that it served a political function at two contentious moments in French history.

Examining a wide range of concerts involving amateur musical societies as well as professional orchestras, I discuss how concerts with music representing various periods and distinct styles served as useful occasions for listeners to make comparisons and develop tastes and opinions. This was not just about gentele cultivation or the acquisition of bourgeois habits and values. It involved a practice—distinguishing aesthetic differences and evaluating their meaning. Learning critical judgment through musical comparisons prepared people to engage in a new mode of political activity, voting, and in this way connected art to politics, active listening to active citizenship.

During the Moral Order (1873–77) and the Ralliement coalition (early 1890s), concert programs presenting *la musique ancienne et moderne* suggested a musical analogue for two forms of political compromise. In the 1870s, when Catholics and conservative royalists nostalgic for the ancien régime shared government with increasing numbers of liberal republicans, concerts offered occasions to negotiate the conflicting values in French society. In 1875, for example, concerts of music from the time of Louis XIV or Louis XV also featured Bizet and Gounod;

Lamoureux's *Harmonie sacrée* (fd. 1874) performed Gounod's *Gallia* and premiered Massenet's *Eve* alongside Handel's oratorios. By 1878, as republicans were becoming a majority, listeners could compare programmatic works by Gossec and Saint-Saëns, overtures by Méhul, Rossini, and Joncières, and choruses by Catel, Rameau, Bizet, and Gounod, accompanied by program notes that reflected on shared attributes in French music. Such concerts thus not only encouraged listeners to perceive relationships between music of the past and present, but also to acknowledge continuity in French history. In the 1890s when republicans in the majority sought reconciliation with royalists and Catholics to combat the rising influence of socialists, *la musique ancienne et moderne* returned to the programs of such organizations as Comtesse Greffulhe's *Société des Grandes Auditions* and the *Concerts Colonne*. That one could find this same juxtaposition in performances by working-class children as well as economically privileged adults, by amateurs as well as professionals, and in private salons as well as huge public halls suggests that a wide range of the French population came to accept their mutual value in the construction of French identity.

With this study, I hope to show how and why the musical world helped support political compromises (more typical in France than we have been led to believe) and how the juxtaposition of values represented in *la musique ancienne et moderne* became an integral part of French identity and an important precedent to concerts of the Schola Cantorum, *Princesse de Polignac*, and Boulez's *Domaine musical*.

## MARYA FREUND AND SCHOENBERG IN PARIS

Elizabeth Keathley

University of North Carolina, Greensboro

It is well known that 1927 marked Schoenberg's first journey to Paris, where he conducted a concert of his music on the invitation of the Société Musicale Indépendante, and his associations with Ravel, Milhaud, and Poulenc are also well documented. Often ignored, however, is the crucial role that the internationally known soprano Marya Freund played in Schoenberg's positive reception in Paris. Freund, who had been inducted into the Legion of Honor in 1925, applied her performing, organizational, and networking skills to parlay the SMI concert into a full-blown Schoenberg festival including two additional concerts, two public lectures by Schoenberg, and a number of visits to important salons, e.g., those of Mme. Debussy and Mme. Sophie Clemenceau. Freund not only performed in each of the festival concerts, but she had also presented the Parisian premiers of a number of Schoenberg's vocal works, including the Second String Quartet, *Das Buch der hängenden Gärten*, and *Pierrot lunaire*, in her own French translation. Moreover, it was Freund who found the Schoenbergs accommodations in Paris when the Nazi regime revoked his professorship at the Prussian Academy of Arts in 1933.

Despite her forty-year relationship with Schoenberg, beginning with her creation of the "Waldtaube" in the 1913 premiere of *Gurrelieder*, despite her tireless promotion of Schoenberg and his works, and despite his gratitude to her—after the 1927 festival she and Schoenberg addressed each other by the familiar "du"—Freund appears in the Schoenberg literature primarily as a singer who could not quite master the *Sprechstimme* of *Pierrot lunaire*. Although Schoenberg did express concern that Freund's rendition of *Pierrot* was too "sung," Parisian critics regarded her interpretation as definitive, and many commentators heard it as specifically French. These facts suggest the significance of Freund's role as a mediator between

Schoenberg and the French audience. Furthermore, although she was not Schoenberg's favorite interpreter of *Pierrot lunaire*, her association with that work was fixed not only by her premiers in Paris, Brussels, London, and Barcelona, but also by further performances, including a 1949 tour for which she had come out of retirement, radio broadcasts on the BBC and Radiodiffusion français of the same year, and a Schoenberg memorial concert in Rome in 1951. Responses from such distinguished musicians as Luigi Dallapiccola confirm Freund's significance as a *Pierrot* interpreter.

Based on correspondence, newspaper clippings, concert programs, and Freund's journal during her organization of the 1927 Schoenberg festival, this paper will reevaluate Marya Freund's relationship with Arnold Schoenberg and his music, especially with respect to his reception in Paris.

## MUSIC, THEATER, AND WOMEN IN THE EIGHTEENTH CENTURY

Lowell Lindgren, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Chair

### VOICES IN HANDEL'S OPERATIC OBBLIGATI

Nathan Link

Yale University

The independent voice-like contour of the instrumental obbligato in many of Handel's operatic arias has inspired descriptive language that seems to imply the presence of para-dramatic personae communicating alongside the dramatic character. For example, Dean describes the solo violin in Rodelinda's "Ombre, piante, urne funeste" as lamenting along with heroine, Strohm suggests that Handel's opera obbligati have the capacity to communicate information incidental or even contradictory to the aria's text, and Lewis conceptualizes the Handelian orchestra as the singer's *compère*. While such characterizations point tantalizingly toward an attractive alternative to the pervasive conception of the opera seria orchestra as capable only of expressing enthusiastic affirmation of an aria's predominant affect, no detailed inquiry has yet accompanied these provocative but essentially impressionistic characterizations of Handel's obbligati.

I investigate the ways in which Handel's instrumental lines can impart semantically specific information by means of their interactions with the primary vocal line during key passages of text, identifying commenting personae in a number of Handel's most expressive aria obbligati. Most commonly, these voices emerge to express dissent in situations in which *opera seria* characters engage in or contemplate immoral or dishonest behavior, employing one of several gestural techniques in order to offer relatively unambiguous commentary upon a character's words or actions. Perhaps the simplest means by which the instrumental accompaniment can impart a moral judgment involves the highlighting of such straightforward words as "si" and "no"—in "Benchè povera donzella" from *Flavio* (1724), for example, as Teodata contemplates how to respond to an improper romantic overture from the king, the obbligato remains conspicuously silent during her utterances of "si," but forcefully doubles her when she sings "no." In other cases, dissonant melodic gestures—which had served as rhetorical emblems of deception (among other things) since the heyday of Italian madrigal—seem to contravene dishonest proclamations. Similarly, disruptions to the standard key relationship between the A and B sections of *da capo* arias, which only become apparent upon the abrupt reintroduction of the opening ritornello by the instrumental accompaniment, are consistently associated with characters' mistaken perceptions of reality, lies, or flawed predictions.

In exploring the possibility of unseen choric commentators in Handel's operas, I take into account a debate—which began in the late seventeenth century and lasted well into Handel's years with the Royal Academy of Music—among prominent members of the London literati regarding the proposed reintroduction of the chorus into spoken drama. Noting the prominent reemergence of the Horatian ideal of the chorus as necessary to “uphold the cause of virtue and try to control the evil,” I argue that the juxtaposition of quasi-narrative commenting voices with dramatic representation would be a compositional device by no means foreign to Handel's aristocratic audiences. Additionally, I consider twentieth-century conceptions of multifaceted representational modes, including Bakhtin's dialogism, Cone's “instrumental persona,” and Abbate's various conceptions of disembodied operatic voices.

### DANCES OF VIRTUE AND PLEASURE: DURAZZO, ANGIOLINI, AND HASSE'S *ALCIDE AL BIVIO* (HERCULES AT THE CROSSROADS, 1760)

Bruce Alan Brown  
University of Southern California

Most accounts of the Viennese operatic reform, starting with Burney's, have emphasized polarization: the *poeta cesareo* Pietro Metastasio and the Empress's favorite composer Johann Adolf Hasse, in the conservative camp, being pitted against the more innovative trio of the composer Christoph Gluck, librettist Ranieri de' Calzabigi, and theater intendant Count Giacomo Durazzo. That this is an overly simplistic view is strongly suggested by an unpublished letter from Durazzo to his Parisian theatrical agent Charles-Simon Favart, which shows Durazzo to have been the primary instigator of Metastasio and Hasse's *Alcide al bivio*, a *fiesta teatrale* for the 1760 wedding of Archduke (later Emperor) Joseph to Isabella of Parma, a granddaughter of Louis XV of France. (The count's involvement with *Alcide*—“Mon opéra italien,” as he called it—later included the management of a publicity campaign for the work, directed primarily toward Paris, in keeping with the political dimension of the work.) A close reading of the opera's text (including the rich iconography of its libretto), along with other documents, suggests that *Alcide* served not only as an allegory of Joseph's coming of age, but also as preparation of Viennese audiences for Durazzo's own reformist opera *Armida* (set to music by Tommaso Traetta), then in an advanced stage of preparation. In both works, luxuriant scenic and musical display in the service of pleasure—personified by the goddess Edonide and the sorceress Armida, respectively—is made to appear morally suspect. This strategy is nowhere more apparent than in the danced *divertissements* in *Alcide*, for the followers of Edonide and of Aretea (goddess of virtue, and stand-in for Joseph's mother, Empress Maria Theresia).

Metastasio's *didascalie* only hint at the nature of the choreographic spectacle; its working-out was left to Durazzo and the talents he supervised. Analysis of handwriting in Hasse's largely autograph score reveals a collaborative approach to the dances depicting the “delightful pursuits” of Edonide's troupe, their melodies being supplied ready-made—probably by the ballet-master Angiolini—for Hasse to orchestrate (staves having been left blank for the purpose). But for the inhabitants of Aretea's Realm of Virtue, Hasse composed, unaided, a huge chaconne whose thoroughly French idiom reflects both the “firmness, decency, and simplicity” of the stage architecture, and the aesthetic orientation of Durazzo, to which Hasse has long been presumed inimical.

“CHARM’D WITH THE SPRIGHTLY INNOCENCE OF NELL”:  
RE-READING *THE DEVIL TO PAY*

Berta Joncus  
University of Oxford

*The Devil to Pay* (1731) was a hit from its inception. Following a sensational run in London, productions spread to the Continent, where the work was seminal for both the opéra comique and the Singspiel. A study of early productions suggests that the ballad opera’s success was due to three factors hitherto ignored. First, the libretto celebrated the widespread practice of wife-beating and invited fantasies of inverting social classes. Second, inserted musical numbers gave performers a chance to comment on the stage action. Third and most importantly, the appeal of soprano Kitty Clive assured the work’s popularity, prompting its producers to transform the original three-act “Opera” into a one-act Clive vehicle, which went on to become the standard version.

Historians discussing *The Devil to Pay* omit mentioning the plot’s main comic gags: the joys of abusing women and the titillation of wife-swapping. These were twinned with the phantasmagoria of having a cobbler’s wife and a privileged termagant exchange their identities by inhabiting each other’s bodies. Violence and metamorphoses were the legacy of the 1686 comedy that the libretto closely followed. Using the device identified by modern scholars as “recuperation,” the action satisfied spectators by reverting to dominant values: the finale quashed the notion of trading social stations while affirming a man’s prerogative to maltreat his wife.

The inserted songs, however, cloaked the post-Restoration farce in the garb of current fashion. Like other ballad operas, *The Devil to Pay* deployed a strategy that John Gay had established for the genre with his prototypical *Beggar’s Opera* (1728). Popular tunes re-set to didactic lyrics peppered the plot; except in romantic scenes, songs primarily halted the narrative to deliver social commentary, creating an alternate critical voice within the drama. In *The Devil to Pay*, the airs in the initial production cautioned men against marrying and identified negative female characteristics. Other numbers—drinking songs and praise of rustic stereotypes—interrupted the plot with favourite song themes.

This ballad opera’s combining of past taste with the vogue for “operatizing” was a standard marketing device for the genre. But critics of the day emphasized that Kitty Clive was responsible for making *The Devil to Pay* a repertory staple. The soprano used contemporary performing practice to radically transform her role of Nell from a passive, subsidiary figure into a beloved, high-spirited heroine.

Consequently, producers revised *The Devil to Pay* in Clive’s image. Through cuts to the dialogue, reductions in the cast and changes to the musical numbers Nell became the comedy’s main figure. What had been a work devaluing women became a sentimental comedy prizing Nell’s simplicity over the excesses of the Lady. Mrs. Clive’s interpretation became the benchmark for all subsequent sopranos, and iconography of her as Nell proliferated. Early foreign adaptors of the ballad opera almost certainly witnessed her performances, and translated versions retained aspects of her interpretation.

*The Devil to Pay* reveals the competing discourses at work in ballad opera, and shows how gender politics and the performer could shape operatic history.

“TO CLEAR ALL HINDERING OBSTACLES FROM THE PATH”:  
 MARIANA VON ZIEGLER’S USE OF MUSIC  
 IN DEFENSE OF WOMEN’S RIGHTS

Mark Peters  
 Trinity Christian College

Leipzig poet Mariana von Ziegler (1695–1760) is known today in musical circles almost exclusively for her nine sacred cantata texts set by Johann Sebastian Bach in 1725. While this contribution was a significant one for Bach’s oeuvre, Ziegler’s involvement in and importance for Leipzig’s musical life was much more far-reaching in the ensuing years. Ziegler played a significant role as a female musician who encouraged, facilitated, and participated in music-making in the city. Furthermore, as I argue in this paper, Ziegler employed music in her vigorous defense of women’s rights to cultural involvement in a male-dominated society.

After providing background on Ziegler as a performer and on how her social position allowed her great influence in Leipzig’s musical scene, this paper will examine Ziegler’s writings about music which appear in three of her four published volumes. These writings, which shed new light on a number of important issues regarding music-making in Leipzig, include several poems, as well as three published letters: one on opera, one on the current state of music in Leipzig, and one on women and music. The final letter serves to introduce a new facet of Ziegler’s music-making, that of its relation to women’s rights. While she continued to emphasize her amateur status as a musician, Ziegler defended here her decision to play the transverse flute, an instrument which in Germany was associated almost exclusively with men. Within the context of Ziegler’s extensive writings about women’s rights to be educated and to publish poetry, I will argue that her defense of her flute playing should be considered as part of her ongoing assertion that women be granted the same rights as men in the realm of culture.

The paper will conclude with consideration of a musical exchange in Leipzig over the issue of women’s rights: one song attacking learned women and another written by Ziegler in response. The anonymous song “Ihr Schönen höret an,” printed in an appendix to Sperontes’s *Die Singende Muse an der Pleisse* of 1736, mocks learned women by describing an imagined university at which women could study such topics as raising children, making music, writing poetry and trivial letters, and drinking coffee. The content and timing of the song clearly indicate that it was aimed at Ziegler, who in 1733 had been named Germany’s first female poet laureate by the University of Wittenberg. Ziegler responded with a song of her own, “Das männliche Geschlechte, im Namen einiger Frauenzimmer besungen” (*Vermischete Schriften*, 1739), in which she criticizes men for attacking women while not recognizing their own shortcomings. She concludes by affirming a common theme from her writings, that all humans are equal and should thus be treated equally.

Ziegler’s employment of music in defense of women’s rights thus represents a significant contribution not only to Leipzig’s musical life but also to the dialogue about women and music in early eighteenth-century Germany.

REPRESENTING POLITICS AND RELIGION  
IN THE SEVENTEENTH CENTURY

Alexandra Amati-Camperi, University of San Francisco, Chair

MUSIC AND LATE-ELIZABETHAN POLITICS:  
THE IDENTITIES OF ORIANA AND DIANA

Jeremy Smith  
University of Colorado

In this paper I propose to challenge the current assessment that the *Triumphes of Oriana* (1601) was a simple paean to Elizabeth I and to argue that its publisher, Thomas Morley and his self-described mentor William Byrd, via their music, were enmeshed with strategies surrounding the royal succession. The present investigation began with the discovery of an incident that occurred in mid-April 1600, when a group of recusants who had met at the house of the music printer Thomas East in Aldersgate Street, London, were arrested for treason. These recusant visitors were caught reading a letter by the leading exiled English Jesuit, Robert Persons that was meant for the ears of the Scottish King, James VI. In it Persons, the putative author of *A Conference about the Next Succession to the Crown of England*, expressed qualified support for James's claim to the English crown. Meanwhile, another English Catholic exile, Henry Constable, was traveling from Edinburgh to Rome to relay the terms by which the Pope would also support James, especially if he converted to the "Old Religion." On English territory, Robert Devereux, the second Earl of Essex and late-Elizabethan England's most charismatic courtier and soldier, was gaining support for what would culminate as an unsuccessful coup d'état designed to oust the queen and install James on the English throne; and East, the aforementioned printer, had just secretly produced second editions of Byrd's three- and four-voiced Tridentine masses, a fourth edition, B1 (discovered in 2002), of his *Psalmes, Sonets and songs*, and, in the following year, Morley's *Triumphes*. By taking into account both the political context surrounding these publications, including the Essex Revolt, the succession question and the Catholic issue, and the ideas reflected in the poetry that was set to music, it can be shown that both composers were strongly linked to the Sidney/Essex complex of ideals that had a special appeal to Catholics. More broadly, this analysis reveals the ways in which certain works of music and certain musicians were enmeshed with strategies surrounding the succession. This paper focuses on the roles played by Essex, his sister Penelope Rich, the poet and Catholic activist Constable, and the Byrd collaborator Edward Paston. The *Psalmes* played the role of propping Essex up as the "heir to Sir Philip Sidney." But the real star was Rich. She was a political figure of great stature among poets, recusants and musicians connected with Byrd and Morley; known to many as Sir Philip Sidney's poetic muse; and often associated with the name Diana. By proposing a different metaphorical identity for "Oriana" and also for the character "Diana," who appears in key works by Byrd and in all the Oriana madrigals as well, I hope to show that the *Psalmes* and the *Triumphes* originally reflected a shared goal among Essexians and Catholics to replace Elizabeth with James VI and his wife Anna of Denmark (our "true" "Oriana").

“DA ME È NATA LA PROVA PRIMA DI TAL GENERE”:  
 RENAISSANCE *BATTAGLIE* AND THE MUSICAL ORIGIN OF  
 MONTEVERDI’S *GENERE CONCITATO*

Paul Schleuse

Hunter College / Graduate Center, CUNY

In the preface to his *Madrigali guerrieri et amorosi* (Book VIII, 1638), Claudio Monteverdi makes specific claims for the originality his *genere concitato*, stating that he had vainly sought the excited affect in older music, and subsequently discovered it through reason alone. He later affirms that “I was responsible for the investigation and first trial of this style.” This originality is essential to Monteverdi’s narrative, according to which past music used only the *temperato* and *molle* genres, requiring a new *genere concitato*. Yet the sonorities of this “new” style are fully present in music of the *cinquecento*.

Monteverdi defines two essential elements of the *genere concitato*: poetry expressing “ira e sdegno,” and the musical figure of sixteen repeated *semifusae* on a single pitch. In practice, he is not strict about this formulation. The texts of his *madrigali guerrieri* do not always express rage in connection with the style, and the musical figure often uses smaller groups of *semifusae* than the prescribed sixteen. The *genere concitato* is also secondarily associated with other musical elements, including triadic melodies, dotted rhythms, and meter changes.

All of these elements are found in sixteenth-century Italian *battaglie*. The earliest of these is Werrecore’s *Battaglia Taliana*, an imitation of Clement Janequin’s popular chanson *La guerre*. While those pieces commemorate military exploits, later *battaglie* are either generic depictions of battle or allegories, and include vocal and instrumental pieces by Andrea Gabrieli, Annibale Padovano, Orazio Vecchi, and Adriano Banchieri, who discusses the style in his *L’organo suonarino* (1605). These depictions of battle are characterized by static harmony with jumbled, often macaronic counterpoint representing voices heard in battle, and nonverbal syllables imitating instruments and artillery. Trumpet signals introduce triadic themes and repeated notes, while drumbeats and cannonry are depicted with slower bass notes. The style is thus a clear precursor of the *genere concitato*. While none of the *battaglie* use the division of the semibreve into sixteen *semifusae*, the effect does occur in larger note-values: a breve divided into sixteen *fusae*, with a mensuration sign suggesting at least theoretical metrical equivalence. Monteverdi’s awareness of the older style is evident in the toccata for *Orfeo*, which shares several of its essential features.

The true musical origin of the *genere concitato* lies not in Monteverdi’s speculative completion of a threefold platonic theory, but in a living musical tradition. Monteverdi’s theoretical contribution was one of abstraction: in the *battaglie* the repeated-note figures are onomatopoeic, but in the *genere concitato* the same figures should express “ira e sdegno.” While this is true of the *Combattimento*, many other pieces in Book VIII depart from the principle and resemble more closely the older *battaglie*.

This paper will explore the transformation of the *battaglia* style in Monteverdi’s *genere concitato*, and his claims of originality. At its premiere, the composer writes, the *Combattimento* was “listened to with great applause and praised;” the audience’s enthusiasm for music depicting combat must have been informed by the recognition of a musical style already familiar to them.

THE TRIUMPH OF JEPHTHAH'S DAUGHTER:  
RELIGIOUS SYMBOLISM AND GENDER AND ROLE EXCHANGE IN  
GIACOMO CARISSIMI'S ORATORIO *JEPHTE*

Beverly Stein  
California State University, Los Angeles

Jephthah's daughter has no name and occupies only six verses in the book of Judges. But in his *Jephte*, Counter-Reformation composer and Jesuit master of persuasion Giacomo Carissimi transforms the unnamed young woman into the oratorio's hero, surpassing even in importance her father, the military hero who rescued Israel from destruction.

While musicologists have tended to focus on the literal meaning of the story (the human tragedy of the vow) and its musical and rhetorical expression, the deeper religious symbolism of the oratorio has gone completely unnoticed. This paper will explore how and why Carissimi accorded such distinction to this particular female character.

The famous *mutatio toni* at the midpoint marks not only a change of affect but, more importantly, the point at which the daughter begins to usurp the dramatic and symbolic role of her father, represented through explicit musical shifts from father to daughter at three levels of scale. The small-scale textual shift in Jephthah's "Heu" lament resonates musically through tonal descent when Jephthah refers to himself and ascent when he refers to his daughter. The role reversal becomes even clearer after Filia offers herself in sacrifice and Jephthah simply parrots back his daughter's previous statement. The father's character then disappears, while his daughter wrings every heart with her moving lament.

The daughter of Jephthah is no ordinary woman: she is, according to Augustine contemporary Quodvultdeus and others, a refiguration of Christ, and it is for this reason that Carissimi raises her up as the oratorio's hero. She has been seen by writers such as Isidore of Pelusium as manly and strong, after the manner of virgins whose pure state endowed them with the physical and moral strength of men. Carissimi suggests such a view when Jephthah falls into lament, a feminine utterance, while his daughter takes over his role as leader, making decisions and commanding nature to obey her as her father formerly commanded his troops; they not only switch roles, but genders. The apotheosis of her character over his may echo the shifting emphasis of the Counter-Reformation from militancy to triumph of the Church.

THE SOURCES OF PELLEGRIN'S *JEPHTÉ*,  
A "TRAGEDY DRAWN FROM HOLY SCRIPTURE"

Blake Stevens  
Stanford University

Within the uniformly secular tradition of *tragédie lyrique*, one opera stands out: the 1732 collaboration of Simon-Joseph Pellegrin and Michel Pignolet de Montéclair, *Jephté*. It drew its subject not from myth or medieval romance but from Biblical narrative. In fact, as the only sacred opera produced at the Académie Royale de Musique in the eighteenth century, *Jephté* would become one of the most acclaimed and frequently revived *pré-ramiste* operas.

Given the conventions governing *tragédie lyrique*, how would a librettist write—and justify—an adaptation of a sacred text? What supplementary sources could he draw upon? The librettist's preface to the 1732 print suggests some answers. Here, Pellegrin invokes both theatrical and theological authorities to defend certain changes he had made to the account in

Judges. Pellegrin offers the example of Pierre Corneille, who had successfully incorporated an amorous intrigue into his Christian tragedy, *Polyeucte martyr*, in order to justify a similar intrigue in *Jephté* where the Biblical account gives none. Moreover, whereas Jephtha originally sacrifices his daughter, fulfilling his vow to God upon his return from a successful military campaign, Pellegrin chooses to spare the daughter. For this revision, Pellegrin cites a theological tradition, both Christian and Jewish, which interprets the sacrifice as a worldly death entailing a life of devotion to God. These revisions accord with the genre of *tragédie lyrique* as Pellegrin inherited it; he is able to preserve an amorous subplot along with a fortunate denouement. It may appear, then, that Pellegrin merely changed the Biblical source to make concessions to what audiences expected of *tragédie lyrique*.

The logic of these revisions—and the expansion of the original narrative with episodes—proves to be more complicated. Pellegrin's conception of *Jephté* is mediated not merely through Corneille, theological disputes, and considerations of genre. His adaptation suggests an awareness of previous treatments of the subject beginning with George Buchanan's Latin college play of 1554, *Jephtes sive Votum*, and subsequent French translations and adaptations of Buchanan. This paper will reconstruct the dramaturgical possibilities these sources may have offered Pellegrin. Two musical works are of particular relevance: an *intermède* accompanying a *Jephté* play at the Collège Louis-le-Grand (1686) and a spoken tragedy with musical interludes, modeled after Racine's *Esther* and *Athalie*, performed at Saint-Cyr (1692). From added principal and secondary roles, episodes, and the denouement, these sources establish a basic framework for the *Jephté* livret. Pellegrin's innovations with respect to these precedents, in turn, help cast into sharper relief the possibilities uniquely available to a dramatist working within *tragédie lyrique*.

## TWENTIETH-CENTURY SKETCHES

Maria-Luisa Vilar-Paya, Universidad de las Américas, Puebla, Chair

### BERG'S SKETCHES AND THE INCEPTION OF *WOZZECK*: 1914–18

Patricia Hall

University of California, Santa Barbara

I saw *Wozzeck* performed before the war, and it made such a huge impression that I immediately decided (after a second hearing) to set it to music.

—Alban Berg to Anton Webern, August 19, 1918

Despite Berg's conviction to compose an opera on Büchner's play, it is doubtful if he made much progress until the end of the war. Several authors have argued that a sketchbook inducting nearly all the extant sketches for Act I, scene 2, and Act II, scene 2, dates from 1914, that is, before the beginning of World War I and Berg's induction into the military. This chronology is also supported by Berg's student Gottfried Kassowitz's remark that Berg began to sketch two scenes immediately after seeing the play.

Yet, in his lecture, "Pro Domo," dated May 23, 1927, Berg claims, "It is difficult for me to fulfill the request today to say something about my opera, because it has been ten years since I began to compose it," thus identifying the inception of the opera as spring, 1917. Berg makes an even more conservative assessment in a letter to Webern from the summer of 1921. Citing

the three interruptions he has thus far endured between summers of compositional activity, Berg places the beginning of composition at the summer of 1918.

As important as this delayed date of inception is the effect of the war on Berg's creative evolution. When Berg began—even in the most tentative form—to compose the opera in 1914, he was stylistically in the world of the *Marsch* of the Three Pieces for Orchestra, op. 6, which he had completed that summer. Certainly Berg's military experiences allowed him to identify with the oppressed soldier of Büchner's play, generating a number of musical and programmatic ideas for several scenes of the opera. At the same time, however, Berg's creative powers were so hampered by military service and inactivity that he remains mired in the style of the *Marsch* in 1918, to the point of mimicking passages from it in Act I, scene 2.

In this paper, then, I decipher several sketches from a frequently cited sketchbook for *Wozzeck*. But I shall also turn to a less likely, and largely ignored source of evidence, Berg's notebooks compiled as a soldier in World War I. As we shall discover, in addition to finally clarifying the chronology of Berg's tentative beginnings on the opera, these notebooks, with their many diagrams and biographical annotations, depict Berg's struggle far more poignantly than a narrative alone. A drama within a drama: How an essentially unknown composer of thirty facing the Great War, post-war inflation, and a complete breakdown of his health, composed an atonal opera which—despite the misgivings of his famous teacher—became one of the masterpieces of the twentieth century.

#### EVIDENCE OF STRAVINSKY'S "PAST" IN THE SKETCHES FOR *PULCINELLA* (1920)

Maureen Carr

Pennsylvania State University

The purpose of this presentation is to examine the "conflict" between past and present in Stravinsky's *Pulcinella* and to show how this "lack of reconciliation" can be explained through an analysis of the musical sketches.

In "The Theorist's Sense of History: Concepts of Contemporaneity in Composition and Analysis," Arnold Whittall writes: "that past and present may not always have been joined by bridges of transition: they may actually be, and need to be, in conflict" (cited by Joseph Straus in *Remaking the Past*). Having studied the evolution of Stravinsky's compositional process for *Pulcinella* from his annotations on the Pergolesi manuscripts that are now in Basel, to the more continuous sketches in the London Sketchbook (that might have belonged to Picasso) and having compared these sources with the printed edition, I am in the unique position of being able to explain the historical context for the "lack of reconciliation" that sometimes exists between the eighteenth-century sources and the outcome of Stravinsky's compositional process for *Pulcinella*. There are also passages in *Pulcinella* where Stravinsky departs totally from his eighteenth-century models in order to reinvent some of his Russian techniques.

Thus, Stravinsky imprinted his style on the musical sources for *Pulcinella* in several ways. Not only did he layer the texture with multiple repeated patterns that articulate specific pitches and rhythms that participate in montages, he also created metrical conflicts and used *stasis* as a contrast for free-flowing melodies. He used the techniques of *superimposition* as well as *juxtaposition*. With the use of added notes (that sometimes form patterns that are more characteristic of the twentieth century than of the eighteenth century), Stravinsky contradicted the musical syntax characteristic of his eighteenth-century sources.

In one place, Stravinsky created a vocal trio that did not appear in the source, “Canzona di Don Pietro” from Pergolesi’s *Lo frate ’nnamorato* (first performed in Naples in 1732). Stravinsky’s continuity sketch for the last part of this trio appears in the London sketchbook. From these examples, it is clear that Stravinsky went well beyond the task of arranging or orchestrating the sources for *Pulcinella* given to him by Diaghilev. The outcome was “more” than Diaghilev had in mind. In Stravinsky’s own words: “A stylish orchestration was what Diaghilev wanted, and nothing more, and my music so shocked him that he went about for a long time with a look that suggested The Offended Eighteenth Century.”

My Powerpoint presentation will provide examples from Stravinsky’s musical sketches as well as Picasso’s sketches for the scenery and costumes. Transcriptions of the musical sketches and excerpts from the published edition of the ballet score will be included in a handout. As one example, the handout would include transcriptions of: the abbreviated annotations that Stravinsky made on the manuscripts (Basel) and the more complete sketch (London) for the Tarantella as well as the comparable equivalent in the printed edition. The source is from Wasenaer (Second Violin Concerto, IV, *Concerti Armonici*).

## DÉSERTS FUTURE AND PAST: REVELATIONS FROM THE SKETCHES

Denise Von Glahn  
Florida State University

Sketch studies of the works of Edgard Varèse have been all but impossible to conduct since his death; the unavailability of his papers has meant that interested scholars had to imagine the thinking behind the works, or rely upon reports from a handful of informants. All that has changed with the recent acquisition of the Edgard Varèse Collection by the Paul Sacher Stiftung in Basel, Switzerland. While still being sorted and catalogued, the collection is now accessible. The almost forty-year wait makes the revelations the papers contain all the more startling.

Among the most epiphany-like are the sketches, score, interpolations, and graphics related to Varèse’s magnum opus *Déserts*, the work that broke his near twenty-year “silence”: the electro-acoustic piece that solidified the composer’s place in twentieth-century music history. Indeed, within the collection one finds color-coded graphs representing the three multi-channeled tape interpolations of organized sound, the “seismographic” notation that clarifies Varèse’s vision of dynamics, all indicated in relation to decibel levels from zero to forty. The composer’s concerns with the details of sonic motion are reflected in second by second, and sometimes half-second by half-second vertical hash marks. Hand-scrawled notes clarify Varèse’s goals for specific sounds: “swishing,” “hammering,” “high grinding.”

While the charts for organized sound show Varèse navigating the new realm of electronic composition, additional insights appear from the consultation of the materials for the traditionally-notated instrumental passages. Here we find Varèse engaging in serial composition, studying overtones and frequencies, arranging a Klangfarbenmelodie, and aspiring to visualize sound.

Among the pages of sketches for *Déserts* are chords with each pitch identified by its frequency, and multiple passages with notes assigned their place in one of Varèse’s many serialized rows. These relate to additional pages, which contain meticulously rendered row matrices, and a published chart entitled “A Correct Table of Music Frequencies, Pitch A = 440.” It summarizes “The Audible Spectrum (of instruments)” and “Limits of Human Ear Sensitivity.” Varèse

includes notes on the harmonic partials of the “Rockefeller Carillon,” although whether he is referring to the one in Chicago or New York is unclear. We learn that early on the piece included a part for organ.

Perhaps most provocative of all the materials related to *Déserts* are drawings and correspondence related to visual manifestations of the work. Numerous conical shaped pencil sketches, sometimes in the corners of sketch pages, conjure sound projecting into space. A more finished, full-sized, colored-pencil drawing of what appears to be three light beacons may suggest connections between sound, color, and light in this work: its three-dimensionality resembles a set design. Letters from 1949–50 speaking of a *Déserts* film testify to a work wherein sound is only one component.

Beyond being Varèse’s first instrumental piece to include electronically generated interpolations of organized sound, *Déserts* was originally envisioned as a multi-media experience that drew upon a lifetime of work in and with sound. Using materials from the collection, this paper will demonstrate that *Déserts* simultaneously points to the future and summarizes a century’s musical thought.

### U2’S COMPOSITIONAL PROCESS: SKETCHING *ACHTUNG BABY* IN SOUND

Paul Harris

University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill

Dave “The Edge” Evans has referred to Paul “Bono” Hewson as the “Patron Saint of the Unfinished Song.” He is referring to Bono’s tendency to continue working on a song sketch as long as there is any chance of salvaging promising material. A demo recording from the *Achtung Baby* (1991) sessions of an untitled song in its primordial state provides a rare example of this. This song, part of over seven hours of demo recordings, contains musical materials which ultimately appear as parts of four songs on *Achtung Baby* and its associated singles, and includes a text fragment which reappears six years later on U2’s *Pop* (1997) as a song title. While there are numerous oral accounts of this kind of process by U2 and other artists (see especially Albin Zak’s *The Poetics of Rock*, 2001), these U2 demos provide an extremely rare, concrete example of the process in action. Analysis of these recordings provides better insight into the compositional procedure of other artists known to work this way such as Peter Gabriel, R.E.M., and other post-punk musicians for whom such demo versions are not widely available for study. Comparison of the demo recording to the radically different final interpretations also shows how much more nascent U2’s recorded sketches are compared to, for example, the Beatles’ demos from the *Anthology* recordings, which still closely resemble the final product. This underscores the polarity between compositional processes where a song is pre-written and then essentially orchestrated in the studio, and where a song is conceived almost entirely as fragments of sound and then realized gradually by developing the material according to the affective content of the fragment, as interpreted by the artist.

Analysis also suggests that U2’s unusual song forms result partly from the way they compose. Sketching several outcomes for a single fragment of material provides U2 with multiple pathways to realization of the final version. Often, rather than choose between two possibilities for a musical fragment, they use both, resulting in a distinctive kind of sectional form that I refer to as a verse/chorus binary form, composed of related, but distinct, material. In such a form, the song begins normatively, but around the halfway point, veers into developmental

material without the original materials returning in their entirety, or in their original form. This atypical mode of composition, which is much more the norm for U2 than most other post-punk artists, may partly explain their exceptional longevity, and ability to undergo processes of reinvention, particularly at the sonic surface, while maintaining a less perceivable, but highly idiosyncratic formal style.

*Friday evening, 28 October*

**CULTURE AT THE CROSSROADS: INTERACTIONS BETWEEN  
EUROPEAN AND AMERICAN MUSIC FROM THE  
GILDED AGE TO THE JAZZ AGE**

**Marianne Betz, Musikhochschule Leipzig, Organizer**

**E. Douglas Bomberger, Elizabethtown College**

**Karen Ahlquist, George Washington University**

**John Graziano, City University of New York**

**Earnest Lamb, University of Arkansas at Pine Bluff**

The search for cultural identity increasingly influenced the discourse on music in the United States from around 1890 until the 1930s. As the construction of identities is correlated to time and the interaction of ethnicities, the perception of “sameness” expressed by music consequently depends on various evolving factors. This panel’s five positions are case studies in American music, a discipline recently discussed as located somewhere in between historical musicology, cultural studies, and ethnomusicology (*American Music* 22/2, summer 2004).

American composers found themselves in a complicated love-hate relationship with Europe. While envying the rich and esteemed Old World musical traditions, they simultaneously tried to distance themselves from these models, in order to establish an individual identity. Europe’s new fascination with African American vernacular musics, along with the changing demographics in the United States, only complicated this search. As diverse musical styles found their way into the mainstream, America’s musical life appeared to be at a crossroads: how could a homogeneous musical and cultural identity emerge from a radically heterogeneous society? The panelists, experts in research on American music, will examine the myriad ways this paradox became manifest: how American cultural institutions attempted to create an American identity by cultivating musical tastes, training future musicians, and influencing the reception of American music abroad.

**E. Douglas Bomberger (Elizabethtown College):** American composers of art music around 1890 wrote music that was international rather than local in style and content. This approach was disparaged when F. X. Arens played a series of all-American concerts in Germany in 1891–92. German critics expected to hear folkloristic nationalism and thus considered cosmopolitan music a failure.

**Karen Ahlquist (George Washington University):** An international, conservative practice dominated musicians’ education at New York’s Institute of Musical Art beginning in 1905. Dedication to this practice as historical fact and natural law, and to the Institute’s paternalistic governance and pedagogy, was defined under founder Frank Damrosch as essential to a musician’s legitimacy.

**Marianne Betz (Musikhochschule Leipzig):** George Whitefield Chadwick’s verismo opera *The Padrone* (1913), which, because of its topic of poor Italian immigrants, was rejected during the composer’s lifetime, exemplifies the discrepancy of the postulate for true musical Americana and musical life with opera as a pillar of upper-class culture, which had no room for realism on stage.

**John Graziano (City University of New York):** The European embrace of American vernacular forms at the turn of the century brought a new kind of music to the “Old World.”

Ragtime, jazz, and the blues were adopted by European popular composers, but were also incorporated into the cultivated music of composers such as Krenek, Hindemith, and Weill.

**Earnest Lamb (University of Arkansas at Pine Bluff):** In 1933, Howard Hanson conducted the Scherzo from William Grant Still's *Afro-American Symphony* in an all-American program in Germany. The Berlin audience broke tradition and demanded an encore. The enthusiasm for music based on Negro folk material appears to be exceptional during the period of *Gleichschaltung* and suggests that Still's music was heard as more "American" than the rest.

**AMS HISPANIC MUSIC INTEREST GROUP:  
CURRENT RESEARCH ON MEXICAN MUSIC BY MEXICAN SCHOLARS:  
CARRILLO, REVUELTAS AND THE "BLACK" VILLANCICO**

**Leonora Saavedra, University of California Riverside, Chair**  
**Aurelio Tello, CENIDIM, Mexico City**  
**Roberto Kolb, UNAM, Mexico City**  
**Ricardo Miranda, Universidad Veracruzana**

Three Mexican scholars will present non-traditional readings of the microtonal music of Julián Carrillo, an unknown orchestral composition by Revueltas, and the representation of the African in the villancico. Presentations will be followed by a discussion on newly available resources for the study of Mexican music.

*Saturday Morning, 29 October*

**CHURCH AND THEATER IN MOZART'S VIENNA**  
**Wye J. Allanbrook, University of California, Berkeley, Chair**

MOZART AND ST. STEPHAN'S CATHEDRAL:  
NEW DOCUMENTARY EVIDENCE

David Black  
Harvard University

In April 1791, Mozart petitioned the Vienna City Council to appoint him adjunct Kapellmeister at St. Stephan's Cathedral. The petition was ultimately successful, and the composer took up the position with the understanding that he would succeed to the full post upon the death of its ailing incumbent, Leopold Hofmann. Although Mozart did make reference to the Cathedral in one of his late letters, the circumstances of his appointment and the nature of his duties at St. Stephan's remain almost entirely unknown. The issue is of particular importance, for the post was Mozart's first church appointment in over a decade, and represents a culminating instance of the composer's increased interest in sacred music during his last years.

This paper makes use of little-known sources from St. Stephan's Cathedral to shed light on the history of Mozart's petition and the musical life he would have encountered during the course of his duties. From documents connected with the petition, some previously unknown, it is possible to determine the process by which the Council initially rejected Mozart's request and then reversed its decision. The St. Stephan's account books, and surviving manuscripts from the Cathedral's music archive, previously considered lost, reveal an extensive sacred music establishment hampered by the lack of interest shown by its Kapellmeister. Mozart's brother-in-law, Franz de Paula Hofer, who was a violinist at the Cathedral, may have provided the composer with inside knowledge concerning Hofmann's illness and neglect of his duties. The appointment to St. Stephan's Cathedral presents us with a brief glimpse of what would have been a major professional activity for Mozart in the years following 1791, if not for his early death.

DON JUAN AT THE FEAST OF ALL SOULS

Edmund Goehring  
University of Western Ontario

The Viennese custom of performing Don Juan plays during the Octave of All Souls spans more than a century. Running from around 1717 into the 1820s, and playing in court and non-subsidized venue alike, the repertoire of these *Allerseelenstücke* included Don Juan settings by Prehauser, Gluck, and Marinelli, as well as a Singspiel version of Mozart's *Don Giovanni*.

The scholarly literature has occasionally noted but rarely examined the practice: Auguste Ehrhard's dismissal of it as "une tradition bizarre" (1888) is about the most extensive commentary we have. Yet it is the very strangeness of this mingling of religion, politics, and theater that makes it a compelling object of study. Reaction to this long-standing custom changes over the course of the century, and, in general, the repertory starts out by causing official embarrassment only to end up rousing local, civic pride. Looking mainly at the phase covering

the reigns of Maria Theresa and Joseph II, this paper will examine the significance of the Don Juan tale as an *Allerseelenstück*.

The main contention is that the use of Don Juan theater at All Souls' Day exposes a reactionary side to a tale frequently presented as progressive. In particular, the practice stands squarely against official Viennese efforts to modernize and rationalize not only theater, but also religion. In religion, the official aim was to purge superstition from devotional life, to wean the public off public ritual and ceremony in order to habituate it to a quieter, more intimate piety. In the theater, meanwhile, there reigned an official animus toward the old Aristotelian apology for comedy, which held that comedy promoted virtue by ridiculing vice. The reformers, in contrast, wanted more restrained, modest comic representations, ones that made virtue appear attractive. A law promulgated at the end of October 1751 gives one example of the intersection of religious and theatrical reforms: it banned certain religious plays because, rather than improving morals, they "merely gave occasion for public scandal." Against such a background, the persistence of a spectacular, comic treatment of an irrepressible libertine condemned to hell—all the while accompanying a religious feast day devoted to speeding the dead out of purgatory—must have come across as atavistic, or, as one early commentator complained, Jesuitical. In this context, "Catholic" and "Baroque" were used as rough synonyms to describe the reactionary face of the theater of Don Juan at All Souls' Day.

Acknowledging this Viennese context means reconsidering an influential modern reading of Don Juan lore, which identifies the legend as a species of the carnivalesque. To be sure, contemporary playwrights acknowledged, often grudgingly, their audience's attraction to eye-catching shows at this part of the liturgical year. But the carnivalesque and the spectacular are not identical categories. This paper will conclude by showing that the All Souls' Day repertoire does not generally evince a defiant assertion of earthly existence. Instead, it addresses anxieties about mortality, damnation, and the possibility of grace—concerns largely unavailable in official perspectives on religion and theater.

### ERADICATING *DON GIOVANNI*: SCHRÖDER, LIPPERT, AND THE 1798 *DON JUAN* AT THE VIENNESE HOFOPER

Thomas Denny  
Skidmore College

In 1865, Leopold Sonnleithner published, for the first time since 1787 and 1788 respectively, the original libretti from the two *Don Giovanni* productions that Mozart had supervised. Sonnleithner made clear that both original versions had been "lost" for decades. He credited the rediscovery of the Vienna libretto with ending decades of textual uncertainty, during which "the placement of the later added pieces, the alterations of scenes, and above all, the ending" had been "in doubt." Both Mozart's Italian versions, from Prague and Vienna, began fading from European cultural memory surprisingly early, within Mozart's lifetime.

This paper reconstructs a single, defining chapter—the 1798 production of *Don Juan* at the Viennese court opera—in the longer story of how Mozart's Italian opera became a stranger in its own land, and in foreign lands as well. The 1798 production, the first by the court theaters since the opera's surprisingly brief initial run in Italian some ten years earlier, used a translation by Karl Friedrich Lippert. Newly arrived in Vienna from Berlin, Lippert based his translation on a freely adapted North German performance version developed initially for Hamburg in 1789 by Friedrich Ludwig Schröder, used also in Berlin from 1790 on, and

published in a 1797 vocal score by Simrock in Bonn. The use of the heavily adapted and re-ordered Schröder-Lippert version in Vienna seems a particularly poignant moment of cultural loss, since it took place in a city where people still living could remember Mozart's Italian version and where critical sources (score, parts, etc.) from the original court opera production were readily accessible.

The paper makes two principal contributions: first, it provides far more precise delineation of the dispersion of this influential performance version, most importantly, by reconstructing the version performed in Vienna 1798; second, it describes the personal and institutional dynamics that facilitated the transmission among these cities. The first contribution, the description of the related performance versions, is based on identifying and comparing early published libretti, and on close study of manuscripts, including new datings and reconstructions of the versions contained in their earliest layers. Relevant libretti survive from Berlin 1790 and 1801 and Hamburg 1796, but not from Hamburg 1789 or Vienna 1798. Various manuscript materials can be dated and connected to early performances: Hamburg (1789 and 1796), including orchestral parts and score; Vienna (1798), score plus souffleur and censor's materials; and Berlin (c1820), souffleur books. The second contribution, describing the mechanisms of transmission, is based on research with both primary and secondary sources for the people and institutions involved, including new archival research about Lippert's Hamburg and Viennese activities.

The 1798 production marks a key moment in the near loss of Mozart's original Viennese version. It is a tale of four cities—Hamburg, Berlin, Vienna, and Bonn. But it is also a tale of three men—Lippert and Schröder (and, to a lesser extent, Simrock)—whose lives, and whose influential work with Mozart's operas, crossed in interesting ways in these centers of German opera.

## THE AMBIVALENCE OF MOZART'S COUNTESS

Richard Will  
University of Virginia

My paper critiques a long-standing consensus that the end of Mozart's *Le nozze di Figaro* (1786) represents an apotheosis of human grace. Facing a husband who has been exposed as unfaithful, Mozart's Countess forgives him and leads the cast in a prayer for happiness. Since the nineteenth century commentators have argued that her act of mercy is sincere (Otto Jahn, Hermann Abert, Joseph Kerman), and recent writers contend that it is also redemptive, leading the cast to recognize timeless truths about their shared humanity (Stefan Kunze, Ivan Nagel, Nicholas Till). In a similar vein, performers have solemnized the scene by playing it very slowly and with quasi-religious sobriety, as is evidenced by audio and video recordings stretching from before World War II into the era of historical performance practice. Such interpretations ignore aspects of the opera that undermine its resolution. In adapting Beaumarchais's *Le Mariage de Figaro*, Mozart and his librettist Lorenzo Da Ponte heightened the moral contrast between the Countess and her husband. They purified the Countess, eliminating her extramarital attraction to the teenage Cherubino and adding soliloquy arias in which she prays for the restoration of marital love. At the same time they coarsened the Count, excising dialogue that evidences charm and self-consciousness of his failings, and assigning him aggressive and overbearing music. The gulf between the couple makes any reconciliation difficult to believe, and so do details of the music, among them the minor-mode asides that

shadow the Countess's initial pardoning of the Count in Act II, and the deceptive cadences that prolong her final pardon and suggest she acts with reluctance. Equally important, the second pardon passes quickly—much more so, I would argue, than the performance tradition indicates. Plea, pardon, and prayer together occupy only twenty-six measures of common-time (4/4) Andante, and the evidence on Mozart's tempo practices suggests they should last little more than half as long as they typically do. Despite its lyricism and lack of comic bustle, the music does not so obviously suspend time as critics and performers assume: understated but clear, its quarter-note pulse anchors the scene in the same temporal mundanity as the preceding intrigues. Reading the scene as more secular than sacred, and the Countess as more ambivalent than sincere, avoids the troubling implications of making her act of mercy the means by which the other characters learn what are said to be Christian or Enlightened ideals. In the traditional interpretation, their education depends not on the mutual forgiveness of Christians or the Enlightened dialogue of equals, but on the unreciprocated forbearance of a self-sacrificing woman. A Countess who is ambivalent about her action, and an ending that remains anchored in the petty tensions of the surrounding events, suggest a less exalted, but fairer and more complex social order. Rather than expect its matriarch to grant redemption, the community of the opera allows that she along with everyone else may recognize, wrestle with, and even resist the conventions that govern their relationships.

## CULTURAL POLITICS IN THE TWENTIETH CENTURY

Stephen Hinton, Stanford University, Chair

### MAKING THE INVISIBLE VISIBLE: THE CULTURE, THEOLOGY AND REALIZATION OF OLIVIER MESSIAEN'S IMPROVISATIONS

Robert Sholl

King's College, London / Thames Valley University, London

Improvisation has become a musicological field that encompasses classical, ethnographical and popular music traditions, as well as psychological, physiological and theological dimensions. Yet sparse attention has been paid to the organ improvisations of the French composer Olivier Messiaen (1908–1992). This paper will combine insights into the culture behind Messiaen's recorded improvisations and his theology of music. It will examine their effect on his compositional output, and analyze their role in our understanding of music and modernity.

The improvisation treatises of Messiaen's mentors, Charles Tournemire (1870–1939) and Marcel Dupré (1886–1971), reveal a pedagogical and performance culture that informed Messiaen's own improvisations. Dupré's formalist concerns with phrase structure and counterpoint, evident in Messiaen's earliest music [especially his *Diptyque* (1930)], are complemented by Tournemire's concerns with serendipity, and the revelation of spirit through the immediacy of improvisation. This connection forms the basis of Messiaen's theology of improvisation.

Messiaen believed that music was not only a spiritual gift, but that it formed a conduit between God and humanity which pierces, like light through stained-glass window, through to the deepest part of ourselves (to that which St. Augustine describes as "more inward to me than my most inward part"). For Messiaen, music had the power to illuminate the latent presence of God in humanity, and, most importantly, at the same time, it called us to respond to

God. Improvisation could provide this reconnection of humanity to God (a *raison d'être* of Messiaen's art), to create what Tournemire calls a "sort of miracle."

Three recordings will be used to illustrate different facets of Messiaen's improvisations. His improvisations on his mother Cécile Sauvage's poetry (1978) reveal his subjective interpretation of Christian predestination. An invaluable DVD (1985) of Messiaen improvising on plainchant reveals not only the influence of Tournemire and Dupré, but that Messiaen's harmony and (orchestration) had its origins in his own kinaesthetic approach to the organ, based on his sensitivity to natural resonance in the harmonic development of organ registers. Another recently released disc (2004) reveals further the profound influence of improvisation on Messiaen's written works. My research will expose the ways in which improvised ideas, harmonies, textures and colours, were developed in Messiaen's works from the *Messe de la Pentecôte* (1950) to his penultimate orchestral work *Eclairs sur l'au-delà* (1988–91).

This paper will raise crucial questions about the significance of improvisation and its role in the changing status of music and modernity. Could Messiaen's rich tapestry of Christian metaphor overcome the negative aesthetic resonances of alienation and progress sedimented in his own dissonant musical language, and, if so, does improvisation constitute an act of euphoric and wilful amnesia that is essential to the progress of aesthetic modernity? Messiaen's improvisations will be shown to embody a search for both transcendence and certainty that stretches the membrane of his own religious ideology. His work provides a touchstone for the burgeoning theological music of the last twenty years that attempts, even through supposedly secular narratives, to reconnect the secular sublime to God.

## CHARLES IVES, AUTONOMY, AND COLD WAR POLITICS

David C. Paul

University of California, Berkeley

In 1950, sociologists David Riesman, Nathan Glazer, and Reuel Denney published *The Lonely Crowd*, which portrayed middle-class America as a society paralyzed by fear of peer disapproval. The book became an unlikely bestseller, providing a satisfying subtext to the "decade of consensus" dominated by the suburban world of "Leave it to Beaver." Cultural historians have scrutinized the book intensively, but a brief reference to Charles Ives has gone largely unnoticed. Riesman and his co-authors held up the composer as an example of an "autonomous man," citing his double life as businessman by day, composer by night. This apparently innocuous reference, I will argue, has major significance for the reception of Ives. It signals his iconic role in an urgent discussion that was then taking place amongst American intellectuals about the nature of freedom—a discussion set against the backdrop of the Cold War.

Riesman, Glazer, and Denney were members of the Congress for Cultural Freedom (CCF), an organization that engaged in cultural politics, championing democracy and denigrating communism in the hopes of winning hearts and minds in a Europe skeptical of American power. That Ives was linked to this project is attested to not only by the reference in *The Lonely Crowd*, but also by the fact that his *Concord* Sonata was performed on a concert sponsored by the CCF in 1952. If the urge towards conformity had eroded the freedoms of American democracy, individual autonomy thrown aside in the desperate attempt to keep up with the Joneses, Ives represented a desirable alternative. Here was a man who had steered a course through two worlds where the dangers of consensus threatened. On the one hand, he had been a successful businessman who preserved his leisure time for an unusual hobby; on the

other, he had avoided the European epigonism of the American musical world by choosing not to pursue a career in music.

Surveying other literature from the fifties, I demonstrate that *The Lonely Crowd's* depiction of Ives was typical, an indication of the extent to which American thinkers had become embroiled in the terms of Cold War discourse. For example, in the climactic chapter of his 1955 textbook, *America's Music*, Gilbert Chase argued that Ives's independence was the necessary precondition to the creation of an authentic American music. Because of his "utter independence of conventional musical standards," Chase wrote, "Charles Ives, first and alone among American composers, was able to discern and to utilize the truly idiosyncratic and germinal elements of our folk and popular music." Such heavy emphasis on Ives's autonomy had the effect of erasing other facets of his biography, in particular the prejudices of the Gilded Age that so influenced his life choices. Those factors, I point out, only began to be discussed by scholars in the 1970s, when the Cold War had lapsed into an even staler stalemate.

### NEW BEGINNINGS: WHITMAN, THE POSTWAR "REVOLUTIONARY ETHOS," AND HINDEMITH'S EARLY RADICALISM

Joel Haney  
Yale University

Although Paul Hindemith's *Drei Hymnen von Walt Whitman* for baritone and piano, written in the wake of the First World War, have largely escaped scholarly notice, they expose a problem basic to his artistic development and to postwar German modernism generally: negotiating the conflict between an inherited ideology of the transcending of artistic convention and an emerging social imperative of broadened accessibility. In their boldness the Whitman Hymns strained Hindemith's early relationship with Schott, who balked at the "new, radical style" taken up by the young composer and left them unpublished during his lifetime. Traces can indeed be found in the first song—a German setting of Whitman's "Ages and Ages Returning at Intervals"—as well as in Hindemith's letters of an idiosyncratic dialogue with certain values of the prewar New Music. Whitman's breathless and boisterous poem, moreover, could be construed as a literary concomitant of Hindemith's emerging radicalism. In scandalously earthy language, an Adamic poet-prophet cries out to humanity full-throated from a new Eden, throwing off the fetters of convention and calling into being an era of primal freshness and spontaneity.

Reading Whitman through the lens of his German reception in the years surrounding the war, though, demands that we reconsider which paradigm should be invoked when assessing the young Hindemith's "radical" turn. At this time, Whitman's broad addresses to humanity resonated profoundly with a "revolutionary ethos" which hoped to recover a social connectedness that had suffered erosion during the imperial era and devastation in the war. Increasingly, art was called upon to play a leading role in refashioning the human community. A consequent emphasis on the broadened accessibility of art, however, collided head-on with the existing modernist demand for radically reshaped materials. For the younger generation, the latter still bore the prestige of artistic high-mindedness, but now also lay open to the charge of irrespirable hermeticism.

That Hindemith's own formation was strongly shaped by this conflict has been recognized, but scholarship traditionally relegates the awakening of his social conscience to the mid- and later 1920s (with particular emphasis on his music for amateurs), allowing the image of a

composer little concerned with his audience to dominate the immediate postwar years. I propose, by contrast, that the social imperative already influenced the first Whitman setting at the beginning of Hindemith's career, filtering his engagement with the legacy of prewar radical modernism. While acknowledging his self-styled embrace of some previously cutting-edge values, I stress the "revolutionary" import of his refusing others.

## GIDEON KLEIN'S MORAVIAN REQUIEM

Michael Beckerman  
New York University

On October 7 1944 the twenty-four-year old Gideon Klein completed a trio for strings. Nine days later he was transported from the Terezin concentration camp where he had been incarcerated for several years, to Auschwitz where he perished. The score of the trio, along with other works by the composer, was hidden and given to Klein's sister after the war. On the basis of new evidence and textual and musical analysis, this paper argues that the physical score itself is not the only aspect of the composition that involved concealment. Folded between two brief and somewhat lively outer movements is a substantial Lento innocently titled "Variations on a Moravian Folk Song." For his variations, Klein makes use of a song from the Slovacko area, "Ta knezdubská vez" (The Knezdub [Priest's Oak] Tower) and morphs the rhapsodic style of the region into a funeral march by slowing the tempo and creating ambiguous readings of the Hungarian-style trochaic accents. We do not know whether the choice of this song reflects a return to the world of childhood—as some have said—or involves a broader meditation about nation and self, but it is probable that the symbolism of the text was a critical consideration:

The Knezdub tower is high, / a wild goose flew over it, landed upon it.

Johnny, take the gun! / Aim at the tower and shoot the goose!

He shot the goose, and shot again. / Farewell my dear, you have betrayed your beloved. / One hundred times farewell.

The song's conflation of the wild goose, the death of the beloved, and a final goodbye, encourages a reading of the movement that pursues connections between a rich array of themes. A composer, unjustly imprisoned, hidden behind stone walls hides a highly personal utterance between the outer walls of his final work. The victim finds a kind of sanctuary in the protected space of a slow movement, traditionally a place of fantasy, love, strong feeling and death. The rhetorical structure of the variation set, which positions expressive outbursts between outer funeral marches, further reinforces the sense that the composer is working quite consciously to convey his specific circumstances, as do harrowing allusions to Mahler's *Kindertotenlieder*. Considering that Klein's most notable activity in the months before the trio's composition was as the pianist and guiding force behind the infamous performances of Verdi's Requiem (widely regarded by inmates as a requiem for themselves) it is probable that this variation movement was consciously intended as requiem, at once an intensely personal statement, and also, like the wild goose of the song, an attempt to reach far beyond the towers to an audience that would come to grips with its implications.

## JAZZ TOPICS

Scott DeVeaux, University of Virginia, Chair

WHO'S ON FIRST, WHAT'S SECOND, AND  
WHERE DID THEY COME FROM?: THE SOCIAL AND MUSICAL  
TEXTURES OF EARLY JAZZ IN NEW ORLEANSThomas Brothers  
Duke University

This paper analyzes instrumental roles in New Orleans, *c.* 1900–1920. The history of “collective improvisation” probably involved the merger of two separate traditions—heterophonic doublings of the lead melody and obbligato counterpoint to the lead. Uptown African Americans who grew up with heterophony in church and the plantation tradition of “ragging” a tune specialized in one, downtown Creoles of color who knew obbligato parts from written-out arrangements specialized in the other.

The extent of heterophonic doublings in uptown bands has not been recognized. Buddy Bolden, the famous cornetist, may have gained his reputation more through heterophony—that is, by playing “second”—than by playing lead, contrary to received wisdom. After Bolden, it was common practice to have violinists and clarinetists carry the lead, with cornet embellishing heterophonically. In the uptown “routine” bands, promiscuous shuffling of instruments and roles was commonplace and it had long-reaching consequences. When we find Louis Armstrong playing second cornet in King Oliver’s Creole Jazz Band in 1923, we should view him as building on a history of improvisational second playing that included Nelson, Bechet and Dodds on clarinet, Johnson, Keppard, Oliver and Petit on cornet. These are the leading figures in early jazz, and each of them rotated between lead and second. This tradition of mixed-up role-playing influenced the mature solo style of Armstrong, which is designed to capture both the melodic coherence of a lead melody and the textural richness of collective improvisation. When the twenty-two year old Armstrong played second to the failing Oliver in 1923, he was not so much being held back as he was in just the right place at just the right time.

The violinists and clarinetists brought into uptown bands to play lead usually came from across the tracks—that is, they were Creoles of color who lived on the downtown, French side of Canal Street. Downtown music making was more oriented towards the salon, where violin and clarinet played the lead and there were no cornets. In uptown African-American neighborhoods, outdoor music-making was much more central; hence the importance of the cornet, of loud playing, and of a dominant cornetist like Bolden ragging embellishments around a straight lead, carried by violin or clarinet. The social structure of early jazz has not previously been analyzed from these perspectives.

From this perspective I also critique the argument of several scholars (Fierhrer, Johnson, Collier, Ostendorf) that the distinctive qualities of early jazz came from the Creoles. Creoles were mainly conservative and reactionary; the driving energy of early jazz came instead from uptown and ultimately from the plantations, from which some 50,000 African Americans migrated to the city. Creoles like Nelson and Bechet were rebels who bucked tradition; they happened to be good at improvisational invention, which made them good second players. As clarinetists, they knew obbligato parts, which enhanced their ability to contribute to the polyphonic texture of collective improvisation, thus turning the practice away from heterophony. In concept, however, they were imitating the uptown innovators.

## JELLY ROLL MORTON AND THE SPANISH TINGE

Charles Garrett  
University of Michigan

In his 1938 interviews with Alan Lomax at the Library of Congress, jazz pianist and composer Jelly Roll Morton identified the “Spanish tinge” as a key component of early jazz. This term has since become a catch phrase, often expressed as the “Latin tinge,” to describe the influence of Spanish, Caribbean, and Latin American musical practices upon music in the United States. In addition to wide-ranging treatments of this phenomenon by John Storm Roberts and Ned Sublette, scholars also have begun to tell the history of Latin jazz, concentrating their efforts on later generations of musicians like Machito and Dizzy Gillespie. Surprisingly, despite the substantial and steadily growing literature on Jelly Roll Morton, the role of the Spanish tinge in his musical life has yet to be treated in detail.

Yet, Morton’s relationship to the Spanish tinge constituted neither a minor flirtation nor a temporary musical detour; on the contrary, it helped to shape his personal biography and occupied his creative imagination, from his ancestral roots to his final studio recordings. This presentation begins by outlining Morton’s exposure to Latin musical cultures as part of his Creole upbringing in turn-of-the-century New Orleans. Along the course of his itinerant career, which featured stops in Texas, California, and Mexico, Morton composed and/or recorded nearly twenty tunes marked by a Spanish tinge, whether gauged by musical traits, programmatic titles, or his own geographic border-crossing. For instance, his composition “Kansas City Stomp” derived its title not directly from the Midwestern jazz capital but from the name of a venue he played in Tijuana, Mexico. To explain how Latin influences extended beyond his frequent incorporation of tango-habañera rhythms into his compositions, my discussion incorporates illustrative examples from Morton’s performances of Latin- or Latin-influenced tunes (“La Paloma” and “Tia Juana”), his brief ride on the tango bandwagon (“The Crave”), his composition of what he called “Spanish” melodies (“Creepy Feeling”), and his long relationship with Anita Gonzales, a fellow Creole who inspired several of his Spanish-tinged compositions (including “Mamanita” and “Sweet Anita Mine”).

Taking this angle to understanding Jelly Roll Morton proves especially productive, for he has always represented a thorn in the side of black-and-white racialized jazz narratives, as result of his reluctance to identify as African-American in favor of proudly embracing Creole culture. Like the recent scholarship of David Ake and Thomas Brothers, which revisits early New Orleans jazz via the lens of Creole culture, my project presents a similar challenge to the binary racial model often employed in jazz discourse; in contrast, my work places greater emphasis upon the international, border-crossing implications suggested by the Spanish tinge. Accordingly, this evocative catch phrase offers a stimulating metaphor for the multiracial, transnational character of jazz and American music.

### WHO PLAYS THE TUNE IN “BODY AND SOUL”?

José Bowen  
Miami University

While jazz has a canon of musical works, these jazz “standards” evoke different models of authority and identity than do most Western musical works, and European legal or phenomenological models are often counterproductive. While “official” lead sheets and musical notation exist for a host of jazz standards, they are not generally authoritative in jazz: the

multiplicity of recorded versions are the true primary sources. So as with language and other performance traditions, performers learn tunes as performed by others; they come to new performers already rich with the inflection and connotation of earlier individual performances.

Despite this different relationship between its performers and composers, the Western notions (a) that musicians are divided into composers and performers, (b) that musical works are fixed and (c) that there is an authentic style of performance that is “true” to the work, have often been accepted as working assumptions in jazz. Looking at jazz from a more African and less European perspective, though, jazz “tunes” seem a different, less fixed, sort of musical work and there are competing sources of authority in jazz performance. (The argument over these concepts in European music is a different matter.) Jazz scholarship and jazz education continue to rely increasingly on written materials, however, as we have not developed alternative ways to study this more oral tradition.

This paper attempts to explore the authorities present in the transmission of Johnny Green’s “Body and Soul.” One of the most recorded tunes in jazz, it has a tradition of “popular” performance before its most important early “jazz” performance by Louis Armstrong in 1930. An alteration in the first four notes of the piece became authoritative, and its most popular recorded version (Coleman Hawkins, 1939) contains barely a reference to the original melody. Hawkins’ version, and not the original sheet music or early performance history, also set a standard key (D flat—even for singers!) and a standard tempo ( $\text{♩} = 90$ , although later it became even slower). Billie Holiday determined which set of lyrics would be sung, but not the form in which they would occur. Other performers added traditions of the “jump” chorus, or the double-time bridge. This paper demonstrates a new model for how we can study and teach musical works in jazz. The European model of music as musical works fixed in notated scores has the advantage of giving us a stable object of study, but using clips from dozens of recordings (over three hundred recordings were studied for this project), this paper will investigate “Body and Soul” as a set of changing and contradictory musical events. Tunes change, but using recordings as a primary source, we can recover the unique and changing concept of the musical work in jazz.

## JAZZ “WITH STRINGS”

John Howland

Rutgers University, Newark

In the 1940s and early 1950s, a variety of richly orchestrated, jazz-inflected popular music genres merged standard jazz ensemble formats with lush, urbane, string-based backgrounds. While these “glorified” jazz textures were direct outgrowths of earlier popular music traditions—including 1930s radio and society/dance orchestras and 1920s symphonic jazz dance bands and theater orchestras—these later trends represent the most direct historical engagement of the bona fide jazz tradition with such hybrid instrumental textures.

From roughly 1940 to 1945, a number of popular big band leaders expanded their ensembles by adding strings and other orchestral instruments to emulate the large hybrid ensembles of contemporary radio orchestras and certain “sweet”-style dance bands. The enlargements of these ensembles, particularly those of Artie Shaw, Tommy Dorsey and Glenn Miller, introduced an enriched popular music idiom that regularly juxtaposed contemporary jazz arranging textures and solo improvisation against self-consciously melodramatic orchestral backgrounds. While the post-War period saw the decline of many big bands in both contemporary jazz and popular culture, this era also marked the rise of various jazz-derived

orchestral idioms that were marketed to a prosperous adult audience that had originally fueled the Swing-era music market as teens. Much of this music expanded on the jazz-plus-strings vogue of the early 1940s. Soloists soon clamored for such quasi-orchestral arrangements following the commercial success of the Charlie Parker “with strings” albums. Equally popular in the early 1950s was the modernist bombast of the big-band-plus-strings “progressive jazz” of the Stan Kenton orchestra. Kenton’s recording label, Capitol, simultaneously pioneered both jazz-plus-strings style mood music as well as an influential jazz-pop orchestral style epitomized in the 1950s recordings of Frank Sinatra and Nelson Riddle. Lastly, each of these orchestral jazz idioms was quickly appropriated for Hollywood film underscoring, as can be seen in both the 1950s crime jazz film score vogue and the Mancini/Riddle-style romantic comedy scores of the late 1950s and 1960s.

Despite the contributions of many genuine jazz artists to these developments, this hybrid orchestral jazz tradition is often ignored or disparaged in most post-1960 jazz scholarship that has sought to narrowly canonize jazz as a high art form. However, in contrast to the venerated canon of recordings exalted by most jazz scholarship, these mid-century middlebrow idioms have continued to foster a parallel and highly successful commercial canon of both “jazz with strings” recordings and lush, Riddle-inspired “American Songbook” vocal recordings. In the modern marketing of jazz, this second critically neglected canon has ironically come to function as the most prominent representative of jazz in popular culture.

Through brief comparisons of select 1940s and 1950s arrangements and recordings, this paper articulates the larger aesthetic discourses and cultural conditions that shaped the hybrid, middlebrow ideals of the jazz-with-strings subgenre and its contributions to the post-War mass marketing of jazz.

## MUSIC, CULTURE, AND POLITICS IN VIENNA: DVOŘÁK TO MAHLER

**Michael P. Steinberg, Brown University, Chair**

## POLITICS AT THE PHILHARMONIC: LIBERALISM AND THE “THREAT” OF DVOŘÁK’S SIXTH SYMPHONY

David Brodbeck

University of California, Irvine

The many striking ways in which Dvořák’s Sixth Symphony (1880) recalls specific stylistic features of Brahms’s Second (1877) have been noted by a number of scholars in recent years. Brahms’s work, which Hans Richter and the Vienna Philharmonic first performed in December 1877, brought him both popular and critical success. The experience of Dvořák’s symphony was at first less rewarding. To be sure, the composer had written the work at the request of Richter himself, who promised a Philharmonic performance in December 1880. But the following months brought repeated postponements of the première, and the orchestra—a democratic institution whose members reserved the right to choose which new works to take into its repertoire—finally dropped the piece from its plans altogether. Although the Philharmonic would play many other works by Dvořák in the years to come, the Sixth failed to appear in its programs until 1910. Some years ago John Clapham suggestively pointed to the “strong anti-Czech feeling” existing in Vienna around 1880 as a likely cause for the orchestra’s

refusal to program the work. Clapham was content to leave this provocative theme unexamined, however, and thus far no other scholar has really given it the attention it deserves. In this paper I take the matter head on by examining the broader historical context in which the unfortunate episode took place.

The Philharmonic was preeminently an institution of the cultural center, and of the “nouveaux riches and newly emancipated” (Gellner) who formed the core of Vienna’s German-speaking liberal elite. Significantly, Austrian liberal ideology understood German identity, not in terms of ethnicity, but in terms of bourgeois cultural values that could be adopted by urban Jews or middle-class members of any of Austria’s many national groups. Bourgeois Czech nationalists, by contrast, claimed ethnicity as the basis of their social identity, and so resisted the liberal imperative to acculturate, aligning instead with German clerical, aristocratic, and other conservative interests. To the liberals, then, Czech nationalism came to be identified with the forces of reaction and thus to be seen as a threat to the general liberal ideals of progress and civilization. Dvořák came to notice in Vienna just as tension between the German and Czech bourgeoisie was coming to a head. The liberal government fell in 1879 and was replaced by a conservative coalition with a strong pro-Slav component; then in 1880, in an especially threatening gesture, the new government mandated Czech as an administrative language on equal footing with German in the mixed-language regions of Bohemia and Moravia. Ironically, through its many references to Brahms’s Second Symphony (and in other ways), the work that Dvořák composed for Richter and the Philharmonic “speaks German” with unusual clarity. But in a period of when liberals felt themselves under siege, nationality trumped culture. What mattered most about Dvořák’s Sixth proved not to be that it sounded like the work of a German but that it had been written by a Czech.

“UNTYING THE TONGUE OF KITSCH”:  
MAHLER AND THE TRIVIAL AS FOLK

Julie Hubbert

University of South Carolina

Defining the “trivial” in Mahler’s music, and likewise explaining Mahler’s continued use of trivialities in the face of persistent criticism, is a topic that has long occupied scholars. While some have focused specifically on Mahler’s process, either searching for specific sources or discussing whether his method of incorporation is allusion or quotation, most have also described this aspect of his style as a manifestation of the large problem of musical modernism. Adorno, for instance, saw the trivial in Mahler’s symphonies as displaying a fundamental conflict between high and low art; the superiority of the concert hall music was being intentionally juxtaposed against the inferiority of popular music. Mahler initiated a “provocative alliance with vulgar music,” Adorno asserted, “. . . [with] shallow popular songs, street ballads and pop hits.” He “sketche[d] salvation for the symphony by untying the tongue of kitsch, unfettering the longing that is (merely) exploited by the commerce that the kitsch serves.”

Mahler’s symphonies certainly are the site of an intended conflict between high and low art. But they are also, I want to suggest, the site of another conflict, one not between high and low but between two different kinds of low. The intrusion of the trivial in Mahler’s symphonies is documenting the emergence of trivial music as distinct not just from symphonic music but from another type of music, a type of popular music that in contrast had long been idealized for its immediacy and simplicity: folk music. Part of this more detailed

understanding of triviality is available in the contemporary criticism of Mahler's symphonies. Mahler's critics denigrated his music by associating it with a growing list of musical types associated specifically with the streets and institutions of the modern metropolitan city. In another contemporary source, however, that to date has received little if any attention in this context, the turn-of-the-century folksong collections, an even more precise definition of musical triviality emerges. Just as Mahler's critics were documenting the encroachment of a kind of music that was not artistic because it was urban, folksong collectors were defining the same urban music as inferior because it was not folk music. In the theoretically-minded prefaces of the folksong collections, the trivial is defined not just as non-art music but more specifically as non-folk music.

The folksong manuals in particular reveal a more detailed conceptualization of triviality, but they also offer a corrective to the interpretation of Mahler's eclectic style. Mahler persisted in incorporating trivialities into his symphonies, they suggest, not just to expand the boundaries of the symphony but to resist this emerging distinction between popular urban music and folk music. In his personal experiences but also in his musical conceptualizations of Nature, particularly in the Third and Seventh symphonies, Mahler purposely confuses trivial and folk, urban and rural. If Mahler untied the tongue of kitsch, then he did so to some extent by disregarding the emerging distinction between trivial and folk, by assigning urban music the value, immediacy and rural location of the folk music.

#### “ONWARD CAN BE THE ONLY APPROPRIATE MOTTO”: ARTHUR SEIDL, GUSTAV MAHLER, AND THE AESTHETICS OF EMPATHY

Stephen McClatchie, University of Regina  
Morten Solvik, IES, Vienna, Austria

One of Gustav Mahler's best-known letters (letter 216 in *Gustav Mahler Briefe*, second ed.) is addressed to the German critic and music historian Arthur Seidl (1863–1928). In this letter, dated 17 February 1897, Mahler expands on the nature of program music and musical inspiration within the context of a discussion of his Second Symphony and a comparison of his “program music” with that of Richard Strauss. Here Mahler uses the striking metaphor of “two miners digging a shaft from opposite ends and then meeting underground” in response to Seidl's reference to the two composers as “opposite poles.” He also discusses the inspiration for the finale of the Second Symphony at Hans von Bülow's funeral in Hamburg.

The letter from Seidl to Mahler that provoked such a revealing reply was recently discovered by one of us in the Handschriftensammlung of the Österreichische Nationalbibliothek. In ten handwritten pages, Seidl tells the composer how his Second Symphony had found “an echo in [his] soul” and awakened the empathy that for Seidl was essential for his musical understanding; Seidl refers to this as “intuitive interpretation.” Such a concept resonates clearly with the expressive aesthetic position so characteristic of the Wagnerian and post-Wagnerian generation. Mahler alluded to this “productive criticism” briefly in his response, but the rediscovery of Seidl's letter now allows us to understand Mahler's rather enigmatic remark. The letter also provides a wider context in which to assess the Mahler-Strauss relationship and their respective views about program music (which demonstrate two aspects of the post-Wagnerian expressive aesthetic position). Finally, Seidl articulates an evolutionary and modernist understanding of the development of musical language that is highly insightful yet not addressed

at all by Mahler in his response. A complete translation of Seidl's letter will be provided as a handout.

The Mahler-Seidl correspondence (which also includes a letter to Seidl dated 21 January 1897 [GMB2 210] as well as Seidl's response to Mahler's February letter, which has also recently surfaced in Vienna) will be contextualized within a wider discussion of the post-Wagnerian expressive aesthetic position, Seidl's own review of Mahler's Second Symphony (which initiated the correspondence), his subsequent reviews of the piece as well as his published writings on program music, Mahler, and Strauss (in particular, his *Moderner Geist in der deutschen Tonkunst*).

## FROM IMPRISONMENT INTO FREEDOM: MAHLER'S "RE-COMPOSITION" OF ACT II OF FIDELIO AS A CREATIVE MANIFESTO

Katarina Markovic-Stokes  
New England Conservatory

Although he had performed Beethoven's *Fidelio* since his earliest conducting posts in Prague and Budapest, it was only in 1891, as the conductor of the Hamburg Opera, that Mahler made a bold intervention into the traditional way of performing this staple of any German opera house. Instead of continuing to perform the Leonore no. 3 Overture either at the beginning of the opera, or between the two acts, as was customary at the time, Mahler placed the Leonore no. 3 Overture inside Act II at the set change after the dungeon scene and before the Finale. This practice, which he revived in 1904 in his Vienna production of *Fidelio*, provoked controversial critical reactions, but due to its practically, dramaturgically, and structurally motivated logic, it gained approval from musicians and conductors and became the performance tradition of many opera houses ever since. Mahler himself unequivocally justified this unconventional insertion not by arguments based on practical considerations, as most authors have suggested (La Grange, Wellesz, Pickett), but by emphasizing broader philosophical connections between the events of the opera and the teleological direction of the Overture. Because he thought that the Overture "compresses the drama's whole gamut of emotions into a great climax," Mahler felt that "only thus will the triumph of good over the forces of evil seem overwhelming."

Mahler's use of the Overture as a "compression" of the opera's emotional gamut is further enhanced by his *Retuschen* to the Overture itself. A close examination of Mahler's annotations to the Overture, including his numerous changes to Beethoven's dynamics and articulation markings, reveals that his annotations were calculated to emphasize, within the symphonic work, the drama of Florestan's release into freedom. A comparison of those to the annotations of the corresponding dramatic section in Act II of *Fidelio*, indicates that Mahler's annotations to both of these works were aimed at affirming their dramatic interconnectedness. Beyond the unquestioned practical benefits of this insertion, I will argue that the implications of this gesture extend to the structure of the opera as well as to the meaning and structure of the Overture itself. By reiterating the role of the Overture's trumpet fanfare just before the final climax of the opera, Mahler intensifies, through this act of re-composition, all the elements of the Beethovenian breakthrough (*Durchbruch*), a compositional gesture laden with political, philosophical and psychological implications. Therefore, by compressing, or cyclically bringing back through the Leonora Overture, the important elements of the dramatic trajectory of the opera at the moment of pereipactia, or just before the final resolution—a

procedure mimicking in effect elements of the *Durchbruch* procedure of his own symphonies—Mahler creates, within the space of Beethoven's work, a creative manifesto of his own artistic ideology.

## NEW LIGHT ON THE “CAPUT” MASSES

Alejandro E. Planchart, University of California, Santa Barbara, Chair

### OCKEGHEM'S MUSICAL ECLIPSE

Robert Nosow

University of North Texas

The straightforward borrowing of the tenor from an anonymous English Mass in Johannes Ockeghem's *Missa “Caput”* masks an extraordinary act of musical symbolism. The “Canon: alterum caput descendendo tenorem per dyapason” transposes the tenor an octave lower, placing it at the bottom of the four-part texture. Ockeghem thereby sets up a conflict between the G mode of the cantus firmus and the D mode of the other voices. The symbolism of the *Missa “Caput”* relates it to the liturgies of Maundy Thursday, Good Friday, and Holy Saturday.

The word *caput* in the fifteenth century was most often understood as part of the astronomical phrase *caput draconis*, “the head of the dragon.” The *caput draconis* is the point at which the moon crosses the ecliptic in northern latitudes, marking an eclipse of the sun. This phrase is inscribed in the tenor of the English *Missa “Caput”* in the Lucca Choirbook; dragons are also depicted at the head of the Ockeghem Mass in the Chigi Codex. As Michael Long notes in regard to the English Mass, the *caput draconis* corresponds to the events commemorated on Good Friday, for at the crucifixion “Erat autem fere hora sexta, et tenebrae factae sunt in universam terram usque ad horam nonam. Et obscuratus est sol. . . .” (Luke 23:44–45). The symbolism applies yet more profoundly to Ockeghem's Mass, for the fallen tenor represents the head of the dragon. The *B-mi* with which it begins and to which it constantly returns requires the F above to be sung also as *mi*, subverting the prevailing harmony. The dark textures and strange harmonies of the Mass, “contrary to reason,” manifest the eclipse in musical terms. The darkness of the Mass relates to the *Tenebrae* offices of Maundy Thursday, Good Friday, and Holy Saturday, at which the altar candles were extinguished one by one, and the Lamentations of Jeremiah were sung. The last candle was covered and often hidden, symbolizing Christ in the tomb.

Late medieval theory also associates the notes G with earth and D with the sun. Throughout most of each movement, the G modality, manifested in the tenor, opposes the D modality of the other voices. In the Gospel of John, Christ “Erat lux vera, quae illuminat omnem hominem” (John 1:9). This light is obscured until the very end of each statement, where Ockeghem adds, after a significant rest, the note D in the tenor, joining the other voices in three perfect intervals. This signifies the rekindling of the altar candle at the Blessing of the New Fire late on Holy Saturday. The yearly rite of baptism followed, as prefigured by the *Mandatum* ceremony, to which the cantus firmus belongs, in which Christ washes the “mundus totus” (John 13:10). In the *Missa “Caput”* the singers may be said to have washed away the sins of the congregation via their symbolic struggle with the dragon of the eclipse.

THE COMPOSER AND THE KNIGHT:  
MUSIC AND CHIVALRY IN THE LATE MIDDLE AGES

Joseph Hupchick  
University of Cincinnati

The institution of chivalry pervaded nearly every facet of medieval society from the eleventh century to the beginning of the early modern period and beyond. *Chevalerie* and its associated qualities—honor, prowess, piety, and courtly love—were embedded firmly in the medieval consciousness.

The connection between music and chivalry is at once both obvious and elusive: the practitioners of chivalry and those of music are often from the same social background, and references to music and musicians recur throughout chivalric literature. Yet direct references to knighthood, battles, violence, and chivalric characters are uncommon in medieval song. This paper proposes that despite the lack of direct evidence to link chivalry to music, allusions to the chivalric world do indeed exist in the music of the late Middle Ages, particularly beginning in the mid-fifteenth century. An examination of several of the chansons attributed to Antoine Busnoys reveals such allusion involving heraldry, specific characters from chivalric romance, the ubiquitous theme of courtly love, and the appearance of *L'homme armé*. The study further shows that by displaying musically the virtues of *prouesse*, *largesse*, *courtoisie*, and *piété*, composers such as Busnoys, Ockeghem, Obrecht, Josquin, and others can be seen as transforming themselves symbolically into knights, in emulation of the aristocratic patrons with whom each was, or aspired to be, associated.

This interpretation of composer as knight is reinforced by several factors related to the tradition of *L'homme armé* masses, most notably the occasions for which such masses were composed. William Prizer, Richard Taruskin, and others have suggested that the masses of Busnoys, Josquin, and others may have been composed for meetings of the Order of the Golden Fleece, the most eminent chivalric order of the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries. Other masses, such as those by Regis and Ockeghem, have been connected with feasts devoted to saints who have been traditionally associated with knighthood, particularly St. Martin, St. Michael, and St. George. Further, the *L'homme armé* tradition itself can be interpreted as an allegorical ritual through which composers, by demonstrating compositional prowess and by imitating and borrowing from other works, are themselves symbolically initiated into the order of pseudo-knights.

One of the most interesting facets of such a symbolic evocation of chivalry in the fifteenth century is its dissociation from the original meanings of *chevalerie*. An examination of original sources by Orderic Vitalis, Geoffroi de Charny, and Bernard of Clairvaux, as well as the work of modern scholars Richard Kaeuper, Maurice Keen, and Johan Huizinga, suggests that at its zenith in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, chivalry was a bloody and violent business, and that the “knighthood” of the fifteenth century was in fact only a hollow shell, displaying only the most obvious outward signs of the institution’s former glory. Thus the composers, while imitating the knighthood of their aristocratic patrons, are imitating an ideal that is already itself an imitation.

WHOSE HEAD? NEW LIGHT ON THE  
CANTUS FIRMUS OF THE “CAPUT” MASSES

Andrew Kirkman  
Rutgers University

In his seminal essay of 1950, Manfred Bukofzer identified the melisma that forms the cantus firmus of the “Caput” Masses. His discovery solved a major puzzle, but in the process, as he noted, created new ones. Why choose the setting of this one word? What, or whose, head was being alluded to, and with what particular import? Bukofzer himself noted that choice of this melisma from a Maundy Thursday chant need not presuppose that the Masses were intended for a related liturgical context, and he suggested composition in veneration of St. Peter. Later scholars have variously offered support for dedication of the Masses to St. Peter or to his papal successors, the “heads” of the church.

However, a large body of evidence presented in this paper strongly suggests that the focus of caput as a cantus firmus, and its identity in that context, was none other than Christ himself, the “head” of the church that is his body. This conceit, deriving from the Pauline epistles, was the focus of repeated and accelerating attention, since it was seen to carry with it the guarantee, deriving from the indivisibility of head and body, of salvation. This paper demonstrates the development of its application from the Bible through the works of the Church Fathers to the late medieval Mass commentaries current during the time of the composition of the “Caput” Masses themselves, and makes that case that awareness of this meaning may have given rise to the composition of the chant melisma itself.

THE SAVIOR, THE WOMAN, AND THE HEAD OF THE DRAGON IN  
THE “CAPUT” MASSES AND MOTET

Anne Walters Robertson  
University of Chicago

God’s dramatic curse of Adam, Eve, and the serpent in Genesis 3:14–15 contains a theological ambiguity that played out in the visual arts, literature, and, as I will show, music of the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries. Translations of this passage leave in doubt whether a male, a female, or both, will defeat sin by crushing Satan’s head (*caput*). This issue lies at the heart of the three “Caput” masses by an anonymous Englishman, Johannes Ockeghem, and Jacob Obrecht, and the “Caput” motet for the Virgin by Richard Hygons from the Eton Choirbook.

Fifteenth-century discussions of the roles of Christ and Mary in confronting sin, often called the “head of the dragon,” help unravel the meaning of these works. The “Caput” masses are Christ-focused and emphasize the Savior or one of his surrogates suppressing the beast’s head, as seen in illumination, rubric, and canon found in the masses. Folklorically based rituals and concepts of liturgical time are similarly built around the idea of the temporary reign of the Devil, who is ultimately trodden down by Christ. Hygons’ motet appears after celebration of the Immaculate Conception was authorized in the late fifteenth century. This feast proclaimed Mary’s conquest of sin through her own trampling on the dragon; the motet stresses Marian elements of the “Caput” theology, including the contrast between the Virgin’s spotlessness and Eve’s corruption. Features of both strands of the “Caput” tradition mirror topics discussed in astrological/astronomical treatises.

Together these masses and motet encompass the multi-faceted doctrine of Redemption from the late middle ages under one highly symbolic “Caput” rubric.

**RACHMANINOFF AND RAVEL**  
**Daniel Albright, Harvard University, Chair**

RACHMANINOFF’S MODERNITY

Charles Fisk  
 Wellesley College

No one, to my knowledge, has ever called Sergei Rachmaninoff a modernist. In interviews he even characterized himself as an anti-modernist, disparaging the reliance of his avant garde contemporaries on calculation and avowing for himself a simple, emotion-based musical aesthetic. Accordingly, he has been judged as lacking in intellectual distinction (by composer-critic Virgil Thomson), as merely reflecting the taste of the lower Russian aristocracy to which he belonged (by music historian Francis Maes) and as stuck in the nineteenth century (by cultural historian Orlando Figes). Because of his enormous popularity, he has been widely considered the twentieth-century exemplar par excellence of philistine musical taste. But not uncharacteristically Richard Taruskin, in his recently published *Oxford History of Western Music*, challenges critical tradition by identifying Rachmaninoff as a “towering figure.” Having bestowed this praise, however, Taruskin still describes him quite simply as “successfully maintaining the familiar and prestigious style of the nineteenth-century “classics” into the twentieth century”: no longer as a Romantic epigone, perhaps, but still as a full-blooded Romantic. It follows that Rachmaninoff continues to play only a minor role in Taruskin’s, as in everyone else’s, story. No well-known Western musicologist to date has given close analytic or critical attention to his music.

Taruskin illustrates his discussion of Rachmaninoff’s career and significance with only one musical example, the famous eighteenth variation from the Rhapsody on a Theme of Paganini. He chooses it because it is in fact intellectually contrived—despite its anachronistically Romantic ambience—via one of Arnold Schoenberg’s favorite techniques, the inversion of the Rhapsody’s opening theme. Apparently no other aspect of the Rhapsody merits consideration in Taruskin’s account, “because historiography, if it is to be interesting, has to give precedence to change over stasis,” and Rachmaninoff was simply perpetuating an already well-established style.

This paper will challenge that position. The eighteenth variation is surrounded—as is the similarly opulent and harmonically traditional twelfth variation, tempo di menuetto—by progressions and textures that could never have occurred in the nineteenth century, and that do not conform to so-called functional harmonic norms. These more traditionally “Romantic” variations thus appear as oases, as nostalgic evocations of a lost musical world rather than as simple instantiations of it; and the marked presence of the Gregorian *Dies Irae* melody in the Rhapsody can plausibly be understood, here as elsewhere in Rachmaninoff’s music, as emblematic of that loss. Rachmaninoff’s musical voice here is therefore no longer a nineteenth-century one that has hollowed out an arena for itself in the twentieth. Instead it is a distinctively twentieth-century voice, but one that in its longing for a bygone world gives full

musical expression to the existential complexity of Rachmaninoff's own cultural and historical position.

## RAVEL'S PERFECTION

Steven Huebner  
McGill University

"Everything that emerged from his mind bears the mark of perfection": in this posthumous tribute to the music of his friend Maurice Ravel, the poet Léon Paul Fargue sounded a leitmotif in writing about the composer. Ravel himself even once acknowledged publicly that his principal goal was to achieve "technical perfection" but, perhaps more realistically than his acolytes, he also stated that it was "impossible to achieve." My first goal in this paper, then, will be to document not only how often "perfection" has been applied as a critical category to the music of Ravel—certainly far more often than to the work of his contemporaries—but also the various contexts in which it appeared.

Despite such ubiquity, the ideological and philosophical substrates behind this aspect of the reception of Ravel's music have not been subject to scrutiny in the literature. I will continue by outlining theories of aesthetic perfection in Western philosophy from Aristotle to Leibniz, Wolff, and then to Kant, whose significant contribution was to separate the apprehension of beauty from the contemplation of perfection. Yet I concurrently acknowledge that most writers on Ravel applied the term perfection not as professional philosophers in order to discuss aesthetic issues, but with more immediate goals of advocacy or detraction. Why perfection? What critical, rhetorical, and even patriotic uses did it serve? For example, I will argue that, applied to Ravel, perfection became yet another term in the delineation of Gallic, as opposed to Teutonic, musical qualities. It was—and continues to be—marshaled to explain the slow gestation of many of his works and to justify his relatively small compositional output: perfection is a time-consuming mistress.

I also want to suggest, however, that philosophical understandings of aesthetic perfection should not be entirely dismissed in considering the more pragmatic orientation of critics and even of Ravel himself. One way to make this link is through an understanding of the discourse around Ravel's music as evoking metaphors relating to aesthetic "surface" as opposed to "depth." Surfaces may be described as clean and polished, as providing a finite set of materials that allow an identification of completeness that is integral to many theories of perfection. Metaphors of depth, to the contrary, tend towards the open-ended and intuitive, conditions not always amenable to rational apprehension. I will conclude by proposing that two literary sources much admired by Ravel himself—Charles Baudelaire's celebrations of the dandy as a social type as well as Edgar Allen Poe's important essay "The Philosophy of Composition"—illustrate a privileging of surface that informed subsequent critical discourses about the perfection of his music.

## TECHNOLOGIES OF THE DIVA

Gabriela Gomes da Cruz, Universidade Nova de Lisboa, Chair  
Alessandra Campana, Respondent

MASSENET, SIBYL SANDERSON, AND THE *FIN-DE-SIÈCLE* DIVA

Karen Henson  
Columbia University

In a period when performers were being described as puppets, or “practical decisions” to be postponed as long as possible (the first comment is from Wagner in 1872, the second from the later Verdi), Massenet seems an almost eighteenth-century figure: a composer who sought repeated associations with singers, working closely with them and leaving behind substantial documentation. He even invited four of them to co-sign his autograph scores. These associations were not with Verdi’s and Wagner’s low voices, or with *verismo*’s tenors, but above all with sopranos, whether the by-then mythic mezzo-soprano Pauline Viardot, the Californian unknown Sibyl Sanderson, the established star Emma Calvé, or another unknown, the mezzo-soprano Lucy Arbell.

This paper will focus on Massenet’s association with Sanderson, for whom the composer rewrote *Manon*, created the title-roles of *Esclarmonde* (1889) and *Thaïs* (1894), and also wrote the 1891 *Le Mage* (though Sanderson never sang in the latter work). Drawing on the autographs and other archival sources, including a *Manon* score annotated by both singer and composer, I will attempt to illuminate their joint endeavors as well as what those endeavors tell us about the Diva at the *fin-de-siècle*. For in addition to being a very eighteenth-century, even *Manon*-esque tale, this is a very *fin-de-siècle* one, in which a signature on an autograph is as much sign of an emerging culture of celebrity as of singer-composer collaboration. Indeed, I will argue that, with Sanderson, Massenet succeeded in creating his own personal Diva, bringing together a little-known émigrée, the rather old-fashioned tradition of *opéra comique* coloratura, and a very 1880s and 90s fascination with female “personalities.” Sanderson was not passive in this process, but contributed her foreignness, an exceptional vocal range, and the ability to shape her full, very nineteenth-century body into static, alluring poses. The ability shines out from the new medium of photo-journalism, of which she was one of the first opera stars. It is also evoked by those scenes in *Esclarmonde* and *Thaïs* where the heroine is required to strike similarly mute poses, suggesting that, if there is singer-composer collaboration to be uncovered here, it is of a kind mediated by technology.

THE SILENT DIVA: FARRAR’S *CARMEN*

Melina Esse  
Eastman School of Music, University of Rochester

At least since E.T.A. Hoffmann’s tale *Der Sandmann*, the Diva has been a source of ambivalence and anxiety. Beautiful, desirable, yet somehow cold, the Diva is an enigma: in the act of singing, her sensuous vitality all too easily devolves into a frightening mechanicity. The silent opera films of the early twentieth century seem to offer a radical solution; here, the Diva is seen but not heard. The strange alliance between silent film and opera has long puzzled commentators. Why should an emerging medium so centered on visual spectacle find inspiration in an art form that revels in the sonic immediacy of the Diva’s voice? Recent

Lacanian approaches have understood silent film's obsession with opera as indicative of a preoccupation with its own lack, with the fundamental muteness at its core. However, such accounts, focused as they are on silence, neglect the actual performance circumstances of these films, which often featured lush orchestral accompaniment and even operatic soloists singing in the pit. In silent film, the Diva's two-fold nature is made explicit in that her mechanically reproduced image on screen is accompanied by an entirely different, live voice.

My paper will explore the implications of this odd technological doubling in the 1915 film *Carmen*, directed by Cecil B. De Mille and starring Geraldine Farrar. First performed at Boston Symphony Hall, accompanied by full orchestra and vocal soloists, *Carmen* was filmed when Farrar was suffering her own vocal crisis and recuperating from throat surgery. The singer's notoriously athletic and sensual depiction of the title character was in stark contrast to her earlier operatic rendition, which was criticized as too "refined." Indeed, some critics saw De Mille's film as injecting the stiff and artificial genre of opera with a healthy dose of realism, and Farrar later imported her screen techniques to the stage of the Metropolitan Opera, shocking audiences when she roughed up a chorus girl and slapped Enrico Caruso's face during an onstage argument.

Focusing on the counterpoint between Farrar's acting style and the voice of the "faceless" *Carmen* singing in the pit, I show how the film recast the familiar operatic tension between physicality and transcendence. Using archival sources from the George Eastman House (including reviews in contemporary periodicals) and Hugo Riesenfeld's arrangement of Bizet's score, I complicate the notion of the self-contained filmic text by taking account of the multiple layers of the silent film experience: visual and aural, live and recorded. *Carmen* relied on the technology of film (especially lighting and close-ups) to construct a "natural" earthiness that encouraged visceral pleasure in the Diva's seductive presence. At the same time, I argue, the circumstances of the film's performance worked to efface a different "technology"—the trained mechanism of the Diva's voice.

## WAGNER'S PARSIFAL

William Kinderman, University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign, Chair

### THE GRAIL IN THE AGE OF MECHANICAL REPRODUCTION: RECORDING *PARSIFAL* FOR THE EARLY TWENTIETH-CENTURY AMERICAN PUBLIC

Stephen Meyer  
Syracuse University

It is an historical irony that the early years of commercial sound recording should correspond so closely to the period in which Wagner's works enjoyed their greatest popularity, for it would be difficult to imagine an operatic oeuvre less well-suited to early recording technology. Two- and four-minute wax cylinders, or early discs such as the 12-inch, 3-minute model released by Victor in 1903, imposed temporal limitations that were ill-adapted to the seamless, extended style of Wagner's works (particularly those that followed *Lohengrin*). Moreover, the complex orchestral sound so vital to the dramaturgy of Wagner's works was difficult to capture with early acoustic recording techniques. Early recordings of Wagner's works thus presented

a potential conflict between technology and content, a conflict that was exacerbated in the particular case of *Parsifal*.

In the first years of commercial recording, the position of *Parsifal* in the repertoire was still marginal. This meant not only that fewer performers were familiar with the score, but also that the process of “condensation”—whereby an opera was distilled down to a small group of highlights—was still underway. An analysis of the early *Parsifal* holdings in the Belfer Archive at Syracuse University (which houses the second-largest American collection of wax cylinders and other early recordings) gives a rough sense of this process. The earliest recordings come from many places in the score, but by the third decade of the twentieth century, the bulk of *Parsifal* recordings concentrated on a relatively small group of musical “numbers”: the first-act Prelude, the Grail scene, the third-act Prelude, and (especially) the Good Friday Music. What is extraordinary about *Parsifal* excerpts is not merely their length (nearly all of them were recorded on multiple discs), but also the prominent role that “pure” instrumental music plays in them. This is particularly surprising in an era in which the reproduction of the human voice seemed to take so much precedence (not least because of the charisma of star singers such as Caruso and Nordica). In the catalogues of the early recording companies, *Lohengrin* appears largely as an opera of arias; *Parsifal*, more often than not, was distilled down to the “voice” of the orchestra.

Although the instrumental music of Wagner’s last opera is exceptionally moving, the unusual profile of *Parsifal* with respect to early sound recordings, I will maintain, has more to do with the plot of the opera than its musical score. As Joseph Horowitz has pointed out, the quasi-liturgical stage action of *Parsifal* was deeply troubling to many American audiences. “Condensing” *Parsifal* into non-vocal highlights could disassociate the music from its plot, making it more accessible to “idealist” interpretations in which it is the power of Art itself that is disembodied and sacralized. In this sense, early recordings of *Parsifal* anticipate the ironic position of the “idealist” artwork in late capitalism, whereby the exchange value of the object is directly tied to its (depleted) aura: to the ways that it articulates resistance to the very process of commodification in which it participates.

### PARSIFAL HYSTÈRIQUE

Brian Hyer

University of Wisconsin-Madison

Through a series of traumatic identifications, first with Kundry (a substitute mother) and then with Amfortas (a father figure), Parsifal emerges in the second act of Wagner’s music-drama (1883) from an amnesiac self-absence to become a subject. As he enters into full consciousness, he regains memories of the past, though the memories he recovers are not his own: his memories, rather, are suggested to him, as is his identification with Amfortas. In the torrent of music issuing from Kundry’s kiss, the dramatic action turns around on itself: Parsifal relives Amfortas’s tortured monologue from the first act, and as he does past and present flow into one another. Parsifal becomes porous and spills over into Amfortas, forming an emotional connection with him that Nietzsche, in the *Genealogy of Morals* (1886), describes as a bond of *sympathy*. Parsifal, that is, *suffers with* Amfortas: he feels the pain of Amfortas’s wound and endures the shame of his humiliation, a condition the music-drama thematizes, memorably, as *Mitleid*—“durch Mitleid wissend, der reine Thor.”

The emotional infection to which Parsifal succumbs in the second act assumes a recognizable historical and neurological form: Parsifal's identification with Amfortas is *hysterical*, an unmeasured reaction to the dissolution of the boundaries of the self. As I will demonstrate, Parsifal's second-act aria conforms to the four stages Charcot outlines in his "Description de la grande attaque hystérique" (1879)—with its seizures, convulsions, and hallucinations—down to the last detail: the aria begins with an aura of the impending crisis and then proceeds, on cue, to a series of bodily contortions, abdominal pains, heart palpitations, labored breathing, and finally paralysis—Wagner clearly had an informant. Charcot's account of the hysterical attack suggests a *mise-en-scène* of the music-drama in which the photographic realism of its central tableau serves as a re-enactment and extension of his celebrated performances in the theater of the Salpêtrière.

I will go on to argue that the notion of empathy, which lies at the core of both the music-drama and historical articulations of the disease, also structures our relation to the music. In Wagner, the music serves as a means of subject-formation, the subjects it forms being our own: in its psychologization of music, its conversion of musical into nervous tissue, the music-drama allows us to register a contingent form of historical consciousness on the pulses, transforming its listeners into hysterics—"Wagner est une névrose." As such, *Parsifal* forms a nodal point in a historical (and musical) transition from a culture of representation to one of identification.

*Saturday afternoon, 29 October*

**AN ITALIAN COMPOSER IN EIGHTEENTH-CENTURY CHINA:  
THE SONATAS AND LETTERS OF TEODORICO PEDRINI**

**Peter Allsop (Exeter University), commentator**

**Joyce Lindorff (Temple University), harpsichord**

**Nancy Wilson (Princeton University & Mannes College of Music), baroque violin**

Through his own words and music, an extraordinary eighteenth-century Italian missionary and musician offers a colorful and multi-faceted introduction to his life and work in China. Drawing on their current archival research on the life and letters of Teodorico Pedrini, Drs. Peter Allsop and Joyce Lindorff will join baroque violinist Nancy Wilson for a program of Pedrini's sonatas, with discussion and readings from his letters.

Sent by the Pope, Teodorico Pedrini arrived in China in 1711 after a tumultuous nine-year journey. He served as music master in the Chinese court until his death in 1746. His work as teacher, writer, composer, performer, instrument builder and tuner was prized by the emperor Kangxi, and respected by his sons, despite the religious and political turmoil raging throughout that time. Pedrini's Opus 3, twelve sonatas for violin and bass, comprise his only known compositions, and is the only surviving manuscript of western-style music left in China during the eighteenth century. It is archived in the Beijing National Library. The sonatas are closely influenced by Corelli, whose work was likely known to Pedrini from his time in Rome, and also from volumes in the Beitang Library, an extensive missionary collection in China.

Pedrini was at the heart of a unique cultural intersection which took place because of two coinciding factors: the European missionary presence in China, and a powerful interest in the cultivation of international knowledge on the part of the emperor Kangxi. This unique environment lasted throughout the seventeenth and much of the eighteenth centuries, when it abruptly ended, again due to political and religious factors: the rites controversy within the Catholic church, and the Chinese imperial resistance to Christianity. Pedrini was a charismatic figure who inspired tremendous controversy because of his opposition to the Jesuit accommodation of the Chinese rites.

Recent investigation by Drs. Allsop and Lindorff in Rome have unearthed approximately one thousand pages of letters and diaries, either by or directly concerning Pedrini, covering a period of over forty years, from 1702 to 1746. Other letters were found in the Missions Etrangères at Paris, where Pedrini remained for almost two years prior to his departure for the Chinese mission. These letters shed detailed and dramatic light on this entire period of Chinese missionary history and contain copious references to music at court, establishing its role as currency in the highly charged milieu of the Chinese court.

**ART SONGS OF LATIN AMERICA**

**Patricia Caicedo, soprano**

**Eugenia Gassull, piano**

The Latin American art song repertory dates from the end of the nineteenth century to the mid-twentieth century. Its origins lie in nineteenth-century Germany and the lieder for piano and voice by Schubert, Schumann and their contemporaries. Latin American compos-

ers quickly began to follow the German model, though in a unique socio-cultural context shaped by nationalist social trends and a period of fertile musical growth. Musical nationalism in Latin America was manifested by composers who were, by and large, trained in Europe and wanted to replicate the European model in their native countries. To this end, they sought out folkloric and popular sources (both real and imagined). Later, they began to set to music poems of native poets in the vernacular, using archaic forms of speech, rural vocabulary, and sometimes indigenous languages (e.g., Quechua).

In this concert are heard art songs from six different Latin American countries written in Spanish, Brazilian Portuguese, and Quechua. Performers are Colombian soprano and musicologist Patricia Caicedo, recognized as a leading interpreter of the Latin American and Spanish lieder repertory, and Catalan pianist Eugenia Gassull, teacher at the Conservatori Superior de Música de Catalunya.

## AMERICAN MUSICS

David Ake, University of Nevada, Reno, Chair

### THELONIOUS MONK'S PIANISM

Ben Givan  
Skidmore College

The jazz pianist Thelonious Monk's idiosyncratic instrumental technique has been a topic of considerable discussion ever since he began his professional career during the 1940s. While his early detractors often accused him of "technical inadequacies" (*Down Beat*, 1949), his devotees sought to legitimate his unorthodox pianism. Some commentators claimed that any notion of Monk's technical deficiency was simply a "misconception" (Blake 1982). Yet many acknowledged his limitations but praised his artistry nonetheless, often employing a modernist discourse based on principles of absolute music, intellectual creativity, and artistic individuality.

Favorable critical judgments of the pianist's playing were frequently grounded in an implicit Cartesian mind/body dualism; Monk's piano technique may have been imperfect, the argument went, but it was subsidiary to his musical ideas. Thus Goldman 1959 writes, "Monk's right hand isn't worth much. He has a hard time playing what he hears in his head. . . . No, man, you gotta dig Thelonious as the thinker," while Schuller 1959 argues that Monk's improvisations "attempt to go beyond the ordinary limits of the piano in the sense that the late Beethoven sonatas are no longer merely 'piano music.'" Such appraisals posited Monk's music as a conceptual abstraction, untethered to the contingencies of its sound, instrument, and physical means of production, not to mention its broader cultural context.

By valorizing Monk's intellect, these early defenses of his technique were intended to counter a lingering racist ideological opposition between "body-oriented" Afrodiasporic culture and "rational," mind-based European civilization. More recent studies of black music, however, have begun to reconsider the body's role, casting it "as the indispensable medium that links the physical world with the spiritual, that facilitates the internalization and reenactment of communal beliefs" (McClary and Walsler 1994). This critical reevaluation offers a theoretical framework for interpreting jazz improvisation as a process involving interdependent bodily, intellectual, and instrumental practices. The intersection between physical and conceptual

aspects of musical composition and performance has recently been addressed by various writers on Western art music (literature dealing specifically with piano music includes Rosen 1995, Christensen 1999, Baker 2001, and Hisama 2001), but no comparable work yet exists on jazz.

By analyzing films of Monk improvising, it is possible to assess the role of inaudible, physical aspects of his performance practice. In particular, details of his piano fingerings can be used to supplement notated transcriptions of his improvisations. Visual evidence suggests that Monk's instrumental technique constituted a symbolic critique of mind/body dualism. In some instances his fingerings seemed willfully arbitrary, as if they were incidental to the "music itself." At other times, his physical approach to the piano keyboard seemed inseparable from the notes he played and the way he articulated them. Occasionally he even seemed to intentionally choose unorthodox fingerings—such as crossing his hands at the keyboard for no straightforward reason—so as to imbue his playing with a degree of expressive tension.

### BETWEEN JAZZ AND THE "GREAT AMERICAN SONGBOOK": THE CASE OF OSCAR PETERSON

Dana Gooley

Case Western Reserve University

Standard jazz history narratives depict the rise of bebop *c.* 1945 as the moment when jazz decidedly withdrew from the popular mainstream it had occupied during the swing era. In this paper I look at the dissemination of Oscar Peterson's music in the 1950s to show that the market for instrumental, small-group jazz continued to thrive on a relationship with popular song in spite of the advent of bebop. In this period record companies clearly distinguished popular-music audiences and jazz audiences in their marketing. But instrumentalists we today associate with jazz, notably Peterson, were used for both markets. This doubling was not merely an atavism of the swing era, for it actually grew stronger in the course of the 1950s. It was catalyzed by a new historical awareness of the "Great American Songbook" as a cultural treasure of intrinsic value.

The potential for small jazz groups to crossover into the pop market first became evident in the mid-40s with the trio of Nat King Cole. Cole appealed to both pop and jazz audiences by offering vocal numbers alongside sophisticated instrumental arrangements. Peterson's trio was modeled on Cole's, and although there was no singer, his producer kept him linked to pop audiences with a series of LP releases devoted to individual Tin Pan Alley composers. Starting in 1952 and continuing through 1954, he issued albums of Cole Porter, Berlin, Gershwin, Ellington, Kern, Rogers, Youmans, Warren, and McHugh under the titles "Oscar Peterson plays Cole Porter," etc. I play examples from these recordings to show that Peterson tailored his style—through easy tempos and reduced melodic embellishment—to popular-music taste (whether by choice or at request of the producer is not clear). In the later '50s, Peterson was recording mostly jazz material again. But the phenomenal success of Ella Fitzgerald's "Songbook" recordings (1957) demonstrated the commercial potential of the "American Songbook" idea. This prompted Verve to take Peterson into the studio to rerecord the entire series of albums (1959), this time released as "Oscar Peterson plays the Cole Porter Songbook," etc. The same sessions produced, in a telling act of compensation, a record called "The Jazz Soul of Oscar Peterson."

This study is intended as a contribution to an industry-centered perspective on jazz history. Dominant jazz narratives, under the sway of Gunther Schuller, have been written according

to anti-commercial, romantic values that underplay the role of recording companies in disseminating jazz and defining its cultural meanings, creating considerable problems for giving singers and popular music significant roles. Peterson's case is not an isolated one. In the 1950s the jazz-pop nexus extended to Art Tatum, Chet Baker, and indeed the entire "with strings" tradition. In the 1960s Wes Montgomery was drawn into it, and the celebration of the "Great American Songbook" or "standards" became central to jazz marketing from 1985 to 2000.

## CLARENCE CAMERON WHITE'S *OUANGA!*: A HARLEM RENAISSANCE COMPOSER'S APPROACH TO BLACK OPERATIC CHARACTERIZATION

Karen Bryan

Arizona State University

The challenges faced by African-American opera singers in the twentieth century are familiar: racism cloaked in a concern for lack of experience and training, the anticipation of the negative reactions from audiences and board members should companies award black singers roles perceived or written for white singers, and questionable representation of black characters. African-American opera companies of the 1940s and 1950s, formed for the express purpose of providing opportunities both to professional singers and to members of the community, answered these challenges by selecting works both from the traditional operatic repertoire and from those based on African or African-American themes.

Clarence Cameron White's *Ouanga!* was an opera in which the composer incorporated themes of African heritage into his research on Haitian culture. This work reflects the reactions of the African-American community to the occupation of Haiti by the United States in 1915. It was also an attempt by White and his librettist, John Frederick Matheus, to create a work in which racial stereotypes were eliminated through a sympathetic portrayal of African-derived traditions.

*Ouanga!* was performed only four times over a period of fourteen years. At the same time it was a landmark work in a period of productions such as *Four Saints in Three Acts*, *Porgy and Bess*, and *Emperor Jones*. The contrast of Vodou and Catholicism, the characterization of historic figures, and the conflict between the European and "native" traditions reflected the interest in the black Atlantic culture on the part of the New Negro movement, White's concern with audience reception, and his own outlook as a middle-class African-American composer.

*Ouanga!* became a logical choice for companies endeavoring to provide performance opportunities for black singers. Professional singers and community members alike could easily perform the solo roles, drawn from both historical figures and fictional characters. The large chorus, which was asked to perform both in a European choral style and in a folk manner representative of the frenzy of "voodoo," was a good vehicle for community performers. The opera requires a corps of dancers for the numerous ensemble scenes, and the orchestra's expanded percussion section replicates the Vodou drums that are a continuing dramatic and musical theme of the opera.

Two of the most prominent African-American companies of these decades mounted productions of the opera: the DraMu Company in Philadelphia, and the National Negro Opera Company which produced the work in concert form in its New York City premiere. Their approaches to staffing had similarities and differences, yet both became representative of the difficulties faced by such companies during this period. I will draw from the letters of White and Matheus, White's correspondence with the managers of these companies, newspaper accounts of the performances, and the archival material of the National Negro Opera Company

to explore the characterization in these operas and how they reflected the growing concern with representation of blacks in opera.

## SOCIAL DARWINISM IN AMERICAN MUSICAL THOUGHT: ALICE FLETCHER'S *OMAHA INDIAN MUSIC* RECONSIDERED

Katherine Dacey-Tsuei  
Columbia University

Among the most prominent early researchers of Native American music was Alice Fletcher. During her twenty-year association with the Bureau of Indian Affairs and the Peabody Museum at Harvard University, Fletcher conducted some of the first ethnographic studies of Native American tribes, living among the Omahas, Nez Pearce, and Winnebagos. Though her vivid descriptions of Indian music-making—compiled in such volumes as *A Study of Omaha Indian Music* (1893) and *The Hako: Song, Pipe, and Unity in a Pawnee Calumet Ceremony* (1904)—found a wide audience, her research has received little scholarly attention in recent years.

Fletcher's writings on music deserve re-examination, however, for they document an important epistemological shift in American thinking. At mid-century, American scientists embraced Darwinism as a natural law that described not only the evolution of individual species, but whole human societies. They cast themselves as neutral observers, tasked with demonstrating how the course of natural selection produced a society as wealthy, powerful, and moral as they believed the United States to be. As Richard Hofstadter explains in *Social Darwinism in American Thought* (Boston, [1955] 1992), these thinkers disdained any form of social engineering; they argued it was the scientist's job "to chart the normal course of social evolution, to show how it will be affected by any given policy, and to condemn all types of behavior that interfere with it" (p. 43). For *fin-de-siècle* scientists, however, Darwinism proved more problematic. They, too, used evolution to describe social progress, but struggled to reconcile the concept of natural selection with the profound economic and social inequities caused by industrialization, immigration, and imperialism. They concluded that the scientist's task "is not to imitate the laws of nature, but to observe them, appropriate them, direct them" through a mixture of reportage and legislative action (p. 75). A close examination of Alice Fletcher's writings on music reveals the degree to which this epistemological shift affected her thinking. On the one hand, her writings are steeped in an older discourse about the American Indian as a noble savage—a discourse given new "legitimacy" in the Victorian age by its association with Darwinian theories of social development. On the other hand, her musical analyses betray her conviction that scientific observation might spur legislators to reform the reservation system; throughout her writing, she marshals musicological evidence to suggest that the Indians were on the brink of "civilization" and thus capable—with government assistance—of being assimilated into American society. This paper will explore the impact of these two conflicting discourses on Fletcher's best-known work, *A Study of Omaha Indian Music*. Particular emphasis will be given to the role of science in shaping white perceptions of Native people and culture. In so doing, this paper will demonstrate how Fletcher hoped to make a scientific analysis of music serve the public interest.

**FIFTEENTH-CENTURY TOPICS**  
**Laurenz Lütteken, University of Zurich, Chair**

*PATER MEUS AGRICOLA EST:*  
 THE EARLY YEARS OF ALEXANDER AGRICOLA

Rob C. Wegman  
 Princeton University

The circumstances of Alexander Agricola's birth and early years, as revealed by newly-discovered documents in Ghent, were not especially happy. He and his brother Jan (who was almost certainly a musician as well) were the illegitimate children of Lijsbette Naps, an independent businesswoman in her forties who, according to all indications, had been taken advantage of by their natural father, Heinric Ackerman. The latter emerges from the documents as an unreliable and unscrupulous individual, an expert in what we now call creative accounting, who apparently sought to make his fortune by marrying or handling the affairs of wealthy women. In 1457 he seems have set his sights on Lijsbette Naps, with whom he had traded on behalf of another woman early that year. Lijsbette was wealthy, independent, and by all accounts not a person who could easily be duped—least of all by Heinric, in whom she clearly had little trust. Yet she was also vulnerable: unmarried, without family or other social networks in Ghent, and, as a non-citizen, not entitled to a range of civic privileges and legal protections.

Given what the documents reveal about Heinric's previous dealings it is not hard to guess what might have happened next. In this paper I will present the most likely scenario in light of the available evidence, and will discuss the consequences and implications for the composer's youth and upbringing in Ghent during the 1460s and early 1470s. The circumstances of his birth, as it turns out, lend considerable irony to the scriptural passage which Agricola selected as the title for one of his musical settings: "I am the true vine, and my Father is the husbandman" (*pater meus agricola est*; John 15:1). By the standards of his own time, Alexander was neither a "true" vine, nor had his father proved himself a caring husbandman. The musical fruits he bore as a composer are to be credited in large part to Lijsbette, who chose to raise her sons as a single mother while running a profitable business and maintaining her social and economic independence.

**A NEW SPANISH MASS FRAGMENT ON "L'HOMME ARMÉ":**  
**ITS CONTEXT AND MEANING**

Lorenzo Candelaria  
 University of Texas, Austin

This paper focuses on the function and significance of a previously unknown Mass fragment for four voices on "L'homme armé" that appears in a beautifully illuminated sixteenth-century chantbook from Toledo, Spain (Yale University, Beinecke Library, Ms. 710). This unattributed fragment on "L'homme armé"—the famous monophonic tune that inspired nearly forty polyphonic Masses by leading composers in France, Italy, and Spain between 1450 and 1600—is a later insertion that sets the "Et incarnatus est" of the Credo. However fragmentary its form, this newly identified work on "L'homme armé" is without a known concordance and thus

represents an addition to the growing corpus of Armed Man Masses. The work's paraphrase of a Spanish Credo found earlier in the manuscript and the seeming influence of the "Et incarnatus est" from Palestrina's *Missa L'homme armé* for four voices (published in 1582) suggest that it is a Spanish composition from the end of the sixteenth century.

While a significant find in itself, this "L'homme armé" fragment raises some broader, intriguing questions: What is this polyphony doing in a Toledan chantbook? Who might have written it? How does its compositional style relate to the virtuosic techniques found in other L'homme armé Masses? And what, finally, is its meaning in this context? After showing how the polyphonic "Et incarnatus est" generally formed an important part of the liturgy in Spain and its colonies, this paper considers the possible authorship of Diego Ortiz—a Toledan credited with having written a lost L'homme armé Mass in Vicente Lusitano's sixteenth-century "Un tratado de cantu de organo" ("A Treatise on Polyphony"). Ultimately, Ortiz's authorship is discounted, but careful consideration is then given to the fragment's unusual double cantus firmus construction in which the tenor and bass set different parts of the "L'homme armé" tune simultaneously against each other throughout. With regard to context, this paper argues that the inclusion of this "L'homme armé" fragment was inspired by the chantbook's magnificent opening illumination depicting an armed knight in the presence of the Virgin and Child. In this light, the role of the fragment as a gloss on the illumination becomes evident: not only does it represent the armed man musically with one of the most recognizable tunes of the Renaissance, it also coordinates the words "Maria Virgine" from the Credo with the segment of the "L'homme armé" melody setting "d'un haubregon de fer." This suggests that Mary was perceived in the metaphorical role of the protective hauberk referenced in the song. By way of conclusion, this paper examines scriptural and Mariological bases for that comparison and, more broadly, emphasizes the important role that chantbooks can play as unexpected sources for recovering and interpreting Renaissance polyphony. As a study of a previously unrecognized use of the "L'homme armé" tune in Toledo, Spain, this paper contributes to the growing narrative on the L'homme armé Mass tradition on the Iberian Peninsula discussed in recent work by Emilio Rós-Fabregas, Owen Rees, and José María Llorens Cisteró.

DUFAY AS MUSICAL THEOLOGIAN:  
THE CASE OF THE *MISSA ECCE ANCILLA DOMINI*

M. Jennifer Bloxam  
Williams College

Our modern understanding of polyphonic Mass settings from the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries, from the age of Dufay through that of Palestrina, is profoundly shaped by our experience of this music as autonomous "movements" removed from the ritual that once housed them. Like altarpieces that now hang in museums, this music no longer exists for us as part of an active devotional life, and we thus focus our analyses on matters of style, structure, chronology, etc. But art historians such as Baxandall, Belting and Lane have shown that conceptually resituating the altarpiece over the altar, and focusing on its role within the rituals enacted before that altar, can illuminate aspects of the object's content and composition otherwise lost to us, and thereby enrich and even transform our understanding of this art. How can music historians attempt to resituate the sacred music of this period from the modern concert hall and sound recording to the solemn religious service sung within the walls of a

church? And what insights into the processes and purposes of polyphonic Mass composition might this exercise offer?

I propose to demonstrate both the method and the potential benefits of such a deeply contextual approach through the consideration of a much-studied Mass by Dufay, the *Missa Ecce ancilla Domini/Beata es Maria*. It is well known that the two plainsong cantus firmi on which this Mass is built relate to the theme of the Annunciation, but the impact of the ritual and theology of this central Marian feast on Dufay's compositional choices, from the macro to the micro level, has never been plumbed.

To begin, I will resituate this work within two liturgical frameworks it once adorned, the Annunciation liturgy as sung at Cambrai Cathedral and at the Court of Burgundy, and show how the complex of ritual actions, plainsongs, and readings informs Dufay's choice and treatment of his plainsong materials. I will suggest analogies between the content and purpose of certain visual representations of the Annunciation and the dialogic as well as communal aspects of Dufay's Mass. Close attention will be paid to the finesse with which the composer interlaces the texts of the cantus firmi (retained in the polyphonic setting) with the text of the Mass Ordinary to convey the role of Mary in the ritual's metanarrative of salvation history. And I will show how Dufay's musical setting captures the potent eucharistic theology of the incarnation of Christ at the part of the Mass celebration surrounding the transubstantiation of the Host. Thus Dufay will emerge as a storyteller and theologian in music, whose compositional decisions respond to and reflect the narrative and theology of the Annunciation and its liturgy.

## THE *LAUDES MUSICAE* IN RENAISSANCE MUSIC TREATISES

Leofranc Holford-Strevens  
Oxford, England

The praise of music was a frequent topic in medieval theory treatises, and also in those of the Renaissance; its ideological content has been well studied by Don Harrán, but there is room for source-criticism of the arguments and *exempla* urged to exalt music and defend it against its detractors. These show significant differences between the Middle Ages and the Renaissance.

Medieval writers are mostly content with certain stock quotations, mainly from Plato, Aristotle, and Christian authors, which they generally copy from their predecessors and beyond which only the very learned stray; in the fifteenth century the net begins to be cast wider, but the effect of humanism is to throw open classical Greek and Latin sources, the former usually read in Latin translation. Christian authorities are not forgotten, but are in general more prominent in writers of northern origin.

This classical learning was not always original to the authors who cited it. Besides the addition of new allusions and quotations to the stock of commonplaces, we find widespread recycling of material from Pseudo-Plutarch's treatise on music in the *Convivia* of Francesco Filelfo, of which in turn Gaffurius made extensive use in his revised *Theorica musicae* of 1492; Gaffurius himself, who compensated for lack of academic appreciation by increasing exploitation of classical antiquity from publication to publication, was to achieve the status of a modern classic.

On the other hand, the Renaissance treatises also exhibit their authors' urge to surpass their rivals by citing texts not previously used in this context, and in the case of Pietro Aaron (even

though he made use of others' learning, not possessing his own) to avoid repeating himself; two texts especially rich in new classical references are considered, one anonymous, the other by Georgius Libanus.

Despite certain references to progress (or decline) in the art, and despite challenges especially to polyphonic music in church worship, it is above all the display of learning, and hence of a status above the mere technician, that seems to motivate these praises.

## HAYDN TOPICS

**Michelle Fillion, University of Victoria, Chair**

### A DYING ART: HAYDN AND THE TEMPO DI MENUETTO FINALE

Dean Sutcliffe  
Cambridge University

The tempo di menuetto finale is a musicological blind spot; even a recent comprehensive study of the finale in instrumental music of the last few centuries (Talbot, 2000) almost fails to mention it. It seems to have been assumed that it represents simply a minuet placed last in the cycle, and hence demands no dedicated study, but this is the case neither formally (a straightforward ternary construction involving a designated trio is rare) nor expressively. It is the emerging difference in expressive typology upon which I shall focus. Tempo di menuetto also received muted theoretical recognition at the time; for Riepel (1752) it simply marked a departure from the tight formal prescriptions of a proper minuet. Other figures described it purely in terms of tempo character—and there is an inherent ambiguity in the stipulation that a movement goes “at minuet speed,” when that was so contested both then and subsequently. It must also have evaded definition since it arose gradually out of the minuet-as-finale, an “unmarked” compositional decision. The tempo di menuetto (to use Haydn's spelling) is initially likely to incorporate the sort of variation design that often went with the minuet-as-finale, but starts to acquire a separate generic identity as the parent practice falls from use. This also occurs as it shrinks in the range of possible applications, becoming largely confined to sonatas for one to three players. And as the fast and brilliant finale becomes normative, composers seem positively to exploit the tempo di menuetto's difference in affective weight and character. In all three senses it may be said to function as a countergenre.

What could it mean to close in this way? If language models were a dominant factor in the contemporary reception of later eighteenth-century music, so by association were models of social behavior. As a generic construct, the tempo di menuetto finale is marked above all by its tone, by modeling an intimate sensibility, full of feeling but disciplined by a minuet gait that promotes continuity of motion. Yet while inviting comparison with the minuet's courtly flavor, it appears increasingly only in lower-brow chamber forms, where its deportment is often modest, but never “popular.” For all such notional independence, the genre dies out sooner than the minuet. Its discourse may have come to seem too undemonstrative, too uneventful for a close. While tempo di menuetto disappeared as a finale, it remained as a distinct expressive quantity, occasionally migrating to other movement positions. Czerny's verdict (1846) on one such example—“simple grace and gentle feeling”—shows that that flavor was still understood, and in fact many later “minuets” adopted the tempo di menuetto code. The tempo di menuetto was cultivated as internationally as the minuet, legitimizing this paper's

wide range of reference to examples by composers such as Boccherini, Clementi and Schobert. Yet Haydn's career encompasses much of the life cycle of this genre and it is on some of his intensely memorable realizations that I shall concentrate.

## THE JESTER'S MELANCHOLY: LOST DIALECTICS IN HAYDN'S LATE CHAMBER MUSIC AND ENGLISH SONGS

Nancy November

Victoria University of Wellington

From the nineteenth century onward, the stereotype of Haydn as cheerful and jesting has dominated the reception of his music. This study contributes to the recent scholarship that broadens this view, with a new approach: I set Haydn's late chamber music and songs in the context of eighteenth-century ideas about melancholy. I consider the ideas of Edmund Burke, Johann Wolfgang von Goethe, Francisco Goya, Henry Home (Lord Kames), and Immanuel Kant. Their conceptions of melancholy were dialectical, involving the interplay of pleasure and pain, corporeality and incorporeality, truth and dissimulation, stasis and dynamism, song and silence, and time and eternity. I explore the relevance of these dialectics to Haydn's English songs through experiential musical analyses, which emphasize the experience (sonic, corporeal, visual) of the listening subject. This approach brings to the fore new ways of performing and hearing this repertoire, whose subtleties deserve further attention. Works discussed include "She Never Told Her Love" (Hob. XXVIa: 34), "Fidelity" (Hob. XXVIa: 30), and "O Tuneful Voice" (Hob. XXVIa: 42). I also refer to the wider context of English melancholy song at this time, in which Haydn's can be situated.

Haydn's English songs are perhaps the most straightforward examples of his musical melancholy mode. Equally though the dialectics of melancholy are relevant to the experience of his instrumental works. In the second part of this study I consider cases drawn from the late chamber music. As with the songs, my evidence includes experiential analyses, extracts from contemporary works on aesthetics, and contemporary criticism of Haydn's works. I follow the lead of Burke, who encapsulated the experience of musical melancholy in the metaphor of the maze, and Johann Karl Ritter von Schönfeld, who showed the applicability of this metaphor to Haydn's instrumental music. The quintessential experience of Haydn's musical melancholy occurs, I argue, when the listener undertakes a kind of auditory "quest" for beautiful song (Burke's "melting voice"), especially through the complex tonal paths (Schönfeld's "labyrinths") of the late string quartet adagios. Works discussed in this section include the slow movements from the String Quartets op. 74, no. 3, and op. 76, Nos. 5 and 6; the Piano Sonata in E-flat (Hob. XVI: 49); and the F minor Variations (Hob. XVII: 6).

Haydn's music, then, demonstrates his sophisticated understanding of melancholy. His personal letters of the 1790s, from Esterháza and London, provide further evidence of his involvement in the paradoxical melancholy of the *fin de siècle*, self-reflective and half sympathy-seeking: here Haydn spoke of his own melancholy disposition. Yet scholars turning to the idea of melancholy in the music of this era have focused on Beethoven, his adagio *La Malinconia* from the String Quartet op. 18, no. 6 in particular. Writers such as Carl Dahlhaus and Joseph Kerman consider this movement as fundamentally new, indeed ahead of its time. Yet, as the present study reveals, *La Malinconia* is but one manifestation of musical melancholy c. 1800, a paradoxically diseased yet thriving cultural phenomenon in which Haydn and his music played a key role.

## JOSEPH HAYDN AND THE BIRTH OF MODERN POLITICAL MUSIC

Nicholas Mathew  
University of Oxford

Political events left their mark on Haydn's compositions throughout his life—from the eulogistic court cantatas of the 1760s to the implicitly topical late masses. But the ways in which politics informed his music changed significantly as he moved from a court environment into the civil societies of Vienna and London. By the time of the Napoleonic Wars, Haydn used his experience of the London musical public to define a new kind of political music. While musicologists have long observed how the composers of the French Revolution created a newly politicized music—an ethically charged, public style manifested in ideological songs, operas, and marches—they have been slower to recognize an equivalent impulse among France's foes. Haydn's political compositions amount to a sort of Burkean opposition to the music of revolutionary and Napoleonic France.

Yet, aside from the disproportionate attention given to the setting of Haschka's "Gott erhalte Franz den Kaiser," Haydn's role in creating a new political music is recognized only at the fringes of musicological debate. Perhaps the fullest discussion of Haydn's political music appears in Beethoven scholarship: Maynard Solomon traces elements of Beethoven's so-called heroic style to Haydn's late choral music, while Esteban Buch's study of Beethoven's Ninth portrays Haydn as a protagonist in what he calls "the birth of modern political music." Yet no critic has discussed Haydn's "political compositions" as a single, coherent body of work—comprising not only "Gott erhalte," the *Missa in tempore belli*, and the *Missa in augustiis*, but also the incidental music to the patriotic play *Alfred* (1796) and the eulogy to Admiral Nelson entitled "Lines from the Battle of the Nile," which was performed when the two men met at Eisenstadt in 1800. To these works one might also add the unfinished "Invocation of Neptune" (a jingoistic English cantata composed while Haydn was in London), the C Major *Te Deum* for Empress Maria Theresa, and perhaps even the "Military" Symphony (no. 100), whose reception in Vienna suggests that its overt militarism quickly acquired more immediate political connotations. Moreover, new research into the reception of Haydn's music during the Napoleonic Wars shows that these compositions were continually reabsorbed into changed political conditions—even as late as the Congress of Vienna.

Finally, an investigation into Haydn's political music, as well as the acquired meanings of his less explicitly political compositions, sheds new light on the so-called work concept and the attendant autonomy aesthetic that were (according to Lydia Goehr and others) emerging at this time. It will transpire that the work concept becomes meaningful only by comparison with its opposite: the "occasional work." It should not surprise us that this pejorative critical term was theorized in the writings of prominent Kantians such as J. C. A. Grohmann just as Haydn was developing his modern political music—a manner of composing that (as Thomas Tolley has recently shown) exploited for political ends the new forms of listener engagement that Haydn had cultivated in London.

HAYDN'S DEPLOYMENT OF TIMPANI AND  
RATIONAL MUSICAL EXPERIENCEBenjamin Korstvedt  
Clark University

This paper treats a seemingly incidental topic—Haydn's treatment of the timpani in his symphonies—as a way to explore significant issues concerning Haydn's symphonic rhetoric and his means of addressing his audience.

Haydn's often striking use of timpani has long been noted and has even given rise to popular nicknames for several works, including the so-called "Paukenmesse," the G major symphony known to German-speakers as "mit dem Paukenschlag" (no. 94), and the "Drumroll" Symphony (no. 103). Each of these compositions includes an outstanding passage that achieves great effect from forceful, surprising use of these instruments.

This paper does not concentrate on these well-known uses of the timpani, which exploit its ability to shock with sonorous force; rather, it focuses on the often subtle ways in which Haydn exploited the timpani's restrictions of pitch. In Haydn's time, the technical limitations of the timpani meant that the instrument could sound only the tonic and dominant pitches of a movement's home key and consequently functioned, in effect, as a sonic marker of the home tonal region. This association was reinforced by the conventional usage of timpani in the eighteenth century in brilliant, fanfare-like passages, usually with trumpets, and as rhythmic punctuation in *tutti* passages that proclaimed the tonic key. Haydn largely followed these conventions in his early symphonies that included timpani, which until the mid-1770s were essentially limited to a series of works in C major (with one exceptional instance in D major).

Beginning in the late 1770s, Haydn's use of the timpani became increasingly unconventional and increasingly interesting. In several symphonies of the 1780s and 1790s, Haydn used the timpani in ways that deliberately played off the unspoken understanding that the appearance of the timpani signaled the presence or imminent arrival of the home key. The richest and most significant of these instances involve not only harmonic incongruence, but also some meaningful complication of Haydn's formal paradigms, often involving the tonal scheme of sonata-form recapitulation and/or exploiting the unusual effect of sounding the timpani against a dissonant or remote harmony. The paper explicates several remarkable examples, including the treatment of specific thematic gestures in the Finale of Symphony no. 53 and in the opening movement in Symphonies nos. 82, 94, 100, and 103.

Finally, the paper speculatively considers the larger significance of such passages and the timpani's role in them. As several commentators have proposed, Haydn's later works essay an enlightened aesthetic, which, in contrast to Romanticism, invests itself primarily in rational—not affective—imaginative experience. This paper argues that Haydn's mature handling of the timpani, which depends on rational apprehension of the instrument's tonal signification beyond the sensuous immediacy of its sound, treats the tonal limitation of the timpani as a previously unrecognized element in the larger set of objective musical relations that constituted the syntactic field of his symphonic arguments.

## NATIONAL IDENTITIES

Ralph Locke, Eastman School of Music, University of Rochester, Chair

### CLOUDLESS BLUE SKIES: CONSTRUCTING PUCCINI AS NATIONAL HERO

Alexandra Wilson  
University of Oxford

Although politically unified, Italy at the turn of the twentieth century remained culturally divided, and appeared to many contemporary commentators to be entering a period of social, political and aesthetic crisis. Puccini's music was promoted by many in the musical establishment as the antidote to this perceived decline and the means by which a sense of shared national identity might be created.

This paper examines the rhetoric and iconography used to construct Puccini as a national composer (a myth which would be fiercely contested by his musical detractors), and reveals that his persona became as politicized as his music. Drawing upon evidence from a broad range of primary documents, my research demonstrates that impressionistic writings can be as useful as more technical reviews in assessing how ideas about music and patriotism were communicated to a wide audience at the beginning of the age of mass celebrity. Specific issues for discussion include: emotive references to landscape, climate and the regional that characterized writings about Puccini; anecdotes associating him with a long lineage of great Italian artists; and the seemingly contradictory depictions of the composer as Classical hero, embodiment of steely modernity, and humble man of the people. My findings illustrate that although national identities are routinely presented as innate and self-evident, they are in fact constructed according to ideological agendas.

This paper forms part of a wider study that contextualizes Puccini within his social, aesthetic and intellectual milieu, offering a fresh view of this culturally important but frequently overlooked composer. The wider aesthetic and historiographical questions raised here concerning canonicity and biography are fundamental to postmodern musicological debates.

### CLASH OF CULTURES AND QUESTIONS OF IDENTITY: DANIEL GREGORY MASON AND LEO ORNSTEIN IN THE 1920s

Michael Broyles  
Pennsylvania State University

In 1920 Leo Ornstein was the most visible symbol of new music in America. As such he did not escape the notice of the conservative critic and composer Daniel Gregory Mason, who in that same year launched a major assault on all that Ornstein stood for. Mason's comments were hardly unique, as many other writers had voiced concerns about Ornstein and his music. But Mason's attack was far more invidious than simply a conflict between radicalism and conservatism. He saw the issue as a clash of cultures that pitted his own Anglo-Saxon heritage against a Jewish menace (Mason's term), which Ornstein more than anyone else represented.

While it is impossible to ignore the blatant anti-Semitism of Mason's position and the cultural situation from which it sprang, this paper will focus rather on two issues that his attack raises: The first relates to Mason's own heritage. Mason essentially recreated the same cultural clash that his own grandfather Lowell Mason had articulated a century before, only the elder

Mason envisioned it in geographic (the untamed West versus the restrained East) rather than ethnic terms. The second and more important issue is why Mason singled out Ornstein. Unlike Bloch, or later Schoenberg, Ornstein thoroughly disavowed his Jewish heritage, both artistically and personally. He attended a Quaker school upon arriving in the United States and married a Fifth Avenue debutante. He had no use for any religion whatsoever. Yet several Jewish writers of the 1920s, responding to the broader threat of anti-Semitism that not only Mason but more ominously Henry Ford articulated, began to champion Ornstein as a prime example of a Jewish composer. They clearly read Jewish elements into Ornstein's music. Their position, combined with Ornstein's own compositional methods, creates a relatively unique situation to address questions of musical identity.

Derek B. Scott and others have held that Orientalism, including Jewish manifestations, is essentially a construct favored by composers seeking the exotic, and that it may or may not have any basis in the music of the region under consideration. Because of Ornstein's highly intuitive approach to composition, the appearance of putative ethnic elements is not likely a conscious construct, and consequently may represent a direct link to his ethnic heritage. In one sense Ornstein presents an ideal laboratory situation: a composer who wrote almost spontaneously and had no desire to introduce exotic elements for their own sake, but whose music seems to contain obvious ethnic qualities. Ornstein's own past problematizes this issue, however. Before coming to the United States he occupied successively two worlds, the Jewish pale of the Ukraine, and high Russian culture of St. Petersburg. Critics who heard Ornstein's music in the 1920s were often confused or uncertain: what is Jewish, what is Russian, and what is vaguely "Oriental"? Through the examination of individual passages of Ornstein's music, this paper will reconsider these problems of musical identity, style and intention.

AMBIGUOUS NATIONALISM: THE JOHANN STRAUSS JR.  
CENTENNIAL ANNIVERSARY (1925) AND  
AUSTRIAN NATIONAL IDENTITY

Zoë Lang  
Harvard University

The study of nationalism in musicology has been dominated by two political paradigms: an authoritarian government controlling its citizens through propaganda, or a rebellious group pitted against an oppressive ruler. However, not all cases of nationalism provide such a clear-cut model of opposition. From the time of its formation in 1919 to the eventual *Anschluss* in 1938, Austria failed to create a coherent national identity. Regionalism and pan-Germanism remained enticing alternatives throughout the interwar period, resulting in an ambiguous conception of Austria as a nation. Partially, the inability to unite the country resulted from the theories of nationalism in this era, which prioritized language as the marker of nationhood. Because the country's language was not unique, Austrians instead promoted their religion and culture as exclusive to their nation. These efforts, however, did not lead to a cohesive national image.

The continued prominence of cultural icons such as Johann Strauss Jr. (1825–1899) served to bestow a sense of continuity between the past and the present. Conceptually, such continuity is required in any nationalism, since it implies that the qualities demarcating the nation are transferable through generations. The modern scholarly treatment of Strauss Jr. in works such as Schorske's *Fin-de-siècle Vienna* stands directly opposition to the image that

emerged in the interwar period. This music was not viewed as it is often portrayed today: little more than the saccharine remnants of the Hapsburg Empire. Instead, commentators strove to link Strauss Jr. with their present; his music became the expression of a distinctive—and irreproducible—Austrian style. At the same time, they emphasized the importance of teaching the next generation about this music, thus providing the illusion that these cultural values would be sustained in the future, along with the nation that fostered them.

My paper argues that Strauss Jr. served as a common cultural focal point during the interwar period; the salient features of his life and works were then refracted into competing national images. Already in his lifetime, Strauss Jr. was revered as the most Viennese of composers. The centennial anniversary of his birth marked an opportunity to remold his image from Hapsburg symbol into one appropriate for the newly-formed nation. Almost one hundred articles from twelve Viennese newspapers covered events from the centennial celebrations. In his book *Imagined Communities*, Benedict Anderson has postulated that newspapers provide an incomparable outlet for creating a sense of community; this medium therefore is ideal for the spread of nationalist sentiments. These documents provide insight into the variegated national views, ranging from Strauss Jr. as a manifestation of the Germanic tradition to emphasizing Strauss Jr. as Viennese rather than Austrian. The press coverage surrounding the centennial anniversary of Strauss Jr.'s birth offers new possibilities for nationalist studies by documenting the struggle of a country unable to develop into a nation, as well as a case study examining the importance of composers as cultural icons during the interwar period in Austria.

### HAMISH MACCUNN AND IMPERIALISM: A SCOT GLORIFIES THE EMPIRE?

Jennifer Oates  
Queens College, CUNY

Hamish MacCunn (1868–1916) built his reputation upon compositions that create atmospheric impressions of Scotland or retell stories of Scottish folklore and literature through music. Yet, in the early years of the twentieth century MacCunn composed three works that participated in exploring the British empire and imperialism: *The Masque of War and Peace* (1900), composed for a war victims benefit; *The Pageant of Darkness and Light* (1908), written for the London Missionary Society; and *Livingstone the Pilgrim* (1913), commemorating the centenary of Livingstone's birth. All three works glorify the British Empire and the importance of bringing Christianity and British moral values to all corners of the world. MacCunn mirrored this blatant promotion of the Empire and Christianity in his music by infusing opposing elements of British music, including quotations of Handel, Bishop, and "God save the King;" hymns and Christian music; exotic music depicting the cultures of Eskimos, native Hawaiians, Africans, and Indians; and music illustrating combative, violent, and hedonistic natives being miraculously saved by white missionaries.

During the peak of the British Empire, exhibitions, festivals, and other popular entertainments showcased the importance and achievements of the Empire by portraying other cultures and the "improvements" that Christianity and British morals brought to these distant lands. This aim to assimilate other cultures into a unified society based on British morals and values was contradicted by the regional divisions within Britain. These divisions, in turn, caused problems in creating a pan-British and pro-Empire image and musical works. Scotland and Ireland continued to promote their own culture and music while actively participating

in the establishment and expansion of the Empire. With British music being composed and promoted as “English,” “Irish,” or “Scottish,” how do imperialism and pan-British sentiments figure into British music of the time? What distinguished “English,” “Irish,” and “Scottish” from pan-British or imperialistic music? And, could a Scottish (or Irish or Welsh) composer compose works both Scottish (or Irish or Welsh) nationalistic works as well as pan-British or imperialistic works without negating the other?

This paper will explore these larger issues of Empire and Britain through MacCunn’s position as a Scottish composer working in London. While MacCunn was only one of many composers writing music supporting the Empire during this time, his particular situation highlights the tensions between English and Scottish identities and imperialism. MacCunn had written non-Scottish works prior to these three imperialistic works, but composing music for popular entertainments with a strong pro-Empire and pro-Britain message marked a striking departure from his usual compositions, Scottish or otherwise. Rather than marking a change in MacCunn’s views on Scotland and England, both compositions illustrate his musical support of the Empire, his ability to compose pan-British music, and his status as a British composer. With *The Masque of War and Peace*, *The Pageant of Darkness and Light*, and *Livingstone the Pilgrim*, MacCunn shows how he navigated through the problems of nationalism and imperialism in creating works that glorify Britain.

## NINETEENTH-CENTURY OPERA

### Denise Gallo, Library of Congress, Chair

ANGELICA CATALANI, ENSEMBLE, AND THE KING’S THEATRE, 1806–13

Hilary Poriss  
University of Cincinnati

“My wife and three or four puppets . . . that’s all that is necessary!” Paul Valabrègue uttered this infamous impertinence during contract negotiations for his wife Angelica Catalani (1780–1849), Europe’s premiere operatic soprano during the first quarter of the nineteenth century. According to historical record, Catalani “was one of the greatest operatic tyrants of all times,” demanding to be the only star on whatever stage she appeared, and insisting on singing exclusively in her favorite operas. Valabrègue’s statement became a slogan for later nineteenth-century critics seeking to explain the “dark age” of one of the most important venues for Italian opera production, the King’s Theatre, London. Indeed, as late as 1855, a critic for the literary magazine, *Fraser’s*, could refer cryptically to “the days of ma femme et trois ou quatre poupées,” knowing his readers would understand that he meant the years 1806 to 1813, when Catalani dominated London’s stages.

The understanding that Catalani clung anachronistically to eighteenth-century performance aesthetics, rather than “advancing” into the nineteenth century, has permitted scholars to avoid serious consideration of Italian opera production in London during these years. With a few exceptions, most investigations of this subject either conclude with the eighteenth century, or begin after 1815, when Rossini’s operas appeared. This study explores one avenue toward bridging this gap, reevaluating opera reception and production in London through the lenses of Catalani’s experiences and contributions.

I begin with an analysis of the criticism that followed Catalani throughout her career, gleaned from biographies and periodicals. From these sources, I seek to identify concerns that figured prominently in the reception of Italian opera and of Catalani herself. Most significantly, London's critics during the 1830s and '40s situated her within an aesthetic debate that contrasted the "star system" with a newly evolving expression, "ensemble." According to the *OED*, the first time "ensemble" was used to denote "the united performance of all voices or all instruments in a piece of concerted music" was in 1844. My research, however, has uncovered several reviews indicating that this term circulated nearly fifteen years earlier in reference to that which Catalani "refused." I will show that her posthumous reputation as a tyrant was shaped by this polemic, as much as it was by actual events.

In the second portion of this essay I turn to Catalani's repertory to ground this aesthetic debate in performance. Drawing on librettos, scores, and contemporary accounts, I illustrate that while Catalani subscribed to the star system, many of the choices she made—from full operas to individual arias—were more than simple star turns. I conclude by introducing a set of theme-and-variation arias that she performed repeatedly in concert and as aria insertions in opera productions. This music, which Mount-Edgumbe referred to as "the height of absurdity," served as a volatile site where concerns regarding ensemble, virtuosity, and "appropriate" uses of the voice were articulated.

#### "ESSENTIALLY THEATRICAL":

#### REALITY AND REPRESENTATION IN ROSSINI'S ITALIAN OPERAS

Emanuele Senici

University of Oxford

Rossini's Italian operas took the operatic world by storm in the early nineteenth century and remained hugely popular for decades. Musicologists have thoroughly documented this phenomenon, but have seldom discussed its reasons. In this paper I suggest a possible explanation, focusing on the ideology behind these works' dramaturgy, and specifically addressing the relationship between reality and representation.

Writing in 1834, Thomas Love Peacock established a direct link between contemporary reality and its representation in Rossini's *opere buffe*: "There has been an increase of excitement in the world of reality, and that of imagination has kept it company.... The public taste has changed, and the supply of the market has followed the demand. There can be no question that Rossini's music is more spirit-stirring than Paisiello's, and more essentially theatrical: more suited to the theatre by its infinite variety of contrast and combination, and more dependent on the theatre for the development of its perfect effect." Taking my cue from Peacock, I argue that the kind of representation at work in Rossini's *opere buffe* is programmatically and self-consciously theatrical, in the sense that it constantly reminds the audience of its theatricality, purposefully preventing identification between characters and spectators. This "essential theatricality" was a recurring theme in Rossini's early Italian critical reception, but, interestingly, this reception pointedly ignored the distinction between *opere buffe* and *serie*, including both genres in its critique of these works' supposed representational failings. Following early-nineteenth-century Italian critics, therefore, I extend my interpretation of Rossini's dramaturgy in terms of "essential theatricality" to his *opere serie* as well.

But why should the prevention of identification with operatic characters and situations on the part of audiences constitute a goal? And why did it prove so successful? I suggest that the answer has something to do with the "increase of excitement in the world of reality"

mentioned by Peacock. The epoch-making changes in all reaches of human activity witnessed in Europe from 1789 onwards ignited a progressive erosion of the belief that it was possible to decode such bafflingly fast-changing reality in any meaningful way, and therefore to establish any meaningful link between this reality and its various forms of representation, including the operatic one. In other words, Rossini's operas were successful because they were essentially and distinctly modern, masterfully interpreting, and perhaps even contributing to, a new distrust in the "legibility" of reality.

In the concluding section of the paper I discuss a particularly telling instance of Rossini's representational strategies, the trio "L'usato ardir" from Act 2 of his last Italian opera, *Semiramide* (1823). While this exceptional piece seems to run counter to my interpretation of these strategies, it does so in ways that throw a revealing light on what had come before, ultimately reaffirming, while finally rejecting it, Rossini's "essential theatricality."

### GIUSEPPE VERDI'S *LA FORZA DEL DESTINO*: 1861, 1862, 1869

Philip Gossett  
University of Chicago

Two years ago in a paper to the AMS it was announced that new documentation pertaining to *La forza del destino* had been released by the Verdi family. One brief excerpt from Verdi's 1861 draft was presented.

The present paper, which coincides with the first performances of the critical edition of the opera, at San Francisco on 4 November 2005, provides a summary of new information about the history of the work. Previous research, by William Holmes and John Nádas, was carried out without access to musical manuscripts pertaining to *Forza* that include:

- 222 pages of sketches, including a complete continuity draft from 1861 and extensive continuity drafts for the revisions Verdi made in 1862 and 1869;
- 130 pages of canceled skeleton score, pages Verdi wrote out in 1861, before orchestrating the opera in 1862;
- 134 pages of orchestrated autograph score pertaining to the 1862 "St. Petersburg" version, pulled from the manuscript during his 1869 "Milan" revision.

Analysis of the 1869 autograph manuscript in the Ricordi archives allows us to differentiate layers and trace the history of the document as assembled and modified in 1861, 1862, and 1869.

Holmes printed several extracts from the 1861 version, as copied in December 1861 into parts from which singers were expected to study the opera. It is now possible to reconstruct the complete 1861 opera, the form that would have been the basis of St. Petersburg performances during the winter of 1861–62 had the prima donna, Emma Lagrua, not fallen ill. The resulting interruption in the history of the work forced Verdi to postpone orchestration of his opera for nine months. When he returned to the score in the late summer and fall of 1862 he not only orchestrated his earlier skeleton score, but also made significant musical and dramaturgical changes.

This paper will concentrate on scenes Verdi modified substantially from one version to another. In numbers such as the Scena Osteria of Act II, the Duet for Don Alvaro and Don Carlo of Act III, and the Accampamento of Act III, it will demonstrate that teleological rhetoric cannot account for the complexities Verdi confronted when moving from his original 1861 ideas through a fully performed 1862 version and a revised 1869 version. His changes respond

to needs of particular singers, Verdi's vacillating attitudes toward convention, and historical and cultural forces in different venues. In 1869, for example, Verdi transposed Preziosilla's solo in the *Scena Osteria* to accommodate his singer, introducing one of the worst transitions in all his operas. In 1861 he boasts to his librettist that the *Accampamento* is "the most united and coherent thing"; two revisions later that unity and coherence were largely sacrificed. Yet some of his most remarkable music was the result of revision: thus, the ensemble featuring Leonora in the *Scena Osteria* did not exist in 1861, when Leonora did not appear in the scene at all. Excerpts from earlier versions will be performed.

## STAGING AND FORM IN GIUSEPPE VERDI'S *OTELLO*

Andreas Giger

Louisiana State University

The *disposizioni sceniche* for Verdi's operas—the staging manuals compiled with the composer's approval and published by Ricordi since 1855—have long been the subject of interest, especially for the information they provide about visual effects, the creation of an atmosphere, the correspondence of gesture and music, naturalness in acting and its relationship to the conventions of the day, to name just a few. Although these manuals eventually included, as in the case of *Otello*, a directive that all instructions be strictly followed in future productions, current scholarship generally acknowledges the impracticability of this directive in our time, when stage technology and tastes have changed and a great variety of stagings have become part of our collective memory.

Discussions of the *disposizioni sceniche* have, however, failed to note the way in which they reveal Verdi's understanding of the relationship between the form of the music and the form created by blocking, the movement of the characters on stage. Verdi conveyed in the *disposizioni sceniche* a cinematic sense of the intersections of formal sequences of motions and musical structure, illuminating an essential and complementary visual conception that goes far beyond the mere description of individual movements and gestures.

In the opening storm scene from *Otello*, for instance, the emerging tonal clarity (which accompanies the subsiding of the storm) corresponds to increasingly distinct and concentrated movements of the chorus; and each of the subsequent formal incisions (the A minor lyrical section beginning with "Dio, fulgor della bufera" and the victory chorus beginning with "Vittoria! Sterminio!") are highlighted by corresponding dramatic blocking. In other scenes, blocking reflects or clarifies musical form to outline shifts in control of one character over another. In the love duet at the end of act 1, for example, the target key of E major (which includes the "bacio" theme) coincides with a shift in blocking from movement controlled by Otello to movement controlled by Desdemona. In a duet otherwise characterized by largely unconventional form, the straightforward trajectory outlined by blocking provides both form and dramatic meaning.

By examining the parallels between musical form and blocking, I will demonstrate that Verdi's instructions for blocking are clearly intended to reinforce the musico-dramatic effects. To further illustrate the point in the case of the opening chorus, I will juxtapose an animated recreation of an excerpt with a recreation of the original staging in Renato Castellani's documentary film *The Life of Verdi*, which despite its implied claim of historical authenticity ignores the blocking instructions of the *disposizione scenica*.

Philip Gossett has argued forcefully that critical editions of nineteenth-century music should "open up the text . . . and suggest historically sanctioned alternatives." While the

*disposizione scenica* for *Otello* does not necessarily have to be followed in modern stagings, it still retains its authority as a key to “open up” our conceptions of the text.

## RUSSIAN MODERNISM

Richard Taruskin, University of California, Berkeley, Chair

### NAVIGATING THE MARKET: THE REPERTOIRE POLITICS OF MAMONTOV'S ENTERPRISE

Olga Haldey

University of Missouri-Columbia

In the late 1890s, the Moscow Private Opera, an enterprise sponsored and directed by Savva Mamontov, was one of Russia's most innovative cultural institutions. It made a strong impact on the artistic lives of both Moscow and St. Petersburg and became a crucible for emerging modernist trends in stage aesthetics. Created as a realization of Mamontov's idealist vision of “serving art,” his company was at the same time a commercial venture that needed to navigate the harsh realities of the Russian theater market: a market distrustful of private enterprise, dominated by the powerful Imperial Theaters backed by the court, and divided by the conflicting ideological agendas aggressively promoted by warring factions in the press. In order to compete, Mamontov's company employed a variety of tactics, the most important being its repertoire policy. Filled with the works either rejected or ignored by the Imperial stage, its playbill ensured the enterprise both popular success and a controversial reputation in the operatic life of late-nineteenth-century Russia.

The rising popularity of Mamontov's enterprise made it a reluctant center of two parallel ideological battles in the operatic press. One pitted three camps against each other: the partisans of the traditional, primarily Italian style; the Kuchkists who promoted the still-neglected works of the Russian Five; and the modernists intent on popularizing Wagner. Another was a bitter struggle for the elevation of Russian music, tinged with nationalism, anti-Semitism, and xenophobia. As is evident from reviews of Moscow Private Opera productions, the press began creating a myth of the enterprise from its opening night on as an “ideological institution” dedicated to the propaganda of Russian music. In so doing, the critics effectively hijacked Mamontov's mission of serving art and replaced it with their own agenda of serving exclusively “native”—i.e., national—art. Trapped in its newly constructed identity, the enterprise was then used as a tool in an essentially political campaign, culminating in its competition with a touring Wagnerian troupe.

The myth of Mamontov's enterprise as a “defender of native art” persisted well beyond the life-span of the company itself. Initially part true and part the critics' wishful thinking, it became a cornerstone of scholarly discourse on the Moscow Private Opera throughout the twentieth century. In the West, this led to a portrayal of Mamontov as a nationalist, and in Russia to one as a realist, whose repertoire policy was geared towards the promotion of Kuchkist composers. As evident from previously unpublished sources, Mamontov's repertoire policy was more flexible than either his critics or scholars believed. It reflected his aesthetic ideals of art synthesis and fusion of opera and drama while responding to the political and ideological realities of the time. Forced to abide by the rules of the press war waged around it, Mamontov's enterprise also took full advantage of the controversy and the free publicity it

generated. It skillfully navigated Russia's operatic market to cater to its increasingly polarized audience during the time of political and aesthetic instability.

## A MODERN BALLET: BENOIS, TCHEREPNINE, AND THE AESTHETICS OF RETROSPECTIVISM

Dimitri Shapovalov  
Cornell University

The ballet *Le Pavillon d'Armide*, while largely overlooked by scholarship, nevertheless sheds light on a vital component of Russian *fin-de-siècle* aesthetics: retrospectivism. Co-authored by the painter and stage designer Alexander Benois, a leader of the World of Art group, the composer Nikolai Tcherepnine, and the choreographer Mikhail Fokine, the ballet premiered in 1907 in St. Petersburg. Two years later, it dazzled a Parisian audience at the opening night of the first season of Diaghilev's Ballets Russes, staking a convincing claim for a strong modernist movement in Russia. But if *Le Pavillon d'Armide*, together with the other works presented to the French public by the Ballets Russes, claimed to represent the face of Russian *fin-de-siècle* modernism, it did so differently from Stravinsky's famous ballets for the same company. Benois, the chief creative mind behind the project, insisted on the importance of historical awareness for modernity. Faced with the bankruptcy of modern civilization, he argued, the gaze of the modern subject must be directed chiefly backwards, towards the past. In his idiosyncratic version of modernism (seen in works like his watercolor series "The Last Promenades of Louis XIV" [1897–98] or "Versailles" [1905]), emulation (both nostalgic and ironic) and stylization determined the course of innovation for art.

Benois was not, however, the sole creator of *Le Pavillon d'Armide*. Despite his effort to assume full control over the planning and production of all aspects of the project, only the libretto, the costumes, and the stage design fully endorsed his vision of the ballet as a reconstructionist tribute to the French Baroque and Rococo. The innovative choreography of Fokine exploited fully the mastery of the Ballets Russes stars Anna Pavlova, Tamara Karsavina, and Vatslav Nijinskii. Mixing convention and innovation in a way that may well apply to the ballet as a whole, Fokine incorporated his choreographic novelties into a traditional combination of pantomime and dance sequences stylized after Marius Petipa (1819–1910), the old *maître* of Russian nineteenth-century ballet. Fokine's contribution thus added another layer of historical reference to the ballet's already diverse palette of styles and approaches.

The music of Tcherepnine further diversifies this palette. Doubtless, Tcherepnine's dual orientation as both a Conservatoire "academicist" and a composer interested in exploring the newest musical techniques of his day played a decisive role in the rich stylistic variety of the music. The musical influences of the ballet range from Baroque lute music (*Armide's* Lament) to Tchaikovsky (Introduction, Valse Noble) to reasonably advanced chromaticism representing Tcherepnine's own time (Tableau I, Scene 3). By freely mixing these diverse styles, Tcherepnine's music does not destroy, but, on the contrary, only reinforces the profound commitment to retrospectivism characteristic of the ballet as a whole. Indeed, the sheer multitude of historical references elevates history to the status of the very subject of *Le Pavillon d'Armide*. In doing so, the ballet establishes a gentle, non-conflicting reciprocity between the Russian *fin-de-siècle* and the past, thus providing a viable counter-aesthetic to European modernism.

FORWARD TO COMMUNISM, BACK TO BACH: HOW SOCIALIST  
REALIST WAS SHOSTAKOVICH'S NEOCLASSICISM?

Marina Frolova-Walker  
University of Cambridge

The task of locating and deciphering subversive messages has characterized Shostakovich scholarship over the past two decades. Some commentators have restricted themselves to a painstaking search for musical quotations and allusions, while others have felt free to assign less verifiable meanings and narratives to the composer's undeniably topic-laden music. The present paper offers a different approach, examining features of Shostakovich's style that threatened to undermine Socialist Realism.

It is generally recognized that Shostakovich abandoned modernism after *Pravda's* condemnation of *Lady Macbeth*: the sound worlds of the Second Symphony or *The Nose* never resurfaced. But another significant trend in Shostakovich's earlier works has received much less attention, namely the Neoclassicism of the First Symphony in the '20s, and of the Cello Sonata and First Piano Concerto in the early '30s. If anything, this was still more a product of Shostakovich's dialogue with the West, reflecting the influence of Stravinsky, Hindemith, Krenek and Casella, all of whom had won the admiration of Russia's progressive young composers in the '20s. Shostakovich's Neoclassicism therefore predates the direct interference of the state in matters of musical style, and must not be considered a product of Socialist Realism. Indeed, the Neoclassicism of Western composers was specifically condemned as a symptom of bourgeois decadence. And yet Neoclassicism continued to figure prominently in Shostakovich's works throughout the '30s and '40s, escaping public censure. The patently Neoclassicist Piano Quintet of 1940 even managed to earn Shostakovich a Stalin Prize. How was this possible?

Soviet published sources consistently swept the issue under the carpet. This was maintained even as late as 1988, when the first serious Soviet study of Neoclassicism to appear since the '20s concluded that "in Russia, Neoclassicism never happened." In the present paper, a very different picture emerges, thanks to the extensive use of unpublished archival material, such as the papers of the Soviet Composers' Union, the Stalin Prize Committee and other sources held at the Russian State Archive for Literature and Art, Moscow. Composers were able to speak much more openly among themselves, even when a stenographer was present, and in the transcripts of their meetings we find that Shostakovich's Neoclassicism was a perennial subject of vigorous debate. We discover that Shostakovich's colleagues detected Stravinsky's *Symphony of Psalms* in the slow movement of the Fifth Symphony and *Pulcinella* in the Finale of the prize-winning Quintet—this at the time when Stravinsky's name could hardly be mentioned in the press. The Eighth and Ninth Symphonies were faulted on similar grounds, but most remarkably, even the Seventh was picked over for Neoclassical traces, at a time when this work was still lauded as a national treasure in public.

This paper seeks to answer several questions. To what extent was Shostakovich isolated as a Soviet Neoclassicist? Did the authorities grant Shostakovich freedoms that were unthinkable for most of his colleagues? Had Western Neoclassical influence to some extent been assimilated into the Socialist Realist language or was it truly an alien element, subtly subverting Stalinist aesthetics from within?

“FAITH THROUGH SKEPTICISM”: DESACRALIZATION AND  
RESACRALIZATION IN ALFRED SCHNITTKE’S FIRST SYMPHONY

Victoria Adamenko  
University of West Florida

The role of religious consciousness in Soviet music, under the conditions of atheist ideology, remains wholly uninvestigated. The dichotomy between the sacred and the sacrilegious in terms of traditional religion was in itself a topic made taboo by Soviet cultural policy; yet this dichotomy was at the center of Alfred Schnittke’s spiritual quest, as is evident from his own published writings and interviews. The influence on him of both Mikhail Bulgakov’s *The Master and Margarita* and Thomas Mann’s *Doctor Faustus*—the novels reexamining the sacred—has been documented [Ivashkin, 1996].

No attempt has been made to elucidate the ways in which the composition of Schnittke’s First Symphony (1969–72) was informed by his awareness of religious culture. As far back as 1965 [Ryzhkin, 1999], long before his baptism into Roman Catholicism in 1980, Schnittke had begun to explore the Bible in depth. His Second Violin Concerto (1966) contains a hidden program on the crucifixion and resurrection of Christ [Shulgin, 1993]. His second symphony, *St. Florian* (1979), was conceived as a hybrid of symphony and mass, while the Third Symphony (1981) questioned the iconicity of the symphonic genre [Ivashkin, 1996]. The First Symphony, this paper argues, foreshadowed the key features of both. Since the score remains unpublished, few have had the opportunity to note that in the First Symphony Schnittke attempted not merely a skeptical deconstruction of those idioms held sacred to the symphonic genre [Taruskin, 1998], but also a reconstruction, or even a re-sacralization of that genre. Despite the fact that his restoration of traditional sonata form attributes in the first and the last movements results in the intentional and exaggerated effect of “failure,” Schnittke revived the venerated form with the help of a timeless structural “formula” based on the number row of the Greek astronomer Eratosthenes (276–194 BC), the use of which he described in his published interviews. In the Finale, the composer invoked sacred symbolism of liturgical music by utilizing fourteen various Gregorian melodies of Sanctus from the 1877 collection *Graduale de Tempore et de Sanctis* [Kholopova, 1990], in addition to the *Dies Irae* tune, and chime music evocative of a liturgical atmosphere. In the third movement, he created an aura of mystical transcendence by turning to non-metric rhythms and a stylistically uniform micropolyphonic texture, both of which strongly contrast with the all-too-earthly polystylistic clichés of the previous movements.

While the political circumstances surrounding the reception of the First Symphony and its stylistic roots in Western music have been discussed, the paradox of the work’s conception has yet to be unpacked. Schnittke’s vision is more idiosyncratic—the construction of a cosmos operated by forces that are identified in religious terms—than it is socially provocative or socio-culturally conformist. The received opinion that Schnittke’s early collage-style works are unrefined [Whittall, 2003] is challenged by an hermeneutic analysis of the First Symphony, the elaborate dramaturgical concept of which matches highly structured pitch and formal structure.

## THE “UTOPIA OF A UNIFIED STYLE,” OR THE MUSICAL NARRATIVITY OF ALFRED SCHNITTKE’S POLYSTYLISM

Jean-Benoit Tremblay  
University of British Columbia

Before his death in 1998, Alfred Schnittke was one of the most performed, recorded and commissioned living composers. Unknown in the West until the late 1970s, the Russian-born composer developed a compositional technique called “polystylism,” which is characterized by the use of two or more styles in a single composition.

Living under the Soviet regime and facing censorship, Schnittke had to compose film music for a livelihood. Polystylism derived from his work on such movies as Andrej Khrjanovsky’s *Glass Harmonica* and Mihail Romm’s *And Yet I Believe*. The former “quotes” famous paintings, from Brueghel to Magritte; the latter presents an eclectic and rather pessimistic account of the world by showing images of China’s Cultural Revolution mixed with others of starvation in Africa among other depressing images. Schnittke used a similar referential technique in two of his most famous and “polystylistic” works: the Concerto Grosso no. 1 and the Symphony no. 1. For Schnittke, polystylism created “new possibilities for the musical dramatization of ‘eternal’ questions—of war and peace, life and death.”

In this paper, I will demonstrate how polystylism makes use of the process of “defamiliarization” in order to create a musical narrative. The juxtaposition of foreign styles—tango and dodecaphonic clusters, for example—is impossible to justify as the consequence of purely musical developments. The rupture between these styles and the “background” of the work brings them to the foreground. Such stylistic shifts result in the creation of spaces, musically unexplainable gaps between “foregrounded” elements and the general background of the work.

The literary theorist Maurice Blanchot describes the possibilities created by such disjunctions. He explains how fragmentation proposes a new kind of arrangement “that accepts disjunction or divergence as the infinite center from out of which, through speech, relations are to be created.” As many authors have noted (Wolfgang Iser, Michel Foucault, Leonard Meyer, Kevin Korsyn), when confronted with gaps, readers and listeners experience the desire to resolve or to explain them. The natural impulse to resolve discontinuities allows narrativity to infiltrate the musical text.

The narrative implications of Schnittke’s polystylism are realized in two stages: (1) the acknowledgment of extra-musical connotations for specific musical styles or borrowings; (2) the ordering of those meaningful units into a narrative. The Concerto Grosso no. 1 constitutes the epistemic nexus of a complex web of extra-musical associations, which includes animation movies, Chamisso’s Peter Schlehmil, Baroque paintings, a film on Rasputin, Jungian definitions of anima/animus and the collective subconscious. While the Symphony no. 1, in the shape of a musical chronicle, proclaims its own death . . . only to resurrect afterwards.

By discussing the origins and the connotations of various stylistic elements as they appear in the Concerto Grosso no. 1 and in the Symphony no. 1, with reference to film excerpts and the examination of the composer’s sketches, I will demonstrate how Schnittke’s music compels listeners to elaborate upon a narrative, not by providing a single definitive “story” for the music, but by explaining the processes involved.

*Saturday evening, 29 October*

## THE COLD WAR AND CHANGING IDEOLOGIES OF NEW MUSIC

**Peter Schmelz, University at Buffalo, organizer**

**Robert Adlington, University of Nottingham**

**Amy Beal, University of California, Santa Cruz**

**Jennifer DeLapp, University of Maryland, College Park**

**Danielle Fosler-Lussier, Ohio State University**

Recently musicologists have begun to investigate the music composed during the decades after World War II, and specifically the relationship between new, “avant-garde” music and the continuing global opposition between the United States and the USSR. As they refine the traditional historiography of this period, scholars have addressed a number of geographic areas, from America and Western Europe to the Soviet sphere, and a number of musical styles, from serialism to chance music. Issues of patronage, propaganda, influence, prestige, reception, and meaning have all been raised in one form or another, yet important questions about these and other topics remain. This panel will present and discuss new research that considers the changing political meanings of new, “difficult” music, and especially—though not exclusively—serialism, in Cold War America, Western and Eastern Europe, and the Soviet Union, focusing on the 1960s. The brief, individual presentations will lay the foundation for a broad discussion of musical trends that have been mapped out thus far only independently. The conversation will suggest additional connections, unanswered questions, and avenues for further research.

One of the primary goals of the session will be to investigate many of the assumptions that currently govern the historiography of the post-war period, namely the conventional narrative that portrays a serial-dominated 1950s giving way to aleatory techniques, collage, and polystylism by the 1960s. In addition to offering refinements to this musical story, the other goal of the panel will be to investigate and explore the strengths and weaknesses of its assumed ideological implications, especially the opposition of Soviet “communist” tonality and Western “resistant” serialism. This binary, usually applied to the music of the 1950s, takes on different shadings from the perspective of the 1960s, as the presentations and ensuing discussion will elaborate. Other topics to be raised include, but are not limited to: Government and private funding of the arts during the Cold War; the role of performance groups with ideologies and musical styles at odds with those of the dominant superpowers; and broader issues of signification in the music.

Robert Adlington will discuss the music theater piece *Reconstructie*, performed at the Holland Festival in 1969, which is loosely based on *Don Giovanni*, but reworked as an allegory of U.S. activities in South America. Amy Beal will describe Musica Elettronica Viva’s ideological approach to free improvisation through 1968 concerts in Rome. Jennifer DeLapp will trace the changing reception of serialism in the American and British “middlebrow” press. Danielle Fosler-Lussier will explore the “myths” surrounding serialism in light of the evolving political détente of the 1960s and the pastiche compositions of Rochberg and Schnittke. And Peter Schmelz will examine the political meanings of the shift from serial to aleatory techniques in the 1960s works of unofficial Soviet composers Schnittke and Pärt.

## CURRENT COPYRIGHT ISSUES IN SCHOLARLY EDITIONS OF MUSIC

**Eleanor Selfridge-Field, Stanford University, organizer**

**Charles Cronin, Columbia University**

**Lionel Sawkins, Beckenham, Great Britain**

**Alexander Silbiger, Duke University**

**Kathleen Hansell, University of Chicago Press**

In the debate over unauthorized copying of MP3 files, there are no subtleties: copies are verbatim and are redistributed without legal authorization. The subtleties of legal issues related to notated music and its potential for modification (in editions, arrangements, score-and-part preparation, adaptation for different media, etc.) are, in contrast, many. These subtleties have long failed to interest copyright authorities. The difference in legal attention parallels obvious differences of commercial importance and de facto differences of repertory. Alternative methods of distribution, lying beyond the control of media conglomerates, undermine commercial expectations for popular music. Vicissitudes in the distribution of classical music have little such effect. In many instances, scholarly editions survive largely through subsidies.

This session explores current legal issues related to the distribution and redistribution of scholarly editions of music. It focuses mainly on recent case law from the conventional world of authors and publishers, and copyright issues in digital distribution. The forum provides one hour of expository presentations, one hour of responses to them, and one hour for free questions related to music and copyright (excluding MP3 issues). The panel participants are Charles Cronin, Lionel Sawkins, Alexander Silbiger, Kathleen Hansell, and Eleanor Selfridge-Field (convener).

In *Sawkins vs. Hyperion* (UK, July 2004), several questions of “authorship” in four editions of French baroque music, prepared for performance and later recorded, were resolved largely in favor of the plaintiff. The central issues in the case were the status of editorial material to facilitate performance (e.g., basso continuo figuration) and the reconstruction of missing material. Both were held to qualify as new “authorship.” In *Sawkins vs. Harmonia Mundi* (France, January 2005) issues related to unauthorized redistribution were debated. What rights, it was asked, does the copyright holder (here the editor) have in a chain of re-instantiations of the work—as background music in a film later aired on television and issued in a video? Lionel Sawkins will give his own observations as a plaintiff.

Charles Cronin will speak about issues raised by the two *Sawkins* cases from his perspective as a lawyer, musicologist, and librarian. He will also comment briefly on areas in which US, British, and French copyright laws are non-uniform. Cronin’s recent articles and website on U.S. case law in music plagiarism [[www.ccnmtl.columbia.edu/projects/law/library/song.html](http://www.ccnmtl.columbia.edu/projects/law/library/song.html)] demonstrate the musically arbitrary nature of many judgments.)

Turning to legal issues surrounding digital distribution of new editions of old music, Alexander Silbiger will speak from his perspective as general editor of the Web Library of the Society for Seventeenth-Century Music [[www.sscm-wlscm.org](http://www.sscm-wlscm.org)]. Does free online distribution simplify copyright issues, or does it complicate them?

Eleanor Selfridge-Field will speak about legal considerations in the distribution of MuseData, an archive of virtual electronic data ([www.musedata.org](http://www.musedata.org)) consisting largely of out-of-copyright editions of eighteenth- and nineteenth-century music. Some problems encountered in distributing virtual data are akin to problems of work identity in “not-quite-fixed” repertories of recent times.

**A SENSE OF PLACE: MUSIC AND REGIONAL ENVIRONMENTS,  
MUSICOLOGY, AND ECOCRITICISM**

**Brooks Toliver, University of Akron, organizer**

**Aaron S. Allen, Harvard University**

**Catherine Cole, Cleveland State University**

**Robert Fallon, University of California, Berkeley**

**Neil Lerner, Davidson College**

**Denise Von Glahn, Florida State University**

**Ellen Waterman, University of Guelph**

**Holly Watkins, Eastman School of Music, University of Rochester**

The idea of place has received much attention among ecocritics in recent years. Although no single approach predominates, some ecocritics focus on regional writers immersed in a very specific local environment, while others bring such specifics to the consideration of a canonic work (situating *Moby Dick* in the context of sperm whale decimation in the mid-nineteenth century, for instance). As these cases make clear, ecocriticism has approached nature as a human construction and the environment as a physical reality. Sometimes ecocritics focus their concerns on what nature means to an author or culture, while at other times they examine ways in which humans have read and misread nonhuman nature. Here the politics of environmentalism lie near the surface, as ecocritics seek to reveal attitudes toward the environment that have ultimately translated into land-use.

In a series of brief presentations and an ensuing discussion, this panel taps into ecocriticism to explore different ways in which music can participate in definitions of place. With examples from reggae, medieval, and classical genres, Aaron S. Allen will examine the importance of how music cannot reflect place, but rather that people impart associations of place onto music. Catherine Cole will discuss the connections between the North American landscape and representations of the noble savage in Rameau's "Les Sauvages," tracing the changing relationship of nature to the "marvelous" in late eighteenth-century French opera. Robert Fallon will argue that American culture increasingly represents "classical music" as pastoral music or as a soothing, escapist cousin to New Age music, in contrast to "popular music" that reflects urban culture and urban problems. Neil Lerner will discuss how Virgil Thomson's film music for *The Plow that Broke the Plains*, *The River*, and *Louisiana Story* uses folk melodies to connect space and score in order to support the films' environmental rhetoric. Brooks Toliver will discuss the value that ecocriticism places on attention to natural detail; if music is less able than literature to distinguish between a wetlands and a riparian zone, can musicologists still make productive use of ecocriticism? Denise Von Glahn will consider the places that three contemporary American women composers—Ellen Taaffe Zwilich, Meredith Monk, and Pauline Oliveros—have memorialized in their music, and asks what those works tell us of the composers' relationships to the environment. Ellen Waterman will examine the "idea of north" as it has signified "authentic" Canadian identity, and will question whether this investment in nature and authenticity is sustainable in contemporary Canada's multi-ethnic urban culture. Holly Watkins will show how the tendency for pastoral topoi to be enclosed within non-pastoral music (as in Trio sections) mirrors the pastoral's function of expressing the nostalgia of an urban artistic culture.

*Sunday Morning, 30 October*

## **AUTHORS AND AUTHORITY IN THE RENAISSANCE**

**Martha Feldman, University of Chicago, Chair**

This session questions the applicability of modern notions of authorship to early music. To start with, all music resists being identified as a “work” in the same sense as literary texts or art objects, for performance complicates any understanding of authorship by introducing the performer into the complex of acts that bring “works” into being. Indeed, performance imbeds music in social practices from which it is very difficult to disentangle “the work itself.” In this sense, then, performance elucidates the impossibility of isolating the composer from the social systems that organize the circulation, performance, and meaning of music.

Nonetheless, it is undeniable that authors are now identified with texts and composers with the notation transmitting their music. When and how did this conflation of musical text and composer occur? The medieval period offers the example of Guillaume de Machaut, who apparently oversaw the copying of his oeuvre from an authorized exemplum, thereby affirming the synonymy between authorship and the codicological unit of the book. The transmission stemmata of Petrarch’s works show a similar correlation between authorship and the book. For the most part, however, manuscripts of music were compilations that transmitted the compositions of several composers, often anonymously.

During the early age of music printing, the fragile relationship between text and composer began to strengthen. Printed books allowed the author’s name to achieve a new relevance, something born out by the figuration of the composer in single-composer prints, vanity prints, “brand-name” marketing around the names of “Josquin” or “Arcadelt,” and authoritative texts that could fit into the newly minted concept of a literary canon on which printers counted to bolster the developing market.

Yet musical “authorship” continued to be complicated by varied means of dissemination both oral and written. Manuscript miscellanies and printed chanson anthologies exemplify the continuity of forms as we move from scribal production to printing, as well as the strong conventions by which “authorship” was shared by compilers, scribes, patrons, and printers. Moreover, books devoted to the works of a single composer were not the only alternative: some composers’ works were issued in “co-authored” books such as the Mass Proper cycle of Isaac and Senfl and the *Cantiones sacrae* of Tallis and Byrd. These prints suggest new relationships—genealogies, national histories—that throw into relief the politics of authorship to which composers appealed as they jockeyed for attention in the new public sphere coalescing around print.

Our session joins material history (paleography, bibliography) to musical and historical analysis in order to develop a sociology of musical authorship in the Renaissance. We show how the practices of the scriptorium, print shop, camera, and court, and the practices of composers, performers, and consumers shaped the figure of the author at a time when the balance between oral and literate culture was still being renegotiated at all levels of society. In so doing, we work outward from the texts toward a new interpretation of what distinguished music and its composers from other authors in early modern Europe.

COLLABORATIVE VOICE IN THE 1575 TALLIS-BYRD *CANTIONES*

Kerry McCarthy  
Duke University

The collection of Latin songs brought out jointly by Thomas Tallis and William Byrd in 1575 is a unique artifact in sixteenth-century music printing. It was the only print of its kind ever produced in England: a large set of Latin-texted sacred works dedicated to the reigning monarch, with an extensive preface praising the composers (to whom she had just granted a printing monopoly) as the next great hope of English music vis-à-vis its better-known competition across the Channel. It appeared on the Elizabethan scene with a heady mixture of artistic ambition and nationalistic propaganda. Its contents were themselves paradoxical: a very public presentation of sacred music acceptable only in the chamber.

The 1575 book of *Cantiones quae ab argumento sacrae vocantur* is also unique in its structure. Its landmark role in English music printing has somewhat obscured its one-of-a-kind status even among Continental publications of the time. It is in fact the only Renaissance sacred print shared with complete equality between two composers. There are seventeen contributions from each, mostly in alternating blocks of three. Although Tallis takes the place of honor at the beginning of the collection and ends it with an impressive display of canonic virtuosity, Byrd's contribution is in some ways the more novel and diverse. The volume, with its carefully balanced format, fills two separate but related roles: a proud retrospective for the older composer, a showcase for the younger.

This paper revisits the 1575 *Cantiones* in light of other contemporary motet collections, and examines how Tallis and Byrd—who appear from both internal and external evidence to have had a firm hand in the publishing process—presented themselves in this varied but well-organized musical portfolio. I offer a new interpretation of the prefatory material and the rather evasive title (“Songs which on account of their subject matter are called sacred”). I also discuss the two composers’ treatment and systematic ordering of various genres: hymns, responds for the Office of the Dead, and large multi-part works, including Tallis’s *Suscipe quaeso* and the surprising medieval origin of its text. The entire book reveals an unusual collaboration between two artists whose musical training lay on either side of the major cultural and religious watershed of sixteenth-century Europe.

SCRIBAL INITIATIVES AND THE MAKING OF  
FIFTEENTH-CENTURY CHANSONNIERS

Jane Alden  
Wesleyan University

While the ambiguity of authorship in relation to text has been the subject of much recent scholarship, little attention has been paid to composite musical genres such as song collections. On account of their varied contents, chansonniers elude taxonomic classification. Part anthology (in the sense of pieces brought together according to a governing principle) and part miscellany (collections of separate texts), these books provide valuable evidence of the scribe's role in helping determine not only form and content but the ways in which chansonniers were read. A number of factors are involved in determining the contents of compilation manuscripts; these variables include specific requests from the patron, the availability of sources, and the extent of scribal involvement in the finished work. While little

documentation survives on the commissioning of song collections, the unusual situation of a scribal concordance found among three manuscripts copied in the third quarter of the fifteenth century (the “Dijon,” “Copenhagen,” and “Laborde” chansonniers) combined with evidence that at least two chansonniers were illuminated in the same artistic workshop offers a fruitful point of departure for an investigation of scribal practices.

This paper seeks to show ways in which the physical aspects of these manuscripts tell of their social, commercial, and intellectual organization at the moment of inscription. One of the demands miscellaneous collections make of those responsible for their organization is flexibility and the means to readjust the project to changed circumstances. Almost all of these manuscripts bear witness to an interruption of the original plan—the first leaf, which presumably indicated ownership, was removed from two of the manuscripts; gatherings were adjusted; and new repertory was added by later hands. The acquisition and positioning of pieces seems to oscillate between a pre-planned notion of the whole and a happenstance “grab-bag.”

The small format and elaborate decorative designs of these chansonniers suggest that the patrons valued them aesthetically as much as musically. But discernible patterns in the arrangement of repertory indicate that, at least for the scribe, musical content was still a priority. At some point in the process of collecting, copying, and making up manuscripts from fascicles, some attempts were made, even if only partial, to organize the repertory to facilitate certain kinds of musical reading. While the manner of organization varied (separation by genre, composer clusters, and specific works placed in prominent positions), the motivation appears to be the same for all these manuscripts—to honor the musical abilities of the patron. Irrespective of whether their owners were musically literate, it was their patronage that enabled the copying of chansonniers, and the munificence of their courts was reflected in the music contained. In addition to being facilitators and recipients, patrons shared with their scribes the role of author, in creating books that evoked a noble world in which they could imagine themselves.

## BOOKS IN PRINT

Kate van Orden

University of California, Berkeley

This paper examines the fortunes of chanson composers in print. The chanson was a commercial success—it accounts for seventy percent of the output of sixteenth-century Parisian presses—yet chanson prints brought composers relatively little renown. From the *Odhecatou* on, publishers typically threw chansons together in anthologies, leaving off attributions and favoring titles such as “Twenty-nine new songs” that advertised novelty and sheer quantity in a marketplace suddenly geared to mass consumption. Attaignant clearly conceived of the chanson anthology as a type of print that did not require names—his first seven collections contain no attributions at all. In short, the chanson was a publisher’s repertoire in which composers often lost control.

In this paper I argue that chanson composers did eventually assert their authority in print by adopting the same publishing strategies previously developed by lyric poets. Remarkable in this respect are seven single-composer prints from the 1570s, all setting the poetry of Pierre de Ronsard. From the start, Ronsard had conceived of his “scattered rhyme” in the form of books. Imitating Petrarch, he launched his career with sonnet cycles readymade for the press.

Such publications were quite new. For example, Ronsard's predecessor at court, the poet-lutenist Mellin de Saint-Gelais, "published" his poetry by singing it, a fact born out by the largely "unauthorized" sources of Saint-Gelais's verse—manuscripts compiled by courtiers, pirate prints, and musical settings by Jacques Arcadelt and others. Indeed, Saint-Gelais favored a style of *poésie pour musique* amenable to the freedoms of oral circulation; by contrast, composers rejected Ronsard's highly literate verse as too difficult for song, even after he became *poète du roi* in 1558.

Twenty years later, Ronsard's "bookish" sonnets suddenly appealed to Antoine de Bertrand, Guillaume Boni, Jean Maletty, and Philippe de Monte, an attraction explained by inspecting the original prints. These "songbooks" attempted to capture for music the authorial status that Ronsard had sought in Petrarch's *Canzoniere*. In unprecedented ways, they vest meaning in inaudible features—dedications, panegyrics, expansive formats, names upon names (the composer's, Ronsard's), portraits of the composer, and, in Bertrand's case, modal and poetic cycles designed to fill a thirty-two-folio part-book. These prints suggest that certain aspects of authorship—and authority itself—were available only as embodied on the page, as though even for musicians, authorial identity relied on the books that carried their names.

These are impressive prints. Yet we should not see in them the swift triumph of authors and their books over an accepting public, for the composers who adopted these materialistic strategies of self-presentation may have chosen to do so only because they were far from the court (in Toulouse, Lyons, abroad). The genre that ultimately succeeded was the light-hearted *air de cour*, which—unlike so many chansons printed between 1570 and 1600—aptly represented the music being performed in "le monde." With *airs* came a revival of manuscript chansonniers, printed staff paper, and lute-song arrangements that, I argue, witness the continuing sovereignty of oral and manuscript publication in the age of print.

### "A LITTLE TEAR, A LOOK, PERHAPS A KISS": THE ORAL-PERFORMATIVE WORLD OF *LE NUOVE MUSICHE*

Michael Markham

University of California, Berkeley

Scholarship on the music of the cinquecento has increasingly come to accept the extension of Nino Pirrotta's "unwritten" tradition across the entire century. Though obscured by the dominance of the polyphonic madrigal after 1530, the "performerly" music of courtly soloists continued to play a central role in the cultural life of the Italian nobility. From *cortegiane oneste* to semi-professionals like *La Pecorina* and Giulio Brancaccio, and leading right up to Caccini's *Le nuove musiche*, the "performerly" idea of style was not based on a set of compositional parameters but on what Caccini himself, on numerous occasions, called *la mia maniera di cantare*.

Caccini's music is one example of the consistent desire of the Italian patriciate to "retreat" from text-based literary culture into the exclusivity of oral-traditional performance. The work of a performer like Caccini was to re-embodiment the figure of the oral-traditional "singer of tales," an image bound intimately with the construction of noble identity. This dense and evocative subtext framed every event in which a solo performer held sway over courtiers. Taking account of this gestural sense of *maniera* has proven difficult due to the often-mentioned shortcomings of musical notation to capture it. When compared to the compositional techniques of the *seconda pratica* polyphonic madrigal, Caccini's songs have appeared either inadequate as affective text-setting or inaccessible to re-creation as performance transcription.

An interesting parallel to this uneasy relationship between composition and performance is found in the fragmentary *scenarii* published by the *commedia dell'arte* actor/improviser, Flaminio Scala. In the prologue to his *Il finto marito* (1618), Scala published a defense of performer prerogative, in the form of a dialogue between a *forestiero* and a *comico*, over the merits of composed vs. improvised comedy. The *forestiero's* complaints about improvisation are eerily similar to the criticisms leveled by most critics at Caccini's compositional style. Scala's defense of the performer, from which the title of my paper is taken, is that "Lovers are more moved and swayed by a little tear, a look, perhaps a kiss; and similar things from their loved one than they are by any great moral philosopher, exhorting them with well-structured writing, perfect conceits, fine locution, and exquisite words."

In the preface of his 1602 collection Caccini called his songs "studies in a manner of singing." Similarly, Scala referred to his *scenarii* as "exercises in the profession of acting." Further parallels can be traced in the structures of their published works. They are often characterized by a buildup of momentum followed by an evacuation of "compositional content," a pattern that forces the performer to do *something* while refusing to divulge exactly what. A comparison of Caccini's solo setting of "Sfogava con le stelle" to Monteverdi's polyphonic setting further demonstrates how Caccini's use of notation to enforce the performer's *maniera* differs from Monteverdi's use of composition as a means to interpret and amplify text.

## THE ANTHOLOGY AS CULTURAL ATLAS

Mary Paquette-Abt  
Wayne State University

This paper will argue that the anthology can serve as an atlas of musical culture by revealing vital contemporary information about a host of topics including musical taste, performance practice, composers' biographies, print distribution networks, and critical issues of the day. My argument is based on a case study of the eleven extant anthologies of a Roman repertory of motets, psalms, and secular songs published between 1614 and 1639 by the singer, composer, and *maestro di cappella* Fabio Costantini. Through these prints I will show how the anthology can be "read" to reveal information about three of the possible concerns for which they provide evidence: as an indicator of evolving musical taste; as a map of a typical musician's biography in relation to his patrons and colleagues in the profession; and as a commentary on performance practice.

Costantini's anthologies were meant to satisfy contemporary listeners' taste and were intended for a market which included the professional singer and sometimes itinerant director of music. His first and most widely disseminated volume of double-choir motets included many by composers of an earlier generation published here for the first time. He thus puts into broader circulation pieces by Palestrina and Marenzio, among others, which were apparently becoming increasingly popular. Subsequent motet volumes were more contemporary in composers and styles. Analysis of tables of contents in these motet volumes reveals the relative prestige of the composers included, juxtaposed with a rational layout of repertory according to performing forces, an intricate dance of due respect and practicality that yields some surprises. For example, in 1616 Frescobaldi was less desirable than other contemporaries all but unknown today. Meanwhile, the psalm collections attest to the continuing preeminence of Vespers as a public musical event well into the seventeenth century.

Central to a reading of the anthologies is Costantini's biography, details of which are present in his dedication texts. These are as varied in tone and content as the character and

personalities of his dedicatees. By studying them in their social as well as biographical context, they afford important insights into the changing forms of patronage in response to shifting economic and political conditions, which becomes starkly apparent particularly in the final three dedications of the 1630s.

Changing performing practices are evident in the 1630 collection of *concertato* psalms (a term used differently in this Roman repertory than in its Venetian or Milanese counterparts) which includes unprecedented performance guidance. Costantini's commentary, couched in his dedicatory language, reveals his attitude toward what he sees as an ill-prepared new generation of musicians. Nonetheless, he accommodates these deficiencies in his print by indicating improvised solo passages which had very likely gone without specification in Roman performances of his own generation.

Costantini's anthologies can thus serve as an indispensable nexus for understanding the musical culture of Rome in the eventful years of the early seventeenth century. I propose, too, that the musical anthology as publication type might well serve as key to cultural practices in other periods and settings.

## CONVENTION, GENDER, AND MEMORY IN THE MUSIC OF BRAHMS Mark Evan Bonds, University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, Chair

### *ALTE LIEBE*: JOHANNES BRAHMS, CLARA SCHUMANN, AND THE POETICS OF MUSICAL MEMORY

Paul Berry  
Yale University

On September 12, 1871, Johannes Brahms dated the autograph of an untitled work for solo piano and dedicated it to Clara Schumann; until the summer of 1878, when a revised version began to circulate among Brahms's friends before publication as the F-sharp minor *Capriccio*, op. 76 no. 1, only Clara seems to have known the work. On May 6, 1876, two years before the *Capriccio* first surfaced among his broader circle, Brahms set Carl Candidus's "Alte Liebe" to music for solo voice and piano; he immediately sent an autograph to the baritone Julius Stockhausen, along with instructions to sing it to Clara, whom he proclaimed the best person to hear it. Acknowledged from the first as one of Brahms's most important lieder, *Alte Liebe* (op. 72 no. 1) presents a powerful musical analogue for the emotional operations of nostalgia. The song's piano postlude simultaneously recalls and transforms its vocal incipit, modeling in tones the process by which the poetic speaker's memories pull him along paths long neglected but nevertheless familiar. Yet, as my paper shows, the postlude itself consists (particularly in its initial autograph version) of thematic, harmonic, and textural material borrowed directly from the F-sharp minor *Capriccio*.

I argue that *Alte Liebe* thus incorporates an allusion in the strongest sense: a deliberate reference to another work, specifically designed to be perceived as such by some intended audience. The concept of allusion remains a prominent interpretive tool for certain scholars of Brahms's music (Knapp, Korsyn, Parmer and Reynolds have recently applied it in varying manifestations) while others question the concept's implicit reliance on the composer's imputed intent, especially given Brahms's notorious reticence regarding his own compositional process. In the case of *Alte Liebe*, however, we can plausibly reconstruct Brahms's intentions

and the implications of his compositional choices using a virtually unprecedented array of surviving evidence: a single aurally salient and analytically defensible borrowing, a clearly defined audience (since, at least initially, only Clara was familiar with the *Capriccio*), two autograph manuscripts that differ significantly from their published versions, and suggestive letters and diary entries addressing the circumstances under which both works were first presented to their intended listener.

After proposing a detailed account of how Brahms adapted the *Capriccio* to its new context, I explore how the musical memories opened up by his piano postlude might have influenced Clara Schumann's understanding of the song. Besides shedding light on *Alte Liebe's* pre-publication pairing with *Unüberwindlich* (op. 72 no. 5), an imaginative reconstruction of Clara's perspective reveals the degree to which the apprehension of Brahms's works may have depended, within his circle, upon the physical sensations of performance. Most importantly, current music-analytic and historiographical methodologies often isolate Brahms's compositional workshop from his social existence; my paper reveals how closely the two were connected. *Alte Liebe's* borrowing from the F-sharp minor *Capriccio* seems meant for Clara's ears alone, but by exploring its potential impact on her interpretation of the song, we may recognize more clearly how music functioned among Brahms's intimate friends, for whom compositional decisions could become charged with the weight of memory.

#### MUSIC AS FIRST AND SECOND NATURE: THE *VIERTELJAHRSSCHRIFT FÜR MUSIKWISSENSCHAFT* AND BRAHMS'S "OCTAVES AND FIFTHS"

Margaret Notley  
University of North Texas

Georg Lukács offered the term "second nature" to refer to conventions that have come to seem natural. Some years later he made the related point that "whatever is held to be natural at any given stage of social development . . . [is] socially conditioned" and by calling nature itself "a societal category" seemed to cast doubt on the possibility of a first nature. Adorno recognized the relevance of "second nature" to common-practice tonality, so ingrained in habits of hearing as to seem grounded in nature. Both of Lukács's discussions, however, have unexplored pertinence to the natural explanations of music inspired by Hermann Helmholtz's theories that proliferated in the late nineteenth century. These explanations provide a context for the final phase of Brahms's work on the manuscript "Octaves and Fifths."

Brahms devoted his manuscript almost exclusively to instances of apparent parallel fifths that he had collected. In 1933 Schenker published a transcription with commentary that related passages chosen by Brahms to his own theory of structural levels. Paul Mast translated Schenker's monograph into English in 1980 and determined that Brahms had worked on the collection at least twice, in 1863 or 1864 and again in the 1890s. Finally, in 1992 Robert Laudon reconstructed one context for Brahms's interest in the topic: polemical disputes around 1860 concerning the continuing validity of the longstanding rule against parallel fifths.

Documents including letters and Brahms's copies of the *Vierteljahrsschrift für Musikwissenschaft* allow a closer understanding of his renewed work on the manuscript and illuminate the thirteen excerpts from villanelle by Marenzio. The latter aspect of the manuscript has received little attention because villanella fifths cannot easily be explained by ideas such as structural levels. Markings in Brahms's personal copies of books and journals show his interest in descriptions of the folk singing in fifths to which the villanella is usually connected, but the

natural explanation that Friedrich Chrysander offered in the *Vierteljahrsschrift* only amused him. Various kinds of evidence underscore Brahms's basic skepticism toward commentary such as Chrysander's that called upon the overtone series to explain musical practices or along related lines advocated just intonation.

Lukács's designation of nature as a societal category seems apt, given the contradictions associated with the natural theories of music prominent in the *Vierteljahrsschrift* and elsewhere. For example, when Helmholtz tried to elucidate the injunction against parallel fifths he assumed just intonation, even though tonality as it had evolved required tempered intervals and he himself recognized tonality as second nature, a product of culture. And while Helmholtz thus used the overtone series to explain the rule against parallel fifths in cultivated music, Chrysander invoked the same phenomenon to explain the "natural" singing in parallel fifths parodied in villanelle. Brahms had little use for natural theories. But the villanella seemed to allude to practices with a potential basis in first nature, confronting him with music of, in his own words, "foreign worlds" that defied the logic of other repertory excerpted in his collection more clearly a matter of second nature.

### GENDERED RECEPTION OF BRAHMS: MASCULINITY, NATIONALISM, AND MUSICAL POLITICS

Marcia J. Citron  
Rice University

While research on Brahms has blossomed recently, it is only beginning to crack the protective shield that has preserved the image of Brahms as an inscrutable figure. Daniel Beller-McKenna makes this observation in *Brahms and the German Spirit* with respect to nationalism and its meaning for the composer. Similarly, with a few exceptions (essays by Susan McClary and Robert Fink), matters of gender and sexuality have been absent from Brahms scholarship. This contrasts with the situation for other nineteenth-century composers, including Beethoven, Schubert, and Wagner.

This paper attempts to open the door wider by exploring gendered constructions applied to Brahms in his lifetime and shortly after. Gendered language in contemporary reviews and writings reveals that Brahms's music was considered "manly" by his advocates, especially Hanslick, and impotent or feminine by his detractors, including Hugo Wolf and Nietzsche. I will contextualize the gendered language and tease out its meanings for culture, nationalism, and musical politics of the late nineteenth century. The gendered rhetoric will also be discussed against the backdrop of gendered ideology of the period: in other composers and repertoires, and in music theory. Such contextualization helps us better understand Brahms's music and historical position, and adds a new perspective to the cultural work of Brahmsians such as Margaret Notley (on Viennese politics), Reinhold Brinkmann (on *fin-de-siècle* melancholy), and Beller-McKenna (on cultural nationalism and religion).

The first section of the paper presents gendered passages from reviews and other writings: Hanslick on the four symphonies and on two chamber works (opp. 99 and 100), Wolf on Symphony no. 4, and Nietzsche on Brahms in general. Interpretive discussion begins with the ties between manliness and German nationalism. Building on the work of Sanna Pederson and Beller-McKenna, I explore the interrelationship of *Bildung*, *Kultur*, symphony, and German identity, and the masculine coding of these elements. The crisis in the symphony after Beethoven and the feminization of certain composers play a role in the need to

masculinize German symphonists, as does the struggle over the successor to Beethoven. The debates around absolute music and the music of the future entail gendered coding. Wagner's gendered rhetoric on text and music, neatly summarized by Thomas Grey, may provide a rationale for Hanslick's association of the symphony with manliness. In music theory, contemporary accounts of masculine and feminine in sonata form demonstrate the discursive power of such metaphors—another reason why the gendered language applied to Brahms should be addressed. Finally, gendered description of Brahms extends into America, where James Huneker's praise shortly after the composer's death involves metaphors that will surface later in Ives.

A study of gendered reception shows Brahms's place in anthropomorphic music criticism of the nineteenth century. It also narrows the uncomfortable gap between Brahms as an un-touchable figure and the very human impact of his music.

VERLORENE JUGEND:

THE BACKWARDS GLANCE IN BRAHMS'S LATE CHORAL LIEDER

Daniel Beller-McKenna

University of New Hampshire

Commentators have long noted a sense of resignation and melancholy in Brahms's late music. Focusing on the four sets of piano pieces Brahms composed around 1892 (op. 116–119), various critics have discerned “romantic reminiscence,” and “dreamy nostalgia,” (Eduard Hanslick) or qualities of “reticence and regret, of melancholy and longing” (Robert Morgan). This view of the elder composer looking back on life presents a highly individualistic and personal account of nostalgia in Brahms. However, several vocal works from the preceding decade already set texts and exhibit musical characteristics that indicate a nostalgic bent in Brahms during his fifties, well before his impulse to look backwards with melancholy would have arisen naturally as a reaction to his own impending mortality. Instead, these express a modern cultural attitude towards history and the past as linear, rather than cyclical, and thereby as ever more distant from the present. Arriving a decade “early” as they do, these works stand at the border between a late romanticism and modernism, between the *Gründerzeit* and the *fin de siècle*.

Several of Brahms's choral lieder of the 1880s communicate this stance with great poignancy. The texts of Brahms's op. 93a, nos. 3, “O süßer Mai,” and 4, “Fahrwohl,” and op. 104 no. 4, “Verlorene Jugend” all dolefully address the linear nature of the past, either directly expressing regret for irretrievable youth or equating the passing of youth with the inevitable turn of the seasons. Significantly, Brahms develops in these pieces a corresponding musical vocabulary for reminiscence that informs the nostalgic tone of his late style. Brahms takes advantage of the choral medium to call into question the identity of the poetic protagonist by fracturing the choral “voice” through a variety of musical means (canon, suspension, etc.) to capture a sense of dislocation and resignation that characterized the onset of modernism in late nineteenth century Europe.

Central to these musical devices is the inherent linearity of tonal music. As music unfolds through time it bears the capacity to refer back subjectively to a musical object (a melody, harmonic progression, a motive, etc.) and potentially to sentimentalize and romanticize that object. In the three choral lieder considered here, Brahms taps into this musical potential to create a dialogue between the linear nature of western music and the sense of separation and

loss assigned to a linear view of history in their texts. As such, these works adumbrate the nostalgic tone of Brahms's last period a decade later and represent Brahms at the border between his mature romantic style and the melancholy of lateness.

## MUSIC AND POLITICS IN THE TWENTIETH CENTURY

David Schiff, Reed College, Chair

### FORGING "WEAPONS OF ART": VERDI, TOSCANINI, AND THE *INNO DELLE NAZIONI* ACROSS TWO CENTURIES

Roberta M. Marvin

University of Iowa

In 1862 Verdi accepted a government commission to write a work to represent the newly liberated Italy at the inaugural concert for the London International Exhibition. The result of his charge was the "Inno delle nazioni," a cantata setting of a patriotic text by Arrigo Boito. Labeled by one Victorian commentator as a work "rife with modern Italian patriotism and modern Italian inspiration," the work was clearly intended, as the iconography on the first edition's title page illustrates, as a political statement about the place of the new Italy in the Western European world.

"Inno delle nazioni" was, however, scandalously rejected by concert organizers in London; and, after only a few performances, primarily in England, France, and Italy, it quickly fell into oblivion. It would nonetheless become a politicized "voice" for Italy at another crucial juncture in Italian history, when it was revived by Arturo Toscanini toward the end of World War II. In 1943 and 1944 Toscanini musically and textually modified Verdi's cantata and performed it in concerts, on radio broadcasts, and on film, in tribute to the people of Italy and as official government propaganda for the peace and reparation efforts of the U.S. He thus created what contemporary commentators labeled a "weapon of art" with which to deal a "blow to despots and dictators."

My paper unpacks the history of this work across two centuries, as a politically charged, internationally significant musical emblem. Drawing on Verdi's letters; previously ignored publications from England and Italy related to the 1862 London Exhibition; memoranda, press releases, and censored radio scripts from the National Broadcasting Company; U.S. government records from the Office of War Information; unpublished correspondence from the Toscanini Archive; and nineteenth- and twentieth-century commentaries from English, French, American, and Italian printed media; I ferret out the messages carried by the work.

I first recount the full story—of both the London premiere of the work and Toscanini's revival of it—as revealed by the newly considered evidence. Against a backdrop of theories of resistance and nation-building, I assess the role of the "Inno" as a vehicle of political propaganda and nationalistic pride, addressing its resonances for various constituencies and its perceived communicative powers, as well as the iconic status of its two "creators," in two temporal and political contexts. The paper presents a case study of music as purposeful social commentary, which has implications for our understanding of intention, meaning, and interpretation in artistic creation.

PERFORMING A POLITICAL SHIFT:  
SPANISH AVANT-GARDE MUSIC IN THE 1960s

Enrique Sacau  
University of Oxford

Towards the end of the 1950s the Spanish ultra-conservative regime of Francisco Franco started actively promoting avant-garde music. This choice starkly contrasted with the backing of aesthetically conservative, anthem-like music on nationalist themes since the end of the Civil War (1936–1939). In the first part of this paper I present the results of primary research that supports and circumstantiates this statement, especially regarding the programming of the main publicly-funded ensembles, as well as the pattern of teaching appointments at the Madrid Conservatory. In the second part I examine the causes of this shift, arguing that they are connected to specific trends in Spanish politics, both national and international.

In terms of internal politics, the second phase of the Spanish dictatorship, from the late 1950s, was dominated by ministers who were trained as economists and developed successful financial policies. In order to distance themselves from previous cabinets, mostly controlled by ultra-nationalist fascist politicians, these new ministers claimed not to subscribe to a specific, well-defined ideology. Rather, they styled themselves as part of a “technocratic” regime. Thanks to its supposed “objectivity” and “purely musical,” ideology-free concerns, avant-garde music sat well with these technocrats’ rhetoric of Spain’s “objective,” ideology-free recent progress.

On an international level, the defeat of Mussolini and Hitler, Franco’s main allies, in the 1940s had resulted in isolation for Spain. In order to break this isolation, at the end of the 1950s the Spanish regime started making a sustained effort to establish diplomatic relations with other Western countries. These relations resulted in economic and military agreements with European democracies and the U.S.A. At the same time, Spanish cultural authorities began to promote programs of cultural exchange with these countries. These programs included music festivals and conferences to which avant-garde composers were invited—“*Bienal de Música Contemporánea*” and “*Festival de Música Española y Americana*” among others—and at which their music was played and discussed.

In the third part of this paper I consider in depth what is probably the most telling example of this shift in musical promotion, the so-called “*Concert of Peace*,” an event organized by the government in 1964 in order to commemorate the twenty-fifth anniversary of the dictatorship—a celebration known as the “*Twenty-five Years of Peace*.” The works commissioned for this concert sit squarely in the avant-garde camp. This aesthetic choice entailed an attempt to show the new face of Spain, both to the Spaniards themselves (the concert was broadcast on the only TV channel) and to the Western countries—their ambassadors to Madrid were invited to the concert. What is more, music critics supported this policy by emphasizing the “inherent modernity” and “political impartiality” of these works.

Finally, I briefly consider why recent Spanish musicology has failed to confront the political implications of the promotion of avant-garde music during the second phase of the dictatorship. I connect this historiographical void with the Spanish transition to democracy (1975–78), which recent historians have called an exercise in amnesia.

NAZI OPERAS? WERNER EGK'S *ZAUBERGEIGE* AND *PEER GYNT*

Joanna Biermann  
University of Alabama

Astonishingly, Werner Egk's second opera for the stage, *Peer Gynt*, first performed in Germany in 1938, made extensive use of musical elements (jazz, "lascivious" modern dances, etc.) from the 1920s which in other composers' works had been labeled "degenerate" by leading Nazis, making the position of those composers untenable and often forcing their emigration. *Peer Gynt* was indeed censured by some Nazi critics. Hitler and Goebbels, on the other hand, were enthusiastic about this young, relatively unknown composer. Goebbels wrote in his diary, "Egk is a very big, original talent. Goes his own, willful way. . . . But he knows how to make music! I am very enthusiastic and the Fuehrer, too." *Peer Gynt* was subsequently placed on official programs for Nazi party functions, effectively launching Egk's career. What was going on here? Was Hitler a closet jazz fan?

The very mixed reception of this work in Nazi Germany has attracted the attention of some later scholars (M. Walter, F. Schneider), who have collected documentation and done much to clarify the political machinations behind Hitler's attendance at the opera. This paper goes an important step further in closely investigating the music of *Peer Gynt*, but also in looking back at Egk's *Zauberigeige*, his first attempt at an opera after the Nazi takeover in 1933. Gingerly testing the waters at a time in which the new aesthetic criteria were anything but clear, Egk based the libretto of his "Volksoper" on a puppet play which itself was based on a Grimm fairy tale, "Der Jud' im Dorn" ("The Jew in the Thorn Bush"), a story full of gratuitous anti-Semitism. Interestingly, Egk actually mitigates the anti-Semitism to a large extent and fills his score with harmless-sounding Bavarian folklore. Egk's ambitious and musically more daring *Peer Gynt* is shown in the analysis to build upon the same dramatic structure. Both works create an analogous polarity of "Self" and "Other" through their musical styles. Both operas, which on the surface seem untouched by any Nazi agenda,—to the degree that a scholar of the period with the authority of Michael Kater simply has to throw up his hands at trying to decide on Egk's intentions—are shown through their music to subtly conform to and support the goals of the Nazi regime.

## SINGING AGAINST APARTHEID: ANC CULTURAL GROUPS AND THE INTERNATIONAL ANTI-APARTHEID STRUGGLE

Shirli Gilbert  
University of Michigan

This paper explores the ways in which music was used to garner international support for the struggle against apartheid in South Africa. From the mid-1970s exiled political groups, particularly the African National Congress (ANC), came increasingly to recognize the potential value of music in promoting the struggle abroad. In November 1974, a one-off performance laid the foundation for the Mayibuye Cultural Ensemble, a London-based grouping that was to achieve considerable success in Britain and Western Europe. Mayibuye was essentially an agitprop group whose performances consisted of an awareness-raising narrative about the evils of apartheid interwoven with dramatic poetry readings and rousing a cappella renditions of "freedom songs." These songs—perhaps more accurately described as short slogans set to simple melodies, sung communally by large crowds—were an integral feature of rallies, fune-

als, and other mass political gatherings inside South Africa. Mayibuye's members performed on a voluntary and part-time basis, but despite its rapidly shifting and amateur membership the group functioned successfully for almost six years. In the late 1970s, as increasing external pressure was forcing many of Mayibuye's performers into more direct political work, another ANC cultural grouping was in the budding stages of development. The Amandla Cultural Ensemble originated amongst ANC exiles based largely in military training camps in southern Africa, principally Angola. Led for much of its existence by well-known trombonist Jonas Gwangwa, Amandla became a popular ambassador for the ANC across Africa and as far afield as Latin America, Europe, Japan, and the Soviet Union. Unlike Mayibuye, it offered large-scale, increasingly professionalized performances incorporating choral singing, jazz, theatre, and dance. Its performances were intended not only to raise international awareness about apartheid, but also to present the ANC's alternative vision of a future, more inclusive South African culture.

Drawing on original archival material, this paper explores developing conceptions of the value of cultural work amongst South African political exiles in the 1970s and '80s, and the changing ways in which music was actively recruited to promote the anti-apartheid struggle internationally. The larger project of which this paper forms a part constitutes one of the first attempts at an extensive historical account of music's role in the struggle. On a local level, then, its importance lies in its focus on a significant yet under-represented music historical area. On a larger level, it addresses enduring questions about the relationship between music and political activism, and the issue—also the subject of frequent and fierce debate at the time—of whether music-centred activism ever achieves equal status with “real” political work.

## ORLANDO DI LASSO

David Crook, University of Wisconsin-Madison, Chair

### THE VOICE OF PROPHECY: LASSO'S SIBYLS AND ITALIAN HUMANISM

Marjorie Roth  
Nazareth College

More than a century after its modern debut, the extravagant chromaticism, unusual texts, and unconfirmed provenance of Orlando di Lasso's motet cycle *Prophetiae Sibyllarum* continue to fascinate as well as to frustrate the goals and methods of music scholarship. Decades of research have yielded only flashes of insight into discrete aspects of the work, tantalizing glimpses that nonetheless resist coming together in a satisfying vision of the piece as a musical/contextual whole. Important questions remain unanswered and unasked. Why, for example, is the chromaticism so pervasive, and is the usual explanation of tone-painting sufficient to address harmonic fluctuations that are not always word-generated? And although the single extant manuscript copy was produced by artisans at the Munich court of Albrecht V, that fact does not and cannot tell us where the cycle was first conceived and composed, or for whom. We also have yet to discover the inspiration behind the work, its intended performance context and—perhaps most important of all—what it meant to the composer, to his patron(s), and to the people who first heard it. In other words, we are still searching for the reasons a

composition with this particular constellation of idiosyncratic harmonic, textual, and stylistic features even exists.

Up to this point, methodological approaches to the *Prophetiae Sibyllarum* have been largely archival or analytical. In this paper I will offer the results of a new, topic-oriented approach. Taking sixteenth-century Italian humanism's understanding of the long and complex Sibylline tradition as my point of departure, I will discuss the cycle first as a meditation on the message and meaning of Sibylline prophecy, and second as an expression of that meaning in ways unique to music. When contextualized as an artwork created to imitate the essence of the Sibylline promise—that of salvation through transformation of the soul—Lasso's motets begin to resonate with other popular cultural themes linked closely with salvation, such as religious reform and alchemical experimentation. The incremental alterations of pitch by which Vicentino described the transformation ("tramutatio") of the mundane diatonic *genus* into the much loftier chromatic and enharmonic *genera* would have seemed, to an audience with specialized humanistic interests and training, strikingly parallel to the incremental perfections of metals in an alchemist's alembic, a physical process that served the Renaissance well as a metaphor for improvement in a variety of spiritual, political, and material contexts.

Viewed in this light, the *Prophetiae Sibyllarum* transcends its reputation as an inexplicable kink in the continuum of evolving musical style and compositional practice. I will show how its underlying theme of transformation suggests new possibilities in terms of patronage and contextual function, and has also inspired a new analytical approach to Lasso's chromaticism. Moreover, I will propose that a figure traditionally associated with the Sibyls, with salvation, and with alchemy was the implied—but thus far unidentified—speaker in the cycle's Prologue.

"PER MIA PARTICOLARE DEVOTIONE": ORLANDO DI LASSO'S  
*LAGRIME DI SAN PIETRO* AND JESUIT SPIRITUALITY IN COUNTER-  
REFORMATION MUNICH

Alexander Fisher

University of British Columbia

The spiritual madrigals of the *Lagrimae di San Pietro* (1594), the final work prepared for publication by Orlando di Lasso himself, occupy a special place in the composer's prodigious oeuvre. Lasso explained in his dedication to Pope Clement VIII that he composed these pieces "for my personal devotion in my burdensome old age [per mia particolare devotione, in questa mia hormai grave età]"; indeed, of all of his sacred music, the *Lagrimae* may be the least functionally-oriented. The poetic cycle had been composed no later than 1560 by Luigi Tansillo, who expressed his regret for the lascivious poetry of his youth by taking as his theme the remorse of St. Peter upon having thrice denied Christ (Matthew 26:69–75). Scoring twenty stanzas of this verse for the symbolically-laden number of seven voices, Lasso added a concluding motet in the contrasting mode *-g2-A*, *Vide homo, quae pro te patior*, in which the crucified Christ himself rebukes Peter, and indeed all mankind, for its ingratitude.

While an interpretation of the *Lagrimae* as a final gesture of penance by the aged composer is tempting, the cycle might best be understood as an examination of conscience not unlike that demanded by the the *Spiritual Exercises* of Ignatius of Loyola. Under Lasso's patron Wilhelm V (r. 1579–98) the Jesuits shaped the spiritual atmosphere of the ducal court and enjoyed increasing influence over a domestic and foreign policy oriented toward the Counter-

Reformation. Despite some disagreements with particular liturgical reforms promoted by the Jesuits, Lasso himself composed choruses for the Society's dramas, helped to train choirboys for the Munich Jesuits, and in his late compositions—Magnificats, litanies, and indeed the *Lagrime* itself—partook of a cultural atmosphere increasingly suffused with both external and interior manifestations of Catholic devotion. The *Lagrime*, indeed, is an expression of penance; but it is also an extended contemplation that resembles the meditations upon sin in the First Week of the *Exercises*. The opening stanzas chosen by Lasso present the external circumstances of Peter's denial, a move analogous to the "composition" of the object of meditation in one's imagination before beginning an exercise. This strong visual component is paralleled by the moment around which the *Lagrime's* narrative turns, the reproachful glance of Christ. Compelled by the shattering glance to meditate upon the nature of his sin, Peter resolves to reject it and the imperfections of the world, a move that resonates with the ultimate aim of the *Exercises*—to contemplate sin and decide with one's free will to reject it and embrace the mysteries of the Cross. The "colloquy," or dialogue, between sinner and Savior that concludes the meditation upon sin in the First Week of the *Exercises* finds its parallel in the final *Vide homo* motet, as Christ responds directly and reproachfully to Peter's contemplation. Throughout the cycle, Peter's interior dialogue seems reflected in the relative restraint and austerity of the musical settings, which balance syllabic declamation with inventive counterpoint and madrigalisms that are effective, yet discreet.

### PERFORMANCE AND/AS HISTORY

**Davitt Moroney, University of California, Berkeley, Chair**

### MUSIC FOR ALL SEASONS: THE ROLE OF THE BAND IN NINETEENTH-CENTURY NEW YORK CITY

John Graziano  
Graduate Center, CUNY

Throughout the nineteenth century, regimental bands served the public in a variety of modes. Their primary duty was to play at official functions of the regiment to which they were attached. But they also played summer concerts in various New York City parks and were available for hire for non-military functions, such as the many social balls and cotillions that took place between the beginning of year and the start of Lent, or in performances of operas where a band was required. Given the range of events in which they were heard, it is not surprising that their repertory was varied, consisting of marches, suites of dances, and arrangements of operatic potpourris.

In this presentation, I examine the many New York City bands that were active from the 1840s through the 1870s, documenting their venues and repertories, the changes in instrumentation—from brass band to mixed winds—that occurred after the Civil War, and the general place of bands in the cultural life of the city.

PERFORMING AUTONOMY: MODERNIST HISTORIOGRAPHIES AND  
THE CONCERTS OF NADIA BOULANGER

Jeanice Brooks  
University of Southampton

In a 1921 review of the *Concerts Colonne*, Nadia Boulanger deplored the lack of attention to program construction that she felt had marred the success of the series. She claimed that the selection of works with mutually complementary relationships was a crucial—if often overlooked—aspect of convincing performance; the best concerts would contain “audacious juxtapositions” to bring out the salient features of each piece through artful comparison. When her own conducting career took off in the following decade, Boulanger was in a position to practice what she had preached. For the next thirty years, her concerts regularly included a mix of very disparate music, ranging from anonymous medieval pieces to contemporary works. She explained, however, that the heterogeneity of the programs was more apparent than real. The seemingly very different pieces shared a single essence despite the diversity of their musical language, an essence that would become clear to the “deeper understanding” upon hearing the works. She located this essence not in style or in any functional or historical meanings, but in structural elements of rhythm and pitch as conveyed by musical texts. The consequence for her performance practice was a concentration on structure and a disregard for what she considered musical surfaces, whether of technique (e.g. vibrato) or style (e.g. ornamentation). Her insistence on juxtaposing music from very different periods within a single performing idiom forcefully drew the listener’s attention to the aspects of music that most interested her—principally elements of harmony and form—and projected a music-historical vision that abandoned conventional chronology and narrative in favor of bold collage.

Boulanger’s ideas about performance and concert construction were consistent with the vision of music history she articulated in her teaching. It relied heavily on the retroactive application of nineteenth-century work-concepts to early music, and on the hierarchical analytical tools employed in the early twentieth century to explicate the structure of musical works. This paper uses unpublished documents (material from Boulanger’s music history courses at the Ecole Normale de Musique from the 1930s; concert program collections; correspondence from the BBC Written Archive) to elucidate the relationships between Boulanger’s music history teaching and her idiosyncratic concert construction. I build on recent research on modernism and concepts of musical autonomy to analyze the ideological currents that underpinned Boulanger’s rationale for her concert planning and performance practice.

CREATING MADAME LANDOWSKA

Annegret Fauser  
University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill

Over the past seventy years, the myth of Wanda Landowska, high priestess of Bach and pioneer *extraordinaire* of the harpsichord, has become firmly enshrined in the history of the twentieth-century early-music revival. Her representation is typically characterized by hagiography, un-reflected adulation, and a pronounced discourse of exceptionality. My paper addresses the Landowska myths and shows their roots as laying in her negotiating the cultural context of Paris at the turn of the twentieth century, when she began her career as performer,

composer, and scholar. Indeed, rather than being “uncommonly visionary,” Landowska’s strategies matched in fact those of other women musicians in the French capital. Drawing on thus far barely used materials, including reviews of her early performances, I explore Landowska’s early career (1900–12) as a signal case-study of successful female career strategies in pre-war Paris.

Contrary to common belief, Landowska was not the only woman harpsichordist in early twentieth-century France: others include Juliette Toutain and Pauline Aubert. Nor was Louis Diémer the only male virtuoso on the instrument. I begin by exploring the instrument and its performers in *fin-de-siècle* Paris. Never entirely absent from French musical life, harpsichords re-emerged in the public eye during the 1889 *Exposition Universelle* where Marie Antoinette’s harpsichord fascinated visitors, Louis Diémer’s performances charmed listeners, and Pleyel’s new, nineteenth-century instruments were celebrated as improved music machines—useful in particular for the revival of the glorious past of French music and the enjoyment of society women. From 1889 onwards the discourse on the instrument was ambiguous, veering between antiquarian and nationalist fascination, and gendered mistrust. By the time Landowska began to concertize, the harpsichord had been re-introduced into the salon circuits and elite concerts of Paris for over a decade.

While her performances provided Landowska with some mark of distinction from the majority of pianists in Paris, her choice of repertoire was far more in line with that of most female pianists of the time. As Katharine Ellis has shown, Baroque music (Bach included) was a staple both in the Conservatoire education of fledgling women pianists and in their later concert performances. Landowska thus featured repertoire that had been perceived as suited for female pianists since the middle of the nineteenth century, turning it into her specialty in the way other pianists focused on composers such as Beethoven or Chopin. Finally, Landowska’s scholarship—which culminated in the publication of her 1909 book, *Musique ancienne* (co-authored with her husband)—was also inscribed in the horizon of French *fin-de-siècle* culture, in particular in the context of the Schola Cantorum where Landowska found an artistic home both musically and aesthetically. I conclude by investigating the creation of “Madame Landowska” out of these Parisian ingredients by the artist’s appropriating of discourses of exceptionality developed and rehearsed by both Parisian women creators and their detractors during the nineteenth century.

## CRACKING THE DUTCH EARLY MUSIC MOVEMENT: THE REPERCUSSIONS OF THE 1969 *NOTENKRAKERSACTIE*

Kailan Rubinoff  
University of Alberta

In the 1960s, Classical music seemed irrelevant to the Dutch baby boomers, who challenged its staid and elitist institutions: orchestras and conservatories. The *Notenkrakersactie* (“notecracker” action), which took place in Amsterdam on November 17, 1969, proved to be a landmark event. On this date, a group of young composers, including Louis Andriessen and Reinbert de Leeuw, disrupted a concert of the Royal Concertgebouworkest with noisemakers and distributed pamphlets protesting the orchestra’s lack of contemporary music programming. Although the demonstration was quickly suppressed, meetings were later arranged between protestors and orchestra administrators, and plans were made to create specialized ensembles and concert venues for composers.

Scholars have tended to interpret this protest as a watershed moment for the musical avant-garde. However, this paper will explore the *Notenkrakersactie*'s central irony, namely that historical performance, and not contemporary music, proved to be one of its main beneficiaries. Indeed, by the 1970s, the Netherlands had established its reputation as one of the most important centers for the study and performance of historical instruments. The Early Music movement, with its origins in amateur music-making, appealed to the anti-elitist sentiments of Dutch young people. Its prominent performers, like Frans Brüggen and Ton Koopman, were involved in political demonstrations, and they attracted attention for performing in casual clothing or in unusual venues.

As the Welfare state grew in the 1970s, so too did the state conservatories, and enrollment in music programs swelled. Offerings were diversified beyond mainstream Classical training to include *schoolmuziek*, non-western musics, jazz and historical performance. Under the directorship of former *Notenkraker* Jan van Vlijmen, the Royal Conservatory in The Hague established internationally renowned programs in both contemporary and Early Music.

Early Musicians also benefited from a reformation of the federal arts subsidy system catalyzed by the *Notenkrakers* protest. As the Dutch arts council sought to free up funding for new initiatives, the sixteen state-funded symphony orchestras became a prime target. In 1966, these orchestras accounted for as much as eighty-one percent of federal spending on music programming, but by 2004, they numbered only ten, and their share of the music budget was halved. Funds diverted from the symphonies were invested in Early Music ensembles, particularly the period-instrument orchestras. In the 1980s climate of Welfare retrenchment, Early Music groups could prove greater economic efficiency than traditional orchestras by operating on a freelance basis, and by obtaining most of their budget from ticket revenues rather than subsidy.

Thirty-five years after the *Notenkrakersactie*, the national symphony orchestras have much less influence on Dutch musical life, and their programming remains stagnant. The current musical scene is highly compartmentalized: a diminishing number of symphonies program canonic nineteenth-century repertoire, while dedicated ensembles perform new or Early Music. Facing the loss of government subsidy, the symphonies are increasingly operating like period-instrument orchestras, exchanging salaries and full-time seasons for contract-based work and less job security. While this may be more economical, and may allow more opportunities for alternative musics to be heard, the specialized ensembles have been critiqued for not attracting broader audiences.

## POPULAR MUSIC

Mitchell Morris, University of California, Los Angeles, Chair

### HOLLYWOOD "LIEBESTOD": MUSIC AND MASCULINITY IN JEAN NEGULESCO'S *HUMORESQUE*

Stephan Prock  
University of Virginia

During the 1940s Hollywood produced a number of films in which musical performance, especially of classical music, figured as an integral element of the plot itself. One of the most important and widely hailed of these films was Jean Negulesco's *Humoresque* (1946) starring

Joan Crawford as Helen Wright and John Garfield as the aspiring concert violinist Paul Boray. At first glance, Boray's performances of classical music (including the eponymous Dvořák trifle) seem entirely conventional and melodramatic in the most literal sense of the word—a means for underscoring, commenting on, and inflating particular elements of the film's basic narrative of desire and death. Indeed, all of Helen's and Paul's most charged emotional moments are intersected by one of Paul's performances of a classical warhorse: Paul's rendition of "The Flight of the Bumblebee" to silence the mocking and overbearing Helen during their first meeting at her cocktail party; his public performance of Lalo's "Rhapsodie espagnole" during which Helen, in her private box, achieves an almost sexual ecstasy; Wagner's "Liebestod" from *Tristan und Isolde* to accompany the breakdown and eventual suicide of Helen.

From another perspective, however, these performances and others in the film (including Paul's rehearsal of the "Carmen Fantasie," which Helen attends) can be understood as something more than simply accompaniments to emotionally charged moments. Following the trajectory of Paul's career across the film, I will examine how these performances interact with visual, narrative and dramatic elements to become musical metaphors for the playing out of the crisis of masculinity in postwar America and its resolution. As such the film provides important insights into attitudes regarding gender and performance in America at mid-century; in particular the problem of classical musical performance as inherently feminizing. The film begins by overtly feminizing Paul's desire to play the violin (rather than, for example, baseball) and continues by making him subject to Helen's economic and sexual power. As the film progresses, however, it gradually redefines Paul's performances as authentically masculine, first by excluding Helen from them and then by situating them authoritatively within the properly reconstituted and legitimized femininity of his mother and girlfriend.

The film employs at least three different strategies to effect this transition, which I will explore in detail. One of these strategies involves consistently aligning Paul with the creative authority of the composer (most specifically, Beethoven) rather than exclusively with the "re-creative" role of the performer. Another strategy involves asserting Paul's musical authority over the film's women in various ways both diegetically and nondiegetically. Finally, the film subtly rewrites the original texts and contexts of specific European classics (even while exploiting their extra-musical associations for dramatic and emotional impact) in order to redress the gender imbalances inscribed within its narrative. Most crucially, the film uses Paul's performance of "his own transcription" of the "Prelude and Liebestod" to rewrite Wagner's narrative of tragic love. In this last performance, all these strategies finally combine to upend the Liebestod entirely, literally drowning female subjectivity in an epiphany of masculine transcendence over feminine desire.

## TAKING IT EASY: COUNTRY ROCK AND SOUTHERN ASCENDANCY IN THE 1970s

Olivia Carter Mather

University of California, Los Angeles

This paper is a study of one of the most commercially successful genres of American popular music, "country rock," a style that has received virtually no serious scholarly attention. My study identifies stylistic traits of country music in country rock while addressing cultural context. The genre features rock music with country-styled vocals and the addition of country instruments (usually the fiddle, pedal steel guitar, or banjo), and includes musicians such

as Bob Dylan, the Byrds, and Linda Ronstadt. By the mid-seventies, it was one of the most popular styles in music and by the end of the decade, country rock's supergroup, the Eagles, dominated the charts, eventually becoming the third best-selling group of all time (behind the Beatles and Led Zeppelin).

The paper follows the theme of "place" in country rock as it relates to the relationship between the South (as represented by country music) and "mainstream" America (as represented by supposedly more national styles such as rock and pop). Country rock musicians' attention to mainstream country caused many to assume that they were politically conservative, but I argue that these musicians worked to negotiate tensions within the rock community around the American South and its place in political history, music history, and the counterculture. By pointing to the music of the left's enemy—working-class whites, represented by mainstream country music—country rock musicians reclaimed not just Southern music, but specifically the music of what some Americans thought to be the most regressive elements of American culture. The style reached its height during the economic rise of the South and the "Sunbelt" in the early seventies, what historian Bruce Schulman calls the "ascendancy of the South." This new validation increased the wider cultural capital of the region, resulting in "country chic" fashion as well as Southern-themed television shows, movies, and advertising. The media and entertainment industries constructed an "easy-going past" such that many Americans came to identify the South with a laid-back lifestyle. Applying the work of Schulman, I maintain that as Southern culture was appropriated nationally, similar shifts occurred in the sphere of country rock; it moved from regional concerns to more personal ones in the seventies.

To illustrate my larger arguments, I discuss two songs by the Eagles, "Take it Easy" and "Peaceful Easy Feeling," concentrating on instrumentation, arrangement, harmony, and vocal style showing how their music was grounded in specific musical conventions as well as the social context of the time. My analysis shows that their success was due to their particular blend of generic musical traits, but also to the relevance of their work in the "working-class chic" of the entertainment industry and cultural "ascendancy of the South" during the seventies. As one of the most popular rock bands since the early seventies, the Eagles' success matters greatly for the entire history of rock, and their widespread acceptance demonstrates how hybrid genres function to make musical meaning out of particular environments.

#### LIP-SYNC IN "LIPSTICK": 1950s POPULAR SONGS RE/PRESENTED IN A TELEVISION SERIES BY DENNIS POTTER

Joshua Walden  
Columbia University

Popular music frequently features in film and television, played in the background as nondiegetic underscoring or emanating from a diegetic source, usually functioning to evoke time and place and to underscore the action. In contrast, in the 1993 television production "Lipstick on Your Collar," set in 1956, screenwriter Dennis Potter foregrounds popular 1950s rock-and-roll hit songs, creating what he has called a "home-made musical." Characters break out in song—but instead of singing, they move their mouths in synchrony with the voices of pop idols. This lip-syncing achieves an effect not usually found in movies and television: the music does evoke mood and setting, but in addition, songs in "Lipstick on Your Collar" are given fresh meaning in their new context, as they become spontaneous expressions of the characters' psychologies.

Because of the viewer's tendency to anchor audio to visual effects in film, and the close synchronization of sound and image as Potter's characters lip-sync, the spectator perceives the union of subject and voice. The viewer knows that the voice is clearly that of a famous rock star and the character is merely lip-syncing, but paradoxically, the result in this case is that the simple emotions expressed in the music become authentic expressions of character. Histories of ventriloquism and folk metaphysics have described the common understanding that ventriloquism involves two voices, the guarded everyday "head-voice" and the authentic, truthful "body-voice," conveying the outward expression of the interior soul. It is the latter, unfiltered mode of expression that the ventriloquist "throws," to be embodied by the straight-talking puppet on his knee. In song numbers in "Lipstick on Your Collar," Potter's characters become like ventriloquist puppets, embodying thrown (over-dubbed) voices that come to be recognized as unguarded expressions of the characters' reality.

After decades of play on radio and film, the songs Potter uses have become nostalgic, even hackneyed artifacts. Here, however, lip-syncing revitalizes these artifacts, lending their clichéd lyrics new, potent meaning in a novel kind of opera. In opera, as Peter Kivy has shown, the musical medium through which one hears song is considered "opaque." As the medium of the message thus becomes evident, the characters appear to be composers of the words they utter. Similarly, when they embody the voices of Elvis, Carl Perkins, and Mickey and Sylvia, Potter's lip-syncing protagonists effectively recompose the songs, which become personalized expressions of the yearnings of a rebellious young generation. In this way, the use of popular music in "Lipstick on Your Collar" clearly illustrates its vital role in the construction of individual and group identities: in the most explosive emotional moments, ordinary characters embody banal songs in profound utterances of feeling. Potter demonstrates that new musical meaning can be derived discursively in conversations between characters and in interactions between aural and visual media.

## NARRATIVE THEORY AS AN ANALYTICAL TOOL IN THE STUDY OF POPULAR MUSIC TEXTS

David Nicholls  
University of Southampton

Narrative theory and popular music are not the most obvious of bedfellows, given that the former lends itself primarily to the elaboration (or analysis) of extended narrative structures, while the latter tends to manifest itself in three- to four-minute songs describing essentially static cameos, vignettes, or states of mind. Among a myriad of examples of non-narrative hit singles from Britain, one could cite The Beatles' "I Want to Hold Your Hand" (1963) or Frankie Goes to Hollywood's "Relax" (1984). Indeed, it is noteworthy that narrativity (as either a term, a concept, or an analytical approach) is rarely—if at all—mentioned in three of the most influential monographs dealing with the study of popular music: Richard Middleton's *Studying Popular Music* (1990), Allan F. Moore's *Rock, the Primary Text* (1993/2002), and David Brackett's *Interpreting Popular Music* (1995/2000).

That popular music texts, including hit singles, may nevertheless contain elements of narration is hardly in doubt, however, as is shown by such songs as The Beatles' "Norwegian Wood" (1968), Kate Bush's "Wuthering Heights" (1978), or The Buggles' "Video Killed the Radio Star" (1979). But narrative structures, and the useful application of narrative theory, truly

come into their own at the point where albums begin to function as significant units of music organization. Referring primarily to Genesis' *The Lamb Lies Down on Broadway* (1974) and The Who's *Quadrophenia* (1973), this paper explores the ways in which music, lyrics, prose, art work, and other elements can be used to create and describe both single and multiple narratives from a series of individual tracks.

## TROUBADOUR AND TROUVÈRE CHANSONS

Virginia Newes, Newton, Mass., Chair

### WRITING, REINVENTION AND THE THIRTEENTH-CENTURY CHANSONNIER PROJECT

Christina Linklater

Harvard University

The chansonnier project was a massive endeavour which saw the swift and unprecedented creation of dozens of anthologies of troubadour and trouvère song. It was also a mysterious achievement: with a single exception, all of the project's effects are temporally removed from the troubadours and trouvères, who flourished much earlier than did this chansonnier culture.

That exception is the anthology now called the Chansonnier Saint-Germain-des-Prés. Thanks to the recent archival findings of Robert Lug, its original layer is now recognized as the oldest surviving chansonnier by far, copied in 1231; by contrast, the next oldest chansonniers were likely created in the 1260s. The very early date of its copying is hardly this manuscript's only unique feature, however. Its principal music scribe used Lotharingian neumes, rendering this the only known example of a chansonnier borrowing a notation more commonly associated with the chant. It is a relatively small volume, with none of the miniatures or gold leaf which quickly became standard features of troubadour and trouvère collections. The 329 songs it contains are not organized according to any immediately-discernible organizational system, while the songs of the other chansonniers were sorted alphabetically, or by author, or both, prior to copying.

This paper contends that the Chansonnier Saint-Germain-des-Prés is of great historical value precisely because of its unusual appearance. Arguing against the common perception of it as a "small, muddled book" with a "mundane nature," I show that this source is precious for being the only chansonnier created out of an early concern for preservation rather than for the later cause of presentation. Illustrating this point are five anonymous songs which appear as a group in the Chansonnier Saint-Germain-des-Prés and in several other manuscripts, as well as in printed books. From the transformation of the texts, melodies and mise-en-page of this corpus, a picture emerges of a transition from oral to written which required changes sometimes subtle but more often aggressive.

Anna Maria Busse Berger proposed, nearly a decade ago, that a medieval scribe might have copied music from an exemplar or remembered it from a performance, yet could also have exercised some agency, drawing on "his ideas as to how he could improve the piece." My paper follows the trajectory of these five songs from their first manuscript appearance in 1231, to their reworking in later medieval chansonniers, drawing attention to the reinvention which

the writing of this music, it seems, necessarily entails. The only songbook copied while a few troubadours and nearly all of the trouvères were still active, the Chansonnier Saint-Germain-des-Prés has heretofore-unrecognized meaning and worth when placed at the very beginning of such a trajectory: this is the closest we will ever come to the living tradition of medieval song.

## DELINQUENT DESCORTS

Judith Peraino  
Cornell University

The descort is a non-strophic medieval lyric genre that survives in both Old French and Occitan, and expresses the idea of “discord” in form, theme, language, and melody. Most discussions of descorts either concentrate on one language or the other, or focus on the descort’s relationship to the lai, since both show a tendency toward parallel versicle constructions. Less attention has been paid to how descorts function as a force of discord and disruption in the challenge they present across languages, to interpreters of the genre such as composers, scribes, and performers.

The manuscript Paris, Bibliothèque nationale, f. fr. 844 (troubadour W; trouvère M) contains the largest single collection of notated descorts (numbering 12), representing both Old French (8) and Occitan (4) composition, as well as several chronological layers of scribal and musical activity. My paper examines the dynamic history of the descort in this one manuscript. Codicological evidence suggests that the anonymous composers and/or scribes of the later Occitan descorts responded to the earlier French descorts. Musical and paleographical evidence further suggests that the influence of the descort, its non-strophic structure and its principle of discord and disruption, can be seen in the chansons and lais added to the manuscript at some point after the Occitan descorts. Finally, based on close work with a singer in the process of recording these previously unrecorded pieces, I discuss the challenges of interpreting the long and unwieldy melodies of the various layers and languages of these descorts in performance. I connect the difficulties of performing descorts to the disruption of genre that the descorts perform in the manuscript.

## *Index of Participants*

- Adamenko, Victoria 143  
Adams, Byron 48  
Adlington, Robert 145  
Ahlquist, Karen 55, 96  
Ake, David 122  
Albright, Daniel 115  
Alden, Jane 149  
Allanbrook, Wye J. 98  
Allen, Aaron S. 147  
Allsop, Peter 121  
Alms, Anthony 41  
Amati-Camperi, Alexandra 88  
Aracena, Beth 35  
Atlas, Allan 74
- Banfield, Stephen 74  
Beal, Amy 145  
Beckerman, Michael 49, 104  
Beller-McKenna, Daniel 156  
Bernstein, Lawrence 70  
Berry, Paul 153  
Betz, Marianne 96  
Biermann, Joanna 159  
Black, Brian 31  
Black, David 98  
Bloxam, M. Jennifer 127  
Bomberger, E. Douglas 96  
Bonds, Mark Evan 153  
Bowen, José 106  
Boyce, James 54  
Boynton, Susan 33  
Brodbeck, David 108  
Brooks, Jeanice 163  
Brothers, Thomas 105  
Brown, Bruce Alan 85  
Broyles, Michael 133  
Bryan, Karen 124
- Caicedo, Patricia 121
- Calcagno, Mauro 41  
Campana, Alessandra 117  
Candelaria, Lorenzo 126  
Carr, Maureen 92  
Citron, Marcia J. 155  
Clark, Suzannah 38  
Clemmens, Sarah 32  
Cole, Catherine 64, 147  
Cole, Suzanne 71  
Coward, Georgia 62  
Cowgill, Rachel 73  
Crist, Elizabeth Bergman 44  
Cronin, Charles 146  
Crook, David 160  
Cross, Jonathan 46  
Cumming, Julie 40  
Cummins, Linda 77
- Dacey-Tsuei, Katherine 125  
DeLapp, Jennifer 145  
Denny, Thomas 99  
DeVeaux, Scott 105  
Doctor, Jenny 48
- Ellis, Katharine 81  
Esse, Melina 117  
Eubanks Winkler, Amanda 59  
Everist, Mark 72  
Eyerly, Sarah 34
- Fader, Don 63  
Fairtile, Linda 58  
Fallon, Robert 147  
Fauser, Annegret 163  
Feldman, Martha 148  
Ferencz, George 75  
Fillion, Michelle 129  
Fisher, Alexander 161

- Fisk, Charles 115  
 Florea, Luminita 79  
 Fosler-Lussier, Danielle 145  
 Frolova-Walker, Marina 142  
  
 Gallo, Denise 136  
 Garrett, Charles 106  
 Gassull, Eugenia 121  
 Giger, Andreas 139  
 Gilbert, Shirli 159  
 Givan, Ben 122  
 Glahn, Denise Von 93  
 Goehring, Edmund 98  
 Gomes da Cruz, Gabriela 117  
 Gooley, Dana 123  
 Gossett, Philip 138  
 Graziano, John 96, 162  
  
 Haggh, Barbara 52  
 Haines, John 80  
 Haldey, Olga 140  
 Hall, Patricia 91  
 Haney, Joel 103  
 Hansell, Kathleen 146  
 Harris, Paul 94  
 Heckert, Deborah 48  
 Helyard, Erin 66  
 Henson, Karen 117  
 Herlinger, Jan 77  
 Hinton, Stephen 101  
 Holbrook, Amy 30  
 Holford-Stevens, Leofranc 128  
 Howland, John 107  
 Hubbert, Julie 109  
 Huebner, Steven 116  
 Hupchick, Joseph 113  
 Hyer, Brian 119  
  
 Izzo, Francesco 74  
  
 Johnson, Anne 78  
 Joncus, Berta 86  
  
 Jurkowski, Edward 46  
  
 Karnes, Kevin 49  
 Keathley, Elizabeth 83  
 Kelly, Thomas Forrest 51  
 Kinderman, William 118  
 Kirkman, Andrew 114  
 Kolb, Roberto 97  
 Korstvedt, Benjamin 132  
 Kruckenberg, Lori 51  
 Kuykendail, James Brooks 48  
  
 Lamb, Earnest 96  
 Lang, Zoë 134  
 Langley, Leanne 48  
 Lerner, Neil 147  
 Leve, James 76  
 Lindgren, Lowell 84  
 Lindorff, Joyce 121  
 Link, Nathan 84  
 Linklater, Christina 169  
 Locke, Ralph 133  
 Lütteken, Laurenz 126  
  
 Macdonald, Hugh 81  
 Magee, Jeffrey 74  
 Mandel, Alan 29  
 Markham, Michael 151  
 Markovic-Stokes, Katarina 49, 111  
 Marston, Nicholas 66  
 Marvin, Roberta M. 157  
 Mather, Olivia Carter 166  
 Mathew, Nicholas 131  
 McCarthy, Kerry 149  
 McClatchie, Stephen 110  
 McGuire, Charles Edward 48  
 Mercer-Taylor, Peter 36  
 Meyer, Stephen 118  
 Miranda, Ricardo 97  
 Morris, Mitchell 165  
  
 Nardini, Luisa 53

- Newes, Virginia 169  
 Nicholls, David 168  
 Norris, Renee Lapp 55  
 Nosow, Robert 112  
 Notley, Margaret 154  
 November, Nancy 130  
  
 O'Connell, Julia Grella 74  
 Oates, Jennifer 48, 135  
 Obert, Simon 68  
 Owens, Jessie Ann 70  
  
 Paquette-Abt, Mary 152  
 Pasler, Jann 82  
 Paul, David C. 102  
 Peraino, Judith 170  
 Peters, Karen 49  
 Peters, Mark 87  
 Planchart, Alejandro E. 112  
 Pollack, Howard 76  
 Polzonetti, Pierpaolo 43  
 Poriss, Hilary 136  
 Preston, Katherine K. 57  
 Prock, Stephan 165  
 Proksch, Bryan 31  
  
 Richards, Annette 60  
 Robertson, Anne Walters 114  
 Roth, Marjorie 160  
 Rubinoff, Kailan 164  
 Rule, Marie Rivers 69  
  
 Saavedra, Leonora 97  
 Sacau, Enrique 158  
 Saltzstein, Jennifer 39  
 Sawkins, Lionel 146  
 Saylor, Eric 48  
 Schiff, David 157  
 Schiller, David 37  
 Schleuse, Paul 89  
 Schmelz, Peter 145  
 Schulze, Hendrik 41  
  
 Selfridge-Field, Eleanor 146  
 Senici, Emanuele 137  
 Shapovalov, Dimitri 141  
 Sholl, Robert 101  
 Shultis, Christopher 44  
 Silbiger, Alexander 146  
 Slim, H. Colin 59  
 Smith, Catherine Parsons 56  
 Smith, Jeremy 88  
 Solvik, Morten 110  
 Stein, Beverly 90  
 Stein, Louise 42  
 Steinberg, Michael P. 108  
 Stevens, Blake 90  
 Stone, Anne 37  
 Sutcliffe, Dean 129  
  
 Taruskin, Richard 140  
 Tello, Aurelio 97  
 Thomas, Downing 66  
 Thomas, Susan 49  
 Toliver, Brooks 147  
 Treitler, Leo 33  
 Tremblay, Jean-Benoit 144  
 Trippett, David 67  
 Tyre, Jess 81  
  
 van Orden, Kate 150  
 van Rij, Inge 61  
 Vilar-Paya, Maria-Luisa 91  
 Von Glahn, Denise 147  
  
 Waeber, Jacqueline 65  
 Walden, Joshua 167  
 Wallace, Katherine 59  
 Waterman, Ellen 147  
 Watkins, Holly 147  
 Webster, James 30  
 Wegman, Rob C. 126  
 Whiting, Steven 45  
 Will, Richard 100  
 Wilson, Alexandra 133  
 Wilson, Nancy 121