



NAGC Blue Pencil and Gold Screen Awards

Judging Criteria and Scoring Method

Rating Scale

- 1 - Did not provide
- 2 - Poor
- 3 - Average
- 4 - Good
- 5 - Excellent

Judging Criteria

Submissions are evaluated on the following seven criteria:

- **Specific Goal, Purpose or Objective:** The goal of the project, and what the applicant intended to accomplish, is clearly defined. Qualitative and/or quantitative information about the situation, context or environment is provided—for example, research, audience opinion or the definition of a problem.
- **Clear Intended Audience:** The specific target audience of the project is defined, and relevant demographic information is provided.
- **Planning & Implementation:** Planning and execution of the project is explained. Implementation may include planning, tactics, medium used, distribution method and people involved. (This information may constitute a communications or promotional plan, and the applicant can upload an additional, separate communications plan if available.)
- **Detailed Budget:** Direct and indirect costs are listed—for example, printing, mailing, licensed graphics, video production and contracted costs. Figures must include staff hours (approximate wages based on time spent). Revenue offsets may be listed, if applicable. The budget shows fiscal responsibility or cost-effectiveness.
- **Outcomes/Effectiveness/ROI:** The result of the entry is clearly stated, including how the communication was received and/or acted upon and whether the outcome was expected. The outcome is aligned with the project's purpose. Relevant examples of audience engagement, testimonials, anecdotal evidence or other data/analytics should be included.
- **Quality of Content:** Quality includes all primary elements of an entry. Depending on the project, elements could include, for example: sound clarity, video pacing, graphics/images/photographs that convey intended messaging, light/composition/color, design, appropriateness for audience, grammar, spelling, punctuation and a writing style that is clear, concise and jargon-free.
- **Creativity:** Creativity may include use of resources (budget, graphics, photography and other elements) and the overall creativity of the entry.
- **“Wow” Factor:** These special factors are any qualities or features that make the project particularly impressive or exceptional. Applicants may highlight any standout elements of the submission.

Evaluation Questions and Scoring Method

A perfect score totals 100 points.

Criteria	Judging Questions	Point Range	Weight
Specific Goal, Purpose or Objective	The entry clearly defines what the project intended to accomplish or resolve.	1-5	2
	Qualitative and/or quantitative information provides understandable context about the situational environment in which the project was undertaken. Information may include, for example, prior research, audience opinion or the definition of a problem.	1-5	1
Clear Intended Audience	The entry defines or describes the specific target audience.	1-5	2
	Audience demographics are included, clear and relevant.	1-5	1
Planning & Implementation	There is a clear communications or promotional plan. (The plan may be described in the applicant's form field response and/or in a separate written communications plan uploaded at the end of the application form.)	1-5	2
	Rate the quality of the project implementation.	1-5	1
Detailed Budget	Comprehensive budget information includes direct and indirect costs. The budget shows fiscal responsibility and cost-effectiveness.	1-5	1
Outcomes/ Effectiveness/ROI	The outcome, effectiveness or return on investment is clearly stated and aligns with the intended purpose.	1-5	2
	The entry includes documentation of outcomes—for example, audience engagement, testimonials, anecdotal evidence or other data/analytics.	1-5	1
Quality of Content	Language, design, visual content, sound production or other content type is appropriate for the target audience.	1-5	2
	Evaluate the quality of the primary content. Depending on the project, elements could include, for example: sound clarity, video pacing, graphics/images/photographs that convey intended messaging, light/composition/color, design, grammar, spelling, punctuation and a writing style that is clear, concise and jargon-free.	1-5	1

Creativity	The project elements convey an overall artistic impression.	1-5	2
	The entry makes creative use of resources, budget, graphics, planning, implementation or any other elements.	1-5	1
Wow Factor	Standout qualities or features give the entry a “wow” factor that makes it particularly impressive.	1-5	1
Judge Comments	Please provide three constructive comments that will be shared with the entrants. For example, you could mention elements of the submission that are particularly successful and make suggestions for improving future applications.	N/A	N/A