A new generation of labor priests

By BRIAN ROEWE

On July 23, housekeepers and other workers at Hyatt Hotels began a global boycott of the hotel chain. Citing unjust hiring practices, unfair wages and unsafe working conditions, the workers have marched, picketed and petitioned organizers and travelers to join them. At many of these demonstrations, standing by the workers’ sides were Catholic priests.

In Washington, it was Fr. Clete Kiley, director of immigration policy at UNITE HERE, the union representing Hyatt workers. In Baltimore, it was Fr. Ty Hullinger and Fr. Patrick Besel.

The priests aligned with the Hyatt workers and other industry workers represent a new generation of labor priests — pastors who preach not only for a just working environment for their parishioners, but stand beside them in their struggle.

“I cannot be preaching about God if I am not helping my brothers and sisters, and be in solidarity with them,” said Fr. Ernesto Jaramillo, pastor of Our Lady of Grace Church in Encino, Calif., and one of the labor priests who attended a May meeting in Chicago.

Continued on Page 10

Bishops quietly adopt protocols for investigations

By JOSHUA J. McELWEE

The U.S. bishops’ committee tasked with enforcing church doctrine adopted new procedures for investigating theologians a year ago, apparently unbeknownst to the theologians whose teachings and writings would be subject to the protocols.

The procedures, dated Aug. 19, 2011, would have been formulated and approved at a time when the U.S. Conference of Catholic Bishops and its Committee on Doctrine were being questioned about their treatment of St. Joseph Sr. Elizabeth Johnson, a theologian whose work the committee sharply criticized in March 2011.

The two primary U.S. theological membership societies faulted the bishops for not following in the Johnson case a set of procedures promulgated in 1989 for dealing with doctrinal questions. Those procedures were the result of deliberations between a group of bishops and theologians, and were repeated on Page 8

A papal high-wire act in Lebanon

By JOHN L. ALLEN JR.

In what may be among the most challenging voyages of his papacy, Benedict XVI is scheduled to visit Lebanon Sept. 14-16, against the backdrop of a bloody insurrection in neighboring Syria and deep tensions in Muslim/Christian relations in various parts of the world.

Vatican officials have repeatedly said that security concerns will not derail the trip, but even if the pope can be kept safe, nobody’s disputing that it will be both a diplomatic and an interfaith high-wire act.

Assuming it goes ahead, the trip will mark Benedict’s first visit to the Middle East since the Arab Spring, and his fourth overall to the region

Continued on Page 13
The protocols state that while theologians being investigated by the committee “may be invited to respond to the Committee’s observations in writing,” the committee “reserves the right to publish criticism without consultation “if it judges that intervention is needed for the pastoral guidance of the Catholic faithful.”

Terrence Tilley, head of the theology department at Fordham University, said he was unaware of the new procedures. After reviewing a copy provided by NCR, Tilley said he wondered why they do not make reference to protections found in canon law for those under investigation to defend themselves in a “competent ecclesial forum.”

“The process on the whole permits the committee to take appropriate actions,” he said, “but the process does not permit theologians whose works are examined to respond in a timely manner in a way that Canon 221 seems to require.”

The procedures approved in 1989, titled “Doctrinal Responsibilities,” specify that theologians who come into question by bishops should be engaged in dialogue in order to clarify their writings’ data, meaning and relationship with Catholic tradition while identifying the implications for the life of the church.

The process contained in “Doctrinal Responsibilities” had an “explicit presupposition of sound doctrine, which holds unless it is refuted by contrary evidence,” Coriden wrote in his Concilium article.

The lack of consultation with theologians in question under the new 2011 protocols means that there is an “assumption that the author is either ambiguous, in error, or both,” wrote Coriden, who serves on the faculty of the Washington Theological Union.

Susan Ross, president of the Catholic Theological Society of America and a co-editor of the issue of Concilium in which Coriden’s article appears, also drew a similar distinction between the two sets of procedures.

While the 1989 protocols ensure “there is a process of dialogue as soon as a question is raised” about a theologian, Ross said, in the 2011 protocols “theologians have no clue that the process is ongoing.”

Ross also said she and the society’s leadership are planning to suggest to the bishops’ doctrine committee that they “take another look” at the 1989 procedures and see if they can be used “beyond the narrow circumstances of what they’ve been interpreted to apply.”

A full version of the 2011 protocols appears following an article by Coriden in the book When The Magisterium Intervenes: The Magisterium and Theologians in Today’s Church, published this summer.

Mercy Sr. Mary Ann Walsh, director of media relations for the U.S. bishops’ conference, said Aug. 17 that the version of the protocols printed in the book “certainly appears to be” the same as the one in use by the doctrinal committee.

Walsh said the full committee approved the protocols, as an “internal document, developed for internal use.”

“The issues don’t come up very often,” she said.

Walsh also said that the protocols came about because the committee’s members were “looking at ways to deal with problems as they arise” and that they are “not incompatible” with the 1989 document.

“Doctrinal Responsibilities” was written for basically bishops and theologians,” Walsh said. “This statement is more guidance for the committee.”

The version of the protocols printed in When The Magisterium Intervenes outlines three stages of response for when the doctrinal committee is requested to look into a theologian or his or her works.

Such requests, it specifies, could come from an individual bishop, another U.S. bishops’ committee, or from a member of the doctrine committee, which is composed of nine bishops and is currently chaired by Washington Cardinal Donald Wuerl.

After Weinandy submits a report to the chairman of the doctrine committee, the protocols mandate that the full committee is to then make a determination if further review is warranted. If so, the letter says that Weinandy, in consultation with Wuerl, is to select “two or more experts” who will make another evaluation, addressing, among other things:

- The “positive aspects of the theologian’s work”;
- Areas where differences of opinion may legitimately exist;
- Places where the writing “departs from the Church’s teaching on faith and morals ... through error and/or ambiguity.”

Following the expert review, the letter mandates that the full doctrine committee determine whether to pursue further action. Such action, it states, could include referral to the theologian’s diocesan bishop, to the Vatican’s Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith, or to another U.S. bishops’ committee.

The doctrine committee itself, the protocols state, may also take a number of its own actions. Among those possible actions:

- Engaging the author in “constructive dialogue resulting in the publication of required clarifications and/or corrections”;
- Encouraging other scholars to publish a critique of the theologian’s work;
- Authorizing publication of a critique in the name of the committee’s executive director, with the approval of the U.S. bishops’ general secretary;
- Publishing a critique in the name of the committee’s chairman, with the authorization of the bishops’ conference president;
- Publishing a critique in the name of the full committee.

“Because publication of a statement by a USCCB committee is an extraordinary action,” the protocols state, “authorization by the Administrative Committee is needed for its publication.” The U.S. bishops’ administrative committee is made up of 36 bishops who direct the work of the bishops’ conference between its plenary sessions.

The 2011 protocol states that if “circumstances appear to require more immediate action,” a committee statement can be published with the authorization of the bishops’ executive committee, or even with the sole authorization of its president. The bishops’ executive committee is composed of conference president, vice president, treasurer, secretary and one member of the administrative committee.

Joshua J. McElwee is an NCR staff writer. His email address is jmcelwee@ncronline.org.
**US NEWS**

**ELECTION 2012**
Franciscans press candidates to act on climate change

**RELIGIOUS SECTION**

**SPECIAL SECTION**
Sisters in Cameroon; art and peace in El Salvador; and more

**ESSAY**
A STATE OF VIOLENCE
What influences our culture of guns? PAGE 18

---

**REPORTER**

In Kansas City, Mo., Sept. 16, the National Survivor Advocates Coalition calls for Bishop Robert Finn to resign.

---

**NATIONAL CATHOLIC REPORTER**

THE INDEPENDENT NEWS SOURCE

NCRonline.org SEPTEMBER 28-OCTOBER 10, 2012

Vol. 48, No. 25 | $2.95

---

**By JOHN L. ALLEN JR.**

**BEIRUT** Some papal trips are important for their substance, while others matter more for their symbolism. Pope Benedict XVI’s Sept. 14-16 outing to Lebanon fell into that second category, showing the world a different face of the Middle East in a moment of mounting violence and deep doubts about the future of the Arab Spring.

As Lebanon’s Daily Star put it, the trip came off as a “symbol of tolerance” in a region whose profile is more often that of fundamentalism, terrorism and sectarian strife. Benedict arrived on the very day that the recent bout of anti-American and anti-Western violence reached its peak, and while a bloody civil war in neighboring Syria continued to rage — neither of which were on the horizon when plans for the trip were originally crafted.

In that context, the focus shifted. Originally, the trip seemed calculated to deliver a shot in the arm to the Christian minority of the Middle East, in decline and full of anxiety about its future. As events unfolded, however, both the pope and his Lebanese hosts seemed determined to use the outing to accomplish something more pressing — to illustrate that the Middle East is not exclusively defined by radicalism and the “clash of civilizations.”

Continued on Page 14

---

**By JERRY FILTEAU**

**BOSTON** At a two-day conference in Boston, its birthplace, Voice of the Faithful marked 10 years of battling sexual abuse of minors by Catholic clergy and seeking to change church structures that permitted and at times facilitated it. But the 450 conference participants spent most of Sept. 14-15 exploring how to continue and expand that struggle over the next decade and beyond.

When Voice of the Faithful was founded at the peak of the U.S. scandal of clergy sexual abuse of minors in 2002, “you spoke a prophetic voice. Never forget, your voice rose up from your faith, from your love for the church,” said Fr. Donald Cozzens, writer in residence at John Carroll University in Cleveland.

“When others lost their nerve and their voice, you didn’t lose your nerve or your voice,” he said. “I salute your courage to come together 10 years ago, to speak your truth to power then, throughout the last decade, now, and into the future. Speaking the truth to power is never easy.”

Cozzens, the award-winning author of *The Changing Face of the Priesthood* and other widely acclaimed books on priesthood in the U.S. today, said that by faith he meant not only “belief in Jesus Christ and his teaching and his church but also … trust.”

“You are the voice of the trusting,” he said. “You trust that God’s Spirit

Continued on Page 10

---

**Lay group marks decade of ‘speaking truth to power’**

By JERRY FILTEAU

---

**Will the charter be honored?**

Bishop’s conviction raises questions about child protection procedures

By JOSHUA J. McELWEE

**KANSAS CITY, MO.** Bishop Robert W. Finn of Kansas City-St. Joseph, Mo., was found guilty Sept. 6 in a county criminal court for failing to report suspected child abuse, becoming the first Catholic bishop to be convicted in a U.S. court of shielding a priest who was a threat to children.

Finn’s conviction has raised questions across the country about the procedures adopted by the U.S. church over the past decade to protect minors, and the 16-month investigation and legal proceedings have left local Catholics stunned (see related story, Page 8).

The crime, a misdemeanor in Missouri, could have cost Finn a year in jail and a $1,000

Continued on Page 8

---

**Pope lifts up the other face of the Middle East in Lebanon**

By JOHN L. ALLEN JR.

**BEIRUT** Some papal trips are important for their symbolism. Pope Benedict XVI’s Sept. 14-16 outing to Lebanon fell into that second category, showing the world a different face of the Middle East in a moment of mounting violence and deep doubts about the future of the Arab Spring.

As Lebanon’s Daily Star put it, the trip came off as a “symbol of tolerance” in a region whose profile is more often that of fundamentalism, terrorism and sectarian strife.

Benedict arrived on the very day that the recent bout of anti-American and anti-Western violence
the bishops' charter, Notzon pointed to a report he prepared on the National Review Board. Following its discussions, Notzon said, he expects the board to make recommendations to the U.S. bishops.

The county prosecutor who brought the case against Finn had no problem with the bishop's actions, even when he was fully aware of the full extent of child pornography charges.

Notzon also said in his interview that he planned to bring up the Finn case with the full National Review Board for the evening of his conviction.

Following the case, Notzon and Fitzgerald agreed that fundraising has taken a hit. "Some donors said they wouldn't give to us because of [the legal] issues," he said. "There's no doubt we've felt it, and the bishop knows that, I've told him." Offutt said he would not comment on whether or not the bishop should resign. Any comment he read "would only be divisive," he said. "I want the best for the diocese. Frankly, I want the best for the bishop. Because the bishop is a decent man. Beyond that, I don't know what to say.

In mid-October, Finn is expected to address the priests of the diocese in person for the first time since his conviction during an annual priest retreat. According to the retreat's schedule, the bishop is to have an hour and a half conversation with them on the future.

Local Catholics were stunned to learn that the evening of his conviction Finn led a confirmation class.

Because the bishop is a nice man. He's a decent man. "I want the best for the bishop. "Would only be divisive," he said. "I want the best for the bishop. Because the bishop is a decent man. Beyond that, I don't know what to say.

In his interview, Notzon also pointed to a report he prepared for the bishops for their annual meeting in Atlanta in June, in which he pointed to a failure of accountability for bishops who do not follow the charter's mandates.

"The question of the consequences for those who do not follow the Charter is still unanswerable," Notzon wrote in his formal report to the bishops. "The National Review Board and the bishop must continue to take seriously the harm done to the Church and the faithful when these requirements are not met."

Notzon also said in his interview that he planned to bring up the Finn case with the full National Review Board for the evening of his conviction. Notzon and Fitzgerald agreed that fundraising has taken a hit. "Some donors said they wouldn't give to us because of [the legal] issues," he said. "There's no doubt we've felt it, and the bishop knows that, I've told him." Offutt said he would not comment on whether or not the bishop should resign. Any comment he read "would only be divisive," he said. "I want the best for the diocese. Frankly, I want the best for the bishop. Because the bishop is a decent man. Beyond that, I don't know what to say.

In mid-October, Finn is expected to address the priests of the diocese in person for the first time since his conviction during an annual priest retreat. According to the retreat's schedule, the bishop is to have an hour and a half conversation with them on the future.

Local Catholics were stunned to learn that the evening of his conviction Finn led a confirmation class.

Because the bishop is a nice man. He's a decent man. "I want the best for the bishop. "Would only be divisive," he said. "I want the best for the bishop. Because the bishop is a decent man. Beyond that, I don't know what to say.

In his interview, Notzon also pointed to a report he prepared for the bishops for their annual meeting in Atlanta in June, in which he pointed to a failure of accountability for bishops who do not follow the charter's mandates.

"The question of the consequences for those who do not follow the Charter is still unanswerable," Notzon wrote in his formal report to the bishops. "The National Review Board and the bishop must continue to take seriously the harm done to the Church and the faithful when these requirements are not met."

Notzon also said in his interview that he planned to bring up the Finn case with the full National Review Board for the evening of his conviction. Notzon and Fitzgerald agreed that fundraising has taken a hit. "Some donors said they wouldn't give to us because of [the legal] issues," he said. "There's no doubt we've felt it, and the bishop knows that, I've told him." Offutt said he would not comment on whether or not the bishop should resign. Any comment he read "would only be divisive," he said. "I want the best for the diocese. Frankly, I want the best for the bishop. Because the bishop is a decent man. Beyond that, I don't know what to say.

In mid-October, Finn is expected to address the priests of the diocese in person for the first time since his conviction during an annual priest retreat. According to the retreat's schedule, the bishop is to have an hour and a half conversation with them on the future.

Local Catholics were stunned to learn that the evening of his conviction Finn led a confirmation class.

Because the bishop is a nice man. He's a decent man. "I want the best for the bishop. "Would only be divisive," he said. "I want the best for the bishop. Because the bishop is a decent man. Beyond that, I don't know what to say.

In his interview, Notzon also pointed to a report he prepared for the bishops for their annual meeting in Atlanta in June, in which he pointed to a failure of accountability for bishops who do not follow the charter's mandates.

"The question of the consequences for those who do not follow the Charter is still unanswerable," Notzon wrote in his formal report to the bishops. "The National Review Board and the bishop must continue to take seriously the harm done to the Church and the faithful when these requirements are not met."

Notzon also said in his interview that he planned to bring up the Finn case with the full National Review Board for the evening of his conviction. Notzon and Fitzgerald agreed that fundraising has taken a hit. "Some donors said they wouldn't give to us because of [the legal] issues," he said. "There's no doubt we've felt it, and the bishop knows that, I've told him." Offutt said he would not comment on whether or not the bishop should resign. Any comment he read "would only be divisive," he said. "I want the best for the diocese. Frankly, I want the best for the bishop. Because the bishop is a decent man. Beyond that, I don't know what to say.

In mid-October, Finn is expected to address the priests of the diocese in person for the first time since his conviction during an annual priest retreat. According to the retreat's schedule, the bishop is to have an hour and a half conversation with them on the future.

Local Catholics were stunned to learn that the evening of his conviction Finn led a confirmation class.

Because the bishop is a nice man. He's a decent man. "I want the best for the bishop. "Would only be divisive," he said. "I want the best for the bishop. Because the bishop is a decent man. Beyond that, I don't know what to say.

In his interview, Notzon also pointed to a report he prepared for the bishops for their annual meeting in Atlanta in June, in which he pointed to a failure of accountability for bishops who do not follow the charter's mandates.

"The question of the consequences for those who do not follow the Charter is still unanswerable," Notzon wrote in his formal report to the bishops. "The National Review Board and the bishop must continue to take seriously the harm done to the Church and the faithful when these requirements are not met."

Notzon also said in his interview that he planned to bring up the Finn case with the full National Review Board for the evening of his conviction. Notzon and Fitzgerald agreed that fundraising has taken a hit. "Some donors said they wouldn't give to us because of [the legal] issues," he said. "There's no doubt we've felt it, and the bishop knows that, I've told him." Offutt said he would not comment on whether or not the bishop should resign. Any comment he read "would only be divisive," he said. "I want the best for the diocese. Frankly, I want the best for the bishop. Because the bishop is a decent man. Beyond that, I don't know what to say.

In mid-October, Finn is expected to address the priests of the diocese in person for the first time since his conviction during an annual priest retreat. According to the retreat's schedule, the bishop is to have an hour and a half conversation with them on the future.

Local Catholics were stunned to learn that the evening of his conviction Finn led a confirmation class.

Because the bishop is a nice man. He's a decent man. "I want the best for the bishop. "Would only be divisive," he said. "I want the best for the bishop. Because the bishop is a decent man. Beyond that, I don't know what to say. 
WASHINGTON - John Carr — arguably the most important spokesperson for Catholic social teaching in the U.S. today — retired Aug. 31 as director of the U.S. Conference of Catholic Bishops’ Department of Justice, Peace and Human Development.

Carr has guided the past two generations of American bishops through the intricacies of connecting Catholic social and moral teaching with U.S. public policy.

The Washington Post Sept. 1 called Carr “the most important policy adviser to the country’s Catholic bishops, their Karl Rove on everything from health care to clergy sex abuse,” in the past 25 years.

One of Carr’s favorite rhetorical (and practical) paradigms is the thoroughly Catholic “and.” The church’s social teaching, he would regularly say, backs the right to life of unborn children and their rights after birth; workers’ rights and responsibilities; employers’ rights and responsibilities. For Carr, Catholic teaching on human rights and correlative responsibilities is an almost endless list of responsible human relationships in society.

Carr told NCR in an interview just before his retirement that he considered it “a privilege” to have worked for the bishops and regarded his interaction with them as an opportunity to help them align their public policy decisions with Catholic social teaching taken in its entirety.

For the fall semester Carr will hold a fellowship at the Institute of Politics at Harvard University in Boston. After that, he will head a new Center on Catholic Social Teaching and Public Engagement that he hopes will be the process of taking St. Catholic University of America in Washington. The center aims to encourage younger Catholic lay men and women to engage in public life within the framework of Catholic social teaching.

He said that today, especially because of the “enormous impact” of Pope John Paul II, “Catholic teaching is at the center of the church’s life.”

“It’s not the church I grew up in,” he said. Today, “the church’s social mission is not fringe, it’s central — it’s not optional.”

A Minnesota native, Carr’s first job after graduating from the College (now University) of St. Thomas in St. Paul with a degree in sociology was program management that he considered it “a privilege” to have worked for the bishops and regarded his interaction with them as an opportunity to help them align their public policy decisions with Catholic social teaching taken in its entirety.

For the fall semester Carr will hold a fellowship at the Institute of Politics at Harvard University in Boston. After that, he will head a new Center on Catholic Social Teaching and Public Engagement that he hopes will be the process of taking St. Catholic University of America in Washington. The center aims to encourage younger Catholic lay men and women to engage in public life within the framework of Catholic social teaching.

He said that today, especially because of the “enormous impact” of Pope John Paul II, “Catholic teaching is at the center of the church’s life.”

“It’s not the church I grew up in,” he said. Today, “the church’s social mission is not fringe, it’s central — it’s not optional.”

A Minnesota native, Carr’s first job after graduating from the College (now University) of St. Thomas in St. Paul with a degree in sociology was program management that he considered it “a privilege” to have worked for the bishops and regarded his interaction with them as an opportunity to help them align their public policy decisions with Catholic social teaching taken in its entirety.

For the fall semester Carr will hold a fellowship at the Institute of Politics at Harvard University in Boston. After that, he will head a new Center on Catholic Social Teaching and Public Engagement that he hopes will be the process of taking St. Catholic University of America in Washington. The center aims to encourage younger Catholic lay men and women to engage in public life within the framework of Catholic social teaching.

He said that today, especially because of the “enormous impact” of Pope John Paul II, “Catholic teaching is at the center of the church’s life.”

“It’s not the church I grew up in,” he said. Today, “the church’s social mission is not fringe, it’s central — it’s not optional.”

A Minnesota native, Carr’s first job after graduating from the College (now University) of St. Thomas in St. Paul with a degree in sociology was program management that he considered it “a privilege” to have worked for the bishops and regarded his interaction with them as an opportunity to help them align their public policy decisions with Catholic social teaching taken in its entirety.

For the fall semester Carr will hold a fellowship at the Institute of Politics at Harvard University in Boston. After that, he will head a new Center on Catholic Social Teaching and Public Engagement that he hopes will be the process of taking St. Catholic University of America in Washington. The center aims to encourage younger Catholic lay men and women to engage in public life within the framework of Catholic social teaching.

He said that today, especially because of the “enormous impact” of Pope John Paul II, “Catholic teaching is at the center of the church’s life.”

“It’s not the church I grew up in,” he said. Today, “the church’s social mission is not fringe, it’s central — it’s not optional.”

A Minnesota native, Carr’s first job after graduating from the College (now University) of St. Thomas in St. Paul with a degree in sociology was program management that he considered it “a privilege” to have worked for the bishops and regarded his interaction with them as an opportunity to help them align their public policy decisions with Catholic social teaching taken in its entirety.

For the fall semester Carr will hold a fellowship at the Institute of Politics at Harvard University in Boston. After that, he will head a new Center on Catholic Social Teaching and Public Engagement that he hopes will be the process of taking St. Catholic University of America in Washington. The center aims to encourage younger Catholic lay men and women to engage in public life within the framework of Catholic social teaching.

He said that today, especially because of the “enormous impact” of Pope John Paul II, “Catholic teaching is at the center of the church’s life.”

“It’s not the church I grew up in,” he said. Today, “the church’s social mission is not fringe, it’s central — it’s not optional.”

A Minnesota native, Carr’s first job after graduating from the College (now University) of St. Thomas in St. Paul with a degree in sociology was program management that he considered it “a privilege” to have worked for the bishops and regarded his interaction with them as an opportunity to help them align their public policy decisions with Catholic social teaching taken in its entirety.

For the fall semester Carr will hold a fellowship at the Institute of Politics at Harvard University in Boston. After that, he will head a new Center on Catholic Social Teaching and Public Engagement that he hopes will be the process of taking St. Catholic University of America in Washington. The center aims to encourage younger Catholic lay men and women to engage in public life within the framework of Catholic social teaching.

He said that today, especially because of the “enormous impact” of Pope John Paul II, “Catholic teaching is at the center of the church’s life.”

“It’s not the church I grew up in,” he said. Today, “the church’s social mission is not fringe, it’s central — it’s not optional.”

A Minnesota native, Carr’s first job after graduating from the College (now University) of St. Thomas in St. Paul with a degree in sociology was program management that he considered it “a privilege” to have worked for the bishops and regarded his interaction with them as an opportunity to help them align their public policy decisions with Catholic social teaching taken in its entirety.

For the fall semester Carr will hold a fellowship at the Institute of Politics at Harvard University in Boston. After that, he will head a new Center on Catholic Social Teaching and Public Engagement that he hopes will be the process of taking St. Catholic University of America in Washington. The center aims to encourage younger Catholic lay men and women to engage in public life within the framework of Catholic social teaching.
Call it the showdown at the lecture hall. Nearly 100 faculty members at the University of San Diego declared a loss of confidence in their president’s leadership in mid-November. They alleged that her cancellation of a British theologian’s visiting fellowship and her response to criticism of the move had shown her to be “ethically bankrupt.”

The faculty of the Catholic university’s College of Arts and Sciences, one of the university’s seven colleges and schools, made the move Nov. 13.

It came following wide criticism of President Mary Lyons’ rescission of a fellowship for Tina Beattie, a theologian known for her work in contemporary ethical issues.

By JOSHUA J. McELWEE

Revoked invitation spurs outrage
President gets no-confidence vote

By JERRY FILTEAU

Bishops face the growing retirement crisis of religious orders
from prominent theologians and professors across the U.S. and the U.K. They expressed concerns in public letters and statements that it could represent a significant chill down on academic thought.

The 47,000-member American Association of University Professors, which represents universities on their protection of academic freedom, chimed in Nov 5. Writing in a letter to Lyons, the organization said the move raises “serious issues of academic freedom with which we are concerned.”

Beattie, a professor of Catholic studies at London’s University of Roehampton, received notice of the cancellation Oct. 27. The theologian, who had been scheduled to take residence at the university Nov. 6, announced the withdrawal of the invitation in an email to friends and other theologians Nov. 1.

Beattie had been set to take up a monthlong visiting fellowship at the university’s Frances G. Harpert Center for Catholic Thought and Culture. In a Nov. 5 statement to NCR, Lyons identified as “the heart of this matter” Beattie’s signing, along with 27 others, of an August letter in The Times of London that said it would be “perfectly proper” for Catholics to support civil marriage for same-sex couples.

While Lyons said that Beattie’s cancellation was made “without regard to pressure groups or donor influence,” the move came after an influential Catholic alumni and a conservative watchdog organization said the move raises “serious concerns about intellectual issues, matters of faith, and also matters of practice and church governance,” she said.

Among other theologians who have published statements supporting the move are Eamon Duffy, a professor of Christian history at the University of Cambridge and a former member of the Pontifical Committee for Historical Sciences; and Paul D. Murray, the president of the Catholic Theological Association of Great Britain and a consultant to the Vatican’s Pontifical Council for Justice and Peace.

“In a way, it’s not about being correct,” said Fr. Frank Santucci, OMI, the university’s assistant vice president for public affairs, said in an interview that when the university president had worked with a donor to secure the gift for the Harpert Center, “there were certain understandings as to what that gift would bring.”

For the Harpert fellowship, Gray Payton said, “there are some pretty rigid, pretty particular expectations of the speakers and others who might come through this program.”

Mannion, who said he was speaking on his own behalf, disputed Gray Payton’s claim that there were clear expectations about how its speakers and fellows should align or not align on church teachings.

That view of the center, Mannion said, is “completely contrary to the understanding of the center and its mission that I was hired and the cardinal Newman Society appointed me.”

An Irish citizen who took the role as the center’s director three years ago, Mannion said he had inquired about what kind of restrictions the university would place on discussions before accepting his position there.

“I was given assurances that there was no question of interference, that academic freedom would be safeguarded,” he said. “I’ve never been told about such donor positions.”

Mannion also disagreed with Lyons’ contention that Beattie’s support of the August letter constituted disagreement in church teachings, saying it was “torturous logic.”

“There’s nothing to dissent from,” Mannion said. “The church doesn’t have binding teaching on civil same-sex partnerships. It has a position and a preference, but it doesn’t actually have a binding teaching.”

Even if it was not the case, the policy on academic freedom should protect her right to sign such a letter, he said after urged Catholics to follow their conscience.”

Jean Porter, a professor of theology at the University of Notre Dame in Indiana, said she and others followed the disinvitation “is for the well-being of the church.”

“The church is starving itself through its reluctance and its fear to engage in really open and honest discussion about intellectual issues, matters of faith, and also matters of practice and church governance,” she said.

Among other theologians who have published statements supporting the move are Eamon Duffy, a professor of Christian history at the University of Cambridge and a former member of the Pontifical Committee for Historical Sciences; and Paul D. Murray, the president of the Catholic Theological Association of Great Britain and a consultant to the Vatican’s Pontifical Council for Justice and Peace.

(Justus J. McIwhee is an NCR staff writer.

His email address is jmcelwee@ncronline.org.)

**INVITATION: NEARLY 100 FACULTY PROTEST**

Continued from Page 1

Following the initial Nov. 6 vote, several untenured faculty members at the university told NCR they had been questioned by their academic dean about the matter and they felt pressured not to support the no-confidence vote. The faculty members asked not to be named for fear of reprisal.

McKenna and another San Diego man known for his conservative Catholic viewpoints, Charles LiMan
dri, said in interviews with NCR that they had widely expressed displeasure with Beattie’s appointment.

Among those they said they contacted were current and former members of the university’s board of trustees, San Diego Coadjutor Bishop Cirilo Flores, the editor of the diocesan newspaper and the Cardinal Newman Society (See Page 9.)

LiMandri, a University of San Diego alumna who has served on the alum
d board, was president of the national alumni association and was chairman of the university’s annual fund, said he found Beattie’s views on same-sex marriage and abortion “over the top, even blasphemous.”

In her Nov. 5 statement, Lyons said it was “significant” that Beattie had signed the August letter regarding gay marriage as a theologian.

“This action is materially different from the exercise of scholarship and teaching appropriate to the role of an academic and whose freedom to do so I consistently defend,” Lyons wrote.

Repeated NCR inquiries to speak directly with Lyons on how she determined what was outside the scope of discussion for theologians went unanswered throughout early November.

Pamela Gray Payton, the university’s assistant vice president for public affairs, said in an interview that when the university president had worked with a donor to secure the gift for the Harpert Center, “there were certain understandings as to what that gift would bring.”

For the Harpert fellowship, Gray Payton said, “there are some pretty rigid, pretty particular expectations of the speakers and others who might come through this program.”

Mannion, who said he was speaking on his own behalf, disputed Gray Payton’s claim that there were clear expectations about how its speakers and fellows should align or not align on church teachings.

That view of the center, Mannion said, is “completely contrary to the understanding of the center and its mission that I was hired and the cardinal Newman Society appointed me.”

An Irish citizen who took the role as the center’s director three years ago, Mannion said he had inquired about what kind of restrictions the university would place on discussions before accepting his position there.

“I was given assurances that there was no question of interference, that academic freedom would be safeguarded,” he said. “I’ve never been told about such donor positions.”

Mannion also disagreed with Lyons’ contention that Beattie’s support of the August letter constituted disagreement in church teachings, saying it was “torturous logic.”

“There’s nothing to dissent from,” Mannion said. “The church doesn’t have binding teaching on civil same-sex partnerships. It has a position and a preference, but it doesn’t actually have a binding teaching.”

Even if it was not the case, the policy on academic freedom should protect her right to sign such a letter, he said after urged Catholics to follow their conscience.”

Jean Porter, a professor of theology at the University of Notre Dame in Indiana, said she and others followed the disinvitation “is for the well-being of the church.”

“The church is starving itself through its reluctance and its fear to engage in really open and honest discussion about intellectual issues, matters of faith, and also matters of practice and church governance,” she said.

Among other theologians who have published statements supporting the move are Eamon Duffy, a professor of Christian history at the University of Cambridge and a former member of the Pontifical Committee for Historical Sciences; and Paul D. Murray, the president of the Catholic Theological Association of Great Britain and a consultant to the Vatican’s Pontifical Council for Justice and Peace.

(Justus J. McIwhee is an NCR staff writer.

His email address is jmcelwee@ncronline.org.)

**Masters of Arts (Spirituality) Online**

“Love is God’s Meaning”: The Spiritual Path of the English Mystics

Professor Philip Sheldrake

January 7-17, 2013 6:30 - 9:30 PM

The course focuses on the two popular and contrasting texts, Julian of Norwich’s “Showings” and Theresa of Avila’s practical and theological-erotic spiritual teachings.

**Introduction to Christian Spirituality**

Frank Santucci, OMI

January 22 - May 10, 2013

**Introduction to Ignatian Spirituality**

Renata Furst, PhD

January 22 - May 10, 2013

Monday evenings 5:30 - 9:00 PM

Courses may be taken online or face-to-face and for credit, audit or enrichment.

Contact Mario Porter for more information at registrar@ost.edu or 210-341-1366

OBLATE SCHOOL OF THEOLOGY

285 Oblate Drive • San Antonio, TX 78216 • www.ost.edu • (210) 341-1366