The Future of Animal Welfare

A look back, around and forward

Roger Haston
PhD, CAO
A Cattle Dog’s Dilemma
Realistic Optimism
A Brief History on Animal Welfare
The Beginning

Cruelty       Abuse       Suffering

Henry Bergh via New York Historical Society
ANIMALDOM

Vol. IX NOVEMBER, 1939 No. 12

ANIMALDOM
Subscription to others than members and life members $2.00 per year postage.

Subscription to others than members and life members $2.00 per year postage.

Annual Membership $5.00. Life Membership $50.00.

Dear Friends:

HERE WE ARE starting on our 14th volume of Animaldom; Christmas is in the offing and our unfortunately misguided enemies not yet brought to sullenly penitent knees. Most of us feel like crying in desperation, “How long, oh, Lord, will it take to make the human

What We Did in November

Prosecutions .................................. 3
Horses ordered from labor ..................... 17
Harness adjustments .......................... 2
Coops of poultry relieved from overcrowding .......... 18
Animals ordered humanely destroyed .......... 9
Assistance and advice rendered ................. 101

Regular Inspections:

Stables (private and livery) ................. 400
Riding Stables .................................. 90
Poultry Dealers .................................. 747
Pet Shops and Kennels ....................... 43
Dumps and Piers ................................. 183
Abattoirs ........................................ 245
Live Stock Auctions ............................. 6
Stack Yards ...................................... 32
Inspections and investigations made in 2 Counties outside of Philadelphia ................. 3
Visits to circuses, dog shows, farms, parades, piggeries ..................... 7
Calls for removal of large animals .......... 7
Calls for removal of small animals .......... 697
Animals humanely destroyed: (large 1; small, 756) .................. 757
Animals handled at Shelter .................. 76
The History of the Five Freedoms

1964

• Release of Ruth Harrison’s “Animal Machines” book which highlighted the abysmal conditions for agricultural animals in Britain

1965

• UK Government commissioned an investigation, led by Professor Roger Brambell, into the welfare of intensively farmed animals
• From this, the Five Freedoms were developed
The Five Freedoms

Freedom of hunger and thirst
Freedom from discomfort
Freedom from pain, injury and disease
Freedom to express normal behavior
Freedom from fear and distress
1970s: Public Awareness Grows

Animals Abandon All Hope When Entering Animal Shelter

The Dogs We Get in Here Are the Ones Nobody Wants or Will Take Care Of?

Facing Lonely, Silent Death

Dogs aren’t kept here for dogs and this name is really misleading. In fact, not a dog in the shelter. However, the dogs are kept here. The dogs are kept healthy, well fed, and with many carrots, apples, and other vegetables. The dogs are also kept clean, with a regular bath and grooming. The dogs are not treated as pets, but as working dogs.

Many of the dogs are from shelters in other areas. They are brought here for training and other purposes. The dogs are trained to do tasks like digging, pulling, and other tasks. The dogs are also used for research purposes. The dogs are not used for any research purposes.

Week and pure chemicals are gassed. The shelter is also the only shelter in the area that is run by dogs and dogs at all times. The shelter is also the only shelter in the area that is run by dogs and dogs at all times. The shelter is also the only shelter in the area that is run by dogs and dogs at all times. The shelter is also the only shelter in the area that is run by dogs and dogs at all times.
The Humane Movement Grows

- First low cost spay and neuter clinics opened
  - 1969 in Los Angeles was the first
- Focus on euthanasia methodology
  - Elimination of cruel and painful methods begin
- Involvement of veterinary community
  - Importance of disease control and animal condition recognized
- Growth of adoptions from shelters
  - Humane organizations begin promoting the rescuing of animals from shelters
1990s: Focus on Outcomes

First appearance of the “no kill” movement

Large well funded shelters developed

Growth of low cost spay neuter begins to impact intake

Public awareness around the value of adoption grows
2000s: A Common Framework

2004 in Asilomar

A group was convened to:

- Build a bridge across varying philosophies
- Develop relationships and create goals focused on significantly reducing the euthanasia of healthy and treatable companion animals
- Developed some guiding principles and a common metric for success.
  - Live Release Rate
- A push for metrics and transparency
Hurricane Katrina
Changing Attitudes Towards Pets

1940 1980 2010

1940 - Backyard
1980 - Bedroom
Growth of Animal Rights
Animal Welfare vs. Animal Rights

Consequentialism

Concerned with choosing the action that will bring about the greatest good for the greatest number of individuals.

Prevention of unnecessary suffering

Ensure a good quality of life and humane death.

Example: Peter Singer

Kantian Theories

Assumes all subjects-of-a life possess inherent value and must be treated as ends-in-themselves, never as a means to an end.

A right may not be sacrificed even if the consequences of doing so are appealing or negative.

Examples: Tom Reagan, Gary Francione
Colliding Frameworks
2010s: Rising Conflict and Confusion

Limited Admission

Why?

RELEASE RATE

HIGH KILL

THE NO KILL + EQUATION

Casualties of animals at rescue and shelter facilities

Casualties of animals at rescues

February 28, 2014, by Merritt Clifton

By Merritt Clifton

At least 25,000 dogs and 15,000 cats found at failed no-kill shelters and rescues from 2005 through 2014 might be politely described as casualties of the "save rate," also known as the "live release rate."

The numbers of dogs and cats impounded by law enforcement from failed shelters and rescues dropped sharply in 2013, after a record 6,020 impoundments in 2012.
Have we been successful?

A quick review of metrics
Why Do We Measure?

- Assess the current state
- Track progress toward success
- Create awareness and focus
- Keep us grounded
- Keep us aligned to our mission
- Motivate our donors & constituents
Risk in Metrics

- Measuring the Wrong Thing
- Drawing the Wrong Conclusion
- Destructive Incentives
  
  *Think Wells Fargo*
- Myopia
Tremendous Progress

[Graph showing a declining trend in euthanasias per 1000 residents from 1965 to 2010, with a notable decrease over time.]
Laws and Cruelty

• Before 1986, only four states had felony animal cruelty laws: Massachusetts (1804), Oklahoma (1887), Rhode Island (1896) and Michigan (1931).

• Three states enacted felony laws in the 1980s, 19 in the 1990s and 25 more since 2000 (including the District of Columbia).

• 50 states currently include felony provisions in their animal cruelty laws.
Sheltering Has Been Focused On

Overpopulation

Homelessness

• Tools we have been using:
  • Spay/Neuter
  • Sheltering
  • Adoption

• The scope of the problems forced us into a reactive strategy

• Most of our metrics and focus have been organizationally and shelter focused
Cats: One Big Complex ......???

- Successful recognition that what we were doing wasn’t working
- The new approaches to cats have rendered traditional measurements like “intake” woefully insufficient
- No agreed upon goal or measure of success
- A mash-up of interests – it’s bigger than the cats
“That’s kind of like how jazz is sometimes. You’re out there predicting the future, and no one believes you”

Branford Marsalis
Trends to Consider

• Animal Supply & Demand
• Transfers and Transport
• The Explosion of Rescues
• Where People Adopt
• The Underserved
• The Economics of Sheltering
• Attitude Polarization
A Growing Inventory Problem?

We are running out of dogs people want... but not everywhere
Intake is Declining
Why The Decline?

- Years of Spay/Neuter
- More public awareness
- Different approach to cats
- Public fear of shelters
- Shelters are not reaching the need
- Shelters are limiting admission
Shelters Don’t Have What People Want

Number of Animals

Intake
Outflows

0
1000
2000
3000
4000
5000

Pitbull/Mix
Chihuahua
German Shep
Terrier Mix
Lab/Lab Mix
Boxer
Sib Husky/Mix
Poodle Toy
Blocky-Headed Whatevers
You’re not from around here, are you?
Explosion of Transfers

778,385 dogs
Transfer at A Large Scale

Percent of Dogs Adopted in Colorado from out of State

- 2008
- 2009
- 2010
- 2011
- 2012
- 2013
- 2014
- 2015
- 2016

Graph showing the percent of dogs adopted in Colorado from out of state from 2008 to 2016, with a significant increase from 2011 to 2016.
Dog-O-Nomics

- $25 to $50 at Source
- $300 to $450 at Destination
- 300,000 to 500,000 in 2016

\[(400 - 50) \times 300,000 \]

\[= 105,000,000 \]

Potential Revenue

This amount of money can attract some bad actors and create problems in both the source and destination communities if not managed holistically.
Small Rescues

They are big and unregulated
Animal Welfare Organizations

Estimated to be 35,000
Rescue or Hoarder

Hoarding is on the rise
Good Intentions

*L'enfer est plein de bonnes volontés ou désirs*

(hell is full of good wishes or desires)

Saint Bernard of Clairvaux, c.1150
How People Adopt is Changing

There is strong competition for adoptable animals
Changing Public Expectations

Then

Now
Growth of Retail Adoptions

Over 1,000,000 in 2016

This is changing the dynamics of the sheltering community
Animal Welfare
Deserts

We are very successful with the people that we are very successful with
The only thing worse than being blind is having sight but no vision.

Helen Keller
Pets-For-Life Data

- Percent of People with No Contact
- No Vet Experience
- No Shelter or AC Contact

Graph showing the percentage of people with no contact for both categories.
Where People Get Their Pets

- APPA
  - Stray: 50%
  - Friend/Relative: 25%
  - Offspring: 25%
  - Breeder: 0%
  - Rescue/Shelter: 0%
  - Petstore: 0%

- Pets ForLife
  - Stray: 75%
  - Friend/Relative: 25%
  - Offspring: 0%
  - Breeder: 0%
  - Rescue/Shelter: 0%
  - Petstore: 0%
Socio-Economic Bias

- **< $35k Income**
  - Altered: 51%
  - Unaltered: 49%

- **> $35k Income**
  - Altered: 93%
  - Unaltered: 7%
Why Free is Too Expensive

Jerry has a cat

Free = $50 to $100
Or more

I need time off work for my cat

4 hrs * $15/hr = $60

How do I catch this thing?

Cat carrier $20
Band-Aids $10

Can I borrow your car?

Gas $20

PetSmart Charities
Innocent Observation

“I’m confused as to why in areas where shelter intake is declining so much, there is still such a big need for spay/neuter services”
Shelter Economics

The model is not viable for most... yet some will thrive
Skyrocketing Cost of Sheltering

2000 (Inflation adjusted)

Average from 200 shelters

PetSmart Charities
The Cost of Doing More

- Total expenditures per animal
- Total program services per animal
- Total veterinary services per animal
Cost per Animal in Non-Profit Shelters

![Graph showing the relationship between cost per animal and number of animal intakes. The x-axis represents the number of animal intakes, ranging from 0 to 25,000. The y-axis represents the cost per animal, ranging from $- to $4,000. The graph includes data points scattered across the graph, indicating a wide range of costs per animal for different numbers of intakes.](image-url)
Scope of the Problem

6,000,000,000

per year

(if nothing changes)
Attitude Polarization

The Growing Divide
Attitude Polarization

Following a general trend in our society, animal welfare is polarizing and getting more extreme
Are We in An Echo Chamber?

The one place we always hear the truth.
A Growing Disconnect?

Us

Them
Genetic mapping of canine fear and aggression

Isaín Zapata, James A. Serpell and Carlos E. Alvarez

Received: 21 June 2016 | Accepted: 13 July 2016 | Published: 8 August 2016

Abstract

Background
Fear/anxiety and anger/aggression greatly influence health, quality of life and social interactions. They are a huge burden to wellbeing, and personal and public economics. However, while much is known about the physiology and neuroanatomy of such emotions, little is known about their genetics – most importantly, why some individuals are more susceptible to pathology under stress.

Results
We conducted genomewide association (GWA) mapping of breed stereotypes for many fear and aggression traits across several hundred dogs from diverse breeds. We confirmed those findings using GWA in a second cohort of partially overlapping breeds. Lastly, we used the validated loci to create a model that effectively predicted fear and aggression stereotypes in a third group of dog breeds that were not involved in the mapping studies. We found that i) known IGF1 and HMGAR loci variants for small body size are associated with separation anxiety, touch-sensitivity, owner directed aggression and dog rivalry; and ii) two
Losing Sight of the Truth

VERIFY: No, the SPCA is not euthanizing pit bulls in Beaumont, despite rumors

The Jefferson County Sheriff’s Department confirmed Sunday that pit bulls and other animal breeds were not being euthanized, as claimed by rumors circulating...

12NEWSNOW.COM
Memphis -- Director Receives Death Threats

Bomb, death threats beset Lindon Animal Shelter

Clarksville crying dog video, petition spur death threats

Augusta animal director receives death threats over euthanasia”
Devastating Realities

Son says life support ending today for 52yr old dog bite victim Antoinette Brown, seen here yrs ago in Army. @NBCDFW
Jace Valdez
Howard Nicholson, Jr.
Diane Jansen
Dylan Andres
Kylar Johnson
James Hurst
Aiden McGrew
Jeremiah Eakwe-Shahan
Clifford Wright
Jazlyn Mesa
Makayla Damell
Eugene Cameron
Ja'Marr Tiller
Jack Redin
Tyzhel McWilliams
Ronnel Brown
Rebecca Carey
Charles Hagerman
Dawn Jurgens
Bryton Cason
Debra Renee Wilson-Roberts
James hudson
Donald Thomas
Rayden Bruce
Nellie Davis
Mary Jo Hunt
Tarilyn Bowles
Dixie Jennings
Remedios Romero-Solares
Dawn Brown
Esteban Alavez
Unknown woman
Savannah Edwards
Tomas Henio
Betty Ann Chapman Todd
Christian Gormanous
Eliese Grace
Isaiah Aguilar
Ryan Maxwell
Daxon Borchardt
Monica Renee Laminack
Tyler Jett
Claudia Gallardo
Jordyn Amdt
Beau Rutledge
Rachael Honabarger
Carlton Freeman
Pamela Marie Devitt
Ayden Evans
Nephi Selu
Arianna Jolene Merrbach
Linda Oliver
Jordan Reed
Daniel Teubner
Samuel Eli Zamudio
Jordan Ryan
Terry Douglass
Katherine Atkins
Nga Woodhead
Levi Watson
Joan Kappen
Jah'Niyah White
Mia Gibson
Michal Nelson
Betty Clark
Tom J. Vick
Christine Bell
Kara Hartrich
Annabell Martin
Kłonda S. Richey
Je'vaeh Mayes
Braelynn Rayne Coulter
Summer Sears
Kenneth Santilla
Raymane Robinson Jr.
Mia DeRouen
Dorothy Hamilton
Jayne Hartland
Katie Morrison
Jessica Norman
Kassii Haith
Holden Garrison
Craig Sytsma
Logan Shepard
Johnathan Quarles Jr.
Cindy Whisman
Joel Chirieleson
Derialem Solom
Javon Da beads Jr.
David Glass Sr
Alice Payne
Logan Meyer
Alameander Dial
Jose Cruz Caizares Robles
Deanne Lynn Coando
Stella Antanaitis
Jayla Rodriguez
Edward Cahill
Christopher Joaquin Camejo
Eugene Smith
Declan Moss
Malaki Mildward
Fredrick Crutchfield
TayLynn DeVaughn
Roy Higginsbootham Jr.
Betty Wood
Julia Charging Whirlwind
De' Trick Johnson
Neta Lee AdamsKenneth Ford
Brayden Wilson
Gaige Ramirez
James Nevis III
Jordan Collins-Tyson
Norberto Legarda
Joshua Strother
Annie Williams
Carolyn Lamp
Max Gracia
Porsche Carter
Cathy H. Wheatcraft
Barbara McCormick
Emilio Rios
Carmen Reigada
Lamarkus Hicks
Tanner Smith
Edgar Brown
Amiyah Dunston
Anthony Riggs
Carter Hartie
Xavier Strickland
Rebecca Hardy
Nyjah Espinosa
Tyrice Trammell-Huston
Payton Sawyers
Talan West
Aiden Grim
Suzanne Story
Bessie Flowers
Sonda Tyson
Sebastian Caban
Adonis Reddick
Earl Wayne Stephens
Hunter Bragg
Erin McCleskey
Jocelyn Winfrey
Susie Kirby
Christopher Malone
Divergent Whys

We aren’t all working for the same thing

- Anti-Euthanasia
- Humane Treatment
- Promote Pet Ownership
- Eliminate Breeding
- Eliminate Suffering
- Reduce Population
- No More Homeless Pets
- Celebrate the Human Animal Bond
Looking Outside Our World

Where can we look to understand the future?
The Extremes of Policies

The devastating impact of Italy’s no-kill legislation
Addressing a Problem

- Education
- Licensing & Registration
- Early Interdiction
- Strict and Severe Enforcement
  - Up to $10,000 fine for aggressive dog attack
  - Potential court ordered euthanasia

How Calgary reduced dog attacks without banning pit bulls

RENE BRUEMMER, MONTREAL GAZETTE
More from René Bruemmer, Montreal Gazette

Dangerous dogs – a sensible solution
Policy and model legislative framework

PETSMART Charities
Getting Under One Roof

Australia consolidated all of the animal welfare groups under a single organization.

British Columbia has built a large organization that has consolidated over 50 organizations.
The Future of Animal Welfare

Pets, people, preserving the bond, professionalization and a whole new set of metrics
## Current Business Trends

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Increasing Cost</th>
<th>Inconsistent Supply Chain</th>
<th>Hard to Access Customers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Increasing Competition</td>
<td>Confused Consumer Messaging</td>
<td>Increased Public Scrutiny</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flat to Declining Market</td>
<td>Increasing Regulatory Pressure</td>
<td>Low Barrier to Entry</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

What do think is going to happen?
Consolidation is happening:

- San Diego
- Washington
- Minneapolis
- ....................

Disaggregation:

- The need is not located where the revenue is generated
- Organizations need to functionally split and locate in the appropriate locale
  - Need
  - Revenue
Honest Risk Assessment

- No formal risk assessment methodology
- Community data on public safety issues is sparse and often flawed
- Discount the cost of a negative experience
- Need to be honest about the consequence of aggression
- Public safety and animal welfare are not mutually exclusive

Our relationship with animals has been built up over 30,000 years. We can not afford to risk jeopardizing that bond for short-term benefit.
Community Impact Assessment Metric
Professionalization

- We risk marginalizing ourselves in society
- We need professional certifications and qualifications
- Passion is not enough
- We serve people and pets, not just pets
Forward to Our Roots

Eliminating cruelty and suffering

Reducing pet homelessness

Adoption and life saving are tactics, not ends

It’s about being humane

Building and maintaining the bond
Difficult Road Ahead

Many of the messages and beliefs that have made us successful are starting to get in our way:

- Animals should only be adopted
- “Adoptable”
- Save them all
- No Kill
- Everyone should have a pet
- Donate to save this poor sad creature locked away in a dirty, dank, stinky shelter where no one cares (backed by sad music)
- People want to kill adoptable pets
Where We Can Be

Preserving and building the relationship between all pets and people

Eliminating cruelty, suffering and abuse

Maintaining public trust and safety
You have to be brave
And your courage to do what’s right
Has to be greater than your fear of getting hurt
So be Brave
Be Brave

Hasan Minhaj
A Cattle Dog’s Dilemma
Thanks For Listening

Questions?