Securing Tennessee’s Future

INVESTING IN EDUCATIONAL OPPORTUNITY:
Strengthening Tennessee’s Commitment to Low-Income Students and their Families

TICUA
SUPPORTING STUDENT CHOICE 50 Years
INVESTING IN EDUCATIONAL OPPORTUNITY:

Strengthening Tennessee’s Commitment to Low-Income Students and their Families

By
Heather Jack
Vice President of Research and Public Affairs

Tennessee Independent Colleges and Universities Association

November 2006
Table of Contents

Foreword ........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................5

Acknowledgements ................................................................................................................................................................................................................................16

Letter from Richard G. Rhoda ..................................................................................................................................................................................7

Executive Summary ..........................................................................................................................................................................................................................9

SECTION ONE: The History of the Tennessee Student Assistance Award (TSAA) Program ........................................................................................................11

SECTION TWO: An Overview of the Tennessee Student Assistance Award (TSAA) Program ..................................................................................12

SECTION THREE: Recommendations and Considerations for State Policy Leaders ............................................................................................20

Methodology ......................................................................................................................................................................................................................21

Appendix A: Data Changes Over Time ...............................................................................................................................................................22

Appendix B: List of 2006-07 TSAC Board Members ........................................................................................................................................25

References .................................................................................................................................................................................................................................26

About TICUA ...................................................................................................................................................................................................................27
In the early 1970s, the Tennessee General Assembly established a student aid program that provided financial assistance for the state’s lowest income population to attend college. Almost 35 years later, with a cumulative investment of over $500 million, the state has supported more than 520,000 low-income students with Tennessee Student Assistance Award (TSAA) grants to attend college in the state.

Investing in Educational Opportunity: Strengthening Tennessee’s Commitment to Low-Income Students and their Families is an important contribution to the on-going discussion about college affordability in Tennessee, and how access to financial aid for college impacts choice and opportunity for low-income students. The recent implementation of the Tennessee Education Lottery Scholarship programs has brought student aid issues to the forefront of the policy debate about the importance of college access, and with that the belief that opportunity should not be determined by a student’s family income.

This study highlights the past 34 years of the TSAA program (including program funding, number of award recipients, and award level). The report also provides recommendations to policy makers on how to fully fund the TSAA program in the future. This study finds that, despite the generous support by the state over the years, thousands of eligible low-income students are still denied this grant each year due to insufficient funds.

This report is a publication of the Tennessee Independent Colleges and Universities Association (TICUA). We hope the recommendations in this report are useful to state policy makers as they move forward with decisions on the future of this program—a program that determines not only the choices and opportunities of the state’s most financially needy students to attend college but also the future economic and social well-being of all Tennesseans.

We welcome your thoughts and comments on this publication.

Claude O. Pressnell, Jr.  
President - TICUA

Joel Cunningham  
Chair - TICUA
Acknowledgements

The author extends appreciation to the following individuals for their support of and contribution to this report: Naomi Derryberry, Grant and Scholarship Program Administrator, Tennessee Student Assistance Corporation; Ron Gambill, President of Educational Funding of the South, Inc; and Claude Pressnell, President of the Tennessee Independent Colleges and Universities Association. Their expertise on this program, and historical insight, provided invaluable information that data alone could not provide.

In addition, special thanks to Robert Anderson, Director of Research and Planning, and Russ Deaton, Director of Fiscal Analysis, of the Tennessee Higher Education Commission. Their work on compiling data for the past ten years of this program provided the opportunity to understand trends in award allocation and student participation. This study would not have been possible without the annual surveys published by the National Association of State Student Grant & Aid Programs. This organization provided the historical data that allowed for a complete analysis of this grant program since its inception.
The Tennessee Independent Colleges and Universities Association has done a service with its timely and important report on the history and future of the Tennessee Student Assistance Award, *Investing in Educational Opportunity: Strengthening Tennessee’s Commitment to Low-Income Students and their Families*. The Commission was pleased to provide data for the project and supports the report’s overall theme: that if Tennessee is to compete in an economy that is increasingly knowledge-based and global, we must craft and sustain policies that encourage participation by citizens historically underserved by postsecondary education.

The report is timely, as evidenced by the fact that it aligns with a recent report from the Commission on the Future of Higher Education, which recommended that the nation should commit to “improving student preparation and persistence, addressing non-academic barriers and providing significant increases in aid to low-income students.” The Tennessee Education Lottery Scholarship is groundbreaking in that it provides extra funding for needy students who meet the merit-based criteria, but the TICUA report reminds us that the presence of the lottery scholarship does not reduce the imperative for further investment in our state’s neediest students. Ninety percent of the TSAA awards currently go to students from families earning less than $30,000 per year, or 150 percent of the federal poverty level for a family of four.

Much of the recent attention in Tennessee higher education policy has focused on implementing the lottery scholarship, resulting in a merit-based program that has found its place as a fundamental vehicle for raising student aspirations, improving academic preparation, and enhancing affordability while removing much of the uncertainty in students’ postsecondary planning. With those goals addressed, the TICUA report rightly refocuses our attention on the need for a continuing commitment to need-based aid for a student population whose successful participation in postsecondary education is necessary if we are to meet our goals as a state and as a nation.

The report is important in that it makes a lasting contribution to the state’s policy literature by compiling the history of this foundational financial aid program. Further, it makes four important observations:

- that over the last decade, the TSAA has covered an increasing percentage of college costs, but for a shrinking share of eligible applicants;

- that thousands of students with an expected family contribution of zero have gone unfunded over the life of the program;

- that over one million dollars in unused TSAA funds are returned annually, an untenable situation when some 100,000 eligible students went unserved last year, an estimated 20,000 of whom did not enroll due to financial reasons; and

- that the program would need to double in size to fund the estimated number of students who do not participate in higher education due to financial reasons.

October 30, 2006
State policymakers, institutions, and students will share responsibility for addressing these realities. A successful policy response will likely require some combination of increasing legislative appropriations to the TSAA program, providing state matching funds for institutional aid to needy students, linking a percentage of tuition increases to the institutional provision of need-based aid, and utilizing some portion of the lottery scholarship fund balance to serve this population.

Finally, while need-based aid is necessary for increasing the rate of postsecondary participation in Tennessee, it is insufficient on its own. Students who have been underserved historically by higher education face multiple barriers that are complex and interrelated. Surely, a comprehensive policy response must also address non-financial barriers such as the level of student aspiration, the rigor of academic preparation, and early and widespread availability of educational information. The Commission is currently engaged on each of these fronts and looks forward to working with TICUA and others toward the common goal of increasing successful postsecondary participation in the state of Tennessee.

Richard G. Rhoda
Executive Director
For many Tennesseans, educational opportunity is threatened. College affordability plays a critical role in determining who enrolls in college. A recent national study, Mortgaging our Future, estimates that in the 1990s somewhere between 1 million and 1.6 million bachelor’s degrees were lost among college-qualified high school graduates from low-and moderate-income families.”¹ If this trend continues without a public agenda by state policy leaders and higher education leaders for addressing college affordability issues, college will no longer be accessible by all but only by those students and families who can afford to pay. The Tennessee Student Assistance Award (TSAA) has made college more affordable for thousands of low-income Tennesseans over the last 30 years. However, this program is under severe strain and without action by state policy makers the financial situation of a student’s family could determine their social and economic mobility.

How the state addresses college affordability comes at a time when a college education is more important than ever. For most, college is the gateway to the middle class. According to Anthony P Carnevale, a leading economist who studies educational needs for the workforce, “There’s only one track in America that leads to success: the college track.”² There is no better time to confront college affordability and address the need for keeping higher education affordable for all who can benefit. Secretary of Education Margaret Spellings, in a recent interview on NPR, said that “90% of the fastest growing jobs in our country now will require postsecondary education.”³ Our country faces one of the biggest higher education challenges in history, and unless the issues of affordability are addressed, the opportunity for low-income students to attend college—and participate in a middle class lifestyle—will remain in jeopardy.

Tennessee faces many of the same college affordability issues as the rest of the nation. In 2004, the Tennessee General Assembly, recognizing the impact of college cost on students and their families, created the Tennessee Education Lottery Scholarship program. This student aid program focuses on academic achievement but includes a need-based aid component. The purpose of this program is to improve academic performance in high school through college scholarship incentives, to promote college access, to retain the state’s best and brightest students to attend college in the state, and to enhance economic and community development through workforce development. By enacting this program, state legislators were able to reduce the financial burden on students attending college—but this program does not replace the need for additional investment in the state’s neediest students. The TSAA represents the only purely need-based program in the state. The TELS scholarship and the TSAA go to very different groups of students. Of those students that currently receive the TSAA grant, only 4,716 (or 25%) also receive the TELS award. This study demonstrates both the importance of and the threats to the state’s need-based financial aid program. The TSAA grant program targets

---

³ Interview on Talk of the Nation, National Public Radio, October 3, 2006.
the state’s lowest income population—the majority from families that earn less than $25,000 a year. Last year, the TSAA program served about 18,700 low-income students but left over 100,000 low-income eligible students unfunded. In 1999, a study conducted on eligible but non-awarded TSAA applicants found that about 1 in 5 reported they did not enroll in college. The primary reason given by these students for not enrolling in college was financial. If we assume that the same ratio of eligible non-awarded TSAA applicants decided not to participate in higher education in academic year 2005-06—approximately 20,000 young adults in the state did not enroll in college because of financial barriers.

This is the first study to provide a comprehensive view of the TSAA program. This report highlights the history of the 34-year program and provides detailed data on funding, award level, and students receiving the award. The most important finding of this report is that despite the significant increase in support for this program, additional investment by state policy makers is required to ensure the future economic and social well-being of low-income Tennessee students and their families.

Research has shown that the availability of financial aid can change the enrollment patterns of low-income students. In order to support the economic and workforce needs of the state, Tennessee state policy makers must promote educational opportunity for all who can benefit. Legislators can change the lives of students by supporting the programs that increase educational opportunity for those in greatest financial need.

The Tennessee Independent Colleges and Universities Association recommends the following actions by state policy makers in order to strengthen educational opportunity for low-income students and their families.

1. Establish a plan for funding every qualified low-income Tennesseean through the Tennessee Student Assistance Award program.
   
   A. Increase annual funding of this program by 15%
   B. Use interest from the Tennessee Education Lottery Scholarship program to fund the TSAA program until the legislature is able to contribute additional dollars on an annual basis.
   C. Combine recommendation 1A and 1B.
   D. Dedicate an income stream to supporting this program.

2. Each year legislatively mandate that any remaining funds from the program will be allowed to carry forward to the next year for program use.

In 1972, the state’s first need-based financial aid program, the Tennessee Tuition Grant, was established by the Tennessee General Assembly. This program, administered by the Tennessee Tuition Grant Program, was created to provide the state’s lowest income residents with financial assistance to attend college in Tennessee.

In 1974, the grant program became the subject of a lawsuit filed to prevent state funds from going to students attending private colleges and universities. Later that year, the Tennessee Tuition Grant program was declared unconstitutional by a panel of three federal judges. In 1974 and 1975, legislation on the program was rewritten to restrict eligibility of Tennessee Tuition Grants to students attending colleges and universities that matched grant funding to students. At the time, public colleges and universities were legally unable to participate in programs that required matching funds to students. At the time, public colleges and universities were not eligible to receive this grant during these years. In February 1975, the U.S. Supreme Court granted a stay. Following that decision, the Tennessee Tuition Grant program was repealed by the Tennessee legislature. In 1976, the Tennessee Tuition Grant program was renamed the Tennessee Student Assistance Award (TSAA). In addition, the Tennessee Student Assistance Corporation (TSAC) was created to administer the TSAA program. With its new name, legislation was written to reinforce the purpose of the program—to provide the state’s lowest income students with financial assistance to attend the Tennessee college of their choice.

In 1993, the Tennessee General Assembly enacted the Restoration Fund. This Fund was a supplemental grant given to TSAA recipients attending Tennessee private colleges and universities. This Fund was created for the purpose of reducing the financial impact of institutional price on a student’s decision to enroll in a private college or university. In 2004-05, the Restoration Fund was renamed the Ben Atchley Opportunity Grant.

Funding for the TSAA program is provided annually by the Tennessee General Assembly. Since its inception, over $500 million has been contributed to the program and over 523,000 low-income students have received grants. State support for this program determines the number of grant recipients and the level of the award amount.

State undergraduate students are able to use this grant to attend any Tennessee two-year or four-year higher education institution, including vocational, technical and nursing colleges. Students must be enrolled at least half-time in college to be eligible for the award.

Student Eligibility

Students apply for the TSAA program by completing the Free Application for Federal Student Aid (FAFSA). The FAFSA utilizes the U.S. Department of Education’s federal methodology to determine an expected family contribution (EFC) to the student’s college education. Today the TSAA program is based on EFC, which is also the way eligibility for the Federal Pell Grant is determined. The expected family contribution is based primarily on parents’ income, the number of dependents, plus the number of dependents in college. The EFC is calculated based on what the federal government determines families should be able to pay toward college, not necessarily based on what families have available to pay for college. In 2005-06, the TSAA program eligibility changed from a yearly EFC of $1,900 to $2,100. The TSAA grant EFC level ($2,100) is lower than the Federal Pell Grant EFC level, which is $3,800/year.

At any given EFC level, tuition and fees at postsecondary institutions determine the financial award a grant recipient receives. Other factors taken into account when determining the award amount include: the legislative and administrative grant award maximum, the availability of funding of the program, and number of eligible applicants.

Governing and Advisory Board

The TSAC board consists of state policy leaders, education and higher education leaders, and private citizens. [see Appendix B for a list of 2006-07 board members].

TSAC also has a voluntary advisory board. These members consist of financial aid administrators from the state’s two-year and four-year higher education institutions including vocational, technical and nursing colleges. This board is appointed by the president of the Tennessee Association of Student Financial Aid Administrators (TASFAA).
This section analyzes the data on the TSAA program in ten-year periods, with the exception of the first fourteen years reported in part one. The data included in the first two parts are limited in scope, but provide general information program funding, students served, and average award level. The data analysis on the last ten years of the program also includes student participation information by award level, gender, ethnicity, and income.

In the late 1960s and early 1970s several states established student aid programs targeted to low-income students and their families. In 1972, Tennessee established its own program—the Tennessee Tuition Grant program. In 1976, following legislative changes to the program, the grant was renamed the Tennessee Student Assistance Award (TSAA). At this time, the state began to increase its investment in the program substantially.

From 1972-1985, the need-based grant program received $65.8 million and awarded 122,881 grants to low-income students to attend college. During this period, the annual investment by the state increased by more than 750% (from $1.1 million to $9.4 million). In the mid 1970s, funding for this program was about .5% of the total higher education budget. Ten years later, the percentage was closer to 2%.

In 1976, this program served 1% of all undergraduate students attending higher education in Tennessee. Ten years later, the program was serving about 10% of all undergraduates enrolling in higher education in the state.

During this period, the allocation of award dollars to TSAA grantees attending different types of postsecondary institutions shifted. For instance, in 1972 about one-third (30%) of all award dollars were distributed to TSAA recipients attending the state’s public colleges and universities, while 70% were dispersed to the state’s private institutions. Fourteen years later, close to half (45%) of TSAA grant dollars were given to low-income students enrolling in public colleges.

From 1972-1985, the TSAA program experienced the most significant increase in the number of grant recipients compared to any other time period. In 1972-73, the program awarded

2,002 low-income students with grants to attend college. By 1985-86, the program was awarding 19,084. Although the number of students served increased, the average grant award decreased by 17% over this period. In 1972, TSAA grant recipients received an average award amount of $588 (maximum award amount was $1,000) to attend college. Three years later, the average TSAA award to low-income students peaked at $900 (the maximum award amount increased to $1200). By 1985-86, the average award amount had fallen 17% below the 1972 award level to $494. During this period, the general policy for administering this program was to reach as many students as possible through this grant program, even if it meant the average award amount to students declined.

College attendance patterns of TSAA grant recipients also showed some change during the first 14 years of the program. In the first year of the program, a little over half (55%) of the award recipients attended a public institution, while 45% attended a private institution in the state. Fourteen years later, 68% of TSAA recipients were attending public institutions and 32% were attending private institutions.

**PART TWO: The Second Ten Years of the Program, 1986-1995**

During the middle years of the TSAA program, state investment increased with little change in the number of awards distributed. During this time, the policy for administering the program changed to focus on increasing the average award amount students received. While about the same number of students would receive the grant over this time period, grant recipients benefited from a higher award level. (see figure 6)

From 1986-1995, the state invested over $142 million in the TSAA grant program. This is a significant increase in state support compared to the first 14 years of the program (at $65 million). During this period, the state dollars invested annually in this program nearly doubled (from $10.6 million to $18.7 million). Even though the program received a substantial funding boost, the number of low-income students benefiting from this program remained relatively stable. (see figure 5)

From 1986-1995, close to 20,000 low-income students a year received a TSAA grant to attend college. While the number of students benefiting...
from this program remained relatively stable, the average award recipients received increased by 59% (from $539 to $857).

Figure 6 illustrates the average TSAA grant level given to recipients from 1986 to 1995. This trend reflects the opposite of what happened in the first years of the program (when the number of awards distributed increased while the average award amount to award recipients decreased). Despite the increases in the award level, when compared to increases in tuition and fee charges, the value of the TSAA award dropped for every sector of higher education over this period except for the two-year public colleges.

**PART THREE: The Past Ten Years of the Program, 1996-2005**

The data available for the last ten years of the program are more comprehensive. In this section, the study analyzes data that are not comparable with the years prior to the mid-1990s. The first part of this section highlights TSAA award distribution and allocation. The second part of this section includes information on students participating in the TSAA program, including data on award type, gender, and income.

In 1997, Governor Don Sundquist appointed a blue ribbon advisory group to study Tennessee’s higher education system and make recommendations for reform. This group, the Governor’s Council on Excellence in Higher Education, included state policy makers, business and civic leaders, and education and higher education leaders. The Council was asked to focus on three areas: academic programs, the percent of tuition and fee charges covered by the average TSAA grant. The data reveal that tuition and fee increases for all sectors of higher education over this period outpaced the increase in the average TSAA award level of $318 (average award was $539 in 1986-87 and $857 in 1995-96). In 1995-96, despite significant increases in the TSAA award level, the value of the average award covered less than half of tuition and fee charges for all sectors of higher education except for the two-year public colleges.

Table 1 shows the average tuition and fee rates for undergraduate students attending college in Tennessee, and

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1: Average Tuition and Fee Charges, 1986-87 and 1995-96</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1986-87</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tuition and Fees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private not-for-profit, 2-year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private not-for-profit, 4-year or above</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public, 2-year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public, 4-year or above</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Please note: Table 1 figures are based on the average award level for all institutions not the average award level by higher education sector (which was not available). Source: Integrated Postsecondary Education Data Systems, Tuition and Fee Surveys, 1986-95. Tennessee Student Assistance Corporation, 1996-2005.
finance and governance. One of the recommendations from this group was to “increase student financial aid for qualified low-income and underserved students and provide incentives for populations who typically do not enroll in college.” This report was used as leverage by the higher education leaders to increase support for the TSAA program in the late 1990s and early 2000s. Up until 2002-03, this program received significantly more funding support than in the past. The last three funding years for this program has remained relatively stable; at the same time the number of eligible students for this program has jumped substantially.

In 1995-96, despite significant increases in the TSAA award level, the value of the average award covered less than half of tuition and fee charges for all sectors of higher education except for the two-year public colleges.

**Award Distribution and Allocation**

In the past ten years, state investment in this program increased from $18 million a year to nearly $38 million a year—peaking at $45 million in 2002-03. The most significant jump in state investment occurred in the early 2000s—the same time that tuition and fees at the state’s colleges and universities edged into double digits. At the time, state policy leaders decided to invest more in the state’s need-based aid program to alleviate the cost of attending college for the state’s lowest income population since they were unable to provide significant funding to higher education. The distribution of program funding by the various higher education sectors remained relatively stable during this time (see table 2).

Table 2 highlights the distribution of TSAA program dollars by higher education sector based on college attendance patterns of grant recipients. From 1996-2005, the Tennessee Board of Regents institutions received the greatest share of TSAA award funding at about 43%, with a slight shift in funding dollars to students attending their two-year colleges. Tennessee’s private colleges and universities received between 37-38%. Fewer TSAA program dollars are going to the University of Tennessee system, while private/business and trade schools have increased the amount of program funding they receive by a couple of percentage points (3.8 to 5.0%). The Technology Centers have shown an increase in program funding. The diploma/nursing programs are in the final stages of being phased out in favor of an Associates or Bachelor’s degree in Nursing, which explains why program funding for diploma/nursing schools has declined to almost zero.

![Figure 7: Actual State Investment in TSAA Program, 1996-2005](image)


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Higher Education Sector</th>
<th>1996-97 Percent of Funding</th>
<th>2005-06 Percent of Funding</th>
<th>Percent (%) Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Independent/Four-Years</td>
<td>37.2%</td>
<td>38.3%</td>
<td>1.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent/Two-Years</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
<td>-0.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private/Business &amp; Trade</td>
<td>3.8%</td>
<td>5.0%</td>
<td>1.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TN Board of Regents</td>
<td>31.9%</td>
<td>30.7%</td>
<td>-1.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Tennessee System</td>
<td>15.0%</td>
<td>12.7%</td>
<td>-2.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TBR Tech/Community 2-year Colleges</td>
<td>10.5%</td>
<td>11.7%</td>
<td>1.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diploma/Nursing</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>-0.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tennessee Technology Centers</td>
<td>0.2%</td>
<td>1.4%</td>
<td>1.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From 1996 to 2005, the number of students benefiting from this grant program declined by 6% (from 20,069 to 18,713). During this time, this program left more than 517,000 eligible low-income students unfunded.

In 2002-03, however, the program served 28,657 low-income students—an all-time record for the program.

From 1996 to 2005, this report tracks the total number of Tennessee residents who were eligible to receive TSAA grant funding, and the total number of students who were actually awarded grant funding. This is the first complete review of this data, and shows the magnitude of the funding challenge facing this program. In 2001-02, the closest this program ever came to funding all eligible applicants, 25,893 low-income students received a TSAA grant—while almost 50,000 eligible applicants were left without funding. In 2005-06, this program funded only 16 out of every 100 eligible low-income students.

The significant jump in eligible TSAA recipients beginning in 2004 was mostly likely the result of the Tennessee Education Lottery Scholarship programs implemented in fall 2004. The TELS program required all students applying for the TELS award to fill out the FAFSA. This requirement resulted in more eligible students for the TSAA program since

---

**Figure 8: Number of TSAA Grant Recipients, 1996-2005**


**Figure 9: Number of Students Eligible vs. Awarded, 1996-2005**

Award eligibility increased from $1,900 to $2,100 yearly EFC in 2005-06. Data are unavailable for 2002-03. Data reports unique recipients per year. These figures include all eligible applicants through the academic year. This is the same criteria for determining Federal Pell Grant recipients. Source: Tennessee Student Assistance Corporation, June 2006.

**Figure 10: TSAA Awards by Higher Education Sector**

the FAFSA is the basis for determining eligibility for the TSAA.

This program does not have the ability to track students who were eligible to receive the grant but do not receive the grant due to insufficient program funding. However, the program does track the college attendance of TSAA recipients. Figure 10 highlights the college attendance patterns of TSAA grant recipients by higher education sector over the past ten years.

For the past ten years, the number of award recipients increased slightly while award distribution to TSAA grantees attending specific higher education sectors shifted significantly. The Tennessee Board of Regents' colleges received the highest proportion of TSAA award recipients, followed by the state's technical and community colleges and then by Tennessee's private colleges and universities.

In 2005-06, this program funded only 16 out of every 100 eligible low-income students.

From 1996 to 2005, the average TSAA grant for all postsecondary institutions increased from $929 to $2,055. The average award by higher education sector also increased across the board. Figure 11 captures the increase in TSAA award level by sector for this time period, and table 3 shows the increase in award value when compared to changes in tuition and fee charges and cost of attendance figures.

In 1996-97, the TSAA award covered 36% of undergraduate tuition and fees at the state's public two-year colleges, 42% at four-year public colleges, 27% at private two-year colleges, and 25% at four-year private colleges and universities. In 2005-06, the

**Table 3: Tuition and Fee Charges and Cost of College Attendance Charges 1996-97 and 2005-06**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>1996-97 Tuition and Fees</th>
<th>% of Tuition and Fees Covered by TSAA Grant</th>
<th>1996-97 Cost of Attendance</th>
<th>% of Cost of Attendance Covered by TSAA Grant</th>
<th>2005-06 Tuition and Fees</th>
<th>% of Tuition and Fees Covered by TSAA Grant</th>
<th>2004-05 Cost of Attendance</th>
<th>% of Cost of Attendance Covered by TSAA Grant</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Private not-for-profit, 2-year</td>
<td>$6,210</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>$8,330</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private not-for-profit, 4-year or above</td>
<td>$8,570</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>$14,885</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>$14,348</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>$22,035</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public, 2-year</td>
<td>$1,047</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>$2,142</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public, 4-year or above</td>
<td>$1,954</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>$5,498</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>$3,841</td>
<td>51%</td>
<td>$9,445</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


**Figure 11: Average TSAA Award Level by Higher Education Sector**

**Figure 12: Distribution by Award Type**

Please note: Data are unavailable for 2002-03. Source: Tennessee Student Assistance Corporation, 1996-2005.
TSAA award paid for 47% of undergraduate tuition and fees at public two-year colleges, 51% of the average tuition and fees at four-year public colleges, 41% at private two-year colleges, and 28% at four-year private colleges and universities. Although the value of the TSAA grant increased over time—this grant still covers less than half of tuition and fees for all sectors of higher education except for the public four-year institutions where it covers about half.

In addition to tuition and fee charges, table 3 also includes the cost of attendance at four-year undergraduate colleges and universities in Tennessee (this figure includes room, board and tuition and fee charges). Despite improvements in award value—the TSAA grant covers less than one-quarter of the cost of attending college at four-year colleges and universities in the state.

**Student Participation in the TSAA Program**

The section highlights information on students participating in the TSAA program. The data provides for analysis on student participation in the TSAA grant program by award type, gender, ethnicity, student level, and income.

**Award Type**

Over the last ten years, the majority of TSAA grants have been given to renewal students—students who received the award the prior year. From 1996-2001, close to 10% of awards were distributed to students who had not received the award previously, and about 10% were distributed to students who at one time had received an award but did not receive it the prior year. In the past five years, the percentage of awards distributed to renewal students increased, while 3-6% respectively of all awards are being distributed to new students and to students who at one time had received an award.
Gender

The majority of TSAA awards over the past decade have gone to women, and the trend has remained relatively constant over the past ten years. The percentage of women receiving TSAA grants is higher proportionately than overall enrollment rates of women at postsecondary institutions in Tennessee.

Despite improvements in award value—the TSAA grant covers less than one-quarter of the cost of attending college at four-year colleges and universities in the state.

Ethnicity

Figure 14 illustrates grant award recipients by ethnicity from 1996 to 2005. Over this ten-year period, the largest jump in percentage of awards given to a specific group of students was to black students—increasing from 23% to 36%. These figures are proportionately higher than overall enrollment figures of black students at the state’s postsecondary institutions. The percentage of awards given to white students also increased from 55% to 57%. Asian, Hispanic and American Indian students continue to receive less than 1% of all TSAA grants. TSAA recipients were more likely to report their ethnicity in recent years.

Family Income

From 1996 to 2005, nearly 80% of all TSAA awards were distributed to students with a yearly family income below $25,000. Over this ten-year period, this program left close to 84,000 eligible students with a family income of zero unfunded.

Expected Family Contribution

In addition to reviewing students’ family income, this report also analyzes data by expected family contribution (EFC). Student eligibility for this grant program is determined by a student’s EFC. The EFC figure is primarily based on parents’ income, the number of dependents in the household, plus the number of dependents in college. In 2005-06, the EFC increased from $1,900 per year to $2,100 per year. The EFC for the Federal Pell Grant (federal need-based aid program) is $3,800 per year, almost twice as high as the EFC of TSAA.

From 1996-2005, over 50% of all TSAA grant recipients had an EFC of zero. Although more than half of all TSAA recipients come from a family income of zero, thousands of students from a family income of zero remain unfunded through this program.

Over this ten-year period, this program left close to 84,000 eligible students with a family income of zero unfunded.

The purpose of this study is to highlight the history of the TSAA program and make recommendations to state policy leaders on how to fully fund the program. Thousands of students have benefited from this program over the years, but this report finds that thousands more go unfunded. According to Measuring Up 2006: Tennessee, young Tennesseans “from high-income families are nearly twice as likely as those from low-income families to attend college.” Legislators have the unique opportunity to change the future lives of students by supporting programs that increase educational opportunity to those in greatest financial need. These recommendations provide options on how to finance this program in the future and expand opportunity for all low-income students to attend college regardless of financial situation.

The Tennessee Independent Colleges and Universities Association recommends the following actions by state policy makers:

1. **Establish a plan for funding every qualified low-income Tennessean through the Tennessee Student Assistance Award program.**

   Last year, $38.4 million in state dollars served over 18,700 students. If the state had fully funded every eligible low-income student through this program, the program would have needed to receive an additional $206 million.

   A. Increase annual funding of this program by 15%. By investing an additional 15% in this program each year, the program could be fully funded in about 26 years.

   B. Use interest from the Tennessee Education Lottery Scholarship program to fund the TSAA program until the legislature is able to contribute additional dollars on an annual basis. The most recent lottery fund estimate is about $316 million. If the interest from this revenue is allocated to the TSAA program, assuming an annual interest rate of 5%, about $15.8 million per year would be generated from the interest. The money from this interest would fund an additional 7,680 eligible low-income students.

   C. Combine recommendation 1A and 1B. If the legislature increased funding each year by 15% and allocated the interest from the lottery program to the TSAA program—the TSAA program could be fully funded in about 12 years.

   D. Dedicate an income stream to supporting this program. Does the state presently have an income stream (tax-based) that could dedicate a portion of its revenue to fund this program on an annual basis? State policy leaders should examine all tax income streams and, if available, dedicate a portion of one revenue stream to improving the educational attainment of the state’s lowest-income students. For each additional funding contribution of $20.5 million, this program can serve an additional 10,000 eligible students with a TSAA grant.

2. **Each year legislatively mandate that any remaining funds from the program will be allowed to carry forward to the next year for program use.** As a state agency, the Tennessee Student Assistance Corporation is required to return unspent funds allocated for the TSAA program. Despite every effort to spend all funds awarded, some funding will always remain. Students should not be penalized for a system that was created to break even. If TSAC had spent all of the money allocated for the TSAA program last year, an additional 1,100 eligible low-income students would have been served through this program.

---

11. This calculation assumes a 3% increase each year in eligible TSAA applicants and a 4% increase each year in award level.
12. The 7,680 figure is derived using the 2005-06 TSAA average award level. The interest rate of 5% is the current interest rate generated from the lottery fund.
13. This figure is derived using the 2005-06 TSAA average award level.
14. This figure includes the $1.5 million revision request by the Governor.
Methodology

The first 24 years of the data reported in this study were compiled by TICUA using the National Association of State Student Grant & Aid Programs (NASSGAP) annual surveys. The past ten years of data reported in this study were compiled by Robert Anderson and Russ Deaton at the Tennessee Higher Education Commission. The analysis of the data was conducted by TICUA research staff. The original source for all of the data on the Tennessee Student Assistance Award program is the Tennessee Student Assistance Corporation.
APPENDIX A

Data: Changes Over Time

34-Year Change Over Time: State Dollars Invested in TSAA Program


34-Year Change Over Time: Number of TSAA Grant Recipients

34-Year Change Over Time: Average TSAA Grant Amount


30-Year Change Over Time: Number of Undergraduate Students Enrolled in Higher Education and Number of TSAA Grant Recipients


30-Year Trend: TSAA Dollars As a Percent of Overall Higher Education Appropriations, 1974-2005

## History of TSAA Program:

**Dollars Allocated, Number of Grant Recipients, Average Award Amount by Year Since Program Inception**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year (Fiscal/Academic)</th>
<th>Program Dollars (Allocated)</th>
<th># of Grant Recipients</th>
<th>Average Award Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1972-73</td>
<td>$1,177,093</td>
<td>2,002</td>
<td>$588</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1973-74</td>
<td>$2,146,628</td>
<td>3,888</td>
<td>$552</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1974-75</td>
<td>$3,370,000</td>
<td>5,697</td>
<td>$592</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1975-76</td>
<td>$640,000</td>
<td>711</td>
<td>$900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1976-77</td>
<td>$1,447,000</td>
<td>2,309</td>
<td>$627</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1977-78</td>
<td>$2,977,000</td>
<td>4,958</td>
<td>$600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1978-79</td>
<td>$3,668,000</td>
<td>6,124</td>
<td>$599</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1979-80</td>
<td>$5,978,000</td>
<td>11,098</td>
<td>$539</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1980-81</td>
<td>$6,475,000</td>
<td>9,001</td>
<td>$719</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981-82</td>
<td>$6,439,000</td>
<td>8,995</td>
<td>$716</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1982-83</td>
<td>$7,221,000</td>
<td>16,485</td>
<td>$438</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1983-84</td>
<td>$6,700,000</td>
<td>15,891</td>
<td>$422</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1984-85</td>
<td>$8,207,000</td>
<td>16,638</td>
<td>$493</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1985-86</td>
<td>$9,434,000</td>
<td>19,084</td>
<td>$494</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1986-87</td>
<td>$10,618,000</td>
<td>19,715</td>
<td>$539</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987-88</td>
<td>$12,591,000</td>
<td>21,987</td>
<td>$573</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1988-89</td>
<td>$11,977,000</td>
<td>19,000</td>
<td>$630</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989-90</td>
<td>$12,977,000</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990-91</td>
<td>$13,487,000</td>
<td>19,893</td>
<td>$678</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991-92</td>
<td>$12,793,000</td>
<td>18,228</td>
<td>$702</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992-93</td>
<td>$14,270,000</td>
<td>19,388</td>
<td>$736</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993-94</td>
<td>$16,755,000</td>
<td>19,388</td>
<td>$864</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994-95</td>
<td>$18,239,450</td>
<td>21,768</td>
<td>$838</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995-96</td>
<td>$18,780,504</td>
<td>21,925</td>
<td>$857</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996-97</td>
<td>$18,652,127</td>
<td>20,069</td>
<td>$929</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997-98</td>
<td>$20,438,157</td>
<td>20,787</td>
<td>$983</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998-99</td>
<td>$20,647,769</td>
<td>17,983</td>
<td>$1,148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999-2000</td>
<td>$21,382,923</td>
<td>18,104</td>
<td>$1,181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000-01</td>
<td>$29,303,534</td>
<td>22,537</td>
<td>$1,300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001-02</td>
<td>$37,320,053</td>
<td>25,893</td>
<td>$1,441</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002-03</td>
<td>$45,726,011</td>
<td>28,657</td>
<td>$1,596</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003-04</td>
<td>$41,833,379</td>
<td>23,303</td>
<td>$1,795</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004-05</td>
<td>$42,645,415</td>
<td>22,917</td>
<td>$1,861</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005-06</td>
<td>$38,447,877</td>
<td>18,713</td>
<td>$2,055</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>$524,764,920</strong></td>
<td><strong>523,136</strong></td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tennessee Student Assistance Corporation
Board of Directors, 2006-07

Honorable Phil Bredesen (Chairman), Governor of Tennessee
Designee: Mr. Patrick Smith

Dr. Richard Rhoda (Vice Chairman), Executive Director
Tennessee Higher Education Commission

Dr. Claude O. Pressnell, Jr (Secretary), President
Tennessee Independent Colleges and Universities Association

Mr. Dale Sims (Treasurer), State Treasurer
Designee: Ms. Janice Cunningham

Mr. John Morgan, State Comptroller of the Treasury
Designee: Ms. Faye Weaver

Mr. Dave Goetz, Commissioner,
State Department of Finance and Administration
Designee: Mr. Peter Abernathy

Ms. Lana Seivers, Commissioner, State Department of Education
Designee: Mr. Morgan Branch

Dr. John Petersen, President, University of Tennessee
Designee: Dr. Robert Levy

Dr. Charles W. Manning, Chancellor, Tennessee Board of Regents
Designee: Mr. David Gregory

Mr. Paul Starnes, President
Tennessee Proprietary Business School Association, Inc.

Dr. Joel Cunningham, President, Sewanee: University of the South
Designee: Dr. Nancy Moody

Ms. Janette Overton, President
Tennessee Association of Student Financial Aid Administrators

Ms. Mary Kate Ridgeway, Citizen Member

Ms. Deborah A. Cole, Citizen Member

Mr. Clay Petrey, Citizen Member

Ms. Victoria Wheeler, Student Member
REFERENCES


Davis, Jerry S. National Association of State Scholarship and Grant Programs 24th Annual Survey, 1992-93.


Digest of Education Statistics, Average Undergraduate tuition & fees and room & board rates 1996-97 (table 313) and 2004-05 (table 313).


Grapevine Survey of State Higher Education Tax Appropriations for Fiscal Year 1999-00.


Reeher, Kenneth R. National Association of State Scholarship and Grant Programs 14th Annual Survey, 1982-83.

Reeher, Kenneth R. National Association of State Scholarship and Grant Programs 15th Annual Survey, 1983-84.

Reeher, Kenneth R. National Association of State Scholarship and Grant Programs 16th Annual Survey, 1984-85.

Reeher, Kenneth R. National Association of State Scholarship and Grant Programs 17th Annual Survey, 1985-86.


Listed Alphabetically

Mr. Darrell Akins - Vice Chair
President - Akins Crisp Public Strategies, Knoxville

Sen. Ben Atchley
Former State Senator, Knoxville

Sister Thomas Aquinas
President, Aquinas College, Nashville

Dr. Gordon Bietz
President - Southern Adventist University, Collegedale

Mr. Dean Chase
President - D. F. Chase, Inc., Nashville

Dr. Joel Cunningham - Chair
Vice Chancellor and President - University of the South, Sewanee

Dr. David Dockery
President - Union University, Jackson

Dr. Harvill Eaton
President - Cumberland University, Lebanon

Mr. Charles Farmer
Mayor - City of Jackson

Mr. Bob Hardin
Vice President - Maytag Corporation, Cleveland

Dr. Dolphus Henry
President - Tusculum College, Greeneville

Dr. Dan Hogan
President and CEO - Fifth Third Bank, N.A. (Tennessee)

Dr. Nancy Moody - Treasurer
President - Lincoln Memorial University, Harrogate

Mr. Jeffrey D. Nesin - Past Chair
President - Memphis College of Art, Memphis

Dr. Claude O. Pressnell, Jr. - Secretary
President - TICUA, Nashville

Sen. Andy Womack
Former Chair - Tenn. Senate Ed. Committee, Murfreesboro & Agent - State Farm Insurance

Aquinas College, Nashville
Baptist College of Health Sciences, Memphis
Belmont University, Nashville
Bethel College, McKenzie
Bryan College, Dayton
Carson-Newman College, Jefferson City
Christian Brothers University, Memphis
Crichton College, Memphis
Cumberland University, Lebanon
Fisk University, Nashville
Free Will Baptist Bible College, Nashville
Freed-Hardeman University, Henderson
Hiwassee College, Madisonville
John A. Gupton College, Nashville
Johnson Bible College, Knoxville
King College, Bristol
Lambuth University, Jackson
Lane College, Jackson
Lee University, Cleveland
LeMoyne-Owen College, Memphis
Lincoln Memorial University, Harrogate
Lipscomb University, Nashville
Martin Methodist College, Pulaski
Maryville College, Maryville
Meharry Medical College, Nashville
Memphis College of Art, Memphis
Middle Tennessee School of Anesthesia, Madison
Milligan College, Milligan College
Rhodes College, Memphis
Southern Adventist University, Collegedale
Southern College of Optometry, Memphis
Tennessee Wesleyan College, Athens
Trevecca Nazarene University, Nashville
Tusculum College, Greeneville
Union University, Jackson
The University of the South, Sewanee
Vanderbilt University, Nashville
TICUA engages Tennessee’s private colleges and universities to work collaboratively in areas of public policy, cost containment, and professional development to better serve the state and its citizens. The association counts among its membership each independent, non-profit, regionally accredited college and university in Tennessee with a traditional arts and science curriculum. In addition, there are several non-profit, regionally accredited members that specialize in such fields as medicine, dentistry, optometry, fine arts, and mortuary science.

**S T A F F**

**CLAUDE O. PRESSNELL, JR.**  
President

**MICHAEL ALBERT**  
Assistant Director of Research and Technology

**SUSANNA L. BAXTER**  
Vice President for Member Services and Grants

**JOAN CHAPPELL**  
Director of Administrative Services

**C. GREGG CONROY**  
Executive Director, TICUA Benefit Consortium

**HEATHER L. JACK**  
Vice President of Research and Public Affairs

**DARLENE THORNTON**  
Administrative Coordinator, TICUA Benefit Consortium

1031 17th Avenue, South  Nashville, TN 37212-2201  
615/242-6400  fax 615/242-8033  
www.ticua.org

For additional copies, please call (615) 242-6400, ext. 202 or fax request to (615) 242-8033.  