The Best Decision
by Design:
Professional Services Selection
Presenters

Huck Lewis, Mayor of Lebanon
Tom Stevens, Hancock County Commissioner
John Brand, Butler, Fairman & Seufert
Selection Committee Assemble
Request for Proposals

The Lincoln County Highway Department, on behalf of the Lincoln County Board of Commissioners, respectively requests a quote for the project with scope details listed below:

1. A 200 foot replacement bridge carrying Harrison Road over Taylor Creek in Taylor Township.
2. Softening of the roadway approach curve to the immediate north. This project will include Preliminary Engineering and Right of Way for both the bridge and the approach roadway work.

The plans for this project must be discussed with the Lincoln County Highway Supervisor prior to the proposal submission. The proposal submission shall contain a written scope of work and a cost to perform the necessary services. The services requested in this RFP include PE and R/W. Call (555) 637 3563 for an appointment.

Matthew Morris, Supervisor

Lincoln County Highway Department
March 10, 2015

Lincoln County Highway Department
Attn: Matthew Morris, Supervisor
100 W. Main Street
Lincoln City, IN 47000

RE: Harrison Road Bridge Replacement over Taylor Creek

Best Price Engineering appreciates the opportunity to submit this proposal for the Harrison Road Bridge Replacement over Taylor Creek in Taylor Township. After reviewing your Request for Proposals, we visited the project site to identify potential areas of concern and project constraints. The following represents Best Price Engineering’s proposed scope of services based on our understanding of the project:

- Preliminary Engineering - Bridge Structural Services
  - Replace existing bridge with in-kind structure
  - Substructure design
  - Superstructure design
  - Provide stream bank slope protection

- Preliminary Engineering - Roadway Services
  - Maintain existing alignment and profile of roadway approaches
  - Install advance warning signs for the approach curve immediately north
  - Update pavement markings
  - Update existing signs

- Right-of-Way Engineering Services
  - No additional right-of-way is anticipated
  - Title Research
  - Verify existing right-of-way limits

Best Price Engineering will provide Preliminary Engineering Services and Right-of-way Engineering Services with the scope outlined above for a lump sum cost of $50,000. Keeping the project footprint within the existing right-of-way and installing an in-kind bridge structure will provide overall cost savings to the Lincoln County Highway Department. When you need a company to deliver a project for the least cost you can count on Best Price Engineering. If you have any questions or comments regarding this submittal, please feel free to contact us at (888) 555-4444. We thank you for your consideration and look forward to working with the Lincoln County Highway Department.

Respectfully,

Best Price Engineering

Joe Best, PE
President

John Price, PE
Vice-President
March 10, 2015

Lincoln County Highway Department
Attn: Matthew Morris, Supervisor
100 W. Main Street
Lincoln City, IN 47000

Mr. Morris,

Midpoint Engineering is pleased to submit this proposal for the replacement of the bridge carrying Harrison Road over Taylor Creek in Taylor Township. Based on our meeting with you on February 9th, 2015, the replacement of this bridge is necessary due to its deteriorated condition.

Per the RFP requirements, our scope of work for this project is broken down by Preliminary Engineering (PE) and Right of Way (R/W) Services as follows:

Preliminary Engineering

- **Geotechnical Subsurface Investigation.** It is anticipated that a geotechnical subsurface investigation will be necessary for this project. The extent of the investigation will be determined in the field.
- **Survey.** Concurrent with design, we will begin the required topographic survey for the project. The survey will cover the entire anticipated project area, including adequate coverage of the creek to perform a detailed hydraulic analysis for the bridge.
- **Bridge Design.** It is anticipated that the new bridge will be approximately 200’ long with a 24’ minimum clear roadway. The proposed structure will be sized to improve the hydraulic characteristics of the existing bridge. It is assumed that the structure will be a precast concrete bridge.
- **Roadway Design.** The approach will be softened and reconstructed to provide two 10’ travel lanes, bordered by two 2’ shoulders. The roadway section will be further discussed with the County prior to finalizing the design. Standard approach railing and transitions will be placed to provide a safe approach through the bridge.
- **Utility Coordination.** Underground and aerial utilities may exist within the project limits. If determined necessary, identification and notification of utilities with facilities that will be impacted by this project will be coordinated.
- **Environmental Services.** We will attempt to identify environmental issues early in the design and to deliver the required environmental approval (if needed) within the required timeframe. It is likely that a categorical exclusion level 2 or 3 will be required for this project to satisfy NEPA.
- **Permits.** An IDEM 401 Water Quality Certification and a US Corps of Engineers 404 permit may be required as a part of the project. A Rule 5 permit may also be necessary as the impact area
of this bridge replacement project may be in excess of one acre. A DNR permit may also be needed since the drainage area could exceed 1 square mile.

R/W Services
Due to the impacts of the project, permanent R/W acquisition is anticipated. The adjacent land near the project includes residential and agricultural properties. We have the ability to provide Lincoln County the following R/W services as needed:

- Prepare R/W plans
- Perform the appraisal
- Negotiate with the property owner
- Purchase the right-of-way
- Provide relocation services if needed.

Anticipated Fees

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Work Categories</th>
<th>Anticipated Fees</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preliminary Engineering (including Survey)</td>
<td>$ 55,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geotechnical Subsurface Investigation (if needed)</td>
<td>$ 5,000*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utility Coordination (if needed)</td>
<td>$ 3,000*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Services (if needed)</td>
<td>$ 7,000*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permits (if needed)</td>
<td>$ 5,000*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R/W Services</td>
<td>$ 25,000*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TOTAL** $100,000

*The actual fee will be determined as the work is completed. If the actual fee exceeds the anticipated fee, a supplement will be requested for the difference.

We appreciate the opportunity to submit this proposal and look forward to working with you on this bridge replacement project.

Sincerely,

MIDPOINT ENGINEERING

John Doe, PE
President
Lincoln County Highway Department
Attn: Matthew Morris, Supervisor
100 W. Main Street
Lincoln City, IN 47000

RE: Request for Proposals – Harrison Road over Taylor Creek

Mr. Morris

Thank you for the opportunity to submit our proposal for this bridge replacement project. Below please find our estimated scope of services required to complete the PE and R/W for this project.

LPA Bridge Replacement Preliminary Engineering Services

- Field Survey
- Geotechnical Investigation
- Environmental Services:
  - Asbestos Inspection
  - U.S. Waters Report
  - Categorical Exclusion Level (Level 1)
  - Archaeological Records Check and Field Work
  - Section 106 Documentation
  - Public Hearing
  - Regulatory Permits (401, 404, IDNR, Rule 5)
- Hydraulic Design
- Utility Coordination (Including Post-Bid Services)
- Design Services
  - Structure Size and Type
  - Roadway Geometric Alternatives (3 alternatives assumed)
  - Project Design and Plans (Recommended structure type and roadway alternative)
- Pavement Design
- Right-Of-Way Engineering (4 Parcels)
- Right of Way Services (4 Parcels, No Condemnation)
- Post-Letting Services (Preconstruction conference, RFI’s, Shop Drawing Review, etc.)

 Proposed Lump Sum Fee = $150,000

Again, thank you for the chance to submit on this project and we welcome the opportunity to work with you and Lincoln County.

Sincerely,

William Engineer, PE
Excellent Engineering, Inc.
Selection of Engineer
March 10, 2015

Lincoln County Highway Department
Attn: Matthew Morris, Supervisor
100 W. Main Street
Lincoln City, IN 4700

Re: Request for Proposals for Design and Right of Way Services for the Harrison Road Crossing over Taylor Creek

Dear Mr. Morris:

Thank you for the invitation to submit a quote to provide Lincoln County with design and right of way consultation services.

As much as we appreciate the opportunity to assist the County in its engineering needs, our firm’s primary motivation is always guided by our client’s best interests and our commitment to deliver successful projects. In lieu of fee based selection, the philosophy of selecting a consultant based on their qualifications to serve the client and the project provides the greatest value and opportunity for overall project success. This process also allows the client to perform a true “apples to apples” comparison of respondents. Therefore, we respectfully decline this opportunity so we can focus our attention on gaining a better understanding of the County’s future project needs in an effort to demonstrate the value of our services.

In our commitment to building and nurturing long-term client relationships, I will continue to stay in touch with the hope and expectation that there will be other opportunities to assist the County in the future. In the meantime, I wish you the best of luck with the successful completion of this project.

Sincerely,

Frank Jones
Stone Engineers, Inc.
Request for Proposals

The Lincoln County Highway Department, on behalf of the Lincoln County Board of Commissioners, respectively requests a quote\(^1\) proposal for the project with scope details\(^2\) listed below:

1. A 200-foot replacement bridge\(^3\) carrying Harrison Road over Taylor Creek in Taylor Township.
2. Softening\(^4\) of the roadway approach curve to the immediate north. This project will include Preliminary Engineering\(^5\) and Right of Way\(^6\) for both the bridge and the approach roadway work.

The plans for this project must be discussed\(^7\) with the Lincoln County Highway Supervisor prior to the proposal submission. The proposal submission shall contain a written scope of work and a cost\(^8\) to perform the necessary services. The services requested in this RFP include PE and R/W. Call (555) 637-3563 for an appointment.\(^9\)

Matthew Morris, Supervisor
Lincoln County Highway Department

\(^1\)Quote implies that the response is to include a fee or cost. Use of the word Proposal (or Letter of Interest) is preferred. RFP should detail what is required in the “proposal” (i.e. Project Manager information, project experience, project approach, etc.).

\(^2\)The listed information does not really contain details of the scope. It mostly contains project information including location and ultimate purpose of the project.

\(^3\)Details of the decision factors in determining the need for a replacement bridge should be provided.
- Did the County evaluate rehabilitation of the bridge, which may be less costly?
- What is the type of bridge required/desired?
- Is there information available for the existing bridge?
- Different design details for different structures will affect the design fee that is being requested.
- Is the existing bridge historic or on the select list? The answer will affect the services that are needed.
- Is there any information about Taylor Creek available that would restrict placing a pier in the water? This will affect design effort as well as permitting (IDNR, IDEM, Corps, etc.)
“Softening” is vague. What is the intent of modification of the north approach? Is an alignment study required to evaluate alternate geometrics or is the intent to simply to widen the existing pavement on the current alignment? To what standards should the modification be adhered to?

Is the consultant to include a topographic survey, or does the County already have a survey? Other services needed (i.e. Environmental, Geotech, etc)?

Right-of-Way: is this R/W Engineering only? Or does this include appraisals, buying, etc?

Although discussion with the proposers is a good idea to answer questions, without any further detail in the RFP the Highway Superintendent may inadvertently relay differing information to different consultants during individual meetings.

QBS procedure would be to accept proposals, without cost information, select the most qualified and then negotiate with the selected consultant. If agreeable terms cannot be reached, the County could then negotiate with the next most qualified firm.

There is not a due date/time stated for the proposals. All proposers should be given a firm date and time, by which the proposals are due to the County.
Proposal Posting Date:
February 11, 2015

Request for Proposals Notification

*Project Location:* Lincoln County Highway Department, Bridge Replacement carrying Harrison Road over Taylor Creek

*Response Due Date and Time:* March 10, 2015 at 12:00pm EST

This Request for Proposal (RFP) is official notification of needed professional services. This RFP is being issued to solicit a Letter of Interest (LoI) and other documents from firms qualified to perform engineering work on federal aid projects. A submittal does not guarantee that the firm will be contracted to perform any services but only serves notice that that firm desires to be considered.

*Contact for Questions:* Matthew Morris
Supervisor
Lincoln County Highway Department
100 W. Main Street
Lincoln City, IN 47000
Office: 555-637-3563

*Submittal requirements:*

Submit three (3) copies of the following:

1. Letter of Interest (required content and instructions follow)

2. Signed Affirmative Action Certification and associated required documents for all items with Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE) goals (sample form follows).

*Submit To:* Matthew Morris
Supervisor
Lincoln County Highway Department
100 W. Main Street
Lincoln City, IN 47000
Selection Procedures:

Consultants will be selected for work items further described herein, based on the evaluation of the Letter of Interest (LoI) and other required documents. The Consultant Selection Rating Form that will be used to evaluate and score the submittals is included for your reference.

To be eligible for consideration, the lead consultant must be prequalified by INDOT.

Requirements for Letters of Interest (LoI)

A. General instructions for Preparing and Submitting a Letter of Interest (LoI)

1. Provide the information as set out in Item B below, in the same order listed, signed by an officer of the firm. Scanned signed documents or electronically applied signatures are both acceptable. Do not send additional forms, resumes, brochures, or other material unless otherwise noted in the item description.

2. LoI’s shall be limited to a total of twelve (12) 8 ½” x 11” pages. Ten (10) pages for Identification and Qualification and two (2) pages for the combined Key staff and Project Approach unless otherwise noted in the Project Description.

3. LoI’s must be received not later than “Response Due Date and Time” as shown in the RFP header shown above. Responses received after this deadline will not be considered. Submittals must include all required attachments to be considered for selection.

B. Letter of Interest Content

1. Identification and Qualifications
   a. Provide the firm name, address of the responsible office from which the work will be performed and the name and email address of the contact person authorized to negotiate for the associated work.
   b. List all proposed sub consultants, their DBE status, and the percentage of work to be performed by the lead consultant and each sub consultant (sample Affirmative Action Certification follows). A listing of certified DBE’s eligible to be considered for selection as prime consultants or sub-consultants for this RFP can be found at the Indiana Department of Transportation’s (INDOT) website. (http://www.in.gov/indot/2576.htm).
   c. Provide personnel resumes and such additional information concerning qualifications as may be relevant to the project.
2. Key staff and Project approach

a. List the Project Manager and other key staff members, including key sub consultant staff and include the percent of time the project manager will be committed for the contract, if selected. Include project engineers for important disciplines and staff members that will be responsible for the work. Address the experience of the key staff members on similar projects and the staff qualifications relative to the required item qualifications.

b. Describe the capacity of your staff and their ability to perform the work in a timely manner relative to present workload and the availability of the assigned staff.

c. Provide a description of your Project Approach relative to the advertised services. For project specific items confirm that the firm has visited the project site. For all items address your firm’s technical understanding of the project or services, as related to your firm’s qualifications.

Requirements for Affirmative Action Certification

A completed Affirmative Action Certification form is required for all items that identify a DBE goal. The consultant must identify the DBE firms with which it intends to subcontract. Include the contract participation percentage of each DBE and list what the DBE will be subcontracted to perform on the Affirmative Action Certification Form. Copies of DBE certifications, as issued by INDOT, for each firm listed are to be included as additional pages after the form. If the consultant does not meet the DBE goal, the consultant must provide documentations on additional pages that it has made good faith efforts to achieve the DBE goal. Please review the DBE program based on any goals set and complete the DBE Affirmative Action Certification form as applicable. What constitutes good faith efforts is explained in detail within the DBE program information referred to above. If no goal is set then no Affirmative Action Certification form is required. Indiana Department of Transportation’s (INDOT) DBE Program Information is available at the Indiana Department of Transportation’s website.

A listing of certified DBE’s eligible to be considered for selection as prime consultants or sub consultants for this RFP can be found at the Indiana Department of Transportation’s (INDOT) website. (http://www.in.gov/indot/2576.htm)

DBE subcontracting goals apply to all prime submitting consultants, regardless of the prime’s status of DBE.
**Work Item details:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Local Public Agency Name:</th>
<th>Lincoln County Highway Department</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Project Location:</td>
<td>Bridge replacement carrying Harrison Road over Taylor Creek in Taylor Township</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INDOT District covering project:</td>
<td>Greenfield</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INDOT Des#: (if known)</td>
<td>1111111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project Phases Included:</td>
<td>Preliminary Engineering, Right-of-Way Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project Description:</td>
<td>This is a 200 foot replacement bridge carrying Harrison Road over Taylor Creek in Taylor Township. Also included is a minor roadway modification at the north approach.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estimated Construction Amount:</td>
<td>$1,500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Funding:</td>
<td>100% Local</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Term of Contract:</td>
<td>completion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DBE Goal:</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Required Prequalification Categories: | 5.2 Environmental Document Prep - CE  
5.6 Waterway Permits  
6.1 Topographical Survey Data Collection  
7.1 Geotechnical Engineering Services  
8.1 No-Complex Roadway Design  
9.2 Level 2 Bridge Design  
11.1 Right of Way Plan Development  
12.1,12.2,12.3,12.4,12.5,12.6,12.7 |
AFFIRMATIVE ACTION CERTIFICATION FOR DBE

I hereby certify that my company intends to affirmatively seek out and consider Disadvantaged Business Enterprises (DBEs) certified in the State of Indiana to participate as part of this proposal. I acknowledge that this certification is to be made an integral part of this proposal. I understand and agree that the submission of a blank certification may cause the proposal to be rejected. I certify that I have consulted the following DBE website to confirm that the firms listed below are currently certified DBEs:
https://financial.gms.in.gov/psc/ggs/EMPLOYEE/EPReport/SOL_APPS_MWBEL Sole DBE Cert BLRF
I certify that I have contacted the certified DBEs listed below, and if my company becomes the CONSULTANT, these DBEs have tentatively agreed to perform the services as indicated.
I understand that neither my company nor I will be penalized for DBE utilization that exceeds the goal.
After contract award, any change to the firms listed in this Affirmative Action Certification to be applied toward the DBE goal must have prior approval by INDOT’s Economic Opportunity Division.

**SUBCONSULTANTS**

**DBE SUBCONSULTANTS TO BE APPLIED TOWARD GOAL**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Certified DBE Name</th>
<th>Service Planned</th>
<th>Estimated percentage to be paid to DBE*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**DBE SUBCONSULTANTS TO BE USED BEYOND GOAL**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Certified DBE Name</th>
<th>Service Planned</th>
<th>Estimated percentage to be paid to DBE*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Estimated Dollar Amount Credited toward DBE Goal: ________________
Estimated Dollar Amount of Voluntary DBE Work Anticipated over DBE Goal: ________________

Name of Company: ____________________________________________

By: ____________________________________________ Date: __________

*It is understood that these individual firm percentages and dollar amounts are estimates only and that amounts paid may be greater or less as a result of negotiation of the contract scope of work. My firm will use good faith efforts to meet the overall DBE goal through the use of these or other certified and approved DBE firms.
Federal Brooks Act Law- 1972
(P.L. 92-582)

Requires that the U.S. Federal Government select engineering and architecture firms based upon their competency, qualifications and experience rather than by price.

Indiana Local Projects
(IC 5-16-11.1-5)

A public agency may make all contracts for professional services on the basis of competence and qualifications for the type of services to be performed and negotiate compensation that the public agency determines to be reasonable.
Why not price proposals from 3 or 4 top-ranked firms under a “best value” process?

• Lack of detailed scope of work beyond basic project parameters leads to inaccurate price proposals.

• Collaborative scoping allows consideration of innovative options not considered by Owner for all facets of project to provide more successful project outcomes – more durable facilities, lower construction costs, shorter construction schedules, lower life cycle costs, etc.

• When cost is a factor in selection, it trumps quality and innovation.

• Submitting firms will cut the scope of work in order to be price competitive and attempt to recover needed design effort and costs during project development.
QBS Processes

QBS Lite
- Step 1-Select firm based on past performance or knowledge of project or community. Document basis of selection
- Complete Step 2 and 3

How do you select your subconsultant?
Overall Long-Term Cost of Project

• Engineering and design services are a small percentage of the total project cost, and studies have shown that QBS actually saves money during the construction phase of the project, which is where most of the money is spent.

• Maryland experience 1976 and 1982 showed that fee bidding or submission of separate technical and price proposals may offer lower initial prices but the “savings” are lost in change orders and time delays.

• A recent study by the University of Colorado and the Georgia Institute of Technology found quantitative evidence that QBS-based projects experienced fewer change orders and construction cost escalation (3% on average) versus the industry standard (10%).
Overall Long-Term Cost of Project

- Engineering Fee $1,000,000 for $12,000,000 Construction project
- Low bid for engineering “saves” 15%=$150,000
- Increase in Construction Cost 7%=$840,000
- Increase to Project Costs=$840,000 - $150,000=$690,000 or 5.75%

THE BITTERNESS OF POOR QUALITY REMAINS LONG AFTER THE SWEETNESS OF LOW PRICE IS FORGOTTEN.
Panel Testimonials
Thank you for attending!