PENDING CORRECTION AND APPROVAL AT THE 2020 MEETING

Minutes of the 2019 Business Meeting

Westin Bayshore, Vancouver
Thursday, April 18, 2019

1. CALL TO ORDER: The meeting came to order at 12:04 PM.

2. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: The Pacific Division of the American Philosophical Association acknowledges that it meets this year on the unceded, traditional territory of the Musqueam, Squamish, and Tsleil-Waututh First Nations.

3. ADOPTION OF AGENDA: The agenda was adopted.

4. ADOPTION OF THE MINUTES: The minutes were adopted as published on the APA web site.

5. MATTERS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES: No matters arising from the minutes.

6. ANNOUNCEMENTS (Arneson): The names of APA members who had passed away since the last meeting were read, and a moment of silence was observed.

7. REPORT OF THE NOMINATING COMMITTEE (Copenhaver): Kwong-Loi Shun (chair), Michael Gill (member at large), Anand Vaidya (member at large), and Rebecca Copenhaver (ex officio) served as the 2018-19 nominating committee. The committee nominates the following for terms beginning July 1, 2019: Evan Thompson for vice president and Vrinda Dalmiya for member at large. Rebecca Copenhaver is nominated for a second term as Secretary-Treasurer.

The nominating committee and the Secretary-Treasurer were approved unanimously.

Copenhaver thanked this past year’s nominating committee.

8. REPORT OF THE SECRETARY-TREASURER (Copenhaver): The Secretary-Treasurer echoed and summarized her remarks from the meeting of the Executive Committee. (See those minutes). She shared that the fiscal situation of the Pacific Division is good. We can predict decrease reserves as a matter of our budget staying flat and expenses rising.

The Executive Committee of the Pacific Division chose not to raise registration rates this year in part because we anticipate an APA membership dues increase and did vote to institute a $10 co-pay for use of AV by those on the divisional program. And it was thought that an increase all three combined would not be well-received.
Copenhaver thanked Cindy Holder (program chair) for all of her work in putting together what has been a great program this year and expressed gratitude that this hotel has been particularly great to deal with.

9. REPORT OF THE PACIFIC DIVISION EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE (Rosenthal): The chair of the executive committee summarized the actions of the committee. (See the executive committee minutes).

The executive committee discussed the relationship between the group program and the divisional program, including whether or not to change that relationship. It was decided that no action would be taken. They discussed the pros and cons of increasing registration rates and decided not to raise registration for next year but emphasized that they would prefer that registration rates be increased incrementally rather than dramatically and so thought that increasing registration rates should be seriously considered next year.

The following actions were taken among others: adopted an emergency plan in case the Secretary-Treasurer becomes incapacitated, instituted a $10 co-pay for AV equipment for participants in the divisional program, revised the practice of accommodations, names were proposed for the program chair (for 2021), for the program committee, and for the nominating committee, and the executive committee expressed gratitude to everyone who made this conference possible. More details and the rest of the actions are available in the minutes of the Executive Committee meeting.

10. REPORT OF THE APA BOARD OF OFFICERS (Ferrer, Stemwedel): Stemwedel summarized her report to the executive committee. (See the executive committee minutes.)

Ferrer summarized her report to the executive committee. (See the executive committee minutes.)

11. ANY OTHER BUSINESS: Cheshire Calhoun was thanked for her tremendous work for the APA.

12. ADJOURNMENT: The meeting was adjourned at 12:38 PM.
Minutes of the 2019 Pacific Division Executive Committee Meeting

Westin Bayshore, Vancouver
Wednesday, April 17, 2019

Present: Rebecca Copenhaver, Cindy Holder, Alyssa Ney, Michael Cholbi, Janet Stemwedel, Richard Arneson, Penelope Maddy and Michael Rosenthal (chair)

Guests: Amy Ferrer, Elizabeth Brake, Jenna Donohue (taking minutes)

1. CALL TO ORDER: The meeting came to order at 3:10 PM.

2. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT: The Pacific Division of the American Philosophical Association acknowledges that it meets this year on the unceded, traditional territory of the Musqueam, Squamish, and Tsleil-Waututh First Nations.

3. ADOPTION OF AGENDA: The agenda was adopted.

4. ADOPTION OF THE MINUTES: The minutes were adopted as published on the APA web site.

5. MATTERS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES: None raised.

6. REPORT OF ACTIONS BY EMAIL:

   The committee added names to the list of philosophers approved for service on the divisional program committee.

   The committee approved the transfer of the 26 month CD to the central fund managed by the APA through the National Office.

DIVISIONAL BUSINESS

7. SECRETARY-TREASUER’S REPORT:

As secretary, Copenhaver thanked the Program Chair, Cindy Holder, for a really fantastic program for the 2019 division meeting. She also thanked the outgoing president (Kwong-loi Shun) and outgoing member at large (Alyssa Ney) for their three years of service.

Meeting registrations continue to go up, and book display numbers have risen significantly under the new sponsorship program initiated by the National Office. We achieved 97% pickup for the hotel by April 1.

Ferrer and Copenhaver are working on securing hotel contracts for the 2022 and 2023 meetings, and they have gotten a consultant (Carol) who is working with the National Office and all three
divisions. When the divisions search as a group, they have more bargaining power. The consultant put together the RFPs (Request for Proposals), sent those out, and advised on how to prioritize. For now, the division continues to go with the same room block numbers as it has been for the past three years. However, they are keeping an eye on this as a shift to meeting participants staying off-site, for example in AirBNBs, may shift that number down. Typically, hotels ask for an attrition rate of between 80 and 85%. If the division does not meet the negotiated attrition rate it must pay for every room that is not booked. Though this is unlikely to happen soon, it is important that the membership understand that when they stay in the meeting hotel, they help to make the meeting possible.

The consultant recommended targeting some cities, and she is helping negotiate as well. There will be news sometime soon. Some of the we received bids were excellent: rates under $200, rebates that can be used to fund graduate student stipends, and other discounts. The bad news is that we received no viable bids for dates other than those that once again conflict with Passover and Easter. The APA doesn’t spend a lot of money, and so when we try to compete with other conferences we lose out to ones that spend more money. We fill need weeks, when the hotels would otherwise be empty, and that is how we make it affordable.

Registration for the Pacific doesn’t seem to vary as much by city as it does for the other divisions. The Pacific division does see registration drop a bit when the meeting is in Canada. There were inquiries about whether being in Canada might affect particularly graduate student registration as opposed to others. Ferrer also pointed out that there are costs/benefits to holding the meeting in Canada since some APA members live and work in Canada.

Returning to her report, Copenhaver expressed that she was pleased to host the AAPT teaching hub this year. There was a teaching hub at all three division meetings this year, and Copenhaver is hopeful that the Hub becomes an APA tradition. It is a lot of work but an excellent contribution to the program. She expressed her appreciation to all who have worked on the teaching hub.

Unfortunately, this year we weren’t able to host the Informal Mini Conference on Inclusion and Diversity that had become a bit of a tradition. Hosting this requires that the chairs of interested committees and groups work together to coordinate this mini conference. We do rely on the committees and groups to do this work, and it didn’t happen this year. We hope that it will come back in the future. We support them in doing this.

There is a new feature on the Pacific program. 9-12 on Friday (7M) we will be hosting the APA Department Chairs Network, a new and hopefully annual opportunity for chairs of departments to engage in crucial conversations and receive support. The board of the APA is spear-heading this effort. This grew out of a suggestion at the November board meeting. At the Central they talked about threats to departments and the APA’s department advocacy toolkit. The session at this meeting is on innovation in the philosophy major and a presenter from ASU is participating to talk about their innovative major called Morality, Politics, and Law.

Ferrer invited topics or people for next year’s session and for future sessions. Holder recommended philosophers in dean and associate dean positions to participate in one of these sessions.
Barbara Herman will be presenting the De Gruyter Kant Lecture.

Deborah Hellman will be presenting the Berger Memorial prize in Philosophy and Law.

Michael Friedman will be presenting the Dewey Lecture.

Richard Arneson will be giving the Presidential Address.

Dom Lopes is receiving the Quinn Prize.

Public Session: Lisa Shapiro and Dom Lopes organized this year’s public session: The Philosophy of Fake News on Wednesday, April 17, 7:00 – 9:00 PM, at Simon Fraser University, Morris Wosk Centre for Dialogue, Asia Pacific Hall. The speakers will be Jennifer Nagel, Endre Begby, and Regina Rini.

This was the first year we tried a new approach to the public session in response to very low attendance for all of the past events despite significant and costly advertising. We had been relying on the program chair along with a few members of the program committee to organize the public session. The new approach this year was to ask two philosophers who have worked with the APA and who live in the meeting city to organize the event. Unfortunately, this year a person who was helping with the organizing fell through, and that resulted in extra work for the two philosophers who were spear-heading the organizing. But they put in a tremendous amount of work and ended up pulling the session off successfully anyway: the venue holds 200 people, and the tickets sold out weeks ago. The event this year was connected with other events also taking place at Simon Fraser, and so this year isn’t a good sample for seeing whether the experiment is successful. It may be that the investment of resources to successfully hold public sessions isn’t feasible for the Pacific APA.

The division is covering travel stipends for 68 graduate students who are on the program, totaling $27,200. There are two matters worth mentioning here: (1) Stipends are for graduate students whose refereed papers have been accepted. Graduate students who are chairing, commenting, or participating in a committee or group session are not given stipends. We would love to have money available to more students, but we cannot afford to do so. (2) Graduate students whose refereed papers are co-authored with a faculty member also do not receive stipends. Were we to grant stipends to students in this category, we couldn’t afford the stipend program.

In 2017, the Pacific Division raised registration rates for the 2018 and 2019 meetings by $10.00 for each of APA members and non-members, and by $5.00 for student members. The intention of the Pacific Division XC on this matter was not to consider rate increases again until 2019. This is what these changes looked like (the two numbers are early bird/on-site registration), add another $5.00 if requested a printed program:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2017: $30/$80 2018 &amp; 2019: $35/$85</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Student Members</td>
<td>APA Members</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The possibility of raising rates was discussed later in the meeting. (See below.)
The fiscal profile of the Pacific Division is good. However, keeping our costs flat, projections indicate that our modest surpluses will begin to drop through 2020 because we can expect expenses to rise. We expect hotel costs to rise as the economy on the west coast continues to grow. In this last round of negotiations, we found that we had to increase our F&B (food and beverage) commitments.

Our reserves consist in a savings account, plus two low yield secure savings instruments (a 19 and 39 month), and a Marriott Bonvoy Points account, and the funds recently approved to be transferred to the Central Fund. The executive committee approved the transfer of the 26 month CD to the National Office. The 19 month times out on 7/14/2019 and the 39 month fund times out on 3/14/2020. At that time all funds, including the savings account, will have or will be transferred to the Central Fund. They will be managed by the financial manager but they remain the funds of the Pacific Division.

On the budget: The committee reviewed the budget, which was pre-circulated. Copenhaver shared some comments and explanations: the overage in general program expenses is because some charges were booked to that line item that should have been booked to printing and production (name badges, signage, etc.) There was also about $1000 for ASL interpretation that was billed to this fiscal year even though it was for the 2018 meeting; it should have been booked to the accessibility line item, but was put in the general expense line. (We’re to make sure we’re more careful about putting these things in the right places going forward.) That interpreter expense should really be thought of as an FY18 expense, and between the general expenses and the printing/production lines, we’re basically on budget there. The telephone/communications charge was for hosting Aqua, which wasn’t in the original budget. The miscellaneous charge was for printing a promo card for the Teaching Hub, which will be offset by billing AAPT/the Teaching Fund after the meeting.

Copenhaver reviewed some goals she had set for herself for 2018. She had planned to create three guidebooks in 2018 to facilitate meeting preparation: (1) program chair (2) program committee (3) secretary-treasurer. The first two guidebooks are complete and should help with communication and information and decrease mistakes. This year there were fewer errors and miscommunications so the guidebooks appear to be working. Holder reported that the first two guidebooks were very helpful. Though some members of the program committee did not read the committee guidebook, Holder was able to direct them there when they reached out to her with questions. Copenhaver and Brake (next year’s program chair) will talk later about a possible webinar for the program committee.

The third guidebook has proven difficult to do while also doing the tasks of the ST. At this point, is it about half completed. Copenhaver plans to complete it in 2019.

We have been directed by the Divisional Coordinating Committee to craft an explicit policy governing the emergency replacement of the Secretary-Treasurer: ST Emergency Succession plan. This may, but need not, be formulated as an addition to the divisional by-laws. This will be discussed later in the meeting. (See below in minutes.)

Copenhaver’s goals for 2019 are to finish the ST Guidebook and to begin a search for a new assistant (to replace Jenna Donohue) to be trained this next year by Jenna. In the past we’ve
looked for assistants by word-of-mouth, asking for especially organized mid-program graduate students who might be interested. But now we’re able to email chairs and graduate students, so we’re likely to issue a job advertisement. So, one of Copenhaver’s goals is to write up a job description, gather applications, and form an ad hoc committee to read applications and help with deciding on candidates.

Finally, Copenhaver asked that the XC enter into the record our gratitude for Anita Silvers, who passed away this year. Anita served the APA her whole career in multiple ways. Her contributions to the Pacific Division made us who we are today. She served as ST for more than twenty years. We honor her memory today. (A moment of silence was observed.)

8. REVIEW OF PROPOSED BUDGET:

The floor was opened for questions on the budget. A revenue drop is predicted in an effort to be conservative but also because rebates that used to be possible are no longer being offered by the hotels, and these used to contribute to our revenue. Some work needs to be done to make sure that each expense is getting put into the correct category. A new budget will be circulated by email.

A/V discussion: By purchasing and setting up their own screens and projectors, the APA was able to reduce the cost to $150 per session (from $1000 per day if we use the on-site A/V). That only works for the smaller rooms. The larger sessions end up being about $6000. Affiliated groups and APA committees are charged $150 per session. The divisional sessions are charged $150 per session, but that comes out of the Pacific Division fund. There is a proposal later in the minutes to charge a $10 co-pay to divisional program participants. That would mean that they would pay $10, and the Pacific Division would still pay $140 per session.

Participants are also able to make their handouts available on their app. (There is no cost to do so, and doing so can help those with visual impairments to take advantage of their software to see the handouts more effectively.) At this time, we don’t have the numbers on handouts uploaded, but those can be retrieved after the meeting.

9. REPORT OF THE REPRESENTATIVE TO THE BOARD (Stemwedel):

Stemwedel reported that the board of officers is aiming to capture more people who identify as philosophers and trying to construct a membership experience that has more value that they can recognize. The board of officers has been in touch with committee members to remind them that their role is more expansive than publishing a newsletter and organizing sessions at meetings.

In the future, the board aims to think of ways the APA could be supporting those who are in the category of adjuncting who can’t buy a home, or save for retirement, etc. And also the Ph.D. philosophers who are completely unemployed. Finding ways as a professional community to be able to do things to help the situations of those individuals but also those groups of people.

The board has also been keeping an eye on the larger environment for philosophy and philosophers and is finding ways to include graduate students and their goals as they understand them, including through the graduate student council.
The board is working on better messaging to donors who want to host prizes. We are interested in having donors possibly be more thoughtful in how they think about the prize they want to offer so that they don’t unintentionally disadvantage particular members of the discipline.

The board has discussed the APA’s small grants about how to think strategically in supporting diversity institutes and initiatives. The APA has a preference for giving seed money rather than promising to support something year after year. The board is trying to balance the ideal with how things really play out. The board has proposed by-law changes. The vote will happen after this meeting, sometime in the next two weeks. These changes aim at attracting and retaining more members to the APA by making the qualifications for APA membership less narrow than they currently are. Some of the thought about how to bring more people in and more fully participating raise interesting implications for the peculiar divisional structure for the APA as an organization. So the proposed by-laws that will be available of some detailed thinking.

A change in dues for membership will be reviewed later in the meeting.

The board had a conversation about conditions under which it might be appropriate for the APA to rescind a prize. The lawyers are involved in these discussions.

The APA is embarking in strategic planning. Stemwedel thinks the planning is locking onto important issues, including public perception of philosophy, whether the philosophical instruction of particularly Ph.D. students is truly preparing students for jobs they may come to have rather than only the jobs that those teaching them have. Aiming at a community of shared values and interests that wants to work together to make our shared and individual worlds better.

**Ferrer:** our bylaws require that in order to be a full voting member of the APA you have to be able to teach philosophy at a college level. That goes back to our origins as an organization, which was as an off-shoot of the American Psychological Association. So you have to have a masters to be a full member. None of our sister societies in history, linguists, etc. have such a requirement. So the new qualification would be that you have to have a professional interest in the scholarly pursuit of philosophy. This would include those who have a bachelors degree in philosophy but went on to pursue careers outside of academic philosophy. Graduate students who wish to be full voting members could from the beginning. So this would mean we can have a larger pool of fully enfranchised members.

There was discussion of the way the program gets assembled. There are no reserved slots for any particular area of philosophy. So if members are interested in seeing certain areas of philosophy at certain meetings, they should submit refereed papers, as that’s what determines what’s on the program.

There was discussion of ways to try to encourage conversations between 4-year faculty and community college faculty. Cholbi suggested in particular programming on the moment when students are deciding what to do with their associates’ degree.

10. REPORT OF THE CEO OF THE APA (Ferrer):
Public Statements: In 2018-2019, the board joined a number of public statements on issues relevant to the APA’s work.

- March 2018: Joint statement via ACLS opposing proposed cuts at UW Stevens-Point
- January 2019: AAAS statement concerning changes to Title IX
- March 2019: Statement opposing cuts to higher education in Alaska
- March 2019: Statement concerning academic freedom in Hungary

New Prizes: Approved and began fundraising for an Ernest Sosa Prize and an Ernest Sosa Fellowship, and for Nicholas Rescher Prize. Developed a plan for the Berggruen winner to give an annual lecture at the Pacific Division Meeting. Martha Nussbaum will be giving her Berggruen lecture at the upcoming Central meeting in Chicago. These lectures will normally be given at the Pacific Division Meeting.

Grants received and awarded:
- First of three years in second term of Mellon grant to support diversity institutes.
- Joint Mellon grant with AHA on HBCU faculty inclusion: conducted three focus groups and holding a meeting of HBCU faculty at Eastern.
- Joined a publication ethics project receiving a small amount of further Mellon funding: conducted focus groups at 2018 APA meetings, virtual focus groups, focus groups with publishers, and a conversation with scholarly society leaders. White paper currently available for public comment.
- Made $25,000 in small grants, nearly $20,000 in diversity grants, several donor fund micro-grants.
- Made several thousand dollars in travel grants through Travel Assistance Fund for Philosophers of Color and Diversity Institute Alumni Fund (in addition to grad student travel stipends)

Other items of note: Filed an insurance claim to cover lost registration revenue from 2018 Savannah meeting; launched a departmental advocacy toolkit; launched Philosophers Beyond Academia Network and held first event with Patrick Byrne at Pacific, second event with Damon Horowitz in NYC; took over UPDirectory; adopted a new investment policy; approved FY2019 budget (balanced, but very close) and received a clean audit; proposed bylaws amendments to streamline and improve APA membership, including an amendment to transition to a rolling membership year, which would take effect July 1, 2020; beginning a strategic planning process; next round of meeting site selection is underway; beginning process of appointing next board chair; currently Ferrer is serving on boards of Delaware Humanities, AAC&U, and NHA, as well as ACLS CEO Executive Committee.

11. COORDINATION OF MEETING PRICING ACROSS DIVISIONS (Ferrer):

As outlined in a memorandum, the board of the APA requests that the XC agree to some changes to meeting pricing policies for purposes of efficiency of time and resources: (1) Divisional executive committees shall set registration fees for their meetings for APA members (regular and student). The APA executive direction/CEO, in consultation with the divisional secretaries-
treasurer, will set the non-member registration fees. In order to incentivize membership, the non-member fee will normally be set at the registration fee for regular members plus the median dues payment of APA members. (2) Divisional executive committees shall set the base registration fees for their meetings. The APA executive director/CEO, in consultation with the divisional secretaries-treasurer, will set the price of a paper program (advance and on site, which may be different prices) in order to cover the costs of providing a paper program and to incentivize meeting participants to choose the paperless option.

12. SECRETARY-TREASURER EMERGENCY PLAN (Copenhaver):

We have been directed by the Divisional Coordinating Committee to craft an explicit policy governing the emergency replacement of the Secretary-Treasurer.

Proposed Amendment to the Bylaws:

Add to Section 2 Duties of the Executive Committee

e. If the secretary-treasurer should depart office as the result of the emergency, the executive committee shall select a suitable and willing person to serve as interim secretary-treasurer while a search to appoint the new secretary-treasurer is carried out.

Change the ordering of the final portion of Section 2 Duties of the Executive Committee

2.e. In the executive committee, questions of order shall be covered by Robert’s Rules of Order.

Shall be:

f. In the executive committee, questions of order shall be covered by Robert’s Rules of Order.

The executive committee voted unanimously to adopt the proposed changes to the by-laws.

13. REGISTRATION RATES (Copenhaver):

In 2017, the Pacific Division raised registration rates for the 2018 and 2019 meetings by $10.00 for each of APA members and non-members, and by $5.00 for student members. The intention of the Pacific Division XC on this matter was not to consider rate increases again until 2019. This is what these changes looked like (the two numbers are early bird/on-site registration), add another $5.00 if requested a printed program.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>2017: $30/$80</th>
<th>2018 &amp; 2019: $35/$85</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Student Members</td>
<td>$110/$160</td>
<td>$120/$170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APA Members</td>
<td>$225/$275</td>
<td>$235/$285</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There was discussion of reasons for or against raising rates for registration.
The committee decided not to raise rates for the 2020 meeting in part because dues membership is increasing next year and the committee is considering charging a co-pay for AV use. It was decided not also to raise the registration rates while both of these other costs to participants are increasing, but the committee recommended that next year’s committee recognize the important benefit of incremental increases and consider raising rates so as to avoid a large increase in a future year.

14. AFFILIATED GROUP PROGRAM (Copenhaver):

An affiliated group contact requested that the executive committee discuss the possibility of having affiliated group program sessions during the slots of the Pacific Division meeting currently reserved for Divisional Program sessions. The possibility was discussed, and it was decided not to allow affiliated group sessions to take place during the slots currently reserved for the divisional program.

15. AV CO-PAY FOR DIVISIONAL PROGRAM PARTICIPANTS (and Copenhaver):

Proposal: In an effort to limit AV expenses and reinforce the message to program participants that AV support is far from free (each division pays $150 per session for sessions with AV), the Pacific Division will join the Central Division (as of the 2020 meeting) in charging divisional program participants who want AV in their sessions a nominal copay of $10.

There was a discussion of the pros and cons of adding this sort of co-pay for AV equipment.

The proposal was passed with a mixed vote.

16. ADA ACCOMMODATIONS PRACTICE (Copenhaver):

Proposed New Practice: The Pacific Division currently has a page that asks those requesting accommodations fill out a form which asks them to disclose their disability and send it to the Secretary-Treasurer of the division by March 1.

Proposal: (1) eliminate this page (2) on page 4 of the Guide (3) adopt the language and policy that is unified across divisions.

The proposal was passed unanimously.

17. PAPER SUBMISSION GUIDELINES PROPOSAL

The Committee on Asian and Asian-American Philosophers and Philosophies met recently and recommends an addition to the APA Submission Guidelines webpage. Under the section “References and Diversity,” they suggest adding the words “and cultures,” as follows. (The suggested additional words are in brackets below.)
References and Diversity

The Pacific Division encourages authors to ask themselves whether they might be significant but under-recognized papers or books by women philosophers or by philosophers form other under-represented groups [and cultures], that were overlooked in the course of writing their papers and/or assembling their bibliographies.

The proposal was passed with one abstention.

18. MEETING SITES AND DATES (Copenhaver):

The 2020 meeting is in San Francisco, and 2021 in Portland. 2022 and 2023 sites will be announced soon.

19. APPOINTMENT OF THE NOMINATING COMMITTEE (XC Committee): The committee approved a slate of candidates for the nominating committee and was encouraged to send Copenhaver more names by email.

ANNUAL MEETING PROGRAM BUSINESS

20. REPORT OF THE PROGRAM CHAIR (Holder): Holder provided a report to the committee and summarized it for the committee.

Acceptance rate, number of participants, all of that was more or less in line with what we’ve seen in the past. Becko and Cindy were responsible for more sessions than usual. Part of this was because several program committee members did not use all of their sessions, so Cindy used their sessions to adopt from the proposed sessions. Becko used some for book sessions because past program chairs had books coming out.

The main difficulty this year was that it was very hard to recruit in Ancient, not just for the committee itself but also for commentators. One thing to think about is why that is. It might have been a blip for this year, but it’s something to keep an eye on going forward.

Having such a large turnover on the program committee made things more difficult. If possible in the future, try to stagger departures.

Recruiting chairs was a real problem, and then a lot of chairs dropped out. It might be worth trying to think about more creative ways to solve this problem.

The keywords that are currently used to categorize papers are not as helpful as they could be. The keywords are often not capturing what’s going on. Cindy recommended that Elizabeth ask program committee members to send her a more detailed explanation of what they work on so that she is in a better position to send papers to appropriate reviewers.

Ferrer spoke to trying to get the keywords themselves updated. The Secretaries-Treasurer are working on changing this, perhaps with a plan to adjust to the PhilPapers taxonomy.
21. APPOINTMENTS TO THE PROGRAM COMMITTEE (XC Committee):

   Becko assembled names for the program committee.

22. PROGRAM CHAIR APPOINTMENTS (XC Committee):

   Holder recommended a list of names for possible future chair of the program committee.
   Elizabeth Brake was approved as the program chair for 2020.

23. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA OF THE ABM (XC Committee):

24. The business meeting agenda was approved.

25. ANY OTHER BUSINESS: None

26. ADJOURNMENT: The meeting was adjourned at 6:29 PM.