

Report on Dual Career Hiring Policies
Subcommittee on Dual Careers
Committee on the Status and Future of the Profession

Committee Charge

- (1) To investigate the range of good practices that colleges, universities, and professional associations have developed to promote fairness in employment for partners pursuing two academic careers.
- (2) To recommend such practices to the APA for consideration by departmental search committees and their administrators.
- (3) To offer advice for those seeking employment in light of the recommended practices.

The following section was given to the committee with the charge.

Contextual Considerations:

The committee's work takes place within the context of assumed primacy of departmental freedom of decision-making and acknowledgement of the wide range of college and university policies and practices that limit or enable departmental choices. The committee's goals would include promoting fairness in employment for all philosophers at the same time it investigates relationship-friendly policies and practices. Although the absence of dual-career appointment policies affects women differentially, it is an issue for the profession at large. There are many factors to be balanced in order to avoid unfairness or the perception of unfairness. For example:

- Recommendations should not privilege legal marriage and should include both same-sex partners and different-sex partners.
- Fair treatment of unpartnered philosophers needs to be considered.
- It is important to balance other goals such as increasing diversity among many groups with the goal of making academic employment more friendly to life partners. Although dual-career policies are just one important piece of a larger set of family-friendly or relationship-friendly issues, one committee cannot be asked investigate the full set of issues. Nevertheless, the committee should feel free to offer suggestions for policies that can supplement or hinder fair dual-career practices. For example, could institutions be more generous in granting leaves, visiting appointments, or fellowships? Could they offer services for non-academic partners?

Background

As the AAUP reports in its 2010 policy report on partner accommodation and dual-career appointments, rules against nepotistic hiring policies at academic institutions were, in the early 1970s, seen as an impediment to women entering academic professions. Those rules were formulated in ways that made no reference to academic qualifications, and thus prohibited hiring even perfectly well qualified individuals. Further, and very

worrisome, was the fact that such policies also had a disparate impact on female academics. Thus, in 1971 the AAUP recommended that such policies be abolished and that Universities, Colleges, and Academic Departments be allowed to hire partners and spouses.¹

As more women have moved into the academic workforce the issue of spousal and partner hiring has been receiving more attention.² Though policies friendly to dual-career couples will likely, overall, benefit female academics in higher proportion, there is no doubt that many male academics in dual-career households will also benefit from such policies. Further, wider recognition of same sex marriages and partnerships has meant that what counts as a dual-career couple has broadened. Faculty members are more likely now than in the past to be married to or in partnerships with other faculty members. Further, due to the fact that many women marry individuals higher on the 'career ladder,' most accompanying spouses or partners are women.³ This document addresses only partners seeking academic positions, recognizing that it would be valuable for universities to offer support to partners seeking nonacademic positions as well.

Considerations in Favor of Practices seeking to Accommodate Dual-Career couples

Some college and university administrators view dual-career accommodation as a competitive necessity. It can be a major factor in hiring and retaining top faculty. Wolf-Wendel, et. al. write that, because of the great expansion in numbers of dual career academic couples, colleges and universities will need to factor in some form of accommodation to attract and keep the best faculty.⁴

Beyond the importance of accommodations in negotiating appointments and retention packages, however, is its importance to other concerns of colleges and universities, such as providing working conditions that don't discourage women from academic professions. As recent data have shown, philosophy in particular has a severe gender disparity problem.⁵ Policies making it difficult for women to pursue careers in academia generally will be one factor underlying this disparity (though there are others, as well).

¹ American Association of University Professors, statement on *Faculty Appointment and Family Relationships*, 1971. The 2010 Report is available at: <http://www.aaup.org/report/recommendations-partner-accommodation-and-dual-career-appointments-2010>

² Jane Loeb and Marianne Ferber provide an excellent overview of this in their introduction to *Academic Couples: Problems and Promises* (University of Illinois, 1997).

³ "Academic dual-career couples in the U.S.: Review of the North American Social Research," *Die Junge Akademie*, January 2002, p. 2.

⁴ Lisa Wolf-Wendel, Susan B. Twombly and Suzanne Rice, *The Two Body Problem* (The Johns Hopkins University Press, 2003). Their introduction gives an overview of the pressures academic employers face in hiring and retention. They cite research indicating that dual career couples consider prospects for their spouse in making decisions about which job to accept and where to work.

⁵ Kate Norlock's recent study for the APA Committee on the Status of Women reports that "...among full-time instructional faculty, women are 16.6% of the 13,000 full-time

Further, both departments and universities can benefit from having two colleagues committed to the long-term well-being of their institutions, their colleagues, and students. It is easier to retain couples, since, in order to move, both would need to secure appointments elsewhere.

Considerations against Dual-Career Accommodations

Departments seeking to hire a couple should also be aware of possible drawbacks and be cognizant of considerations of fairness. If some faculty see partner hiring as a zero-sum game, there can be resentment of a partner. This possibility should be acknowledged and dealt with as soon as possible.⁶ Institutions seeking to make accommodations should make sure that there is a suitable balance of opportunities for both single and partnered faculty.

As discussed below, accommodations need not take the form of providing a partner with a tenured or tenure-track line. Offering an appointment to an accompanying spouse or partner must of course depend on the individual's qualifications for the position. Wolf-Wendel, et. al., note that this is of particular concern at many research universities.⁷ They argue that the department should have the final say on whether the accompanying spouse or partner is qualified for the position. This tends to be more of an issue if the couple is seeking employment in different departments. Wolf-Wendel, et. al, also note that deans involved in crafting accommodations should use the tenure-line accommodation judiciously. It should be clear that the accompanying spouse or partner is qualified.

On occasion, accommodating a spouse or partner may direct resources away from other core institutional goals. Thus, it should also be noted that goals of accommodating spouses and partners need to be balanced against other goals that the college or university has, as well as the goals of the department or departments in question, and different sorts of accommodations may work in some cases not in others.

Different Ways in Which Accommodations May be Implemented

Some colleges and universities possess greater resources than others, and hence are in a better position to offer jobs to accompanying partners. Some are located in more densely populated areas with more academic institutions, allowing for increased prospects for employment at area institutions. The options available to any department will largely be determined by the policies and practices adopted by its institution. The best of the available options for a particular case will also vary with institutional context. This document can only lay out possible strategies to consider.

philosophy faculty (that is, 2, 158) and 26% of the 10,000 part-time instructors (that is, 2,600).”

⁶ Some universities have set up ADVANCE programs which provide resources to departments as part of a college or university wide initiative to encourage diversity. Such resources can offset any worry that the department loses through dual hiring.

⁷ 142.

Accommodations run the full range from none to funds set aside by university administration to support partner lines. Between these options lie a variety of ways accommodation can work. For example:

- The department and institution may be open to setting up a permanent position for the partner, either in the same department or in a different department. From the couple's perspective, this is usually the best option.
- The department and institution may be open to allowing couples to share a single line or a 1.5 line.
- The department and institution may be in a position to offer the partner a temporary bridging position such as a short-term teaching, fellowship, or post-doc position. They can be very helpful for couples moving into an area in which there is a good prospect for the partner to find employment at another institution. It also gives the institution additional time to try to develop a permanent line for the partner. However, if the 'bridge' is intended to be *merely* temporary, and it is not expected to lead to a permanent line, that should be made clear to all parties.
- The department and institution may be able to offer a longer-term, possibly open-ended, non-tenure track appointment.
- The institution may be able to offer the spouse or partner a position outside the normal academic ranks, for example, in administration or academic support.
- Where institutions are unable to employ the partner, they should consider other forms of career support such as providing access to scholarly resources or a non-paying appointment title for the partner. The institution may be able to find other ways to accommodate the stresses of a situation in which one partner must locate elsewhere, such as providing the employed partner more frequent unpaid leaves than typical, flexible teaching schedules, etc.

In arranging joint hires departments should consider how candidates, for example, will be evaluated on performance. Appointments and committee assignments should be arranged to avoid conflicts of interest or the appearance of conflicts of interest: for example, one member of the couple should not be allowed to participate in evaluations of the other member. It would be best if the larger institution had a general policy regarding these sorts of potential conflicts, but, if one isn't in place at the institution, departments should consider establishing their own, and the policy should be made clear to all members of the department. In the case of shared appointments it is also extremely important to make the tenure clock for each person clear, and what responsibilities must be met by each person as conditions of tenure.

Again, the focus of this report is on accommodating dual-career academic couples. Generally, in these situations, both partners desire an academic position. In more densely

populated areas it may be possible for partners to find employment at different institutions. Some universities have formed groups to facilitate couples pursuing this option. For example, many colleges and universities in New England are members of the New England Higher Education Recruitment Consortium [HERC].⁸ Institutions should be sensitive to overall problems in hiring trends in academia, and not use dual-career hiring as an opportunity to hire more adjunct and part-time faculty members as replacements for tenure-track lines.

Recommendations for Departments

Early in the search process, and certainly prior to interviewing job candidates, determine whether or not your institution has a policy on dual-career accommodation.

If there is a policy, determine what it allows or mandates. The policy should also be part of the institution's faculty handbook and available online. Information about this policy should be easily available to job candidates as well. It must be up to the job candidate to initiate a conversation about dual-career appointments, but the department chair or chair of the search committee should make this as easy as possible for the candidate. In the interests of providing information in a manner that is fair and not intrusive, the department might, for example, include a statement of dual-career hiring policies in a general information packet provided to all interviewees.

If there is no policy, try to acquire information about how such hires have been pursued in the past at your institution. It is also in the long-term interests of the department to work with the administration and other departments and programs to encourage the development of policies. The policies should be developed and reviewed through a process with meaningful faculty input - via the relevant university committee, for example.

According to Stanford University's Clayman Institute for Gender Research Report, "Dual Career Academic Couples: What Universities Need to Know," better outcomes are achieved through the hiring process if both partners are treated equally and fairly.⁹ For example, both partners should be put through the regular interview process. When the dual-career hire is raised in the context of a retention case, then the process should still involve a full review. It would be wise for the department to consider the hire in the context of its long-term goals for area coverage, diversity, and so forth, in addition to overall size of the department. Some institutions, such as the University of Michigan, have campus wide programs that establish frameworks for approaching dual career accommodation in the context of department planning.¹⁰ For example, as a result of their

⁸ Wolf-Wendel, et. al., also discuss a variety of local consortia and relocation services universities can provide dual-career couples access to in Chapter 4 of *The Two Body Problem*.

⁹ page 48.

¹⁰ See, for example, their advice sheet at:

<http://www.advance.rackham.umich.edu/FAQDualCareer.pdf>

ADVANCE Program, the University of Michigan offers advice on dual career hiring. Accommodations in Michigan's case are handled through the Provost's office.¹¹

Sometimes a department will be approached as part of an accommodation plan for another department. To the extent that deans would like to promote dual career accommodations they should not penalize cooperating departments in terms of subsequent line allocations, and, in particular, deans should be sensitive to the fact that the partner hire might not fulfill any of the department's long term goals. Departments, before proceeding with such a hire, should make sure they have clarity from the dean on how the partner hire would affect their future hiring.

Factors for Dual Career Couples to consider

Candidates can often check in advance online to see whether institutions to which they are applying have policy statements or sets of practices regarding dual hires or other employment support for partners. One of the most difficult questions for candidates is when to raise the question of partner accommodation. Because couples' needs vary, and institutional situations vary as well, it is difficult to advise candidates concerning the best time to raise the question of partner accommodation. Listed below are factors to consider.

- According to the Stanford study (2008), the majority of those applying for positions at the assistant professor level raise the issue of partner hires either in the interview (54%) or after a verbal offer has been made (31%).¹²
- If members of a couple will consider a position *only if* an institution hires both of them, it saves everyone time to make this explicit. Senior academics are sometimes in this position as are younger couples who apply to a geographically isolated campus or are willing to share a position or 1.5 positions.
- If a dean or provost has reserved resources for supporting dual hires, those resources are likely to be exhausted fairly early in the hiring season, so raising the question earlier rather than later can make sense. Candidates should also be aware that when two departments are involved, the negotiations required can be delicate and time-consuming.
- Institutions that are open to dual career hires may still need time to determine what might be possible. Job seekers who are seeking to move from one permanent position to a new one might consider taking a leave of absence from their current position, when allowed. They might also negotiate with the hiring institution to be brought on as a visiting professor with an agreement that the position will automatically become a tenure-stream or tenured position should a partner position be created and the candidate decide to stay.

¹¹ http://www.provost.umich.edu/programs/dual_career/

¹² page 55.

Beyond the issue of when to raise the question, partners who are both offered positions should ensure there is complete clarity about the terms and conditions of appointment they are being offered, which should be spelled out in writing. What are the service, teaching, and research expectations, and requirements for tenure? (This is especially crucial if they are splitting an appointment.) What kinds of research, teaching, sabbatical, and technical support are they being offered? Will they each have their own office, or must they share an office? What happens if the partnership breaks up and one partner leaves the institution?

Partners who are offered positions in the same department should take conscious steps to ensure that each is known and valued by colleagues for his or her own work and contributions. The article listed below by Elizabeth Simmons has excellent concrete advice on how to achieve this. Also, respect the fact that departments are balancing a number of competing values and priorities as you negotiate options for a partner or for yourself.

.....

APPENDIX

Good resources (compiled by the APA Ad Hoc Committee on Dual Careers):

Ferber, Marianne A. and Jane W. Loeb, *Academic Couples: Problems and Promises* (University of Illinois Press, 1997).

Simmons, Elizabeth, "Dual Career Academics: the Right Choice," *Inside Higher Ed* (July 27, 2012), at:

<http://www.insidehighered.com/advice/2012/07/27/getting-dual-career-academics-good-start-essay>

Wolf-Wendel, Lisa, Susan B. Twombly, and Suzanne Rice, *The Two-Body Problem: Dual-Career-Couple Hiring Practices in Higher Education* (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 2003)

--The AAUP site: <http://www.aaup.org/AAUP/comm/rep/dual.htm>

-- The American Historical Association Best Practices Statement:

<http://www.historians.org/Perspectives/Issues/2002/0203/0203aha5.cfm>

--The University of Michigan Advance Program site: <http://sitemaker.umich.edu/advance>

-- The NSF Advance program site:

<http://www.portal.advance.vt.edu/index.php/categories/workandlife/dual-career>

--The Stanford dual career site:

<http://gender.stanford.edu/dual-career-academic-couples>

-- The Stanford Clayman Institute for Gender Research 2008 Study:

<http://gender.stanford.edu/dual-career-research-report>

-- Stanford's list of university dual-career programs:

University Dual-Career Programs

- [Stanford Family Matters](#)
- [UC Berkeley Partner Hiring Guidelines](#)
- [UC Faculty Family Friendly Edge](#)
- [Pennsylvania State University Dual-Career Program](#)
- [University of Florida Dual Career Service Procedures](#)
- [University of Michigan Dual-Career Program](#)
- [University of Nebraska Dual-Career Program](#)
- [Utah State University Dual-Career Assistant Protocol](#)
- [Technische Universitaet Muenchen Dual-Career Program](#)
- [University of Minnesota Dual-Career Services](#)
- [Bucknell University Dual-Career program](#)
- [University of Chicago Dual-Career Office](#)
- [Cornell University Dual-Career Program](#)
- [Wright State University Dual-Career Support](#)
- University of Virginia [Office of Dual-Career Recruitment](#)

- [Dual Career Service at Münster University](#)
- [University of Missouri Equity Office](#)
- [Universitaet Siegen Dual Career Service](#)