Human Trafficking: Do you know the signs and what to do?

Tessa Tibben, DHSc, MPAS, PA-C
Learning Objectives

At the conclusion of the presentation attendees will be able to:

• Define human trafficking & understand types
• Understand the elements that must be present for an act to be considered human trafficking
• Recognize health related consequences of human trafficking
• Describe the barriers to healthcare readiness in interceding on behalf of trafficked victims
• Describes the potential signs a trafficked patient may exhibit during a healthcare visit
The Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000 and its subsequent reauthorizations define human trafficking as:

- a) Sex trafficking in which a commercial sex act is induced by force, fraud, or coercion, or in which the person induced to perform such act has not attained 18 years of age; or
- b) The recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, or obtaining of a person for labor or services, through the use of force, fraud, or coercion for the purpose of subjection to involuntary servitude, peonage, debt bondage, or slavery.
Common Types

- Labor trafficking
- Sex trafficking
Labor Trafficking

• Involves use of force, physical threats or abuse, psychological coercion, abuse of the legal system, or other coercive means to compel someone to work (U.S. Department of State)
• Migrants are particularly vulnerable to this form of trafficking
• Higher rates of labor trafficking are found in:
  – Food service industry
  – Domestic work
  – Agriculture
  – Commercial fishing
  – Unspecified general labor
Sex Trafficking

- Exploitation of both children & adults in performing commercial sex activity against their will
  - Street or International based prostitution
  - Pornography
  - Brothel-based work
  - Escorts or strippers
  - Minor may be brokered as ‘mail order brides’ & subject to ‘survival sex’ in exchange for basic needs
Other Trafficking

- Organ trafficking
- Trafficking of children for armed combat
Breakdown of Human Trafficking Elements
What Constitutes Human Trafficking?
### The AMP Model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ACT</th>
<th>MEANS</th>
<th>PURPOSE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Recruitment</td>
<td>Threat or use of force</td>
<td>Exploitation, including:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport</td>
<td>Coercion</td>
<td>Forced commercial sex</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transfer</td>
<td>Abduction</td>
<td>work of others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harboring</td>
<td>Fraud</td>
<td>Sexual exploitation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Receipt of persons</td>
<td>Deception</td>
<td>Forced Labor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Abuse of power or vulnerability</td>
<td>Slavery or similar practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Giving payments or benefits</td>
<td>Removal of organs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Other types of exploitation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Act + Means + Purpose = Human Trafficking**
What is Being Done?

- State level
- Internationally
State Level

- Arizona is a prime transit and destination area for human trafficking
  - Border state with easy interstate access
  - High number of professional sporting events and conferences
  - Near tourist destinations such as, Las Vegas and San Diego
- National Human Trafficking Hotline in 2019 reported for AZ

- 651 Contacts for year 2019
- 234 Human trafficking cases reported
  - 141 Adult
  - 47 minor
  - 188 Female
  - 33 Male
State Level

- In 2014 Governor Brewer signed into Law H.B. 2454
  - Created a task force on human trafficking to help identify victims and strengthen the state’s stance on trafficking

- In way of education, Attorney General Office (AGO) has a free community presentation on awareness that targets youth and parents
  - Target’s foster care agencies and other community groups
  - Go to azag.gov/outreach/presentation

- AGO also supports Safe Action Project, Arizona collaborative effort for tourism industry to provide training on identification, reporting and prevention

- Polaris Project has 10 categories of law that are deemed critical to basic legal framework for combatting human trafficking, by which states are assessed and given a tier ranking
An Act to combat trafficking in persons, especially into the sex trade, slavery, and involuntary servitude, to reauthorize certain Federal programs to prevent violence against women, and for other purposes.

First, comprehensive federal law that approaches prevention, protection and prosecution.

Act
The report divides nations into tiers based on their compliance with standards outlined in the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) of 2000. These tiers are:

- Tier 1 countries whose governments fully comply with the TVPA's minimum standards.
- Tier 2 countries whose governments do not fully comply with an TVPA’s minimum standards but are making significant efforts to bring themselves into compliance with those standards.
Tier 2 watchlist countries whose governments do not fully comply with the TVPA’s minimum standards, but are making significant efforts to bring themselves into compliance with those standards and:

- The absolute number of victims of severe forms of trafficking is very significant or is significantly increasing; or
- There is a failure to provide evidence of increasing efforts to combat severe forms of trafficking in persons from the previous year; or
- The determination that a country is making significant efforts to bring themselves into compliance with minimum standards was based on commitments by the country to take additional future steps over the next year.
Tier systems in TVPA

- Tier 3 countries whose governments do not fully comply with the minimum standards and are not making significant efforts to do so.
Trafficking In Person Report 2019 Data
Demand for Human Trafficking

• Three levels of demand
  – Employer demand
  – Consumer demand
  – Third parties involved in the process (recruiters, transporters, agents)

• According to International Labor Org 2014 report, human trafficking global profits are estimated at $150 billion/year for traffickers
  • $99 billion from commercial sexual exploitation
  • $34 billion in construction, manufacturing, mining and utilities
  • $9 billion in agriculture, including forestry and fishing
  • $8 billion dollars is saved annually by private households that employ domestic workers under conditions of forced labor
Who Are the Traffickers?

According to National Human Trafficking Resource Center, examples include:
- Brothel & fake massage business owners
- Employers of domestic servants
- Gangs & criminal networks
- Growers & crew leaders in agriculture
- Intimate partners/family members
- Labor brokers
- Factory owners
- Pimps
- Small business owners & managers
Who Are the Buyers?

• Supply/demand looks different from country to country and is shaped by complex interlocking pieces

• For victims used in the sex industry, approximately 41% of the time buyers work in professional arenas or are considered to be someone trustworthy (teacher, coach, pastor, law enforcement)
Populations Vulnerable to Trafficking

- Those living in poverty seeking economic gain that are tricked into trafficking (highest “push” factor)
- Homeless youth, runaway
- Migrant or refugee status
- LGBTQ status
- Persons with lack of education
- Being disabled or marginalized
- High-risk behaviors (e.g. substance abuse, sexual activity)
Methods of Recruiting

- Kidnapping, deception/fraud
  - Ads promising careers for foreigners
  - Recruitment by other victims
- Debt bondage
- Parents, family or significant others selling adults/children
Methods of Controlling Victims

- Traffickers maintain control by:
  - Keeping their passports, money or identifying documents
  - Victims may be in a country illegally and fear deportation if they seek recourse
  - Victims are isolated, frequently moved from place to place to prevent formation of relationships
  - Forcing victims to use illicit substances
  - Starvation
  - Confinement
  - Beatings/torture
  - Threats of violence to victim & victims' family
General Warning Signs

- Talk about an older boyfriend/girlfriend
- Have expensive gifts from a new friend/boyfriend/girlfriend
- Be inexplicably absent from school
- Run away from home
- Show signs of physical injury such as bruises or fractures
- Be inappropriately dressed
- Indicate signs of drug addiction
- Exhibit malnutrition
- Reference traveling to other cities
- Exhibit changes in demeanor
- Have a new tattoo of a person’s name, barcode or other strange symbol
Health-Related Consequence of Human Trafficking
Health-Related Consequences

Often, health issues for sex trafficked persons stem from inhumane conditions, lack of health services and lack of preventative health services

- Physical, sexual, emotional attacks by traffickers
- Poor sanitation
- Inadequate nutrition
- Poor personal hygiene
- Danger workplace environments
Health-related Consequences

• Physical health issues
  – Multiple ranging from neurologic to malnutrition
  – Injuries
    • Head and face 70% of time (more in way of dental)
Health-related Consequences

• Mental health issues
  – Study showed 98% of trafficked victims suffered at least one psychological issue during exploitation and 96% afterwards
    • Depression (89%), flashbacks (68%), shame/guilt (82%), PTSD (55%) and attempted suicide (42%)
  – For domestic minors sex trafficking, many victims experienced mental health issues prior to their exploitation from years of prior abuse and neglect
Health-related Consequences

• Sexual health issues
  – Trafficker often prohibit condom use (may allow other birth control methods)
    • Increased risk of STIs, HIV and unwanted pregnancies

• Substance abuse problems
  – Used as means of exerting control to ensure compliance
    • A 2014 study showed 84% of respondents had used alcohol or substances (marijuana, cocaine, alcohol)
    • Among minors, 88%
  – Traffickers also prey on those with substance abuse problems
Health-related Consequences

- Prior child welfare involvement
  - Histories of youth need to explore for past child welfare involvement (42%), prior abuse or neglect (90%) or runaway histories (63%)
  - Prior foster care placement
  - Parental substance abuse (59%)
  - Past sexual abuse (57%)
Health-related Consequences

- Tattoos
  - Potential indicator of human trafficking
  - Traffickers “mark” trafficked individuals as their property, especially in sex trafficking
    - “For sale”, “Daddy”, “Property of..”
    - Trafficker's name
    - Common symbols - “$” “ATM” and crowns
Common Health Problems of Trafficked Victims

- Chronic pain
- Complications from unsafe abortions
- Contusions
- Fractures
- GI problems
- HA
- Hepatitis
- HIV
- Malnutrition
- Oral health problems
- Pelvic/vaginal pain
- Resp problems related to chemical or agricultural exposures
- STIs
- Sleep deprivation
- Substance
- Physical injuries
  - Cigarette burns
  - Branding “tattoos”
  - Strangulation injuries
- TB
- Unhealthy weight loss
- Unwanted pregnancy
- Mental health issues
  - Anxiety
  - Depression
  - Delayed development & cognitive growth
  - Pathologic fear
  - Hopelessness
  - PTSD
  - Substance abuse
  - Suicidal ideation
Lack of awareness is a major barrier
  - Lack of awareness and research within healthcare settings has created barriers in development of adoptable models of care
Role of Clinicians

• Role is threefold:
  – Screening and identification of trafficked individuals
  – Management of acute healthcare needs
  – Referral for health, safety, and legal resources
Role of Clinicians

Emergency Department is the setting most frequented by trafficked victims

Other areas:

| Urgent Care          | Family planning clinics, such as Planned Parenthood | Public and private offices |
Role of Clinicians

- Polaris survey of trafficked survivors showed:
  - 69% had accessed healthcare services while being trafficked and of this 85% indicated it was for medical issues caused by their exploitation.
  - Additionally, 57% stated they were never asked questions related to trafficking but did receive dismissive or insensitive comments and/or questions from healthcare professionals.
Role of Clinicians Screening and Identification

- Trafficked persons come from all demographics
- May not readily disclose that they are a trafficked individual or even identify themselves as such
- May be preconditioned to not trust law enforcement and/or healthcare providers
Role of Clinicians
Screening and Identification

There is no “one sign”

Accurate, detailed documentation of history, social history, and physical exam may reveal indicators or red flags that healthcare providers should recognize.

It is a collective of warning signs.
Recommendations
Role of Clinicians
Screening and Identification

- Vera Institute for Justice received grant funding to develop a validated tool to assist public agencies in identifying trafficked victims
- Trafficking Victim identification Tool (TVIT)
  - Short and long version
  - Both found to be highly reliable in predicting labor and sex trafficking in men and women, among US and foreign-born victims
Screening and Identification
TVIT Example Questions revolve around...

• **Physical Environment**
  – Not free to leave or come and go as wishes
  – In the commercial sex industry & has a pimp or manager
  – Unpaid, paid very little, or paid only through tips
  – Works excessively long and/or unusual hours
  – Not allowed breaks or suffers unusual restrictions at work
  – High security measure sexist in the work and/or living locations
  – Claims of ‘just visiting’ and inability to clarify where he/she stays or their address

• **Poor Physical Health**
  – Lacks regular medical care or denied medical services by employer
  – Appears malnourished or shows signs of repeated exposure to harmful chemicals
  – Shows signs of physical and/or sexual abuse, physical restraint, confinement, or torture
  – Under-dressed for the weather particularly in winter
Screening and Identification

TVIT Example Questions revolve around...

- **Poor mental health or abnormal behavior**
  - Fearful, anxious, depressed, submissive, tense, or nervous/paranoid
  - Exhibits unusually fearful or anxious behavior after bringing up law enforcement
  - Avoids eye contact
  - Loss of sense of time
  - Numerous inconsistencies in history
  - Presents to clinic with older man

- **Lack of control**
  - Has few or no personal possessions
  - Not in control of his or her own identification documents (ID, license, passport)
  - Has boyfriend (or other person in position of power) answering for the patient during clinical visit
Role of Clinicians Screening and Identification

Health and Human Services Department has also created a tool

- Not validated but draws from evidence-based practices
- Adult Human Trafficking Screening Toolkit and Guide

AHTST tool
### Role of Clinicians

**Screening and Identification**

**AHTST Example Questions**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Where are you from?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are you being held against your will?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Can you come and go as you please?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do you have a passport/identification papers with you? If not, who has your ID/passport?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Were you ever forced into doing something against your will?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How many hours/days or days/week do you work? How much do you eat?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Where do you live? Are there locks in the door and windows so that you cannot leave on your own?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Does anyone threaten you with violence when you try to leave?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
How to Approach Patient

- Imperative to work on building rapport & trust
- Victims may not disclose secondary to fear or retribution from captors or they may be returned to their captors
- Some victims may not even recognize they are a trafficked person
How to Approach Patient

Make every attempt to separate patient before asking specific questions

- Could be done while performing physical exam
- If adult patient;
  - When approaching a patient, it is important to disclose your responsibility to report so patient has informed consent
  - Call the National hotline number if you are unaware of your local resources & how to support someone you suspect is being trafficked 1-888-3737 888

If patient is a child, use assistance of social service specialist before interviewing if possible
How to Approach Patient

Remain unbiased, nonjudgmental to help facilitate trust

Goal is not to get the patient to disclose but to create an atmosphere wherein the patient feels comfortable and empowered in disclosing

Risk of nefarious recourse at hands of captor to patient and/or patients' family is real

Suspected victims can text ‘help’ to BE-FREE
After Disclosure Occurs

• Important to conduct needs assessment that addresses:
  – Acute physical needs
  – Referrals for acute and chronic psychological consequences of trafficking
  – Coordinate with several agencies; mental health, law, social services
Safety Needs for Healthcare Providers

• Consideration for safety of the victim and healthcare works
• Know your facilities safety measures and protocols
Moving Forward
Prevention

Health & Human Services (HHS), Department of Justice (DOJ) and Homeland Security – worldwide strategic approach

4 P’s

| Prevention | Protection | Prosecution | Partnership |
|------------|------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|

Prevention

• Worldwide strategy is achieved through:
  – Research and awareness
  – Promotion of protocols and capacity building
  – Strengthening of partnership & coordination

• May 2015, “Trafficking Awareness Training Health Care Act” was passed
  – To develop EVB practices for healthcare providers
  – Design and implement a pilot program to test these best practices

• Dec 2018, President signed into law the SOAR (Stop, Observe, Ask, and Respond) to Health and Wellness Act of 2018
  – Allowed HHS to develop training programs for healthcare and social service providers with a budget of $4 million FY 2020-2024, making HT a priority
  – https://www.acf.hhs.gov/otip/training/soar-health-and-wellness-training/soar-online
What Can I Do?

Healthcare providers (HCPs) are uniquely positioned to:

- Research
- Recognize
- Care for
- Educate
- Advocate

HCPs are positioned to collaborate with many other agencies and have agency to bring education to their patients, patient's families and community.
What Can I Do?

- Educate yourself as to populations at high risk
- Be sensitive to social history
- Provide risk-specific resources for those of your patients who are in high-risk categories
- Have educational pamphlets or poster in office exam rooms with hotline numbers
- Consider creation of social media page to communicate educational information, resources, community support groups
- ICD-10 codes for Human Trafficking
Color Blue

• The color blue has become the international color associated with trafficking awareness
  – The Blue Campaign
  – The Blue Heart
  – Blue Blindfold

• Jan, 2012, President declared the month of January to be Human Trafficking awareness Month
Protection and Prosecution

• 2007, US created Human Trafficking Prosecution Unit
  – Part of the Criminal Section of the Civil Rights Division
  – Created to assemble country’s expert prosecutors on human trafficking
    • Prosecutors work in concert with Assistant U.S. Attorney
Protection and Prosecution

- Trafficking Victims Protection Act created a visa category (T status or T-visa) specifically for trafficked individuals
  - Allows victims to reside in US & receive healthcare in return for participation with law enforcement in the prosecution of their traffickers
Organizations Fighting Trafficking & Resources

- Blue Heart Campaign (UN)
- International Justice Mission
- A21
- National Human Trafficking Hotline
Organizations Fighting Trafficking & Resources

Office on Trafficking in Persons
SOAR to health & wellness training

HEAL trafficking

Physicians Against the Trafficking of Humans (PATH)

Futures Without Violence
Organizations Fighting Trafficking & Local Resources

- Polaris Project
- Phoenix Dream Center
- ASU School of Social Work
- Office of Sex Trafficking Research
- TRUST: Training and Resources United to Stop Trafficking
References


Questions?