Futures Sub-Committee on the Development of CIE Scholarship

Committee members: Aaron Benavot (chair), Beatrice Avalos, Sangeeta Kamat, Ayaz Naseem, Jurgen Schriewer and Michele Schweisfurth

Background

The futures sub-committee on Comparative and International Education Scholarship was charged with:

- Discussing the viability of establishing an award for comparative education scholarship about Latin America in the memory of the late Cecilia Braslavsky, former Director of the International Bureau of Education (Geneva)
- Examining the criteria used by different award/scholarship committees—for example, UREAG, New Scholars Award, Jackie Kirk Book Award—as well as those used for awards, or recognition of distinction within the Society’s Special Interest Groups (SIGs). Discuss whether the current set of CIES awards and scholarships should be reorganized and/or standardized, and how? Consider whether there should be scholarships for scholars wishing to participate in CIES-sponsored workshops before, during and after the annual meeting.
- Carefully considering what constitutes CIE scholarship and discussing various ideas of how to improve the quality of research and scholarship presented at the CIES annual meetings.

Action item 1: Approve initiative to establish a Latin America Research Scholarship award in CIES

In the summer of 2010, CIES President Maria Teresa Tattu, asked Aaron Benavot to develop a proposal to establish an endowment/award in Cecilia Braslavsky’s memory, which would honor comparative-international scholarship of educational issues in Latin America, and would help facilitate the participation of an awardee each year at the annual CIES meeting. Benavot then contacted several distinguished Latin American scholars and asked if they would be willing to serve on a special ad-hoc committee for this purpose. All agreed to do so (see below); in addition, members of Cecilia’s immediate family also agreed in principle to serve as honorary members.

The initial purpose of the ad-hoc award committee would be to mobilized about 20,000-30,000 USD for the Latin American Research Scholarship (LARS). After six months or so the ad-hoc committee would report back to the CIES Board of Directors, indicating the amount of donations secured and ask whether, and under what conditions, the Society would provide ‘matching’ funds mobilized from non-CIES sources, so that a LARS endowment could be established. The interest from the principal of the endowment would then be used to fund the LARS awardee to attend the annual meeting of CIES and to present a paper and/or give a presentation.

Members of the Advancement of CIES Ad Hoc Committee, which met in Michigan, asked Benavot to expand on the proposal and, among other things, briefly summarize the scope and quality of Cecilia Braslavsky’s comparative education scholarship so that a more informed discussion of this proposal can be taken up by the BOD during the Montreal meeting. The actual proposal follows:
Proposal to establish a Latin America Research Scholarship award in honor of Cecilia Braslavsky

Purpose:

Several CIES members propose the establishment of a CIES-sponsored Latin America Research Scholarship award in honor of the late Cecilia Braslavsky¹, former professor of educational sciences at the University of Buenos Aires, former Director of the education area at the Facultad Latinoamericana de Ciencias Sociales or FLACSO (1982-1993), former Director-General of educational research and curricular development at the National Ministry of Culture and Education in Argentina (1994-2001), former Director of UNESCO’s International Bureau of Education (2001-2004), long-time comparative education scholar, policy analyst and outstanding teacher/advisor. The main purpose of this award is to stimulate comparative scholarship about education in Latin America, and to disseminate this scholarship to CIES’s community of comparative and international education scholars.

The annual award would be given to a scholar who has produced an outstanding publication or has who contributed significantly to advancing comparative education scholarship in and about Latin America. The award would help defer travel and other expenses related to participation at the annual CIES meetings. The awardee can either reside in Latin America or elsewhere and would be expected to present original research or perform an important capacity at the annual meeting (e.g., invited speaker or panelist) during the year of the award. Depending on the amount of funds available, and the quality of applicants, more than one award may be given each year.

Amount of the award: to be determined

Procedure: Scholars-researchers who wish to apply for the Latin American Research Scholarship Award in honor of Cecilia Braslavsky must be CIES members in good standing and will need to:

• Fill out a short application form describing the nature of their proposed participation in the annual CIES meeting and their financial need;
• Submit a brief CV as well as an article or publication that best represents their scholarly work in CIE;
• Applications from PhD students should include a letter of recommendation from their dissertation advisor.

Deadline: The application and supporting materials should be sent to the CIES Secretariat (to be forwarded to members of the Braslavsky LARS Award committee), no later than 2 months before the annual CIES conference.

Disbursement of Award: The awardees will receive a check (or cash if requested) in person at the venue of the CIES annual conference.

Members of the Latin America Research Scholarship Award Committee:

Aaron Benavot, USA (Chair)
Juan Carlos Tedesco, Argentina (former Federal Minister of Education)
Cristián Cox, Chile

Action item 2: Establish an Ad-hoc committee on Awards to comprehensively examine criteria used by all CIES-related award committees and consider options for reorganization

The committee was asked to examine the criteria used by different award/scholarship committees and discuss whether the current set of CIES awards and scholarships should be reorganized and/or standardized in some way. For various reasons it decided to defer to the insights emerging from several other on-going committees, and recommend that an ad-hoc committee be establish by the Board of Directors in Montreal to examine these issues in greater depth and detail.

Joel Samoff’s report provides a brief overview of the history of CIES awards and raises pertinent questions and issues to be discussed by the BoD. The Samoff report discusses the three major CIES awards--outstanding article in CER; best CIE dissertation; and Honorary Fellow award (see also annex below)—and several additional awards: 1) the Joyce Cain award for outstanding scholarly article that explores themes related to people of African descent; 2) the Jackie Kirk award for outstanding published book in areas of gender and education and/or education in conflict (fragile states, post conflict and peace education); and 3) International Travel Awards for distinguished service to CIE.

In addition James Williams Jacob and Paula Hunt, who are co-chairs of the Higher Education SIG, have prepared a report on the state of SIGs. They compiled some preliminary information about SIGs that have organized or established awards-related activities. They indicate that there are basically three forms of recognition mentioned by SIG chairs:

1) awards that showcase, honor or recognize outstanding scholarship on the main topic/focus of the SIG or its geographical region
2) awards that recognize an individual's lifetime achievement or service in the area
3) awards for young scholars (mainly for dissertations) who focus on the SIG topic or region

At present there appears to be no SIGs providing travel awards.

In general less than half of the 18 officially recognized SIGs indicate that they have established any kind of award, and most of these awards are to be found among the larger SIGs. Partly this is due to the fact that many SIGs have only recently been organized (less than 5 years), have limited memberships, few funds, and have yet to establish themselves fully in the Society.

Finally SIG awardees mainly receive a plaque or certificate in recognition of their outstanding scholarship. While precise information is still lacking, the authors of the report indicate that they would be surprised to learn if any SIG did provide a monetary award.
Action item 3: Form an ad-hoc committee to continue to develop specific proposals to encourage scholarship in CIES and/or apply for grants to foundations or other sources to organize special CIES sessions with key individuals in the field to also consider such proposals.

The committee drafted a fairly comprehensive outline of how CIE scholarship is embedded in the activities of CIES (see below). It was recommended that this outline be further discussed and revised in the coming weeks and then be considered as a basis for a broader discussion of the present state of CIE scholarship in the Society. Different ideas as to how this process might take place will be presented in the final report of the ad-hoc Committee.

Since the outline below advances a wide-ranging view of CIE scholarship, it was recommended that a forward-looking sub-committee be established, which would compile the views of many different CIES members with respect to each dimension of CIE scholarship noted in the outline. These views would eventually be integrated into a comprehensive report to the CIES Board of Directors and to the membership for discussion. It is expected that specific recommendations to improve CIE scholarship will eventually be considered.

Overview of CIE Scholarship (tentative)

1. Scholarship as conceived
   - Theoretical debates in CIE field
   - Overviews of past CIE scholarship, including shifts in CIE research at CIES, as well as changes in CIE research in relation to national/international policy contexts
   - Identification of promising research areas or issues
   - What is meant by ‘comparison’ or the ‘comparative method’ in CIE?
   - Examples of innovative analysis

2. Scholarship as reported
   - Assess the nature of CIE scholarship in Comparative Education Review
   - Examine CIE scholarship in CIES Perspectives (the Society newsletter)
   - Consider a CIES-sponsored publication series to advance CIE scholarship (contact existing series editors eg Alex Wiseman, David Philips, Mark Mason)
   - How can CIES web sites, including Special Interest Group (SIG) sites, better disseminate CIE scholarship
   - Other publication outlets to advance CIE scholarship

3. Scholarship as utilized
   - How is CIE scholarship utilized and applied in international agencies
   - How is CIE scholarship used in education-focused NGOs
   - How is CIE scholarship incorporated in development of national education policies and included in the debates and discussions of national education reform
   - How can CIE scholars engage with policy-makers in order to facilitate the appropriate utilization of CIE scholarship?

4. Scholarship as taught
   - Compile information on CIE degree programs in the US and elsewhere
   - Compile information about specific CIE courses that are offered in secondary or post-secondary institutions by analyzing course syllabi (Loyola Univ project)
   - Examine CIE scholarship as found in professional development workshops (e.g. IIEP)
• Developing a pool of powerpoint presentations to be distributed via the CIES web site

5. Scholarship as remembered/honored
• Promote and disseminate histories of CIE scholarship
• Expand and make more accessible the CIES archives
• (Re)Consider awards to CIE scholars and scholarship

6. Scholarship as networking
• What roles do national and regional CIES meetings play in the development of CIE scholarship?
• What should be CIES’s involvement in other national CIE societies and in the WCCES?
• In what ways should CIES support the inclusion of non-USA based CIE scholars?

This outline can be further modified at the Board of Directors’ meeting in Montreal. BoD members are asked to contribute ideas of whether, and how, this outline might serve as a catalyst for future discussions and debate.

Annex: List of previous CIES Awardees

**List of Honorary Fellows**

1987
Claude Eggertsen (d.)
C. Arnold Anderson (d.)

1990
Harold Noah
Philip Foster (d.)

1991
Mary Jean Bowman (d.)
Andreas Kazamias
Gerald H. Read (d.)
R. Murray Thomas

1994
Max A Eckstein

1997
Noel McGinn

1998
Don Adams

1999
Rolland Paulston (d.)

2000
Elizabeth Sherman Swing

2001
Norma Tarrow

2002
Mathew Zachariah

2003
Robert Arnove

2007
Joseph P. Farrell
William M. Rideout

2008
Vandra Masemann

2009
Martin Carnoy

2010
John Hawkins
George Bereday Award Recipients: Best Article in the *Comparative Education Review*


**Gail Kelly Award - Outstanding Dissertations**


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Dissertation Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>Peiying Chen</td>
<td>for her dissertation entitled <em>Acting otherwise: Institutionalization of women's/gender studies in Taiwan's universities</em>, University of Southern California, 2003.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>Gustavo Fischman</td>
<td>for his dissertation entitled <em>The Dilemma of the Second Mothers’ Teaching: Gender and Struggle over Education in Argentina</em>, University of California at Los Angeles, 1997.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>