Appendix A: Awards Process and Judging Criteria

Awards Process

Nominations for the next year's book awards are submitted September–October each year by members of CILIP. Nominations are checked and verified for their eligibility before nominations are announced.

The process is organised by the Youth Libraries Group (YLG), one of CILIP's Special Interest Groups, which itself has 1500 members. 12 children's librarians – members of CILIP's Youth Libraries Group – form the panel of judges, and read and assess all nominated books based on the official judging criteria.

The judging panel meet to decide the longlist of books for each medal, 20 for Carnegie and 20 for Kate Greenaway. From this list they choose the shortlists, consisting of up to 8 books for the Carnegie medal and up to 8 for the Kate Greenaway medal. Finally, the medal winners are selected. Longlists are published in February and shortlists in March, with the winners announced at a ceremony in June. Amnesty's judging panel choose a title and recipient from each shortlist to receive the Amnesty CILIP Honour.

Nominations

Nominations are made by members of CILIP. Each member can nominate up to 2 books for the Carnegie Medal and up to 2 books for the Kate Greenaway Medal.

Nominations for the 2018 awards opened on 1 September 2017 and ran to 06 October 2017. Nominations were announced 06 November 2017. You can view the full list of verified nominations on the Press Desk.

Eligibility

To be eligible for the Awards, titles must have been first published in the UK between 1 September and 31 August of the previous calendar year.

Books first published in another country must have been co-published in the UK within three months of the original publication date.

The book must be written in the English language (either as an original work in English or a first English translation of a foreign-language work) and specifically published for children and young people.

The book may be co-authored; however, multiple author anthologies are excluded.

In the case of e-books and short stories or poetry previously published in a magazine or elsewhere, the point of publication should be considered as the date when the work is published as a whole. At least 75% of the complete work must be original material published for the first time within the specified time frame.
All categories of books, including poetry, non-fiction and graphic novels, in print or ebook format, for children and young people are eligible.

Books by previous CILIP Carnegie and/or CILIP Kate Greenaway Medal winners are eligible.

Criteria: Carnegie Medal

The book that wins the Carnegie Medal should be a book of outstanding literary quality. The whole work should provide pleasure, not merely from the surface enjoyment of a good read, but also the deeper subconscious satisfaction of having gone through a vicarious, but at the time of reading, a real experience that is retained afterwards. All criteria will not necessarily be relevant to every title nominated. Where appropriate, consider and assess the following:

Style
Is the style or styles appropriate to the subject and theme and conducive to the establishment of voice?
Do dialogue and narrative work effectively together?
How effective is the use of literary techniques and conventions?
How effective is the use of language in creating narrative tension, conveying setting, atmosphere, characters, action etc.? How appropriate is that to the theme?
Where rhyme or rhythm are used, is their use accomplished and imaginative?
Where factual information is presented, is this accurate and clear?

The plot
Is it well-constructed?
Do events happen, not necessarily logically, but acceptably within the limits set by the theme?
Is the final resolution of the plot credible in relation to the rest of the book?

Characterisation
Are the characters believable and convincing?
Are they well-rounded, and do they develop during the course of the book?
Do they interact with each other convincingly?
Are the characters' behaviour and patterns of speech consistent with their known background and environment?
Do they act consistently in character throughout the book?
How effectively are the characters revealed through narration, dialogue, action, inner dialogue and through the thoughts, reactions and responses of others?

Criteria - Kate Greenaway Medal
The book that wins the Kate Greenaway Medal should be a book of outstanding artistic quality. The whole work should provide pleasure from a stimulating and satisfying visual experience which leaves a lasting impression. Illustrated work needs to be considered primarily in terms of its graphic elements, and where text exists particular attention should be paid to the synergy between the two.

All criteria will not necessarily be relevant to every title nominated. Where appropriate, consider and assess the following:

The artistic style

Is the medium appropriate?

Is the style creative and distinctive?

Does the style work with the subject?

Is there a consistent quality of illustration throughout the book?

The format

Is the typography (i.e. format, typeface, print size, spacing, novelty features etc.) integral or intrusive?

Does the layout draw the reader in or is it distracting?

How appropriate are the size and shape of the book?

What use is made of covers, end-papers and title page?

Synergy of illustration and text

Are there recurring visual themes or images that enhance the reader’s understanding of the book?

How well do the illustrations and text relate to each other in terms of layout?

Are the images and text consistent with each other?

Do the illustrations enhance the text or are they ‘pictorial upholstery’, i.e. for decorative purposes only?

In the case of information books, how accurate and clear are the illustrations?

The visual experience

How well does the book either offer the reader new experiences, or reflect their pre-existing experiences?

Does the book succeed in working at different levels for different readers?

What are the aesthetic qualities of the book?

What is the overall impact of the book on the reader?

Criteria: Amnesty CILIP Honour

Two special commendations are awarded to the author and illustrator of two books; one from each shortlist, that most distinctively illuminates, communicates, or celebrates our personal rights and freedoms.
In each category, Carnegie and Kate Greenaway, the panel look for books that:

- Celebrate the values of freedom, truth, justice and fairness
- Contribute to a better understanding of any one or more of our human rights, as stated in the [Universal Declaration of Human Rights](https://www.un.org/en/udhr/) and the [Convention on the Rights of the Child](https://www.unicef.org/ CRC/)

The Amnesty CILIP Honour is the first children's books commendation to celebrate deep themes that are far too often ignored. The best books are more than plot and character: they have human rights at their core and are a vital tool in developing empathy. More than that, they can give children the awareness and confidence to stand up and shape a better world.