

ANTHOLOGY/COLLECTIONS (FICTION)

Overall Evaluation

1. Is the entry presented in an acceptable book organizational layout (i.e., introduction, preface, foreword, afterword, and/or author biography) and in format (i.e., margins, spacing, chapter/section divisions, overall readability, etc.)?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable
2. Please rank the aptness of the book title in relation to the themes and content of the book.
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable
3. Please provide additional information regarding your assessment.

Opening

1. Does the opening introduction or foreword draw you in by starting with a compelling explanation of what is to follow? (If there is no introduction or foreword, does the first story or piece draw you in?)
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable
2. Have you been intrigued enough to want to read on?

- a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable
3. Please provide additional information regarding your assessment.

Plot Premise

1. Do the plots in the various pieces make sense in terms of the dramatic or overall focus of the book?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable
2. Is there enough conflict and inherent drama to sustain each individual story with its scene or events having a purpose in moving the collective story forward, either in terms of plot or the journey the character(s) take?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable
3. Do you get to the end of each piece and find no plot holes, no plot inconsistencies, and no problems with plot plausibility or believability?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average

- c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable
4. Was the “Promise” of the Opening and/or the Introduction or Foreword fulfilled by the conclusion of the anthology (or last story) so that you got to the end and felt that the pieces flowed together well?
- a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable
5. Please provide additional information regarding your assessment.

Setting/World Building

1. Does each piece have a strong sense of place and circumstance in such a way that you believe in it?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable
2. Do the worlds created for each piece feel “real” and “true” to the extent that you can lose yourself in them completely?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable
3. Do setting and imagery add to mood and tone in each piece, and are they woven effectively throughout?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable
4. Were you able to suspend disbelief if the setting or world in which each piece takes place was unusual?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average

e. Poor/Unacceptable

5. Please provide additional information regarding your assessment.

Specific Genre/Topic Criteria

1. This category, which is awarded to the editor (or single author) of the anthology, applies to non-erotic fictional works which cover a wide variety of topics, genres, or styles. Has the editor made the theme or message of the project clear so that what is promised by the title and supporting information (introduction, preface, foreword, afterword, author bios, etc.) is what you get in the reading?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable

2. Has the editor or author presented a work that is successful for its genre topic, where each part contributes to the whole, and all parts of the collection go together with pleasing unity?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable

3. Is each story or piece well-written, well-edited, and consistently as good as the other stories/parts?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable

4. Did the editor or author put together a collection that is always on topic and that demonstrates thorough research wherever called for?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average

- c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable
5. Is there variety in tone, style, and content where appropriate, or do all the pieces strike the same tone and seem unremarkable?
- a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable

6. How well do the pieces in this anthology employ clever, imaginative, and/or unique ideas in the topics or themes they fall into?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable

7. As you read through the book, the parts should remain strong and entertaining. How well did the editor avoid filler stories or saggy pieces, especially at the end?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable

8. Please provide additional information regarding your assessment.

Characters/Characterization

1. Does each piece have a memorable and well-rounded narrator or main protagonist (or two or more main protagonists if the story calls for it) with traits and flaws that make them unique and human?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable
2. In each piece, do the main characters grow as human beings, and is that growth clearly connected to emotional challenge? OR – if the main character does NOT grow (as happens in a Tragedy or plot with an anti-hero), does the character's failure to grow and change make sense in the context of the book?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable
3. Secondary characters should be distinct and differentiated and should not seem like cardboard clones. Do the authors handle the secondary characters well without making them boring or allowing them to hijack the plot?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable
4. In the pieces, are the actions of all characters consistent with the manner in which they have been characterized (for example, if a character is presented as a liar and a cheat, is this reflected in her decision and behavior, assuming growth and change may occur)?
 - a. Excellent

- b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable
5. Are the descriptions of the characters mostly fresh and effective, making use of imagery, metaphor, and apt detail while avoiding clichés and derivative details?
- a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable
6. Please provide additional information regarding your assessment.

Dialogue

1. Is the spoken dialogue natural sounding and credible for the characters? Does it sound fresh and colorful rather than derivative and flat?
- a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable
2. Does the dialogue reveal and nuance character interactions while avoiding repetitiveness and unrealistic over-telling?
- a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable

3. Does the dialogue enhance and move the story, avoiding purposeless “information dumps” and/or rambling?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable

4. Have the authors made good use of interior Voice (especially in the case of the main character[s])? Is there an appropriate balance between the external narrative/exposition and the internal thoughts and the spoken dialogue?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable

5. Please provide additional information regarding your assessment.

Narrative/Structure

1. Narrative consists of the balance between the descriptive exposition (the Telling of the story and the action and dialogue (the Showing) in a book. In each piece, is there a balance between the showing and the telling that feels effective and unforced?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable

2. Are narrative passages in each piece necessary and compelling, and balanced well with dialogue and scenes of action? Does the narrative flow well without being too spare, saggy, bloated, or cluttered with too much trivial detail?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable

3. Does the writing move you along through each story with mastery and effectiveness within the scope of the structure of each piece?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable

4. Within the structure, do the timelines make sense so that you are grounded and know where you are in time? Where needed, are you given cues (or dateline/chapter headers) that allow you to keep track of when and where you are?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average

- c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable
5. Do you sense a logical and pleasing structuring of the pieces in the anthology? Does it seem there was a rationale behind the way they flowed, from beginning to end?
- a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable
6. Please provide additional information regarding your assessment.

Style/Voice

1. Is the author's writing of each piece vivid, evocative and readable, displaying variety in tone, style, and content where appropriate?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable

2. Are Point of View (POV) and Perspective clear at all times? When Perspective transitions occur between characters, are they purposeful and smooth? Or does it seem the author is using head-hopping without a good reason to?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable

3. Is the writing grounded in the senses with description balanced between the intellectual and sight, smell, taste, texture, sound, and sixth sense? Are all the senses used in proper proportions?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable

4. Does the writing (whether hard-edged and difficult or softer and sweeter) have a beauty to it that is striking and attractive, that gives you reading pleasure?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average

- d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable
5. Are errors in spelling, grammar, usage, and facts so rare that they in no way interfere with your reading experience?
- a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable
6. Please provide additional information regarding your assessment.

Overall Impressions

1. Flaws aside, how intriguing, memorable, and/or touching did you find this anthology? When you reached the end, did you feel an impact – a powerful cumulative effect – from the reading?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable
2. Is there a pleasing balance between the emotions evoked and the intellectualism of the pieces?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable
3. Did you find a fair amount of universality so that the majority of the target audience for the topic/subject/themes would be satisfied with this anthology?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average
 - d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable
4. Even if you found that you did not “like” the anthology (because of topic or personal reasons), is the book still remarkable and effective for what the editor was trying to accomplish?
 - a. Excellent
 - b. Above Average
 - c. Average

- d. Below Average
 - e. Poor/Unacceptable
5. Please provide additional information regarding your assessment.

Lesbian Content

1. The guidelines for the Goldie Awards require that each work nominated “must contain significant lesbian content, characters, and/or themes.” Lesbian content includes: The main character identifies as a lesbian, and/or the main character is or ends up in a lesbian relationship, and/or the theme or plot deals with lesbian issues and/or lesbian life.
 - a. Significant lesbian content
 - b. Some lesbian content
 - c. No lesbian content

Judge’s Summary

1. Briefly, please summarize what you thought this book was all about.